



**Office of Education  
Performance Audits**

**INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**FOR**

**CALHOUN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**MARCH 2012**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

## Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Team.....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Initiatives For Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress .....</b>	<b>4</b>
<b>Annual Performance Measures For Accountability .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>High Quality Standards.....</b>	<b>18</b>
<b>Capacity Building .....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Early Detection And Intervention.....</b>	<b>53</b>
<b>Calhoun County Summary .....</b>	<b>53</b>

## INTRODUCTION

An announced (five days in advance) Education Performance Audit of the Calhoun County School District was conducted on October 17-20, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate reasons the county had not achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) during four of the past five years, the county's achievement ranked in the lower ranking of the other school districts in West Virginia, and other existing circumstances that warranted an on-site review. The Team also reviewed district level high-quality standards in accordance with appropriate procedures to make recommendations to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the high-quality standards as required by W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies.

The Education Performance Audit Team interviewed the Calhoun County Board of Education President and members of the board of education, school district personnel including the superintendent, the personnel official, director of finance, director of support services, director of special education, and other county office and school personnel. The Team examined documents including the Calhoun County Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan; minutes of meetings of the Calhoun County Board of Education; personnel documents; personnel evaluations; the school system policy manual; regulatory agency reviews, i.e., financial audit, the Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), etc.; and letters, faxes, and materials of interest to the Education Performance Audit.

This report presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings regarding the Calhoun County School District.

**EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM**

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Dr. Donna Davis, Deputy Director

<b>NAME</b>	<b>TITLE</b>	<b>COUNTY</b>	<b>CATEGORY</b>
David Bailey	HVAC Technician Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities
Dr. Monica Bean	Assistant Director Office of Research	WV Department of Education	AYP/Five-Year Strategic Plan/High Quality Standards
Dr. Teddi Cox	Education Consultant	Preston County	Leadership
Chris Derico	Director of Services	Lewis County Schools	Policies
Robyn Fitzsimmons	Personnel Director	Marshall County Schools	Personnel/Hiring Practices
Laura Kiser	Coordinator Office of Professional Preparation	WV Department of Education	Certification
Jody Lucas	Treasurer/Chief Business School Officer	Cabell County Schools	Finance
Carroll Staats	Board Member	Jackson County Schools	Evaluations/ Administrative Practices

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Calhoun County had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

#### **8.1.6. Regional Service Education Agencies.**

The Director of the Office of School Support, West Virginia Department of Education, recommended that leaders at Calhoun Middle/High School contact the Director of Services at RESA 5 for assistance and professional development for Whole School Improvement to include the High Quality Standards and the Framework for School Improvement. One action step was creating a leadership team at Calhoun Middle/High School. This team studied data about performance and found that school culture issues were prevalent with staff and students. The next year was spent working on culture. The Mission, Core Beliefs, School Planning Process, and Goals for Community/Parent support were all revised in a collaborative manner. Presently, the staff had collected three sets of data and was exploring within departments how they can produce and execute action plans and work goals.

#### **7.8.1. Leadership.**

##### Student Leadership.

Calhoun Middle/High School established a Student Leadership Team in 2010-2011. The school partnered with PB&J Consultants and Ohio State University to facilitate student leadership roles in the school. Fifty students in grades 6-12 were selected to participate in this student team which is led by the school counselor. Students will participate in eight workshops throughout the 2011-2012 school year. The students selected for this team represented a cross section of the student population, including at risk and targeted students. Forty of the 50 students selected continued the leadership team this year (2011-2012). They participated in workshops focusing on developing individual leadership, communication, professional skills, and a commitment to their school and community. Developing these skills will build a foundation for long-term school climate and culture change at Calhoun Middle/High School. This team's recommendations have resulted in menu changes for school lunch and breakfast.

Teacher Leadership Team.

