



FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

BARBOUR COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Belington Elementary School in Barbour County was conducted March 15, 2011.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of **Belington Elementary School** was conducted **March 13, 2012**. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Carroll Staats

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

02 BARBOUR COUNTY

Jeff Kittle, Assistant Superintendent

201 BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Cindy Vance, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 324 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	156	164	163	99.39	58.06	Yes	Yes	✓
White	156	163	162	99.38	58.06	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	28	29	28	96.55	33.33	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	104	111	111	100.00	52.88	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	156	164	163	99.39	50.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	156	163	162	99.38	50.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	28	29	28	96.55	18.51	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	104	111	111	100.00	49.03	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 98.3%

02 BARBOUR COUNTY
Jeff Kittle, Assistant Superintendent

201 BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Cindy Vance, Principal
Grades PK - 05
Enrollment 316 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	153	162	162	100.00	33.98	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	151	159	159	100.00	34.43	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	23	26	26	100.00	17.39	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	91	98	98	100.00	21.97	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	153	162	162	100.00	30.06	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	151	159	159	100.00	30.46	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	23	26	26	100.00	8.69	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	91	98	98	100.00	20.87	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 98.3%

02 BARBOUR COUNTY
Dr. Joe Super, Superintendent
201 BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Cindy Vance-Sigley, Principal
Grades PK - 05
Enrollment 324 (2nd month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2010-2011

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	146	149	147	98.65	35.17	Yes	No	X
White	143	146	144	98.63	35.91	Yes	No	X
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	26	26	26	100.00	19.23	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	83	86	85	98.83	24.09	Yes	No	X
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	146	149	147	98.65	37.24	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
White	143	146	144	98.63	38.02	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	26	26	26	100.00	15.38	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	83	86	85	98.83	27.71	Yes	No	X
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed
Attendance Rate = 98.8%**

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Achieved Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

This is the 1st year that Belington Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement. Belington Elementary School failed to achieve AYP in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in mathematics for the 2009-2010 school year. Belington Elementary School achieved AYP in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts, and in the SES subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 58.00 percent in mathematics and 74.00 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 67.92 percent in mathematics and 64.15 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 72.00 percent in mathematics and 72.00 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Data Management.
2. How to Use Language to Improve Learning.
3. Building Fluency.
4. Data Transition.
5. Tier 3 Intervention.
6. TechSteps.
7. WESTEST2 Data Analysis.
8. Title I Wilson Training.
9. Curriculum Mapping.
10. DIBELS and Benchmarking.
11. Read Naturally.
12. Writing Road Map.
13. Acuity.
14. Visualizing and Verbalizing.
15. Accelerated Reader.
16. Smart Board.
17. Everyday Math for Teachers in K-02 and Grades 03-05.
18. Mobi/Elmo.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – March 2012

ACHIEVED STANDARD.

Belington Elementary School made gains in students performing at the proficient level in all subgroups in both mathematics and reading/language arts. Improved percent proficiency was modest in mathematics. Significant improvements were shown in reading/language arts in the all students (AS) subgroup (+7.18 percent), the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup (+7.56 percent), the special education (SE) subgroup (+6.69 percent), and the economically disadvantaged subgroup (+6.84 percent).

Even though the percent of students scoring proficient improved, Belington Elementary School did not meet adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the AS, W, and SES subgroups in mathematics and the SES subgroup in reading/language arts.

West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education-Performance Based Accreditation System* in Section §126-13-6 provides:

- 6.1. A system of points on an index will be used to assess and weigh annual performance measures for state accreditation of schools and approval of school systems that gives credit or points on an index to prevent any one measure alone from causing a school to achieve less than full accreditation status or a school system from achieving less than full approval status: Provided, that a school or school system that achieves AYP is eligible for no less than full accreditation or full approval status, as applicable, and the system established pursuant to this subsection shall only apply to schools and school systems that do not achieve AYP.

