



**Office of Education  
Performance Audits**

**EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT  
FOR  
BOONE CAREER-TECHNICAL CENTER**

**BOONE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**JULY 2014**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

# Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Team.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>School Performance .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Commendation .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>High Quality Standards.....</b>	<b>8</b>
<b>Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Identification Of Resource Needs .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Early Detection And Intervention.....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Summary.....</b>	<b>15</b>

## **INTRODUCTION**

An announced Education Performance Audit of Boone Career-Technical Center in Boone County was conducted on May 14, 2014. The purpose of the review was to assess the vocational center's compliance and progress with the high quality standards mandated by West Virginia Code §18-2E-5.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed vocational center personnel, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

## **EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM**

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chairs – Allen Brock and Dr. Michelle Samples, Coordinators

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Career and Technical Instruction – Kathy Gillman, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Career and Technical Accountability and Support – Dr. Sherri Nash, Executive Director

West Virginia Department of Education Team, Office of Career and Technical Instruction – Cynthia Sundstrom, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Instructional Technology – Mark Moore, Coordinator

## SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

### 06-701 BOONE CAREER-TECHNICAL CENTER

Jeffrey Nelson, Principal

#### ACT WorkKeys Assessment

ACT WorkKeys is a job skills assessment system that helps employers select, hire, train, develop, and retain a high-performance workforce. This series of tests measures foundational and soft skills and offers specialized assessments to target institutional needs.

Successful completion of ACT WorkKeys assessments in Applied Mathematics, Locating Information, and Reading for Information can lead to earning ACT's National Career Readiness Certificate (NCRC). In West Virginia, recipients are awarded certificates of Platinum, Gold, Silver, or Bronze depending on their skill levels in Applied Mathematics, Reading for Information, and Locating Information. The certificate can complement diplomas, degrees, and resumes, and it gives job seekers an advantage in the interview process.

#### Performance Data 2010-2013

Year	Number of Completers	WorkKeys Reading		WorkKeys Math		WorkKeys Locating Info		Performance Test	
		Required Level	BCTC Level	Required Level	BCTC Level	Required Level	BCTC Level	Required Level	BCTC Level
2010 - 2011	91	72%	84%	69%	65%	66%	66%	78%	47%
2011 - 2012	94	72%	90%	69%	76%	66%	76%	78%	100%
2012 - 2013	98	72%	89%	69%	78%	66%	80%	78%	97%

Source: Information provided by the center.

The chart, Performance Data 2010-2013, shows the number of completers at Boone Career-Technical Center increased steadily during a three-year period. Between 2010-2011 and 2011-2012, the number of completers increased by three and between 2011-2012 and 2012-2013, this number increased by four. Overall, the school increased the number of completers since 2010-2011 by seven.

**Reading.** Reading scores on the ACT WorkKeys for students at Boone-Career Technical Center fluctuated during the past three years, but increased five percent since 2010-2011. Each of the three years student scores were well above the required level (72 percent) by the following margins: 2010-2011 (12 percent); 2011-2012 (18 percent); and 2012-2013 (17 percent).

**Math.** Math scores on the ACT WorkKeys for students at Boone Career-Technical Center increased 13 percent over a three-year period. The most significant increase in scores (11 percent) was experienced between 2010-2011 and 2011-2012. A slight increase (2 percent) was seen between 2011-2012 and 2012-2013. While student scores were 4 percent below the required level (69 percent) in 2010-2011, scores for the most recent two years exceeded the required level by the following margins: 2011-2012 (7 percent); and 2012-2013 (9 percent).

**Locating Information.** Locating Information scores on the ACT WorkKeys for students at Boone-Career Technical Center increased 14 percent from 2010-2011 to 2012-2013. The largest gains for Locating Information (10 percent) were seen between 2010-2011 and 2011-2012. A four-percent improvement in student scores was seen from 2011-2012 to 2012-2013. Student scores matched the required level (66 percent) in 2010-2011 and exceeded the required level in 2011-2012 (10 percent) and 2012-2013 (14 percent).

**Performance Test.** Student scores (47 percent) on the State Performance Test in 2010-2011 were 31 percent below the required level (78 percent). A significant increase (53 percent) was seen in 2011-2012, with only a slight decrease (3 percent) in 2012-2013. For 2011-2012 and 2012-2013, student scores were 22 percent and 19 percent above the required level (78 percent), respectively.

