



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

CENTRAL CITY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

CABELL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MARCH 2011

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	7
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	8
Education Performance Audit.....	8
High Quality Standards	8
Indicators of Efficiency	11
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	12
Identification of Resource Needs	13
Early Detection and Intervention	14
Education Performance Audit Summary	15

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Central City Elementary School in Cabell County was conducted January 26, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review concentrated on the declining student achievement and the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator
West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader and Technology – Wesley Holland, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Don P. Bower	Elementary School Principal	Leon Elementary School Mason County
James E. Frazier	Elementary School Principal	Henry J. Kaiser Elementary School Jackson County
Evelyn Kelly Haynes	Elementary School Principal	Watts Elementary Kanawha County
Amy C. Kammer	Intermediate School Principal	Point Pleasant Intermediate School Mason County
Martina S. Mills	Retired Middle School Assistant Principal	Chapmanville Middle School Logan County
Mindy D. Wilson	Elementary School Assistant Principal	Jefferson Elementary School Wood County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

12 CABELL COUNTY

William A. Smith, Superintendent

290 CENTRAL CITY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Patrick O'Neal, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 575 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	186	224	222	99.10	56.21	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	164	192	191	99.47	57.92	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	17	26	25	96.15	37.50	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	36	45	44	97.77	28.57	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	158	189	188	99.47	56.32	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	186	224	223	99.55	66.48	Yes	Yes	✓
White	164	192	192	100.00	67.07	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	17	26	25	96.15	62.50	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	36	45	44	97.77	25.71	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	158	189	189	100.00	66.45	Yes	Yes	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 96.5%

12 CABELL COUNTY
William A. Smith, Superintendent
290 CENTRAL CITY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement
Patrick O’Neal, Principal
Grades PK - 05
Enrollment 551 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	197	230	227	98.69	27.31	Yes	No	X
White	175	205	202	98.53	29.06	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	16	18	18	100.00	0.00	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	40	47	46	97.87	23.07	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	157	188	187	99.46	25.64	Yes	No	X
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	197	230	228	99.13	34.35	Yes	Yes	✓
White	175	205	203	99.02	35.26	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	16	18	18	100.00	18.75	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	40	47	46	97.87	20.51	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	157	188	187	99.46	31.41	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 95.3%

CENTRAL CITY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	88	74	86	72	97.73	31.94	37.50	22.22	6.94	1.39	30.56
04	66	53	65	52	98.48	38.46	40.38	15.38	5.77	0.00	21.15
05	76	70	76	70	100.00	38.57	32.86	21.43	2.86	4.29	28.57

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	88	74	86	72	97.73	48.61	16.67	22.22	9.72	2.78	34.72
04	66	53	66	53	100.00	47.17	28.30	15.09	9.43	0.00	24.53
05	76	70	76	70	100.00	34.29	24.29	20.00	12.86	8.57	41.43

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

The following charts show the actual number of students proficient and not proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts out of the number enrolled for the full academic year (FAY).

Mathematics			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	197	53	141
White	175	50	122
Black	16	0	16
Special Education	40	9	30
SES	157	40	116

Reading/Language Arts			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	197	67	128
White	175	61	112
Black	16	3	13
Special Education	40	8	31
SES	157	49	107

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Achieved Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

This is the 1st year that Central City Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement. Central City Elementary School failed to achieve AYP in the all students (AS) and the economically disadvantages (SES) subgroups in mathematics. Central City Elementary School achieved AYP in the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup in mathematics and in the SES subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. Although not large enough to constitute a subgroup for accountability the racial/ethnicity black (B) and special education (SE) subgroups need attention and plans for improved performance. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 69.44 percent in mathematics and 65.28 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 78.85 percent in mathematics and 75.47 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 71.43 percent in mathematics and 58.57 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Differentiated Instruction.
2. Professional Learning Communities (PLC).
3. Formative and Summative Assessment.
4. Jennifer Ashlock Training.
5. Building Common Assessments.
6. WESTEST2 Data Analysis.
7. Identifying Five Essential Skills.
8. Polycom.
9. Singapore Math.
10. Highly Effective Classrooms.
11. Three Critical Elements to Effective Schools.
12. mClass Reading (DIBELS).
13. mClass Math.
14. AIMSweb Mathematics.
15. Building Collaborative Teams.
16. Whiteboard Training.
17. Smart Responders.
18. SMART Tables.

19. Organizational Health.
20. SMART Goals.
21. Instructional Practice Inventory.
22. CCE Yearly Routine and Procedures.
23. Innovation Zone.
24. First Step to Success.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Central City Elementary School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

8.1. Indicators of Efficiency.

8.1.1. Curriculum; 8.1.3. Facilities; 8.1.4 Administrative Practices; 8.1.5. Personnel.

Cabell County School System provided Central City Elementary School a wealth of resources including personnel, technology, equipment and materials, programs, and a beautifully constructed school. The structure is in place to provide an effective and efficient educational program.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While Grades K, 4, and 5 teachers discussed and demonstrated the proper use of the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs), the Team could not verify that the CSOs were the basis for the curriculum in Grades 1, 2, and 3.

7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)

The Team observed 12 students unsupervised for 15 minutes while they were waiting for lunch. This was a safety concern for the school and students. The Team also observed a student sitting outside a classroom unsupervised.

