

**Final Education Performance Audit Report**

**For**

**CHEAT LAKE MIDDLE SCHOOL**

**MONONGALIA COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**September 2008**

**West Virginia Board of Education**

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Cheat Lake Middle School in Monongalia County was conducted on January 5, 2006.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Cheat Lake Middle School in Monongalia County was conducted May 9, 2008. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

**SCHOOL PERFORMANCE**

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team’s findings.

**56 MONONGALIA COUNTY**

Frank Devono, Superintendent

**301 CHEAT LAKE MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**

Joanne Hines, Principal

Grades 05 - 08

Enrollment 572 (2004-05 2nd month enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2004-2005**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Group** | **Number Enrolled for FAY** | **Number Enrolled on Test Week** | **Number Tested** | **Participation Rate** | **Percent Proficient** | **Met Part. Rate Standard** | **Met Assessment Standard** | **Met Subgroup Standard** |
| **Mathematics** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 535 | 559 | 559 | 100.00 | 79.81 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 523 | 540 | 540 | 100.00 | 79.73 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Hispanic | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* |
| Asian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Low SES | 113 | 122 | 122 | 100.00 | 50.44 | Yes | No |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 66 | 70 | 70 | 100.00 | 24.24 | Yes | Safe Harbors |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| **Reading/Language Arts** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 535 | 559 | 559 | 100.00 | 83.92 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 523 | 540 | 540 | 100.00 | 84.13 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Hispanic | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* | \* |
| Asian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Low SES | 113 | 122 | 122 | 100.00 | 55.75 | Yes | No |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 66 | 70 | 70 | 100.00 | 27.27 | Yes | No |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**

**Attendance Rate = 96.8%**

**56 MONONGALIA COUNTY**

Frank Devono, Superintendent

**301 CHEAT LAKE MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**

Joanne Hines, Principal

Grades 05 - 08

Enrollment 572 (2005-06 2nd month enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2005-2006**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Group** | **Number Enrolled for FAY** | **Number Enrolled on Test Week** | **Number Tested** | **Participation Rate** | **Percent Proficient** | **Met Part. Rate Standard** | **Met Assessment Standard** | **Met Subgroup Standard** |
| **Mathematics** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 536 | 556 | 554 | 99.64 | 81.08 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 504 | 521 | 519 | 99.61 | 80.67 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | 19 | 19 | 19 | 100.00 | 84.21 | NA | NA | NA |
| Hispanic | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Asian | 10 | 12 | 12 | 100.00 | 90.00 | NA | NA | NA |
| Low SES | 126 | 133 | 131 | 98.49 | 50.00 | Yes | No |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 75 | 76 | 74 | 97.36 | 26.02 | Yes | No |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| **Reading/Language Arts** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 536 | 556 | 556 | 100.00 | 86.00 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 504 | 521 | 521 | 100.00 | 85.71 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | 19 | 19 | 19 | 100.00 | 89.47 | NA | NA | NA |
| Hispanic | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Asian | 10 | 12 | 12 | 100.00 | 90.00 | NA | NA | NA |
| Low SES | 126 | 133 | 133 | 100.00 | 57.93 | Yes | No |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 75 | 76 | 76 | 100.00 | 34.66 | Yes | Safe Harbors |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed  
Attendance Rate = 96.0%**

**56 MONONGALIA COUNTY**

Frank Devono, Superintendent

**301 CHEAT LAKE MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**

Joanne Hines, Principal

Grades 05 - 08

Enrollment 577 (2006-07 2nd month enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2006-2007**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Group** | **Number Enrolled for FAY** | **Number Enrolled on Test Week** | **Number Tested** | **Participation Rate** | **Percent Proficient** | **Met Part. Rate Standard** | **Met Assessment Standard** | **Met Subgroup Standard** |
| **Mathematics** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 540 | 565 | 563 | 99.64 | 85.68 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 505 | 526 | 524 | 99.61 | 85.28 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | 22 | 23 | 23 | 100.00 | 86.36 | NA | NA | NA |
| Hispanic | \* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Asian | 12 | 14 | 14 | 100.00 | 100.00 | NA | NA | NA |
| Low SES | 143 | 152 | 151 | 99.34 | 61.26 | Yes | Confidence Interval |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 72 | 76 | 75 | 98.68 | 39.43 | Yes | Safe Harbors |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| **Reading/Language Arts** | | | | | | | | |
| All | 540 | 565 | 561 | 99.29 | 85.66 | Yes | Yes |  |
| White | 505 | 526 | 522 | 99.23 | 85.25 | Yes | Yes |  |
| Black | 22 | 23 | 23 | 100.00 | 90.90 | NA | NA | NA |
| Hispanic | \* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Indian | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |
| Asian | 12 | 14 | 14 | 100.00 | 91.66 | NA | NA | NA |
| Low SES | 143 | 152 | 149 | 98.02 | 63.12 | Yes | Safe Harbors |  |
| Spec. Ed. | 72 | 76 | 73 | 96.05 | 35.71 | Yes | No |  |
| LEP | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* | \*\* |

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed  
Attendance Rate = 100.0%**

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

**Below Standard.**

**5.1.1. Achievement.**

Cheat Lake Middle School failed to achieve adequately yearly progress (AYP) in 5.1.1. Achievement of the economically disadvantaged students (SES) in mathematics and reading/language arts and special education students (SE) in reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 9.4 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the West Virginia Board of Education continued the school’s Conditional Accreditation status at the September 2005 State Board meeting.

