

OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDITS



FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

WELLSBURG MIDDLE SCHOOL

BROOKE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2007

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

The West Virginia Office of Education Performance Audits conducted an Education Performance Audit of Wellsburg Middle School in Brooke County on October 19, 2005.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Wellsburg Middle School in Brooke County was conducted March 19, 2007. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school "... does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education."

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

10 BROOKE COUNTY

Charles Baker, Superintendent

303 WELLSBURG MIDDLE SCHOOL - Needs Improvement

Toni Paesano, Assistant Principal (Principal resigned end of September 2005)

Grades 05 - 08

Enrollment 499

WESTEST 2004-2005

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	488	500	497	99.40	72.42	Yes	Yes	✓
White	478	490	487	99.38	72.47	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	221	229	228	99.56	65.00	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	88	91	88	96.70	38.37	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	488	500	497	99.40	79.21	Yes	Yes	✓
White	478	490	487	99.38	79.41	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	221	229	228	99.56	70.45	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	88	91	88	96.70	38.37	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 99.8%

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the performance measures and the Follow-up Education Performance Audit Team's findings. The high quality educational standards and performance measures were investigated through the examination of documents; observation of practices; and interviews with personnel, students, and parents.

10 BROOKE COUNTY

Mary K. Hervey DeGarmo, Superintendent

303 WELLSBURG MIDDLE SCHOOL - Needs Improvement

Toni Paesano, Principal

Grades 05 - 08

Enrollment 481 (2nd month enrollment report)

WESTEST 2005-2006

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	460	478	476	99.58	76.85	Yes	Yes	✓
White	450	467	465	99.57	76.78	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	229	243	242	99.58	69.29	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	78	84	84	100.00	44.87	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	460	478	477	99.79	82.35	Yes	Yes	✓
White	450	467	466	99.78	82.18	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	229	243	242	99.58	75.00	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	78	84	84	100.00	37.17	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 99.8%

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Below Standard

5.1.1. Achievement.

Wellsburg Middle School failed to achieve adequately yearly progress (AYP) in 5.1.1. Achievement of the special education (SE) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 9.4 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the West Virginia Board of Education continued the school's Conditional Accreditation status at the September 2005 State Board meeting.

Wellsburg Middle School achieved AYP in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval and may have achievement deficiencies if interventions are not applied.

While the SES subgroup achieved mastery in mathematics (65 percent) and was at the State's starting point average of 2003-04 and 2004-05 baseline results, this subgroup was not at the level of the all students (AS) (72.42 percent) and racial/ethnicity white (W) (72.47 percent) subgroups. Brooke County and Wellsburg Middle School must be mindful of this achievement disparity and implement high yield instructional strategies and programs designed to close the achievement gap of SES students.

The Team determined that the Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) had been revised to address 5.1.1. Achievement.

The following professional development/training opportunities were provided by the county and/or school.

1. Summer Learning Academy.
2. Five-Year Strategic Planning.
3. Special Education Forums.
4. WESTEST and Test Mate Clarity.
5. CSOs Performance Descriptors.
6. Inclusion/Collaboration - RESA VI.
7. Project MERIT.
8. Middle/High School Counselor.
9. Reading and Mathematics Symposiums.
10. Mapping/Prioritization (Grades 2-5) – RESA VI.
11. Differentiated Instruction - RESA VI.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

BELOW STANDARD. Wellsburg Middle School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the special education (SE) subgroup in mathematics and increased the percent proficient from 38.37 percent in 2004-2005 to 44.87 percent in 2005-2006, the school did not achieve AYP for the SE subgroup in reading/language arts. The

percent proficient declined from 38.37 percent in 2004-2005 to 37.17 percent in 2005-2006.

Note: The school achieved substantially above the State's percent proficient 33.5 percent in mathematics (Wellsburg Middle School - 44.87 percent) and was comparable to the State's percent proficient in reading/language arts – 37.5 percent (Wellsburg Middle School - 37.17 percent).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress to Meet the Standard (5.1.1. Achievement – SE)

6.1. Curriculum

6.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team observed classrooms, interviewed teachers, and reviewed documents and determined that all staff were not utilizing the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) to drive their curriculum. Additionally, one teacher referred to the West Virginia Board of Education Instructional Goals and Objectives (IGOs) instead of the CSOs.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All teachers interviewed could thoroughly articulate the use of Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) and how they are incorporated to drive the curriculum.

