

OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDITS



DRAFT EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

WELLSBURG MIDDLE SCHOOL

BROOKE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

DECEMBER 2005

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction.....	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance.....	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability.....	6
Education Performance Audit.....	7
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	7
High Quality Standards.....	8
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	11
Identification of Resource Needs	12
Early Detection and Intervention.....	13
School Accreditation Status	14

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Wellsburg Middle School in Brooke County was conducted on October 19, 2005. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Unified School Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Keith Burdette, Coordinator, Office of Program Services

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Donna Wilkes, Training Specialist, Office of Hospitality Education and Training

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Garrett Carskadon	Primary School Principal	Burlington Primary Mineral County
John Lewis	High School Assistant Principal	Morgantown High Monongalia County
Jeannie Montgomery	Middle School Teacher	Spencer Middle Roane County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

10 BROOKE COUNTY Charles Baker, Superintendent

303 WELLSBURG MIDDLE SCHOOL - Needs Improvement
Toni Paesano, Assistant Principal (Principal resigned end of September 2005)
Grades 05 - 08
Enrollment 499

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	488	500	497	99.40	72.42	Yes	Yes	✓
White	478	490	487	99.38	72.47	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	221	229	228	99.56	65.00	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	88	91	88	96.70	38.37	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	488	500	497	99.40	79.21	Yes	Yes	✓
White	478	490	487	99.38	79.41	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	221	229	228	99.56	70.45	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	88	91	88	96.70	38.37	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 99.8%

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
05	113	109	113	109	100.00	6.42	22.02	44.04	21.10	6.42	71.56
06	131	127	131	127	100.00	3.15	18.11	45.67	26.77	6.30	78.74
07	121	118	120	118	99.17	8.47	16.95	52.54	19.49	2.54	74.58
08	135	134	133	132	98.52	7.58	27.27	43.18	18.94	3.03	65.15

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
05	113	109	113	109	100.00	9.17	20.18	37.61	30.28	2.75	70.64
06	131	127	131	127	100.00	0.79	16.54	40.16	33.07	9.45	82.68
07	121	118	120	118	99.17	6.78	12.71	45.76	22.88	11.86	80.51
08	135	134	133	132	98.52	5.30	12.88	43.18	25.76	12.88	81.82

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

Other Relevant Performance Data

2004-2005 Writing Assessment Distribution Of Performance Across All Performance Levels Grade 7

	Total # Tested	% Novice	% Partial Mastery	% Mastery	% Above Mastery	% Distinguished	% Below # Mastery	% At or Above Mastery
WELLSBURG MIDDLE	110	3%	25%	55%	14%	4%	28%	72%

**Physical Assessment – Presidential Physical Fitness Test
Passage Rate**

Percentage of Students	School Year
33.74%	2003-04
80.00%	2002-03
38.823%	2001-02

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Below Standard

5.1.1. Achievement.

Wellsburg Middle School failed to achieve adequately yearly progress (AYP) in 5.1.1. Achievement of the special education (SE) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 9.4 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the West Virginia Board of Education continued the school's Conditional Accreditation status at the September 2005 State Board meeting.

Wellsburg Middle School achieved AYP in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval and may have achievement deficiencies if interventions are not applied.

While the SES subgroup achieved mastery in mathematics (65 percent) and was at the State's starting point average of 2003-04 and 2004-05 baseline results, this subgroup was not at the level of the all students (AS) (72.42 percent) and racial/ethnicity white (W) (72.47 percent) subgroups. Brooke County and Wellsburg Middle School must be mindful of this achievement disparity and implement high yield instructional strategies and programs designed to close the achievement gap of SES students.

The Team determined that the Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) had been revised to address 5.1.1. Achievement.

The following professional development/training opportunities were provided by the county and/or school.

1. Summer Learning Academy.
2. Five-Year Strategic Planning.
3. Special Education Forums.
4. WESTEST and Test Mate Clarity.
5. CSOs Performance Descriptors.
6. Inclusion/Collaboration - RESA VI.
7. Project MERIT.
8. Middle/High School Counselor.
9. Reading and Mathematics Symposiums.
10. Mapping/Prioritization (Grades 2-5) – RESA VI.
11. Differentiated Instruction - RESA VI.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Wellsburg Middle School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

6.1.3. Learning environment. The school building was attractive and well maintained. Students and staff demonstrated pride in their school.

