



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL

BERKELEY COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

DECEMBER 2010

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	4
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	9
Education Performance Audit.....	11
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	11
High Quality Standards	12
Indicators of Efficiency	13
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	14
Identification of Resource Needs	14
Early Detection and Intervention	15
Education Performance Audit Summary	16

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Musselman High School in Berkeley County was conducted October 14, 2010. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the declining student achievement.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader and Technology – Sterling Beane, Jr., Coordinator, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Shari D. Bouis	High School Principal	University High School Monongalia County
Candy K. Canan	High School Principal	Hampshire Senior High School Hampshire County
Tammy W. Gilbert	High School Teacher	Moorefield High School Hardy County
Kimberly J. Greene	High School Assistant Principal	University High School Monongalia County
David R. Mazza	Middle School Assistant Principal	Bridgeport Middle School Harrison County
Steve F. Rodriguez	Middle School Principal	Fairview Middle School Marion County
Toni A. Shute	High School Principal	Brooke High School Brooke County

Name	Title	School/County
Timothy M. Sites	High School Assistant Principal	Jefferson High School Jefferson County
Joe A. Starcher	Director	Brooke County
Thomas N. Wood	General Supervisor	Marshall County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

04 BERKELEY COUNTY

Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent

503 MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL – Passed

Ron Stephens, Principal

Grades 09 - 12

Enrollment 1,498 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	308	319	307	96.23	58.38	Yes	Yes	✓
White	276	284	274	96.47	59.17	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	14	17	16	94.11	50.00	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	14	14	13	92.85	46.15	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	39	40	36	90.00	28.57	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	77	83	79	95.18	41.89	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Reading/Language Arts								
All	308	319	306	95.92	54.20	Yes	Yes	✓
White	276	284	274	96.47	53.93	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	14	17	15	88.23	38.46	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	14	14	13	92.85	69.23	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	39	40	36	90.00	20.00	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	77	83	79	95.18	40.54	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Graduation Rate = 83.9%

04 BERKELEY COUNTY

Manuel P. Arvon, II, Superintendent

503 MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL – Passed

Ron Stephens, Principal

Grades 09 - 12

Enrollment 1,565 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	338	350	338	96.57	30.79	Yes	Yes	✓
White	300	309	298	96.44	31.95	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	25	27	26	96.29	16.66	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	41	43	41	95.34	15.38	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	97	104	99	95.19	21.50	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	338	350	338	96.57	27.05	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	300	309	298	96.44	27.05	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	25	27	26	96.29	29.16	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	41	43	40	93.02	7.69	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	97	104	98	94.23	21.50	No	Confidence Interval	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Graduation Rate = 84.8%

MUSSELMAN HIGH SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
11	350	338	338	328	96.57	48.78	20.43	19.21	9.45	2.13	30.79

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
11	350	338	338	329	96.57	32.83	40.12	14.89	10.03	2.13	27.05

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

**NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP), HONORS, AND
COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED
2010-2011**

High School	Number of AP Courses Offered	Number of Honors Courses Offered	Number of College Credit Courses Offered
Musselman High	9	13	2

Advance Placement Courses: AP English Language and Composition; AP English Literature and Composition; AP Calculus; AP Statistics; AP Biology; AP Chemistry; AP Psychology; AP US Government and Politics; and AP US History.

Honors Courses: Geometry; Algebra II; English 9; English 10; English 11; English 12; World History; US History I; US History II; Civics; Science 9; Biology; and Chemistry.

Dual Credit: English 101 and English 102.

ADVANCED PLACEMENT TEST (APT) (COLLEGE BOARD)

Musselman High	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09
10 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%)	3.1%	8.3%	2.7%	4.3%	11.1%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%)	3.7%	8.3%	5.7%	9.6%	8.0%
10 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	NA	NA	NA	NA	NA
11 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	63.6%	23.1%	100%	37.5%	51.3%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	77.8%	50%	51.9%	39.3%	10.3%

Source: (AP Test Takers) West Virginia 2008-2009 NCLB Report Card.

Source: Scores of 3 or higher: Provided by School.

The Grade 11 Advanced Placement (AP) test takers increased significantly from 3.1 percent in 2004-2005 to 11.1 percent in 2008-2009 and the percent of Grade 12 test takers increased from 3.7 percent in 2004-2005 to 8.0 percent in 2008-2009.

Grade 11 AP test takers scoring 3 or higher decreased from 63.6 percent in 2004-2005 to 51.3 percent in 2007-2008.

Grade 12 AP test takers scoring 3 or higher decreased from 77.8 percent in 2004-2005 to 10.3 percent in 2008-2009. The county and school are urged to study the decrease in performance on the AP examination for Grade 12 students and make necessary adjustments for students to score higher on the examination to receive college credit for the course(s).

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2007		
	Number of High School Graduates 2006-07	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	17,914	57.5%
Berkeley County	910	55.1%
Musselman High	298	53.7%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2007, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Musselman High School's overall college going rate percentage (53.7 percent) was lower than the Estimated College Going Rate for West Virginia (57.5 percent) and Berkeley County (55.1 percent). The school should investigate means to improve the college going rate.