The index showed that Belington Elementary School performed within the point range (511.38-421.57) for full accreditation status.

The principal reported the following professional development trainings specific to the Education Performance Audit Report.

1. Implementing Common Core Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs).
2. Project Based Learning.
3. Using CSOs to guide lesson planning.
4. Teaching Math Across the Curriculum.
5. Strategies for Parent Involvement.
6. Teaching Writing Across the Curriculum.
7. Using Acuity and WV Writes.

8. **DIBELS Next.**
9. **Data Analysis.**
10. **Number Sense.**
11. **Global 21 and Teach 21.**

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Four teachers could not discuss West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) usage in their classes. These teachers said that they wrote their lesson plans and then matched their plans with the CSOs. One teacher stated that she went through the textbook front to back and it was matched to the CSOs.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All teachers were provided a copy of the West Virginia 21st century content standards and objectives (CSOs) for each subject they were teaching.

In staff meetings prior to school opening in August, the staff discussed CSOs and procedures to use the CSOs to guide instruction. Checklists for the CSOs were provided to assist teachers and ensure the CSOs had been taught. The CSOs are discussed during monthly curriculum meetings and the checklists are reviewed and instructional planning is adjusted to ensure student needs are being met. The principal monitored this process during classroom walkthroughs and lesson plan reviews.

The Team interviewed the principal and several teachers, reviewed lesson plans, and verified the CSOs were conscientiously being used by the faculty in planning instruction.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Two students were sleeping in one classroom during the entire Team observation period of 30 minutes

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The principal held a discussion with staff on procedures to use when students sleep or are disengaged during class. Professional development on Differentiated Instruction and varied instructional activities to keep students interested and motivated was provided to the staff. Student engagement was being monitored during the principal's classroom walkthroughs. The Team visited several classrooms and found all students actively engaged in the class activities.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

One teacher did not vary instruction. Teacher directed instruction was the only instructional strategy in this classroom.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The teacher was no longer a member of this school faculty. The Team visited several classrooms and found a variety of instructional strategies being used in all classrooms. The entire staff had participated in additional training for differentiating instruction in the classrooms. Instruction was being monitored by the principal through lesson plan reviews and classroom walkthroughs.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

A majority of teachers interviewed stated that they did not conduct writing instruction at least one time per week. All teachers must be conducting writing instruction, with feedback, at least one time per week in each class.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – March 2012

COMPLIANCE. Professional development on Writing Across the Curriculum was provided. The Team reviewed teachers' notebooks containing weekly student writing samples. The principal reviewed lesson plans to ensure that all teachers were teaching writing. Teaching writing was also an item on the classroom walkthrough checklist and was checked as the principal performed the classroom walkthroughs.

7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)

One teacher did not have enough Everyday Math workbooks and Math at Home books. This teacher stated that she had turned in a request but had not heard anything from the central office about the status of these books.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. No one knew what happened to the request for the mathematics instructional materials. Procedures to report shortages of books and/or materials were reviewed with the staff. The Team interviewed teachers and the principal and found the lack of books and supplies was not a problem this school year.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Grade 4 teachers stated that they were not teaching science and social studies daily.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed classroom schedules and lesson plans, visited classrooms, and interviewed teachers and confirmed science and social studies were being taught daily.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.** Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Three teachers had lesson plans that could not be followed by a substitute teacher. One teacher did not have lesson plans after October 8, 2010. All teachers stated that the principal had completed minimal amounts of lesson plan reviews.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The school staff adopted a lesson plan rubric that provides ample information for the teacher to present the lesson or for a substitute teacher to continue the lesson in the teacher's absence. The Team reviewed teacher lesson plans in the classrooms and found that all lesson plans reviewed contained adequate information for a substitute teacher. The principal reviewed lesson plans about three times each quarter this year.