6.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Through teacher interviews, the Team determined that some staff members did not hold high expectations for all students, especially those in the special education (SE) subgroup. Some teachers stated that the special education students just can't do the work so if the student makes a "good attempt" they will receive a good grade.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team interviewed teachers and the principal and reported that staff showed high expectations for all students. Classroom observations and student interviews reinforced this.

6.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

The Team observed minimal computer usage throughout the school. Through classroom observations and interviews with teachers and students, the Team determined that technology was not used in several classrooms.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Most teachers used technology on a regular basis. Computer laboratories and individual classroom computers were being used efficiently and effectively.

6.2. Student and School Performance

6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Several lesson plans were incomplete and very sketchy. Plans needed to include more information, such as strategies, activities, materials to be used, and type of assessment to be used to ensure student mastery of the lesson. This would allow a smoother transition from the regular education teacher to a substitute teacher.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Lesson plans were complete and thorough and could easily be used by a substitute teacher.

RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1.5. Instructional strategies. Classroom observations and lesson plan reviews showed that some teachers applied a variety of instructional strategies; however, the Team noted that students of other teachers could benefit more from a wider array of instructional strategies in the classroom. The Team recommended that professional development on research-based instructional strategies be provided to teachers to make this a consistent practice among all teachers and that the principal and county staff monitor classrooms to assure effective application of high-yield instructional practice.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Staff development on varying instructional strategies was provided to all teachers and teacher interviews and a check of lesson plans confirmed the effectiveness of the staff development.

6.1.12. Multicultural activities. Although teachers implemented individual activities relevant to multicultural education, including zero tolerance prevention, a unified, comprehensive plan to organize this instruction was not evident. The Team recommended that the school organize the activities to create a multicultural plan.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. A county and school Multicultural Plan was in place and articulated by the staff.

- 6.5.4. Physical assessment.** The Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) scores for 2003-04 were at 33.74 percent. The physical education teacher reported to the Team that students only have access to physical education classes “about 20 to 30 days per year.” The Team recommended that the school increase the availability of physical education classes, which would improve performance on the physical assessment. Note: The Team observed that the physical education instruction taking place was of high quality.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. An additional physical education teacher had been added to the staff and all students were meeting the required number of minutes for the class.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Wellsburg Middle School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Brooke County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Brooke County or the accreditation status of the schools.

7.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Programs were needed to assist teachers in delivering the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) and developing lesson plans. These programs would better serve the school and have a direct impact on student achievement.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

Staff development addressing the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) and lesson plans had been provided and the Team noted improvements in both areas.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Wellsburg Middle School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 16.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county Unified Improvement Plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team determined that Wellsburg Middle School and Brooke County have the capacity to correct the identified deficiencies.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

The school still needed to develop capacity in the special education (SE) subgroup in reading/language arts as adequate yearly progress (AYP) had not yet been achieved.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

17.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 17.1.1. School location.** The site was not 11 acres + 1 acre for each 100 students over 600.
- 17.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The music facility did not have acoustical treatment.
- 17.1.12. Grades 7-12 auditorium/stage.** Acoustical panels and controlled illumination were not available.
- 17.1.15 Health service units.** Curtained or small rooms with cots and a toilet were not provided. The refrigerator did not have a lock.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

All facility needs remained the same.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the achievement levels of students in the special education (SE) subgroup, Wellsburg Middle School and Brooke County must implement high-yield instructional strategies that will improve achievement. Brooke County must actively pursue assistance from RESA VI, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Instruction must be data-driven and relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY

Assistance had been provided to the school; however, the school must continue to implement high quality research-based programs to increase the scores in the special education (SE) subgroup in reading/language arts.

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
10-303 Wellsburg Middle	Conditional Accreditation		5.1.1. (SE)	May 31, 2007

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Approval status of the Brooke County School System and continue the Conditional Accreditation status of Wellsburg Middle School with a May 31, 2007 Date Certain to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).