



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

BARBOUR COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JUNE 2011

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	6
Education Performance Audit.....	7
High Quality Standards	7
Indicators of Efficiency	9
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	10
Identification of Resource Needs	11
Early Detection and Intervention	12
Education Performance Audit Summary	13

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Belington Elementary School in Barbour County was conducted March 15, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are declining and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review concentrated on the declining student achievement.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator
West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader and Technology – Sterling Beane, Jr., Coordinator, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Janie C. DeVaul	Elementary School Principal	Watson Elementary School Marion County
Ronald G. Hall	Elementary School Principal	Marlinton Elementary School Pocahontas County
Don E. Johnson	Elementary School Principal	Sutton Elementary School Braxton County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

02 BARBOUR COUNTY

Jeff Kittle, Assistant Superintendent

201 BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Cindy Vance, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 324 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	156	164	163	99.39	58.06	Yes	Yes	✓
White	156	163	162	99.38	58.06	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	28	29	28	96.55	33.33	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	104	111	111	100.00	52.88	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	156	164	163	99.39	50.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	156	163	162	99.38	50.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	28	29	28	96.55	18.51	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	104	111	111	100.00	49.03	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 98.3%

02 BARBOUR COUNTY
Jeff Kittle, Assistant Superintendent
201 BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Cindy Vance, Principal
Grades PK - 05
Enrollment 316 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	153	162	162	100.00	33.98	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	151	159	159	100.00	34.43	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	23	26	26	100.00	17.39	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	91	98	98	100.00	21.97	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	153	162	162	100.00	30.06	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	151	159	159	100.00	30.46	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	23	26	26	100.00	8.69	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	91	98	98	100.00	20.87	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 98.3%

BELINGTON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	53	50	53	50	100.00	26.00	32.00	24.00	14.00	4.00	42.00
04	56	53	56	53	100.00	37.74	30.19	24.53	3.77	3.77	32.08
05	53	50	53	50	100.00	42.00	30.00	20.00	8.00	0.00	28.00

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	53	50	53	50	100.00	54.00	20.00	18.00	6.00	2.00	26.00
04	56	53	56	53	100.00	33.96	30.19	22.64	11.32	1.89	35.85
05	53	50	53	50	100.00	48.00	24.00	16.00	10.00	2.00	28.00

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

The following charts show the actual number of students proficient and not proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts out of the number enrolled for the full academic year (FAY).

Mathematics			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	153	52	101
White	151	52	99
Special Education	23	4	19
SES	91	20	71

Reading/Language Arts			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	153	46	107
White	151	46	105
Special Education	23	2	21
SES	91	19	72

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Achieved Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

This is the 1st year that Belington Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement. Belington Elementary School failed to achieve AYP in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in mathematics for the 2009-2010 school year. Belington Elementary School achieved AYP in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts, and in the SES subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 58.00 percent in mathematics and 74.00 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 67.92 percent in mathematics and 64.15 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 72.00 percent in mathematics and 72.00 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Data Management.
2. How to Use Language to Improve Learning.
3. Building Fluency.
4. Data Transition.
5. Tier 3 Intervention.
6. TechSteps.
7. WESTEST2 Data Analysis.
8. Title I Wilson Training.
9. Curriculum Mapping.
10. DIBELS and Benchmarking.
11. Read Naturally.
12. Writing Road Map.
13. Acuity.
14. Visualizing and Verbalizing.
15. Accelerated Reader.
16. Smart Board.
17. Everyday Math for Teachers in K-02 and Grades 03-05.
18. Mobi/Elmo.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Four teachers could not discuss West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) usage in their classes. These teachers said that they wrote their lesson plans and then matched their plans with the CSOs. One teacher stated that she went through the textbook front to back and it was matched to the CSOs.

- 7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)**

Two students were sleeping in one classroom during the entire Team observation period of 30 minutes.

- 7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

One teacher did not vary instruction. Teacher directed instruction was the only instructional strategy in this classroom.

- 7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

A majority of teachers interviewed stated that they did not conduct writing instruction at least one time per week. All teachers must be conducting writing instruction, with feedback, at least one time per week in each class.

- 7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)**

One teacher did not have enough Everyday Math workbooks and Math at Home books. This teacher stated that she had turned in a request but had not heard anything from the central office about the status of these books.

- 7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Grade 4 teachers stated that they were not teaching science and social studies daily.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

Three teachers had lesson plans that could not be followed by a substitute teacher. One teacher did not have lesson plans after October 8, 2010. All teachers stated that the principal had completed minimal amounts of lesson plan reviews.

- 7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)**

Grades 3 and 4 teachers stated that they did not use WESTEST2 data analysis to guide the curriculum. DIBELS, West Virginia Writes, and Acuity were being used in all classes.

7.8. Leadership

- 7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)**

This is the first year for the principal at Belington Elementary. While there were a high number of deficiencies, the Team believed that the principal was working to improve achievement and was knowledgeable of the needs of the school. To achieve this end, it is important that the principal continue to receive assistance from the Barbour County Central Office, RESA 7, the West Virginia Center for Professional Development, and the West Virginia Department of Education.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Belington Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Barbour County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Barbour County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

A complete and thorough review of procedures including, but not limited to, classroom management, data analysis, West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) implementation, Five-Year Strategic Plan, instructional strategies, lesson planning, and implementing writing is needed for the staff.

The Barbour County Central Office is strongly urged to continue to provide assistance and support to the new principal and ensure the success of not only students, but the new administrator.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Belington Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building needs to be developed for educators at the school in strategically targeting resources to the teaching and learning process as indicated in the Five-Year Strategic Plan to improve student and school achievement.

The Office of School Improvement will be contacting the school and county regarding the necessary revisions of the school's strategic plan and providing assistance through the West Virginia Department of Education State System of Support.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms. Storage was not adequate in all classrooms.

19.1.14. Food service. A locker/dressing room was not available.

19.1.15. Health service units. A health service unit of adequate size was not available. The room was very small. A toilet was not provided.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the achievement levels of students in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups, Belington Elementary School and Barbour County must implement high yield instructional practices and instruction that will improve students' achievement. Barbour County must actively pursue assistance from RESA 7, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

Education Performance Audit Summary

Belington Elementary School's Education Performance Audit concentrated on the declining student achievement. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school.

The Team identified nine high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

- 7.1.1. **Curriculum based on content standards and objectives** (some teachers could not discuss how the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) were delivered in the classroom. Lesson plans were being matched to CSOs after development).
- 7.1.2. **High expectations** (sleeping students were observed in one classroom).
- 7.1.5. **Instructional strategies** (one teacher did not vary instructional strategies).
- 7.1.6. **Instruction in writing** (many teachers did not have weekly writing instruction).
- 7.1.8. **Instructional materials** (one teacher was short on math books and workbooks).
- 7.1.9. **Programs of study** (grade 4 was not teaching science and social studies daily).
- 7.2.3. **Lesson plans and principal feedback** (some plans were inadequate for a substitute to use).
- 7.2.4. **Data analysis** (grades 3 and 4 did not use test data to guide curriculum).
- 7.8.1. **Leadership** (principal needed more assistance).

The Team noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit and the revised strategic plan, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Belington Elementary School and Barbour County to correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.