



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

HOOVERSON HEIGHTS PRIMARY SCHOOL

BROOKE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MARCH 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Education Performance Audit.....	9
Commendations	9
High Quality Standards	10
Indicators of Efficiency	11
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	12
Identification of Resource Needs	13
Early Detection and Intervention	14
Education Performance Audit Summary	15

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Hooverson Heights Primary School in Brooke County was conducted December 17, 2013. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was two-fold. The primary purpose was to investigate the reason for performance and progress that are persistently below standard. Secondly, the purpose was to make recommendations to the school, school system, as appropriate, and West Virginia Board of Education on such matters as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education – Janet M. Bock, Coordinator, Office of Early Learning

West Virginia Department of Education Technology – Mark Moore, Coordinator, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Susan B. Ferrell	Primary School Assistant Principal	Nutter Fort Primary School Harrison County
Larry R. Werry	Retired Elementary School Principal	Fairview Elementary School Marion County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

10 BROOKE COUNTY

Dr. Kathy Kidder-Wilkerson, Superintendent

204 HOOVERSON HEIGHTS PRIMARY SCHOOL – TRANSITION

Nicole L. Ennis, Principal

Grades K-04, Enrollment 186 (2nd month 2012-2013 enrollment report)

In 2013, West Virginia received waiver approval from certain federal rules and deadlines under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). West Virginia received approval to use its own accountability system which was developed to more effectively identify struggling schools and better direct resources to struggling schools (2013 ESEA Results). Every public school in the state is designated as a **SUCCESS, TRANSITION, FOCUS, SUPPORT** or **PRIORITY** school.

The West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) designated Hooverson Heights Primary School a Transition school. Transition schools are those schools that have either met their target based on their WVAI score or demonstrated that a majority of their subgroups are making academic progress against the annual academic goals in mathematics and reading/language arts, or the school has reached its goals in attendance or graduation rates. Transition schools may be demonstrating some combination of low achievement, achievement gaps, low growth or low attendance/graduation rates. The school must show progress in student achievement each year to maintain or improve this designation. A school's designation is determined once a year based on prior school year data, including WESTEST2 results.

Designation Status for Hooverson Heights Primary School.

Designation:	TRANSITION	Next Year's Target:	63.1706
Index Score:	31.2715	Met at least 50% of targets in Mathematics and Reading:	YES
Index Target:	61.2544	Met Participation Rate Indicator:	YES
Met Index Target:	NO		

Supporting Data

Proficiency (40% of the index score)	13.32
Achievement Gaps Closed (20% of the index score)	7.40
Observed Growth (15% of the index score)	2.81
Adequate Growth (20% of the index score)	3.00
<u>Attendance Rate (5% of the index score)</u>	<u>4.73</u>
Total Accountability Index (out of 100)	31.27

The West Virginia Accountability Index targets are set for each school to reach progressively higher performance on a defined set of data. Schools have an overall score based on multiple components of student and school performance. All schools are required to meet the same end point, thus defining school-specific trajectories requiring higher rates of improvement for lower performing schools. Targets comprised of the five components listed above are set with a goal of all elementary schools in West Virginia reaching 74.6679 by 2020. Proficiency targets are set at 75 percent for all students in all subgroups by 2020.

Hooverson Heights Primary School did not achieve the Accountability Index Target for the 2012-2013 school year. Considering the target index of 63.1706 for 2014 and proficiency target of 75 percent by 2020, with a current index score of 31.2715, Hooverson Heights Primary School has a steep trajectory to achieve both short term and long term targets. A significant gap exists between current performance of each subgroup and the target of 75 percent.

**HOOVERSON HEIGHTS PRIMARY SCHOOL
Grade-Level Proficiency Data
School Year 2013**

Grade-Level and Subgroup		Mathematics			Reading/Language Arts		
Grade	Group	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient
3	White	> 95%	45.71%	54.29%	> 95%	48.57%	51.43%
3	Black	> 95%	>95%	< 5%	> 95%	>95%	< 5%
3	Special Education	> 95%	66.67%	33.33%	> 95%	91.67%	8.33%
3	Low Socioeconomic Status	93.75%	53.33%	46.67%	93.75%	60.00%	40.00%
3	Total	> 95%	47.22%	52.78%	> 95%	50.00%	50.00%
4	White	> 95%	69.23%	30.77%	> 95%	64.10%	35.90%
4	Black	> 95%	<5%	> 95%	> 95%	<5%	> 95%
4	Special Education	> 95%	86.67%	13.33%	> 95%	93.33%	6.67%
4	Low Socioeconomic Status	> 95%	90.00%	10.00%	> 95%	80.00%	20.00%
4	Total	> 95%	67.50%	32.50%	> 95%	62.50%	37.50%

Attendance Rate = 94.60%

The chart, Grade-Level Proficiency Data for School Year 2013, depicts participation, non-proficient, and proficient percentage rates by grade level and subgroup for mathematics and reading/language arts. In mathematics, Grade 3 scored the highest with 52.78 percent proficient and Grade 4 scored 32.50 percent proficient. Mathematics Grade Level Proficiency Data showed gaps between Grades 3 and 4 and gaps in subgroups at each level.