- 7.2.4. Data analysis.** Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)

Grades 3 and 4 teachers stated that they did not use WESTEST2 data analysis to guide the curriculum. DIBELS, West Virginia Writes, and Acuity were being used in all classes.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The teachers used the CSOs as their primary guide for instruction. The WESTEST2 data analysis and the benchmarking test data were also used to adjust instruction to ensure students' weaknesses were being addressed.

7.8. Leadership

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

This is the first year for the principal at Belington Elementary. While there were a high number of deficiencies, the Team believed that the principal was working to improve achievement and was knowledgeable of the needs of the school. To achieve this end, it is important that the principal continue to receive assistance from the Barbour County Central Office, RESA 7, the West Virginia Center for Professional Development, and the West Virginia Department of Education.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The principal reported that support from the Barbour County Schools Central Office staff had continued and was very beneficial. Monthly meetings were held with the principal, the county superintendent of schools, and the Title I Director to review progress and plan further steps to continue school improvements.

RESA 7 continued providing relevant staff development with training in Using Technology (MOBI and Elmo) and on the Instructional Practices Inventory (IPI). The school is in the process of implementing the IPI.

Under the leadership of the principal, the school demonstrated improvement in correcting the findings identified in the Initial Education Performance Audit report and improving the WESTEST2 results.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Belington Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Barbour County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Barbour County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

A complete and thorough review of procedures including, but not limited to, classroom management, data analysis, West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) implementation, Five-Year Strategic Plan, instructional strategies, lesson planning, and implementing writing is needed for the staff.

The Barbour County Central Office is strongly urged to continue to provide assistance and support to the new principal and ensure the success of not only students, but the new administrator.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW CONCLUSION

The staff has taken the task of improving the school seriously and participated in many activities designed for school improvement. School improvement activities included: A complete curriculum audit was conducted; CSOs were distributed to all teachers; trainings on using the CSOs to guide instruction was provided; a CSOs checklist was developed for teachers to track CSO mastery; curriculum, instruction, and student achievement were reviewed and student progress was monitored during monthly staff meetings; professional development was provided on differentiating classroom instruction; lesson planning improved with a new lesson plan rubric and administrative monitoring; and writing across the curriculum was being practiced by all teachers. The principal reported that support and assistance from the Barbour County Central Office staff continued and was most beneficial.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Belington Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building needs to be developed for educators at the school in strategically targeting resources to the teaching and learning process as indicated in the Five-Year Strategic Plan to improve student and school achievement.

The Office of School Improvement will be contacting the school and county regarding the necessary revisions of the school's strategic plan and providing assistance through the West Virginia Department of Education State System of Support.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW CONCLUSION

The school staff, with assistance from the Barbour County School District Central Office staff, reviewed and revised the school Five-Year Strategic Plan and developed additional goals and action steps to improve student achievement. County resources were targeted to support the action steps in the plan. This revised plan has been implemented and the deficiencies in the OEPA Audit report were being successfully addressed. The West Virginia Department of Education provided assistance with reviewing and upgrading the school Technology Plan.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** Storage was not adequate in all classrooms.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** A locker/dressing room was not available.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health service unit of adequate size was not available. The room was very small. A toilet was not provided.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW CONCLUSION

All facility resource needs remained the same as identified in the original Education Performance Audit report.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the achievement levels of students in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups, Belington Elementary School and Barbour County must implement high yield instructional practices and instruction that will improve students' achievement. Barbour County must actively pursue assistance from RESA 7, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW TEAM SUMMARY

Belington Elementary School principal and staff have received assistance from the Barbour County School District Central Office staff and RESA 7 staff in providing professional development activities designed to improve instructional planning and delivery of effective student instruction. The staff was using data from the WESTEST2 and quarterly student progress benchmarking of all students to target instruction to student weaknesses. This analysis of data enabled teachers to provide more effective instruction to meet student needs and increase student achievement. Curriculum maps and West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives were being used to keep the curriculum on track and relevant.

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
Belington Elementary	Full Accreditation			

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the **Full Accreditation** status of **Belington Elementary School**.