### Job Placement 2010-2013

Year	Positive Placement		Jobs in Field		Continuing Ed. In Field	
	Required Level	BCTC Level	Required Level	BCTC Level	Required Level	BCTC Level
2010-2011	90%	93%	60%	53%	60%	86%
2011-2012	90%	87%	60%	51%	60%	86%
2012-2013	90%	89%	60%	63%	60%	86%

Source: Information provided by the center.

**Positive Placement.** Positive placement for students completing programs at Boone Career-Technical Center was above the required level (90 percent) in 2010-2011 by three percent; however, this percentage was less than the required level each of the following two years: 2011-2012 (3 percent) and 2012-2013 (1 percent). Although positive placement fell 6 percent from 2010-2011 to 2011-2012, there was a slight increase (2 percent) in 2012-2013.

**Jobs in Field.** The statistics for jobs in field revealed lower rates than the required level (60 percent) in 2010-2011 (7 percent) and 2011-2012 (9 percent). This percentage (63 percent) increased three percent above the required level in 2012-2013. Although a slight decrease in the percentage of students finding jobs in field (2 percent) was experienced between 2010-2011 and 2011-2012, an increase of 12 percent was seen between 2011-2012 and 2012-2013, making for an increase of 10 percent over the three-year period.

**Continuing Education in Field.** Statistics for continuing education in field were consistent for Boone Career-Technical Center from 2010-2011 to 2012-2013. The percentage of students (86 percent) from Boone Career-Technical Center who continued their education in field was significantly above the required level of 60 percent each of the three years by 26 percent.

## **PERFORMANCE DATA AND JOB PLACEMENT - ANALYSIS**

Analysis of the data for Boone Career-Technical Center showed students typically demonstrated higher scores in the Reading component of the ACT WorkKeys compared to Math; however, Math scores steadily increased since 2010-2011. The center had addressed this issue by including the following goal in its strategic plan: “To increase student ability in the area of mathematics.” Also, as an action step within the strategic plan, teachers were asked to develop at least one goal for the Online Educator Evaluation System that involved Reading or Math.

With regard to positive placement, statistics for students at Boone Career-Technical Center were above the required level (90 percent) two of the three years. Continuing education in field statistics for students at Boone Career-Technical Center were well above the required level (60 percent) each of the three years. There was concern regarding jobs in field, as this was significantly lower than the required level of 60 percent by as much as nine percent in 2011-2012. Although a significant increase was seen the following year and this data was affected somewhat by the positive placement statistics, the jobs in field data indicated the center needed to work closely with its advisory council in monitoring the local and State job markets, and counselors needed to work closely with students in identifying employment opportunities.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were attended by staff during the 2013-2014 school year as reported by the principal.

1. Opening School/Operational Handbook Meeting.
2. Employee Evaluation System.
3. Strategic Plan.
4. Marketing Career and Technical Education (CTE) with Parent Visitation.
5. Parent-Teacher Evening 1.
6. Advisory Council Meeting.
7. Marketing CTE/Makeup Session with Photos.
8. Evaluation System, Data.
9. Lesson Plan Development.
10. Benchmark Lesson Plan Guide, Session 2.
11. New Data: What is Our Response?
12. High Expectations.
13. Embedding Math and English in CTE.
14. Rubrics for Math and Writing.
15. CTE Teacher Handbook Review and Updates.

Prior to the Education Performance Audit, the OEPA staff provided an in-service to Boone Career-Technical Center staff on April 15, 2014, to review the indicators in Policy 2320 and prepare staff for the audit.

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### COMMENDATION

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Boone Career-Technical Center had undertaken positive school improvement initiatives. The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

**7.1.2. High expectations.** The Team determined the principal and staff at Boone Career-Technical Center exhibited high expectations through the variety of research-based professional development in which they participated. The center was utilizing the KALPA Learning Systems Professional Development Management System which allowed for personalized professional development for staff members. CorporateTraining`Materials.com and Education to Go were additional online resources being used by staff to strengthen classroom instruction.

Further evidence of the high expectations established by the principal and staff at the center was the creation of the Operational Handbook for Career and Technical Education Teachers. Although initially intended for beginning teachers, the handbook was a comprehensive resource for all teachers, including such topics as understanding the characteristics of effective teaching, implementing classroom management skills, knowing the moral and legal responsibilities of teachers, collaborating with colleagues, and using technology as an educational tool. The information contained in the handbook and the tools provided in the appendices for lesson planning, were of exceptional quality.