In reading/language arts, Grade 3 scored 50.00 percent proficient and Grade 4 scored 37.50 percent proficient. While gaps were prevalent in several subgroups at each grade level, Grade 3 black and special education subgroups and Grade 4 special education subgroup were particularly significant with scores of <5 percent, 8.33 percent, and 6.67 percent respectively.

HOOVERSON HEIGHTS PRIMARY SCHOOL Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group

***Note:** Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST2 score.

Low	between 1-34th percentile
Typical	between 35th-65th percentile
High	between 66th-99th percentile

Subgroup		Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
		Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
All Sub-Group	School	17 (47%)	10 (28%)	9 (25%)	36.0	42.9%	20 (56%)	12 (33%)	4 (11%)	27.0	44.2%
	County	688 (40%)	524 (30%)	526 (30%)	46.0	44.5%	675 (39%)	482 (28%)	560 (33%)	46.0	42.9%
	State	51,165 (35%)	45,256 (31%)	50,057 (34%)	50.0	45.1%	50,484 (35%)	45,076 (31%)	50,227 (34%)	50.0	48.8%
White Sub-Group	School	17 (49%)	10 (29%)	8 (23%)	36.0	42.7%	20 (57%)	12 (34%)	3 (9%)	27.0	44.0%
	County	662 (40%)	511 (31%)	495 (30%)	46.0	44.7%	651 (40%)	462 (28%)	534 (32%)	46.0	43.0%
	State	47,034 (35%)	41,704 (31%)	46,085 (34%)	50.0	45.7%	46,584 (35%)	41,462 (31%)	46,170 (34%)	50.0	49.2%
Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	23.0	22.2%	*	*	*	27.0	7.4%
	County	142 (48%)	82 (28%)	70 (24%)	38.0	20.6%	140 (49%)	77 (27%)	69 (24%)	38.0	13.0%
	State	7,956 (43%)	5,628 (31%)	4,781 (26%)	41.0	18.3%	7,406 (41%)	5,488 (30%)	5,291 (29%)	43.0	16.1%
Non-Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	10 (40%)	7 (28%)	8 (32%)	47.0	54.0%	14 (56%)	8 (32%)	3 (12%)	29.0	64.0%
	County	546 (38%)	442 (31%)	456 (32%)	47.0	50.3%	535 (37%)	405 (28%)	491 (34%)	48.0	50.3%
	State	43,209 (34%)	39,628 (31%)	45,276 (35%)	51.0	49.6%	43,078 (34%)	39,588 (31%)	44,936 (35%)	51.0	54.2%
LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	42.0	27.8%	*	*	*	27.0	30.6%
	County	348 (40%)	260 (30%)	258 (30%)	44.0	36.1%	361 (42%)	245 (29%)	248 (29%)	43.0	32.7%
	State	26,545 (38%)	21,619 (31%)	22,119 (31%)	47.0	37.5%	25,763 (37%)	21,435 (31%)	22,576 (32%)	47.0	40.8%
Non-LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	36.0	56.1%	*	*	*	29.0	56.1%
	County	340 (39%)	264 (30%)	268 (31%)	48.0	53.6%	314 (36%)	237 (27%)	312 (36%)	49.0	54.1%
	State	24,620 (32%)	23,637 (31%)	27,938 (37%)	52.0	58.1%	24,721 (33%)	23,641 (31%)	27,651 (36%)	52.0	62.5%
Male Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	44.0	38.1%	*	*	*	29.0	33.3%
	County	349 (41%)	245 (29%)	259 (30%)	45.0	45.0%	373 (44%)	236 (28%)	237 (28%)	41.0	33.9%
	State	27,113 (37%)	22,439 (30%)	24,615 (33%)	48.0	44.3%	27,485 (37%)	22,259 (30%)	24,047 (33%)	47.0	41.0%
Female Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	36.0	48.6%	*	*	*	27.0	57.1%
	County	339 (38%)	279 (32%)	267 (30%)	47.0	43.9%	302 (35%)	246 (28%)	323 (37%)	51.0	51.9%
	State	24,052 (33%)	22,817 (32%)	25,442 (35%)	51.0	45.9%	22,999 (32%)	22,817 (32%)	26,180 (36%)	52.0	56.9%

***Note:** Schools are those schools that have at least a 4th grade.

*Denotes cell size <20.

The chart, Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group, identifies the percent proficient in each subgroup as compared to the county and the State averages. In addition, subgroup growth is examined and determined to be low, typical, or high based on previous performance. In mathematics, the special education subgroup demonstrated low growth and all other subgroups demonstrated typical growth. In reading/language arts, the all, white, special education, non-special education, low socioeconomic, non-low socioeconomic, male, and female subgroups demonstrated low growth.

The chart indicates the average percent proficient in mathematics was 42.9 percent and 44.2 percent in reading/language arts. In mathematics, the special education (22.2 percent) and low socioeconomic (27.8 percent) subgroups scored significantly lower than those not in the subgroups. Females scored 10.5 percent higher than males.

