



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

BERKELEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

FEBRUARY 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

| | Page |
|--|------|
| Introduction | 2 |
| Education Performance Audit Team | 2 |
| School Performance | 3 |
| Annual Performance Measures for Accountability | 6 |
| Education Performance Audit..... | 7 |
| Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress | 7 |
| High Quality Standards | 7 |
| Indicators of Efficiency | 9 |
| Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies..... | 10 |
| Identification of Resource Needs | 11 |
| Early Detection and Intervention | 12 |
| Education Performance Audit Summary | 13 |

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Winchester Avenue Elementary School in Berkeley County was conducted November 2, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for low student performance and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

| Name | Title | School/County |
|------------------|--|---|
| Brad A. Fittro | High School Assistant Principal | Liberty High School Harrison County |
| Jeff A. Pancione | Elementary School Principal | Augusta Elementary School Hampshire County |
| Larry R. Werry | Retired Elementary School Principal | Fairview Elementary School Marion County |

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

04 BERKELEY COUNTY

Manual P. Arvon, II, Superintendent

214 WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Dean Warrenfeltz, Principal

Grades PK - 03

Enrollment 399 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

| Group | Number Enrolled for FAY | Number Enrolled on Test Week | Number Tested | Participation Rate | Percent Proficient | Met Part. Rate Standard | Met Assessment Standard | Met Subgroup Standard |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| Mathematics | | | | | | | | |
| All | 29 | 40 | 40 | 100.00 | 27.58 | Yes | Confidence Interval | ✓ |
| White | 20 | 26 | 26 | 100.00 | 35.00 | NA | NA | NA |
| Black | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Hispanic | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Asian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Indian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Multi-Racial | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Pacific Islander | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Spec. Ed. | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Low SES | 21 | 30 | 30 | 100.00 | 23.80 | NA | NA | NA |
| LEP | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Reading/Language Arts | | | | | | | | |
| All | 29 | 40 | 40 | 100.00 | 10.34 | Yes | No | ✗ |
| White | 20 | 26 | 26 | 100.00 | 10.00 | NA | NA | NA |
| Black | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Hispanic | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Asian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Indian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Multi-Racial | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Pacific Islander | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Spec. Ed. | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Low SES | 21 | 30 | 30 | 100.00 | 9.52 | NA | NA | NA |
| LEP | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 97.5%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY
Manual P. Arvon, II, Superintendent
214 WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Dean Warrenfeltz, Principal
Grades PK - 03
Enrollment 359 (2nd month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2010-2011

| Group | Number Enrolled for FAY | Number Enrolled on Test Week | Number Tested | Participation Rate | Percent Proficient | Met Part. Rate Standard | Met Assessment Standard | Met Subgroup Standard |
|------------------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------|
| Mathematics | | | | | | | | |
| All | 29 | 41 | 40 | 97.56 | 31.03 | Yes | Confidence Interval | ✓ |
| White | 19 | 25 | 24 | 96.00 | 42.10 | NA | NA | NA |
| Black | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Hispanic | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Asian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Indian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Multi-Racial | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Pacific Islander | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Spec. Ed. | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Low SES | 22 | 34 | 33 | 97.05 | 18.18 | NA | NA | NA |
| LEP | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Reading/Language Arts | | | | | | | | |
| All | 29 | 41 | 40 | 97.56 | 31.03 | Yes | Confidence Interval | ✓ |
| White | 19 | 25 | 24 | 96.00 | 36.84 | NA | NA | NA |
| Black | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Hispanic | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Asian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Indian | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Multi-Racial | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Pacific Islander | * | * | * | * | * | * | * | * |
| Spec. Ed. | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |
| Low SES | 22 | 34 | 33 | 97.05 | 22.72 | NA | NA | NA |
| LEP | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** | ** |

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.0%

WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

| Mathematics | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------|--------------------|-----------------|---------------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------------|
| Class | Tested Enr. | FAY Enr. | Tested | FAY Tested | Part. Rate | Novice | Below Mastery | Mastery | Above Mastery | Distinguished | Proficient |
| 03 | 41 | 29 | 40 | 29 | 97.56 | 24.14 | 44.83 | 10.34 | 20.69 | 0.00 | 31.03 |

| Reading | | | | | | | | | | | |
|----------------|--------------------|-----------------|---------------|-------------------|-------------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------------|
| Class | Tested Enr. | FAY Enr. | Tested | FAY Tested | Part. Rate | Novice | Below Mastery | Mastery | Above Mastery | Distinguished | Proficient |
| 03 | 41 | 29 | 40 | 29 | 97.56 | 58.62 | 10.34 | 20.69 | 6.90 | 3.45 | 31.03 |

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Achieved Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Winchester Avenue Elementary School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP). Winchester Avenue Elementary School does not meet the minimum number (N) in the tested grade levels. Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System* states for these schools “the AYP will be determined using the total aggregate population and averaging the WESTEST scores over a three year period.” The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address all subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 68.97 percent in mathematics and 68.96 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were reported by the principal.

