



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

BERKELEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

AUGUST 2009

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Winchester Avenue Elementary School in Berkeley County was conducted on April 29, 2008.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Winchester Avenue Elementary School in Berkeley County was conducted May 1, 2009. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

04 BERKELEY COUNTY

Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent

214 WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Dean Warrenfeltz, Principal

Grades K - 03

Enrollment 275 (2nd month 2005-2006 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2005-2006

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	32	38	38	100.00	75.00	Yes	Yes	✓
White	23	27	27	100.00	78.26	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	21	27	27	100.00	71.42	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	32	38	38	100.00	78.12	Yes	Yes	✓
White	23	27	27	100.00	78.26	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	21	27	27	100.00	71.42	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 98.1%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY
Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent
214 WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed
Dean Warrenfeltz, Principal
Grades K - 03
Enrollment 382 (2nd month 2006-2007 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2006-2007

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	33	40	40	100.00	60.60	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	27	33	33	100.00	62.96	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	23	29	29	100.00	47.82	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	33	40	40	100.00	66.66	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	27	33	33	100.00	66.66	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	23	29	29	100.00	56.52	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.2%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY
Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent
214 WINCHESTER AVENUE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed
Dean Warrenfeltz, Principal
Grades K - 03
Enrollment 425 (2nd month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	24	35	35	100.00	87.50	Yes	Yes	✓
White	20	25	25	100.00	90.00	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	11	21	21	100.00	72.72	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	24	35	35	100.00	75.00	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	20	25	25	100.00	75.00	NA	NA	NA
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	11	21	21	100.00	54.54	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 95.0%

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Met Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Winchester Avenue Elementary School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students. None of the subgroups had a number (N) greater than 50.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 39.39 percent in mathematics and 33.33 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Counselor In-Service.
2. Emergency Plan/Discipline Plan.
3. Test Data Analysis.
4. Math in the Early Childhood.
5. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
6. Creative Curriculum.
7. Harcourt Trophies Reading Training.
8. Co-Teaching and Inclusion.
9. Effective Instructional Strategies.
10. Marzano Strategies.
11. Dealing with Disabilities in the Regular Education Classroom.
12. No More Interruptions (Guided Reading).
13. Ecers Module.
14. Cyber Mentoring.
15. Becoming Bilingual.
16. West Virginia Mathematics Academy.
17. C. C. Bates Literacy Stations.
18. West Virginia Center for Professional Development Evaluation Institute.
19. Response to Intervention (RTI).
20. Standards Based Mathematics Stations.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

MET STANDARD. Winchester Avenue Elementary School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS) subgroup in reading/language arts by application of the confidence interval. AYP was

achieved in mathematics with a percent proficient of 87.50 in 2008 as compared with 60.60 percent in 2007.

The principal reported the following professional developments and/or training opportunities were provided.

1. Book Study – *Reading for Meaning*.
2. Ruby Payne – *Children in Poverty*.
3. Training in Using Acuity.
4. Training in the SPIRE Program for use in RTI Tier 3.
5. Managing Reading Centers.
6. RTI Pilot School.
7. STAR Assessment Program.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)

Cleaning chemicals (located on the second floor and in the basement) were accessible to students. Ammonium chloride was in one coat room and was clearly marked “Keep out of reach of children – DANGER.” This compromised a safe learning environment.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All cleaning supplies had been moved into locked storage closets where students cannot get them. The principal had provided a safety checklist for the custodian to use to check the building each morning prior to students’ arrival to ensure no cleaning chemicals or other safety hazards existed. The staff had been instructed by the principal to check their areas for any materials that should not be there and report any such materials to the office.

- 7.1.9. Programs of study.** Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Grade 2 and Kindergarten classes did not have 60 minutes of mathematics daily. Mathematics was taught only 45 minutes in Grade 2. Mathematics was taught only 30 minutes Monday through Thursday and 55 minutes on Friday in Kindergarten.

One Grade 1 class did not have 90 minutes of reading on Thursdays. Furthermore, 90 minutes of uninterrupted reading did not occur in either Grade 1 class. An activity in the middle of the reading time interrupted the flow of reading instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team checked all classroom teachers' schedules and found the required time in reading and mathematics was being provided daily.

- 7.1.13. Instructional day.** Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Six of the eight general education classrooms did not have the required 315 daily instructional minutes. The Team calculated the instructional time from the schedules, which was approximately 300 minutes daily.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team checked schedules for all classroom teachers and verified that every classroom teacher was meeting the required instructional time.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.** An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

Five of the nine teachers interviewed could not discuss the educational components of the Five-Year Strategic Plan. It was evident that the plan did not guide school improvement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All members of the staff participated in the development of the school Five-Year Strategic Plan. The entire plan was reviewed in the beginning of the year staff meeting. Progress toward meeting the plan was discussed at several faculty meetings throughout the year. Teachers were randomly “quizzed” about the plan by the Team. When asked, they could verbally discuss the contents of the plan and what they were doing in their respective classrooms to meet the objectives of the plan.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

The guidance counselor stated that she met with students in excess of 75 percent of the time; however, no counseling log was maintained to verify this amount.

When the Team interviewed the counselor about the counseling program, the example given was counseling students in the counselor’s office. Examples of small group counseling or class counseling were not presented by the counselor or teachers. Teacher interviews were also vague about direct student counseling. In the absence of a log or specific examples of student counseling services and a lack of substantive staff interview information, the Team concluded that the 75 percent direct student counseling time was not occurring.