Cheat Lake Middle School achieved AYP in the special education (SE) subgroup in mathematics only by application of the safe harbors provision. Only 24.24 percent of the students were proficient in this cell. A significant disparity existed between the achievement of the economically disadvantaged (SES) and special education (SE) subgroups and that of the all students (AS) and racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups and apply interventions to close the achievement gap for the economically disadvantaged (SES) and special education (SE) students.

The following professional development/training opportunities were provided by the West Virginia Board of Education, RESA VII, the county and/or school.

1. Technology – United Streaming training.
2. WESTEST test overview and disaggregation.
3. “I Know” Website training.
4. World Book online training.
5. Five-Year Strategic Plan planning session.
6. Responsible Student Program training.
7. Technology Integration training – United Streaming, EDClass, with Active Book Reader, Blogs, Marco Polo, and WebQuest Portal.
8. Confidentiality training.
9. Reading Strategies and Integration.
10. Note-taking strategies.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**MET STANDARD. Cheat Lake Middle School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in achievement of the special education (SE) subgroup in reading/language arts.**

**The Cheat Lake Middle School staff continued to learn new strategies and methods to instruct students in the SE subgroup and students in this subgroup improved in achievement. The SE subgroup scored 27.27 percent proficient in 2005 and improved to 35.71 percent proficient in 2007 in reading/language arts. The staff holds high hopes that the reorganization of the special education program to include most special education students in general education classrooms will provide the push needed for this subgroup to achieve AYP on the 2008 WESTEST.**

West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education*-*Performance Based Accreditation System* in Section §126-13-6 provides:

6.1. A system of points on an index will be used to assess and weigh annual performance measures for state accreditation of schools and approval of school systems that gives credit or points on an index to prevent any one measure alone from causing a school to achieve less than full accreditation status or a school system from achieving less than full approval status: Provided, That a school or school system that achieves AYP is eligible for no less than full accreditation or full approval status, as applicable, and the system established pursuant to this subsection shall only apply to schools and school systems that do not achieve AYP.

The index showed that Cheat Lake Middle School performed within the point range (1068-842) for distinguished accreditation status.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

**Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.**

**6.1. Curriculum**

**6.1.6. Instruction in writing*.* Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child’s weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

The Team interviewed teachers and students and found all teachers were not providing instruction in writing to all students on a weekly basis. The Team also observed that in many cases student writing was not collected and corrected for spelling, punctuation, content, and grammar.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed samples of writing from all subjects. The school adopted the 6 Traits of Writing as the school’s writing program and all teachers received training in teaching writing. Students in all classes were writing on a weekly basis and the writing assignments were collected and corrected for grammar and content.**

**6.2. Student and School Performance**

**6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

The Team observed several lesson plans that were incomplete and could not be followed by substitute teachers. Given the deficiencies in the special education (SE) subgroup and the performance of the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup, it is important that the administrators review plans and assure that lessons are coherent, relevant, sequential, and address students’ learning needs.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE. The faculty worked together to create a new lesson plan format for the school. Lesson plans in the new format contained all the information necessary to present an effective lesson and for a substitute teacher to teach the class in the teacher’s absence. Lesson plans were reviewed regularly and commented upon by the principal and assistant principal. The Team reviewed lesson plans and talked with teachers and verified that effective lesson planning was taking place.**

**6.4. Regulatory Agency Reviews**

**6.4.1.** **Regulatory agency reviews.** **Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures**. (**W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)**

Deficiencies noted in the State Fire Marshal report had not been corrected. Issues included:

1. Book slot in the wall of the Media Center needed to be replaced to prevent infiltration of smoke in case of a fire.

2. Door closures were needed in the new modular building.

3. Wire mold boxes and covers needed to be installed over the exposed wiring in the Home Economics Room where the lights had been removed.

4. Emergency lights needed to be installed in the Weight Room area on the old stage of the gymnasium.

Two areas of the Food Establishment Inspection Report had not been addressed. These included:

1. Ceiling vents in Dish Room were not cleaned.

2. Ceiling tiles were in poor repair in several kitchen locations.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE. All deficiencies noted in the State Fire Marshal Report and the Food Establishment Inspection Report had been corrected.**

**RECOMMENDATIONS**

**6.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.** The Team observed that the county-provided lesson plan folders contained tabs that referenced the West Virginia Instructional Goals and Objectives (IGOs). The Team recommended that all information be updated to address the current West Virginia Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs).

