



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FOLLOW-UP EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL

BERKELEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

FEBRUARY 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Musselman High School in Berkeley County was conducted October 14, 2010.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Musselman High School was conducted October 31, 2011. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

04 BERKELEY COUNTY

Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent

503 MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL – Passed

Ron Stephens, Principal

Grades 09 - 12

Enrollment 1,498 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	308	319	307	96.23	58.38	Yes	Yes	✓
White	276	284	274	96.47	59.17	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	14	17	16	94.11	50.00	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	14	14	13	92.85	46.15	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	39	40	36	90.00	28.57	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	77	83	79	95.18	41.89	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	308	319	306	95.92	54.20	Yes	Yes	✓
White	276	284	274	96.47	53.93	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	14	17	15	88.23	38.46	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	14	14	13	92.85	69.23	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	39	40	36	90.00	20.00	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	77	83	79	95.18	40.54	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Graduation Rate = 83.9%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY
Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent
503 MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL – Passed

Ron Stephens, Principal
Grades 09 - 12
Enrollment 1,565 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	338	350	338	96.57	30.79	Yes	Yes	✓
White	300	309	298	96.44	31.95	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	25	27	26	96.29	16.66	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	41	43	41	95.34	15.38	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	97	104	99	95.19	21.50	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	338	350	338	96.57	27.05	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	300	309	298	96.44	27.05	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	25	27	26	96.29	29.16	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	41	43	40	93.02	7.69	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	97	104	98	94.23	21.50	No	Confidence Interval	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Graduation Rate = 84.8%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY
Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent
503 MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL – Needs Improvement
Ron Stephens, Principal
Grades 09 - 12
Enrollment 1,557 (2nd month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2010-2011

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	315	324	315	97.22	42.25	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	271	279	270	96.77	42.10	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	23	23	23	100.00	34.78	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	18	18	18	100.00	55.55	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	42	44	40	90.90	10.52	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	105	110	105	95.45	29.41	Yes	No	✗
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	315	324	312	96.29	34.64	Yes	No	✗
White	271	279	267	95.69	35.49	Yes	No	✗
Black	23	23	23	100.00	17.39	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	18	18	18	100.00	44.44	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	42	44	40	90.90	5.26	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	105	110	105	95.45	21.78	Yes	No	✗
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Needs to Improve
Graduation Rate = 84.2%

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Met Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Musselman High School achieved adequately yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in reading/language arts and in the SES subgroup in mathematics only by application of the confidence interval. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 11 – 69.21 percent in mathematics and 72.95 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following charts show the actual number of students proficient and not proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics		
	Students Proficient	Students Not Proficient
All Students	104	234
White Students	96	204
Black Students	4	21
Special Education	6	35
SES	21	79

Reading/Language Arts		
	Students Proficient	Students Not Proficient
All Students	91	247
White Students	81	219
Black Students	7	18
Special Education	3	38
SES	21	76

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW 5.1.1. Achievement

ACHIEVED STANDARD. The WESTEST2 scores improved at Musselman High School for the 2010-2011 school year.

Mathematics percent proficient increased significantly for all subgroups except the special education (SE) subgroup. Although not large enough to constitute a subgroup for accountability, the racial/ethnicity black (B) students showed the greatest gain from 16.66 percent proficient in 2009-2010 to 34.78 percent proficient in 2010-2011. The SE subgroup declined from 15.38 percent proficient to 10.52 percent proficient in 2010-2011.

Reading/language arts results showed improvement in all subgroups except the racial/ethnicity black (B) and special education (SE) subgroups. The B subgroup declined measurably from 29.16 percent proficient in 2009-2010 to 17.39 percent proficient in 2010-2011. The special education (SE) subgroup declined from 7.69 percent to 5.26 percent. The economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup showed a marginal increase in student percent proficient (21.50 percent to 21.78 percent).

Below Standard.

5.1.2. Participation rate.

The economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup did not meet the participation rate standard in reading/language arts. The county and school are urged to vigorously address this issue.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Essential Curriculum and Revised Curriculum Maps.
2. West Virginia 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) Workshop for National Board Certified Teachers.
3. Acuity.
4. Leadership and Learning Workshop.
5. Renaissance for Education.
6. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
7. Test Analysis.
8. West Virginia Statewide Technology Conference.
9. Watershed Dynamics.
10. APL Strategies.
11. Sparks Write-A-Lab Workshop.
12. West Virginia Writes.
13. PLC I: Implementing Professional Learning Communities.
14. PLC II: Maintaining a Professional Learning Community.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW 5.1.2. Participation rate

ACHIEVED STANDARD. Musselman High School met the participation rate in all subgroups.