W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. School counselors in public schools (f) School counselors shall be full-time professional personnel, shall spend at least seventy-five percent of work time in a direct counseling relationship with pupils, and shall devote no more than one-fourth of the work day to administrative activities. Provided: That such activities are counseling related.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team was provided the counselor’s work logs which showed she spends at least 75 percent of her time in direct counseling relationship with students.

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.** Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Three teachers did not have lesson plans.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team checked lesson plans in each teacher's classroom. All lesson plans were complete and contained the basic areas of: the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs), Objective, Activities and/or Procedures for the day, Evaluation, and Homework. In addition to checking the lesson plans in classrooms, the principal collected, checked, and commented on lesson plans each month.

7.6. Personnel

- 7.6.3. Evaluation.** The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

One teacher did not have the first observation by November 1, 2007 and a later observation had not been signed by the teacher.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed personnel evaluations and found them to meet the requirements of the West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and the Berkeley County Board of Education evaluation policy.

7.8. Leadership

- 7.8.1. Leadership.** Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

Due to the number of deficiencies found at Winchester Avenue Elementary School, the Team determined that technical assistance needed to be provided by the central office administration, the West Virginia Department of Education, and RESA VIII to assist the building administrator in the school's operation.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. A Coordinator for Berkeley County Schools has met with the principal throughout the year to review the operations of the school and offer suggestions and advice on ways to improve the operations. The assistant superintendent, Director of Title I, members of the Department of Instruction, and the Human Resources Director have all provided assistance to the principal. The principal reported that all this assistance was valuable to him in resolving the deficiencies.

RECOMMENDATION

7.1.3. Learning environment. Teachers stated that they did not feel safe in the building due to the inability to secure the facilities. The building doors, both inside and outside, could not be locked in an emergency. The Team recommended that the school and county investigate means of securing the building.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION PARTIALLY FOLLOWED. The outside doors have been secured. The second set of doors on the front of the building had been replaced and a new “buzz in” system had been installed. Classroom doors had old, unusable locks and a request to replace them had been sent to maintenance.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Winchester Avenue Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Berkeley County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Berkeley County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Mathematics and reading instruction that were not being taught the required amount of time could show a direct correlation with the declining WESTEST scores. The administration must ensure that the programs of study are followed and the instructional time meets or exceeds the requirements.

The school's Five-Year Strategic Plan must be a guiding force for the school's curriculum. The plan met the needs of the school; however, the administration must provide staff development and teachers' ownership of the plan and ensure that all teachers use the plan to address student needs.

When asked why the WESTEST scores had dramatically declined from the 2005-2006 school year to the 2006-2007 school year, a majority of the staff indicated that it was due to the high student transient rate. Data provided by the school indicated that 80 students had moved into the school and 97 students had moved out of the school from the spring 2006 testing to the spring 2008 testing.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

The school schedules had been adjusted to ensure the required time for instruction in mathematics and reading was being provided. The length of the instructional day had been extended to ensure all students were receiving at least 315 instructional minutes each day. Staff members had been involved in reviewing the school Five-Year Strategic Plan and were knowledgeable of the educational components of the plan and were using the plan to guide classroom instruction. Student scores on the WESTEST

continued to fluctuate, and the student Mobility Rate through March 2009 was approximately 46 percent.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Winchester Avenue Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building needed to be developed for educators at the school in implementing the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan to improve student and school achievement. The plan was well-developed; however, it was not evident that the plan had been communicated to staff or that staff was involved in developing the plan.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

The principal has held training sessions and faculty meetings to ensure the faculty is knowledgeable of the educational components of the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan. The plan is being used by teachers to guide their lesson planning.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The site was not five acres plus one acre for each 100 students over 240, was not easily accessible and conveniently located, was not large enough for future expansion, and not removed from undesirable noise and traffic. The site was not suitable for special instructional needs, e.g., outdoor learning. Sufficient on-site, solid surface parking for staff, visitors, and individuals with limited mobility was not available. The playgrounds/recreational areas were not well equipped and appropriate for the age level.
- 19.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** The administrative office area did not include an adequate reception/waiting area.

- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** The counselor did not have easy access to student records.
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** The Library/Resource/Media Center did not have appropriate space, newspapers, pamphlets, and recordings.
- 19.1.7. K classrooms.** The Kindergarten classroom did not have a sink and hot and cold water.
- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** Storage was not adequate in all classrooms.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service area was not convenient to a service drive for deliveries and waste removal. Seating was insufficient for dining and study purposes. A teachers' dining area of adequate size was not provided. Food and non-food storage was not adequate. A locker/dressing room was not provided.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health service unit was not available. The following were not available: Curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board, toilet, lavatory, scales, medicine chest, refrigerator with locked storage, first aid kit, work counter, desk and chair, and locked medication box.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

No change.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the dramatic decline in achievement levels of students in all subgroups, Winchester Avenue Elementary School and Berkeley County must implement high yield instructional practices that will improve students' achievement. Berkeley County must actively pursue assistance from RESA VIII, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY

Assistance from Berkeley County Schools, RESA VIII, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development has been requested and received. These agencies provided the following assistance.

- 1. Training in the Response to Intervention (RTI) Program.**
- 2. Training on effective reading instruction.**
- 3. Guided Reading Management.**
- 4. APL instructional strategies.**
- 5. Acuity training and use in the classroom.**
- 6. Standards Based Instruction.**
- 7. Early Childhood Training.**
- 8. 21st Century Learning Strategies.**

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
04-214 Winchester Avenue Elementary	Full Accreditation			

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Accreditation status of Winchester Avenue Elementary School.