1. WESTEST2 Data Review.
2. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
3. Guided Reading/Strategies/Differentiation.
4. Grading Practices Webinar – Grading for Success.
5. Everyday Math.
6. APL Classroom Management and Refresher for Administrators.
7. *Other People’s Children, Beyond the Golden Rule, and Culture and Learning* Book Studies.
8. Making Reading Stations Work in the Classroom.
9. West Virginia Mathematics Conference.
10. Critical Thinking Training.
11. Depth of Knowledge/Power Standards.
12. Classroom Techniques and Strategies for Behavior Disorders and Autism Classrooms.
13. Kindergarten Teachers Trained in Common Core.
14. Acuity.
15. Writing Instruction.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Winchester Avenue Elementary School had undertaken an initiative for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiative and activity included the following.

- 7.1.2. High expectations.** The school's staff held high expectations for all students. All students were kept on task through high quality instruction. All students observed were challenged with higher order thinking skills instruction.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Teachers stated that the textbook was the basis for the curriculum, and that this was required by the Berkeley County Central Office. Teachers must use their professional knowledge to determine the delivery of the content standards and objectives (CSOs) as to the needs of their students.

- 7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)**

One girls' rest room stall was visible from the hallway through a mirror. If the stall door was opened, a person could see the commode. The Team recommended that this issue be resolved to ensure student privacy.

Several floor tiles on the basement floor were cracked and had holes in them. The Team recommended that the school repair or replace the missing tiles to prevent tripping.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)**

The guidance counselor was meeting with students less than 50 percent of the time. The counselor had two duties, bus duty during the morning and afternoon, which was stated as a major reason for not spending 75 percent of the work day in a direct student counseling relationship.

7.6. Personnel

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team identified the licensure issue listed in the chart.

| Educator | Courses/Content Teaching | Certification/Status | Findings | Recommendations |
|----------|--------------------------|---|--------------------------------|--|
| Educator | 4115 ESL | Long Term Sub permit in English 5-AD Long Term Sub permit German PK-AD Long Term Sub Permit Math 5-AD | Does not have ESL endorsement. | Apply on Form 2 to add endorsement with correct fee. Does educator have coursework for ESL? |

7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)

One new teacher last year (2010-11) did not have a mentor and did not have a mentor this year (2011-12) either. All new teachers must be given a mentor to ensure a proper transition into the building and to assist in the proper curriculum delivery.

RECOMMENDATION

7.1.3. Learning environment. Teachers requested a way to lock the doors to their classrooms in the event of an emergency. The age of the building and the classroom doors made it impossible to secure the classrooms if needed. The Team recommended that the Berkeley County Central Office provide assistance through the county maintenance office for staff to have the capability to secure classrooms.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Winchester Avenue Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Berkeley County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Berkeley County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The curriculum in the classrooms must be based on a thorough analysis of the student needs as outlined by the content standards and objectives (CSOs). The CSOs, in conjunction with proper data analysis and the goals of the school, as outlined in the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan must be the combined guiding force behind all curriculum. The student achievement percentage increased from the 2009-2010 school year to the 2010-2011 school year. The principal and staff had implemented high quality instruction in all classes and the Team believed that the increase in achievement will continue.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Winchester Avenue Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The principal and staff of Winchester Avenue Elementary School possessed the capacity to correct the deficiencies found at the school.

The school is urged to continue assistance and support provided by the Berkeley County Central Office, RESA 8, and the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Improvement.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site did not have five usable acres, was not easily accessible and conveniently located, and was not large enough for future expansion. On-site solid surface parking for staff, visitors, and individuals with disabilities was not sufficient. The playgrounds/recreational areas were not well equipped and appropriate for the age level.
- 19.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** An adequate waiting/reception area was not available.
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** Easy access to student records was not available.
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, on-line periodical indexes, and copying equipment were not available.

- 19.1.7. K classrooms.** The Kindergarten classrooms did not have a sink or hot and cold water.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facilities did not have a ceramic kiln or black-out areas. The music facilities did not have music chairs with folding arms, music stands, a podium, or acoustical treatment. The physical education facility did not have a drinking fountain.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service area was not convenient to a service drive for deliveries and removal of wastes. The following were not available: Chalkboard, bulletin board, or locker/dressing room.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health service unit was not available. The school did not have curtained or small rooms with cots, a bulletin board, toilet, lavatory, scales, a medicine chest, refrigerator with locked storage, work counter, desk and chair, or a locked medication box.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

Education Performance Audit Summary

Winchester Avenue Elementary School's Education Performance Audit concentrated on the low student achievement. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school.

The Team identified five high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

- 7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.** (Teachers stated textbooks were the basis for instruction.)
- 7.1.3. Learning environment.** (Student privacy of one rest room was compromised and several floor tiles created tripping hazards.)
- 7.2.2. Counseling services.** (Other duties interfered with counseling services.)
- 7.6.2. Licensure.** (There was a licensure issue with one teacher.)
- 7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship.** (A new teacher lacked a mentor.)

The Team presented one commendation (7.1.2. High expectations), one recommendation (7.1.3. Learning environment), noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted early detection and intervention support.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audits and the revised strategic plan, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Winchester Avenue Elementary School and Berkeley County to correct the findings in the report by the next accreditation cycle.