West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education-Performance Based Accreditation System* in Section §126-13-6 provides:

6.1. A system of points on an index will be used to assess and weigh annual performance measures for state accreditation of schools and approval of school systems that gives credit or points on an index to prevent any one measure alone from causing a school to achieve less than full accreditation status or a school system from achieving less than full approval status: Provided, That a school or school system that achieves AYP is eligible for no less than full accreditation or full approval status, as applicable, and the system established pursuant to this subsection shall only apply to schools and school systems that do not achieve AYP.

The index showed that Musselman High School performed within the point range (755.60 – 553.03) for distinction accreditation status.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Students returning from the James Rumsey Career Technical Center returned 10 to 15 minutes late to classes resulting in these students not receiving the 8100 required minutes. Policy 2510 provides an exception for students attending career/technical centers; however, the Team observed one teacher delaying instruction for all students until the Rumsey students entered the class.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. Students continued to return from the James Rumsey Career Technical Center approximately 12 minutes after class had begun. By the time that all students had gone to their locker and arrived in class, upwards of 15 minutes instruction for that particular class had been lost, resulting in the students not receiving the required 8100 minutes for the class. The principal had instructed the classroom teachers to begin instruction on time so the remaining students' instructional time did not suffer.

7.2. Student and School Performance

7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

A majority of the teachers' lesson plans were incomplete and could not be followed by a substitute teacher. The administrators would have difficulty in seeing a relation between the lessons and the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) being taught on a daily basis.

Special education co-teachers used the lesson plans of the general educator; however, they did not provide written accommodations for the special education students. The special education subgroup percent proficient showed the necessity of intense instruction and accommodation.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Teacher lesson plans were complete and thorough. The principal was advised that teachers keeping different classes of the same content on the same pace without written support of modification was not permitted.

7.6. Personnel

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team identified 16 certification deficiencies at Musselman High School. The principal and the Berkeley County Director of Personnel must contact the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Professional Preparation to correct these issues.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All teacher certification issues had been corrected.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Musselman High School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Berkeley County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Berkeley County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The staff at Musselman High School had taken a proactive approach to the low achievement test scores and had implemented high quality staff development to correct the problem. All staff were knowledgeable of the student data and the needs of whole classes and of individual students. Time-on-task and high quality instruction were evident buildingwide and the Team believed that scores will rise if the initiatives in place are consistently applied.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

Musselman High School had a new principal to begin the 2011-2012 school year. The principal was aware of the needs of the school and had implemented high quality staff development to assist the teachers. The issues of students returning from the James Rumsey Career Technical Center was out of the control of the principal; however, the central office staff indicated they were seeking remedies for this situation.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Musselman High School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team believed that the school has the capacity to increase student achievement. The principal must continue to take an active role in ensuring that high quality instruction continues and that all curriculum decisions are based on what the students need as defined by data.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

The new principal was organized and knowledgeable of the students' curricular needs. While Musselman High School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in several subgroups, the percent proficient of student achievement increased in most of the individual cells. Musselman High School and Berkeley County are urged to continue to investigate and apply methods and programs to increase student achievement. Specific subgroups needing concentrated attention are identified in the narrative of Annual Performance Measure 5.1.1. Achievement.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.6. Grades 9 through 12 computer laboratory.** Adequate work stations (20) were not provided and the student to computer ratio was not 3 to 1 schoolwide.
- 19.1.11. Grades 6-12 science facilities.** All science facilities did not have a sink, hot and cold water, gas, ventilation fume hood, demo table, sufficient laboratory workspace, fire extinguisher, blanket, and emergency showers.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

19.1.6. Approximately 150 student computers had been added to the school. While not yet to the 2 to 1 ratio, the ratio was greatly improved.

19.1.11. New science facilities had been added to the school and all materials and equipment were now available.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The high quality staff development implemented must be continued and implemented in all appropriate classrooms. Student data must be a driving force behind the curricular decisions made at the school.

FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY

The principal and teachers were using data to make curricular decisions. The principal was the curriculum leader of the school and had written verification of numerous staff development sessions to show that student data were being used and that the teachers had assistance needed to provide a high quality education. It will be necessary for the principal and teachers to examine the subgroups that declined in achievement.

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
04-503 Musselman High	Temporary Accreditation	7.1.13		September 1, 2012

Education Performance Audit Summary

One finding (7.1.13. Instructional day) from the original Education Performance Audit continued as an issue at the school.

Pursuant to W.Va. Code §18-2E-5, the Office of Education Performance Audits (OEPA) recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education issue Musselman High School Temporary Accreditation status with a September 1, 2012 Date Certain to correct the remaining finding. If the noncompliance is not corrected by the Date Certain, the school will be recommended for Low Performing status and the ensuing consequences in W. Va. Code §18-2E-5. (n) (6).

The OEPA will conduct another follow-up review after September 1, 2012 to determine that improvement efforts have been sustained and the remaining standard (7.1.13) has been corrected.