In reading/language arts, the special education (7.4 percent) and low socioeconomic (30.6 percent) subgroups scored significantly lower than those not in the subgroup. Females scored almost 23.8 percent higher than males.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY - ANALYSIS

Hooverson Heights Primary School contains Grades K-4 and has a small student enrollment of approximately 186 students. The Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group showed all subgroups demonstrated low growth in reading/language arts.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. West Virginia Next Generation Content Standards.
2. Title I Retreat Data Analysis.
3. Engrade.
4. Special Education Compliance.
5. Edmoto.
6. Educate West Virginia.
7. Academic Vocabulary.
8. Social Studies Materials.
9. Collaborative Teams Network.
10. Safe and Supportive Schools Training.
11. Teacher Evaluation.
12. Instructional Practices Inventory.
13. Depth of Knowledge.
14. Book Study: Quality Questioning.
15. Book Study: Making Thinking Visible.
16. Number Talks.
17. Lexia Learning.
18. Star Reading.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

COMMENDATIONS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Hooverson Heights Primary School had undertaken positive school improvement initiatives. The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

7.1.2. High expectations. All teachers exhibited high expectations for all students. Through the interview process and classroom observations the Team found that high expectations were prevalent for students, teachers, and the principal. Respect was exhibited buildingwide and students were on task and engaged in high quality instruction and learning activities. All staff members expressed a concern for the low student achievement scores and discussed the positive effects of the professional development and the principal's guidance. The staff had thoroughly examined student data and formulated individual classroom plans for increasing student achievement based on formal and informal student data. The Team determined that the initiatives undertaken by the principal and staff are directed toward higher student achievement.

7.1.4. Instruction. The STEM (science, technology, engineering, mathematics) Club provided students excellent opportunities for exposure in these sciences. Numerous activities expose students to the different areas of STEM and inform them of the benefits of exploring these fields for future employment. Twenty-four (24) Grade 4 students attend the club weekly. Topics explored include the following.

- What Makes a Bic Click – Exploring Ball Point Pen Engineering.
- Energy Balls – How Do They Work and How Can You Make Circuits With Them?
- Parachutes – Create and Modify Parachutes.
- Rattlebacks – Exploring the Elliptical Mystery.
- Bounce Higher – Exploring Newton's Laws of Motion.
- Light – Understanding the Colors of Light.
- Binder Clips – Using Force to Measure Binder Clips and Exploring Levers.
- Catapults – How Will Changing the Fulcrum Effect the Distance an Object will Travel on a Catapult when Force is Applied?

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The Team commended the exceptional buildingwide use of technology. The school was fully supplied with technology and the staff had extensive professional development in the implementing technology. Students were using technology in all classes and were fluent when talking with Team members about how they

were using a variety of technology. The Team member from the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Instructional Technology, stated that Hooverson Heights Elementary School had implemented technology to one of the highest levels that he had seen statewide.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

None.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Hooverson Heights Primary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Brooke County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Brooke County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

None identified.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Hooverson Heights Primary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

Hooverson Heights Primary School demonstrated the knowledge and capability to provide a high quality, challenging curriculum based on student needs as determined by the formal and informal data provided by the teachers. Teachers could speak fluently about the types of enrichment available for students who were excelling in their academics and also about the type of additional assistance available for students who were struggling. Title I interventions and after school opportunities were available for students needing those services.

The Team determined that the school is working on developing the capacity to increase student achievement through the professional development provided teachers, the high expectations buildingwide, and the leadership demonstrated by the principal and teachers. The 2014 WESTEST2 assessment will determine if the school has demonstrated the capacity to improve student achievement.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not at least five acres. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** The counselor's office did not have easy access to student records. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, and copying equipment were not available. (Adversely impacts program and student performance.)
- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** The music/art room did not have various communication technology and movable furniture and equipment. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)

- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility did not have 2 deep sinks, hot and cold water, counter space, mechanical ventilation, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas. (Adversely impacts program and student performance.)
- The music facility did not have music stands, a podium, an instructor's station, or acoustical treatment. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- The physical education facility did not have provisions for two or more teaching stations, a data projector or 50" screen monitor, or network connections. (Adversely impacts program and student performance.)
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service area did not provide for receiving, storage, cooking, serving, dining, and dishwashing. A dry erase board, locker/dressing room, lavatory, chairs, or toilet were not available. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health service unit of adequate size was not provided. There were no curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board, or work counter. (May adversely impact student health and safety.)

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Student data, both formal and informal, were driving the classroom curriculum buildingwide. Technology use, Title I interventions, the STEM program, remediation, and acceleration were being implemented to increase student achievement. The Team believed that the school has monitored student progress and developed and applied intervention programs that will improve student performance.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Hooverson Heights Primary School's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Hooverson Heights Primary School in improvement efforts.

The Team presented three commendations (7.1.2. High expectations; 7.1.4. Instruction; and 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application).

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends and a motion is requested that the West Virginia Board of Education approve this report.

Based on the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education approve the Hooverson Heights Primary School's report.