Staff demonstrated professionalism that evidenced a commitment to being role models for students, parents, and the community. The staff exuded personal pride and respect for their position. The students exhibited excellent behavior and impeccable manners and presented themselves in a mature manner.

6.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. The student attendance rate at Wellsburg Middle School was 99.8 percent. The administration and staff placed a high priority on student attendance.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress to Meet the Standard (5.1.1. Achievement – SE)

6.1. Curriculum

6.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team observed classrooms, interviewed teachers, and reviewed documents and determined that all staff were not utilizing the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) to drive their curriculum. Additionally, one teacher referred to the West Virginia Board of Education Instructional Goals and Objectives (IGOs) instead of the CSOs.

6.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Through teacher interviews, the Team determined that some staff members did not hold high expectations for all students, especially those in the special education (SE) subgroup. Some teachers stated that the special education students just can't do the work so if the student makes a "good attempt" they will receive a good grade.

6.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

The Team observed minimal computer usage throughout the school. Through classroom observations and interviews with teachers and students, the Team determined that technology was not used in several classrooms.

6.2. Student and School Performance

6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Several lesson plans were incomplete and very sketchy. Plans needed to include more information, such as strategies, activities, materials to be used, and type of assessment to be used to ensure student mastery of the lesson. This would allow a smoother transition from the regular education teacher to a substitute teacher.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6.1.5. Instructional strategies.** Classroom observations and lesson plan reviews showed that some teachers applied a variety of instructional strategies; however, the Team noted that students of other teachers could benefit more from a wider array of instructional strategies in the classroom. The Team recommended that professional development on research-based instructional strategies be provided to teachers to make this a consistent practice among all teachers and that the principal and county staff monitor classrooms to assure effective application of high-yield instructional practice.
- 6.1.12. Multicultural activities.** Although teachers implemented individual activities relevant to multicultural education, including zero tolerance prevention, a unified, comprehensive plan to organize this instruction was not evident. The Team recommended that the school organize the activities to create a multicultural plan.
- 6.5.4. Physical assessment.** The Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) scores for 2003-04 were at 33.74 percent. The physical education teacher reported to the Team that students only have access to physical education classes “about 20 to 30 days per year.” The Team recommended that the school increase the availability of physical education classes, which would improve performance on the physical assessment. Note: The Team observed that the physical education instruction taking place was of high quality.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Wellsburg Middle School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Brooke County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Brooke County or the accreditation status of the schools.

7.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Programs were needed to assist teachers in delivering the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) and developing lesson plans. These programs would better serve the school and have a direct impact on student achievement.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Wellsburg Middle School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS	RECOMMENDED RESOURCES
6.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instructional Services (304) 558-7805
6.1.2. High expectations.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instructional Services (304) 558-7805
6.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instructional Technology (304) 558-7880
6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instructional Services (304) 558-7805

16.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county Unified Improvement Plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

The Team determined that Wellsburg Middle School and Brooke County have the capacity to correct the identified deficiencies.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 17.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 17.1.1. School location.** The site was not 11 acres + 1 acre for each 100 students over 600.
- 17.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The music facility did not have acoustical treatment.
- 17.1.12. Grades 7-12 auditorium/stage.** Acoustical panels and controlled illumination were not available.
- 17.1.15 Health service units.** Curtained or small rooms with cots and a toilet were not provided. The refrigerator did not have a lock.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the achievement levels of students in the special education (SE) subgroup, Wellsburg Middle School and Brooke County must implement high-yield instructional strategies that will improve achievement. Brooke County must actively pursue assistance from RESA VI, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Instruction must be data-driven and relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

School Accreditation Status

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
10-303 Wellsburg Middle	Conditional Accreditation	6.1.1; 6.1.2; 6.1.7; 6.2.3		
			5.1.1. (SE)	May 31, 2007

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified four (4) high-quality standards – necessary to improve performance and progress to meet 5.1.1. Achievement – for the special education (SE) subgroup and presented three (3) recommendations.

Wellsburg Middle School’s Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and process standards and progress related to student and school performance in the area of deficiency (5.1.1 SE). The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this draft report to guide Wellsburg Middle School in improvement efforts. The school and county have until the next accreditation cycle to correct deficiencies noted in the report.