The extra efforts the center made in recruiting students also spoke to a culture of high expectations. Professional grade marketing materials (brochures, flyers, and website) were developed to provide information about the centers programs. Additionally, sophomores from each of the three area high schools were scheduled to visit the center during December and January with current students providing demonstrations in classes. Similar visits were also scheduled for elementary and middle school students. The center also planned a summer "Skill Skool" Academy for middle school students. The academy was initially planned for 40 students; however, approximately 200 students applied for the program. As the principal reported, it was very evident the center was working diligently to remove the stigma that career and technical education was "a second class education".

The Team also determined the center's efforts to ensure a quality education for all students was commendable. Twenty-five percent of the center's student body was comprised of students with disabilities compared to a countywide rate of 18.25 percent. To ensure that all students had access to appropriate reading materials, e.g., textbooks, the center had invested in individual licenses for students through Learning Ally, which provided audiobooks. The center also provided each senior student with at least one tuition free credential examination.



## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

**Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.**

#### 7.1. CURRICULUM.

**7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities. The technical and adult programs in the school are aligned with first local, and then state, then national job market opportunities. (Policy 2510)**

As revealed through the administrative interview, one advisory council meeting had been held at Boone Career-Technical Center for the 2013-2014 school year. Minutes from the meeting indicated it had been primarily an informational session with little programmatic input from the council based upon labor market data. Following guidelines established by the Carl D. Perkins Career and Technical Education Act, the Team recommended the center hold two council meetings during the school year and develop meetings which provide for examination of job market data and greater input from council members regarding this data and programs being offered.

#### 7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

**7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)**

The school currently had two part-time counselors, totaling .9 of a counseling position. One counselor provided documentation that revealed 58 percent of the work day was spent in a direct counseling relationship with students. This did not meet the requirement of Policy 2315, *Comprehensive Developmental Guidance and Counseling*, which requires, "School counselors spend at least 75% of their time in a direct counseling relationship with pupils." The second counselor provided documentation verifying 75 percent of the work day was spent in a direct counseling relationship with students.

## **7.6. PERSONNEL.**

**7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)**

The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Professional Preparation, reviewed professional educators' licensure. The results involved eight different teachers. The following issues were identified:

Two teachers were assigned a course code which could not be located in the West Virginia Education Information System Course Code Manual.

One teacher did not hold the appropriate endorsement for one course code assigned to him/her in the master schedule and was on permit for another.

Two teachers did not hold the appropriate endorsement for Specific Learning Disabilities.

Two teachers were assigned invalid course codes in the master schedule.

One teacher was on permit.

**7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)**

A review of the electronic status report available through the Online Educator Evaluation System revealed two teachers were in the Initial Progression and one teacher in the Intermediate Progression at Boone Career-Technical Center. Each of these teachers lacked the final observation required for their given progression. As provided in Policy 5310, *Performance Evaluation of School Personnel*, administrators are required to complete all observations by May 1 of the school year.

## RECOMMENDATION

**7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Although evidence of writing assignments was found in teacher lesson plans, the Team determined from the administrator and teacher interviews that some teachers were uncomfortable in grading and providing feedback on written assignments with regard to mechanics and punctuation. The Team recommended the staff explore professional development opportunities with regard to effectively scoring and providing feedback on student writing and implement a schoolwide process for doing so.

## INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Boone Career-Technical Center in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Boone County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Boone County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.**

It was evident that the principal explored a variety of options in providing professional development opportunities for staff at Boone Career-Technical Center. However, the Team determined a more formalized process needed to be implemented, such as a needs assessment, to allow for greater staff input regarding professional development offerings. The Team also found that results from the self-reflections completed by teachers as part of the Online Educator Evaluation System were not being utilized in planning professional development for the staff. The Team recommended these results be considered when creating the annual professional development plan for the upcoming school year.

## **BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES**

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Boone Career Technical Center in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

**18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

While the Team determined the principal and staff have the capacity to correct the findings outlined in this report, there was concern that advisory councils were not being utilized to their full potential. Such councils can have a profound impact on curricular offerings for career and technical centers and the Team recommended the school conduct more data-driven discussions with council members, which could directly affect opportunities for students through programs being offered.

## IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

**19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

**19.1.1. School location.** The center was not situated on a site with 15 usable acres. (Did not adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

## **EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION**

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

**None identified.**

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Boone Career-Technical Center's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Boone Career Technical Center in improvement efforts.

The Team identified four high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities.

7.2.2. Counseling services.

7.6.2. Licensure.

7.6.3. Evaluation.

The Team presented one commendation (7.1.2. High expectations), made one recommendation (7.1.6. Instruction in writing), noted an indicator of efficiency (8.1.4. Administrative practices), and offered capacity building resources.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Boone Career Technical Center and Boone County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.