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. These changes were made when the faculty created a new lesson plan format.**

**6.1.3. Learning environment.** Several classrooms had wrinkled carpet that was fastened with duct tape. This presented a tripping hazard. The carpet needed to be repaired or removed to provide a safer environment.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The carpet was replaced with tile in the Grade 6 classrooms. Plans were made for the carpet in the other classrooms to be removed after Cheat Lake Middle School is moved into the renovated University High School property and it is determined how these rooms will be used.**

**6.1.5. Instructional strategies.** The school was not implementing an inclusion model for special education (SE) students. Special education students were being instructed in a self-contained classroom setting. In order to increase the number of students proficient in the SE subgroup, the school needed to implement an inclusion program across all grade levels and examine instructional strategies to determine their effectiveness.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The school’s special education program was reorganized and many special education students were included in the general education classrooms for instruction with the support of special education co-teachers.**

**6.1.8. Instructional materials.** Teachers reported that they had not received adequate training on the implementation of the newly adopted mathematics textbooks. Some teachers also indicated they had not received adequate training on the implementation of the reading program. The Team recommended that the school and county provide more extensive training to ensure the efficient and effective delivery of all subject area material.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Additional training was provided for the newly adopted mathematics textbooks. More extensive training was being provided for all new textbook adoptions.**

**6.1.12. Multicultural activities.** Although teachers implemented individual activities relevant to multicultural education, including zero tolerance and prevention, no approved unified, comprehensive plan to organize this instruction was evidenced. The Team recommended that a county plan be approved, implemented, and that staff be trained in its implementation.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. A school plan for multicultural activities had been prepared and implemented by the faculty.**

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Cheat Lake Middle School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Monongalia County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Monongalia County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**7.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.**

In order to increase the achievement of the economically disadvantaged (SES) and special education (SE) students, the school and county need to investigate the collaborative approach to education. This would expose these students to instruction provided by general education teachers who are well trained in subject area content.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

**The special education program was reorganized to include special education students in the general education classrooms with support provided by special education co-teachers in the classrooms. Interviews with teachers working in the inclusion program indicated the program was being implemented smoothly and most special education students were thriving in the general education classrooms.**

**BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES**

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Cheat Lake Middle School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

16.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

The Team determined that Cheat Lake Middle School and Monongalia County have the capacity to correct the identified deficiencies; however, the capacity must be developed in the Special Education Department to provide quality services to address the low performance of the SE subgroups on the WESTEST. Furthermore, the school and county must examine instruction provided SES students to determine if the rigor and expectations are in place. The Team recommended that the Monongalia County School System Director of Special Education and the school administrator engage the Special Education Director and the Professional Development Director at RESA VII in developing the school’s capacity to improve the school’s achievement of the SE students and SES students.

Note: This is the first year for the current principal at Cheat Lake Middle School. The Team interviewed teachers and students and concluded that great strides had been made to improve student achievement. The Team believed that student achievement for all students will increase given the atmosphere of the school.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

**Cheat Lake Middle School, with support from Monongalia County Schools central office staff and RESA VII, had corrected the identified deficiencies listed in this report. The staff examined instruction for the special education students and reorganized the special education program to provide special education students more rigorous instruction in general education classrooms. Teachers were using the information received from the county benchmark testing to identify student academic needs and plan instruction in the classrooms and through tutoring sessions to address the identified needs. This was being done for all students including the economically disadvantaged (SES) and special education (SE) students.**

**IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS**

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county’s schools and how those impact program and student performance.

**17.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18‑2E‑5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing “Need” for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 *and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

**17.1.1. School location.** The school site was not large enough for future expansion.

**17.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** The administrative office area did not include an adequate reception/waiting area. The administrative personnel were not provided sufficient work space and privacy.

**17.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility was not of adequate size and lacked adequate storage. The physical education facility was not of adequate size and did not have a display case or bulletin board.

**17.1.11. Grades 6-12 science facilities.** The science facilities were not of adequate size.

**FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**There had been no change for items in this section; however, Cheat Lake Middle School will be moved into the old University High School facility as soon as renovations are completed.**

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the low student performance in the SES and SE subgroups it is imperative that Cheat Lake Middle School and Monongalia County continue to investigate research-based, high-yield methods of instruction that will bring about the success of all students. These students need to be given exposure to instruction by general education teachers in collaboration with special education teachers.

**FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY**

**Professional development for the staff on high-yield instruction methods continued. Some of the professional development training completed by the staff included:**

* **Reading Strategies.**
* **6 Traits of Writing.**
* **Writing Across the Curriculum.**
* **Application Model for Rigor/Relevance Framework – Bill Daggett.**
* **Learning Pyramid – Bloom’s Taxonomy.**
* **Tech Steps.**
* **Parent Link.**
* **Ready-to-Use-Writing – Mini Lessons.**
* **ReQuest – Strategy for Comprehension.**
* **Differentiated Instructional Strategies.**
* **Co-Teaching.**
* **Smart Board Training.**
* **Instructional Strategies – How to Teach for Rigor and Relevance – Helen Branegan.**
* **21st Century Learning Skills.**

**A plan had been implemented to schedule special education students into general education classrooms with collaboration between the special education teachers and general education teachers.**

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue Cheat Lake Middle School’s previous accreditation status until the 2008 performance data are analyzed and the 2008 Report of Ratings is approved by the West Virginia Board of Education.