During the day of the Education Performance Audit, students were dismissed two hours early due to adverse weather. During the time from the announcement of early dismissal and when the students left the school, the Team witnessed numerous parent calls to teachers and very little instruction was taking place in any of the classes observed. This occurred over an hour and a half of time. It was evident that there was no schoolwide plan or a plan that was expeditiously followed for early dismissal. It appeared that many teachers and students were disorganized and unsure of the proper procedures.

7.1.4. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, *Assuring the Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs* (hereinafter Policy 2510). (Policy 2510)

Science was not being instructed with 50 percent minimum active inquiry, hands-on investigation, and experimentation in all classes. Science instruction mostly involved textbooks and worksheets. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2520.3 – 21st Century Science K-8 Content Standard and Objectives for West Virginia Schools, states, “Students will engage in active inquiries, investigations, and hands on activities for a minimum of 50 percent of the instructional time to develop conceptual understanding and research/laboratory skills.”

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child’s weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While writing instruction was occurring at least one time per week in all classrooms, teachers indicated that feedback was not given to students. Students were not made aware of corrections to improve their individual writing skills.

7.2. Student and School Performance

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

Approximately half of the teachers could not discuss the goals and action steps of the school’s Five-Year Strategic Plan or how they were to be implemented in

the classrooms. The Five-Year Plan must be a driving force in curriculum delivery.

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

The Team could not verify that all lesson plans were reviewed at least once per quarter. It was reported that substitute teachers had to develop lesson plans in some instances. Nearly half of the lesson plans could not be followed by a substitute teacher and two teachers did not have lesson plans for the Team to review.

7.6. Personnel

- 7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)**

While the beginning teacher and mentor were meeting, the principal was not giving input to these meetings and did not have verification of involvement in these meetings. The principal was not a member of a professional support team required by W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b.

7.7. Safe, Drug Free, Violence Free, and Disciplined Schools

- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)**

A schoolwide discipline plan was not in place. Teachers reported that they would like to have a consistent plan to deal with student discipline. Teachers handled discipline in their own manner. The Team noted that student discipline was excellent during the day of the Education Performance Audit.

7.8. Leadership

- 7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)**

Due to the number of deficiencies found at Central City Elementary School, the Team determined that assistance needed to be provided by the Cabell County Central Office administration, the West Virginia Department of Education, and RESA 2 to assist the building administrator in improving the operation of the school.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Central City Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Cabell County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Cabell County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

There was a dramatic decline in student achievement at Central City Elementary School from the 2008-2009 school year to the 2009-2010 school year. The principal had implemented numerous high quality staff development sessions and was knowledgeable of the school's needs. The principal must ensure that the school does not lose sight of its primary goal "improved student performance".

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Central City Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building needs to continue to be developed for educators at the school in strategically targeting resources to the teaching and learning process as indicated in the Five-Year Strategic Plan to improve student and school achievement.

The Team recommended that the Cabell County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Mr. Charles Heinlein, Executive Director, Office of School Improvement, at 304-558-3199 to arrange a School Support System for correcting the deficiencies and improving student and school performance.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

19.1.1. School location. The school site was not five usable acres, plus one acre for each 100 students over 240 and was not large enough for future expansion. Visitor parking was insufficient and very limited.

19.1.5. Library/media and technology center. Automated circulation capacity and on-line periodical indexes were not available.

19.1.7. K classrooms. The Kindergarten classrooms did not have hot water.

19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas. The art facility did not have hot water, mechanical ventilation, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas.

The music facility did not have acoustical treatment.

The physical education facilities were not acoustically treated with direct access to outdoor or recreational activities. There was no drinking fountain or provisions for two or more teaching stations.

19.1.15. Health service units. A refrigerator with locked storage was not available.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

It is recommended that Central City Elementary School pursue assistance from the Cabell County Central Office, RESA 2, and the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) to increase student achievement in all areas. Given the low performance in all subgroups, it is imperative that programs and practices be implemented immediately in order to address these issues.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

Central City Elementary School is one of the consortium of elementary (Innovation Zone) schools in Cabell County. The Innovation Zone fundamental purpose stated in the grant application was “. . . to establish high performing professional learning communities . . . embedded in the work day of teachers.” Cabell County requested and received a waiver from West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510 in the length of the instructional day as well as flexibility from the precise number of instructional minutes required for particular subjects. Consequently, instructional time was eliminated from consideration by the Educational Performance Audit for this school.

The county and school have worked hard to establish professional learning communities (PLCs) at Central City Elementary School. Implementation of PLCs at the school has several levels of PLCs that appeared to be carefully orchestrated and closely connected. Spring 2011 WESTEST2 results will show if the goal of the Innovation Zone is being achieved.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified nine high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

They include the following:

- 7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.
- 7.1.3. Learning environment.
- 7.1.4. Instruction.
- 7.1.6. Instruction in writing.
- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.
- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.
- 7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship.
- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations.
- 7.8.1. Leadership.

The Team presented four commendations (8.1.1. Curriculum; 8.1.3. Facilities; 8.1.4. Administrative Practices; and 8.1.5. Personnel), noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Central City Elementary School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Central City Elementary School in improvement efforts.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Central City Elementary School and Cabell County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.