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2009					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	8,311	1,291	15.53%	2,020	24.31%
Berkeley County	462	63	13.64%	63	13.64%
Musselman High	143	16	11.19%	19	13.29%

Source: First-Time Freshmen, Previous Year WV High School Graduates in Developmental Courses by Type of Course Fall 2009 (census).

Musselman High School's percent of students enrolled in developmental English at 11.19 percent was lower than Berkeley County (13.64 percent) and the State (15.53 percent). The percent of students in developmental mathematics (13.29 percent) was substantially lower than West Virginia (24.31 percent) and slightly lower than Berkeley County (13.64 percent). The Team commended the school for the lower percentage of students having to take developmental courses.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Met Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Musselman High School achieved adequately yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in reading/language arts and in the SES subgroup in mathematics only by application of the confidence interval. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 11 – 69.21 percent in mathematics and 72.95 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following charts show the actual number of students proficient and not proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics		
	Students Proficient	Students Not Proficient
All	104	234
White	96	204
Black	4	21
Special Education	6	35
SES	21	79

Reading/Language Arts		
	Students Proficient	Students Not Proficient
All	91	247
White	81	219
Black	7	18
Special Education	3	38
SES	21	76

Below Standard.

5.1.2. Participation rate.

The economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup did not meet the participation rate standard in reading/language arts. The county and school are urged to vigorously address this issue.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Essential Curriculum and Revised Curriculum Maps.
2. West Virginia 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) Workshop for National Board Certified Teachers.
3. Acuity.
4. Leadership and Learning Workshop.
5. Renaissance for Education.
6. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
7. Test Analysis.
8. West Virginia Statewide Technology Conference.
9. Watershed Dynamics.
10. APL Strategies.
11. Sparks Write-A-Lab Workshop.
12. West Virginia Writes.
13. PLC I: Implementing Professional Learning Communities.
14. PLC II: Maintaining a Professional Learning Community.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Musselman High School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

- 7.1.3. **Learning environment.** The atmosphere of the school was positive and all staff and students reported that the school had “a great school environment”. Students stated that they felt safe and that discipline was fair and equal. The facility was well-maintained and attractive.
- 7.1.4. **Instruction.** The Team commended the principal for instituting various activities that directly addressed the lower WESTEST2 scores. The proactive approach of the entire administrative team was indicative of the entire staff’s dedication to the advancement of student achievement.
- 7.1.12. **Multicultural activities.** The Team commended the school’s approach to developing and implementing the Multicultural Plan. A former student and current teacher at Musselman High School noted a disconnect between African American students and white students as a multicultural issue. This teacher participated in writing the school’s Multicultural Plan to address this area. The staff recognized the importance of multicultural activities and their role in the success of the plan. The plan was put in place and students and staff reported that it was successful in bridging the two groups. A staff book study on multicultural and diversity issues is planned and multicultural activities are an ongoing part of the school’s curriculum.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)**

Students returning from the James Rumsey Career Technical Center returned 10 to 15 minutes late to classes resulting in these students not receiving the 8100 required minutes. Policy 2510 provides an exception for students attending career/technical centers; however, the Team observed one teacher delaying instruction for all students until the Rumsey students entered the class.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

A majority of the teachers' lesson plans were incomplete and could not be followed by a substitute teacher. The administrators would have difficulty in seeing a relation between the lessons and the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) being taught on a daily basis.

Special education co-teachers used the lesson plans of the general educator; however, they did not provide written accommodations for the special education students. The special education subgroup percent proficient showed the necessity of intense instruction and accommodation.

7.6. Personnel

- 7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)**

The Team identified 16 certification deficiencies at Musselman High School. The principal and the Berkeley County Director of Personnel must contact the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Professional Preparation to correct these issues.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Musselman High School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Berkeley County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Berkeley County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The staff at Musselman High School had taken a proactive approach to the low achievement test scores and had implemented high quality staff development to correct the problem. All staff were knowledgeable of the student data and the needs of whole classes and of individual students. Time-on-task and high quality instruction were evident buildingwide and the Team believed that scores will rise if the initiatives in place are consistently applied.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Musselman High School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team believed that the school has the capacity to increase student achievement. The principal must continue to take an active role in ensuring that high quality instruction continues and that all curriculum decisions are based on what the students need as defined by data.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive

Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 *and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.6. Grades 9 through 12 computer laboratory.** Adequate work stations (20) were not provided and the student to computer ratio was not 3 to 1 schoolwide.
- 19.1.11. Grades 6-12 science facilities.** All science facilities did not have a sink, hot and cold water, gas, ventilation fume hood, demo table, sufficient laboratory workspace, fire extinguisher, blanket, and emergency showers.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The high quality staff development implemented must be continued and implemented in all appropriate classrooms. Student data must be a driving force behind the curricular decisions made at the school.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified three high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

They include the following:

- 7.1.13. Instructional day.
- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.
- 7.6.2. Licensure.

The Team presented three commendations (7.1.3. Learning environment, 7.1.4. Instruction, and 7.1.12. Multicultural activities), noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Musselman High School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Musselman High School in improvement efforts.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Musselman High School and Berkeley County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.