A team of teachers comprised a Teacher Leadership Team at Calhoun Middle/High School. This team was developed to work on data-driven school improvement. The teacher team developed and implemented programs during the 2010-2011 school year to address school improvement and student achievement. Some of these included: Instructional Practices Inventory (IPI) data collection, Student leadership/focus groups, and the 5<sup>th</sup> period plan for Support for Personalized Learning (SPL). The teachers visited other schools to gather strategies relative to achieving goals set forth by staff. The teacher leaders delivered professional development to their co-workers in the areas of “Love and Logic,” and “Respect and Protect”.

## COUNTY PERFORMANCE

### ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and related student performance data. It also presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

#### 5.1. ACCOUNTABILITY.

##### 5.1.1. Achievement.

###### Adequate Yearly Progress

The No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data for the 2010-2011 school year identified that Calhoun County did not achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP). Calhoun County failed to achieve AYP for four of the last five years. Additionally, the school district performed in the bottom ranking of all school districts in West Virginia. Chart 1 shows the grade span/assessment and subgroup(s) that did not achieve AYP. It also shows the percent proficient for each grade span/assessment and subgroup.

Compared to the 2010 scores, Calhoun County students showed a negligible increase in the elementary level mathematics percent proficient in the all students (AS) subgroup (35.3 percent to 36.7 percent) and in the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup (35.5 percent to 36.5 percent). The elementary economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup percent proficient decreased from 37.2 percent to 32.1 percent. Secondary level mathematics percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (27.4 percent to 31.4 percent), the W subgroup (27.5 percent to 31.3 percent), and the SES subgroup (22.1 percent to 26.8 percent).

Student proficient scores significantly decreased in elementary reading in the AS subgroup (40.4 percent to 32.3 percent), in the W subgroup (40.6 percent to 32.1 percent), and in the SES subgroup (40.7 percent to 29.5 percent). Secondary reading percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (21.6 percent to 28.8 percent) and the W subgroup (21.7 percent to 29.1 percent).

The Team noted the progress in achievement; however, the increased percent proficient was still well below the State average percent proficient.

Chart 1

<b>WESTEST</b>			
<b>GRADE SPAN/ASSESSMENT</b>	<b>SUBGROUP</b>	<b>2010-2011 PERCENT PROFICIENT</b>	<b>2009-2010 PERCENT PROFICIENT</b>
Elementary - Mathematics	All Students (AS)	36.7%	35.3%
Elementary - Mathematics	White (W)	36.5%	35.5%
Elementary - Mathematics	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	32.1%	37.2%
Secondary - Mathematics	All Students (AS)	31.4%	27.4%
Secondary - Mathematics	White (W)	31.3%	27.5%
Secondary - Mathematics	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	26.8%	22.1%
Elementary - Reading	All Students (AS)	32.3%	40.4%
Elementary - Reading	White (W)	32.1%	40.6%
Elementary - Reading	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	29.5%	40.7%
Secondary - Reading	All Students (AS)	28.8%	21.6%
Secondary - Reading	White (W)	29.1%	21.7%

Chart 2 shows that the number of Calhoun County's schools identified for not achieving AYP increased since 2009.

In 2007 and 2008, one school did not make AYP. All schools in the county made AYP in 2009; however, since 2009, the number of schools not meeting AYP steadily increased from one in 2010 to two in 2011.

Chart 2

<b>NUMBER OF SCHOOLS NOT ACHIEVING AYP</b>		
<b>Year</b>	<b>Number of Schools Not Achieving AYP/Total Schools</b>	<b>Percentage Achieving AYP</b>
2007	1/3	66.7%
2008	1/3	66.7%
2009	0/3	100.0%
2010	1/3	66.7%
2011	2/3	33.3%

Charts 3 and 5 indicated that the 2010-2011 Calhoun County School District student percent proficient in mathematics was substantially lower than the State percent proficient at both the elementary and secondary levels in mathematics. Calhoun County School District's percent proficiency rate of the all students (AS) subgroup was 36.7 percent in elementary mathematics compared to the State proficiency rate of 45.2



percent. The percentage of Calhoun County AS secondary students proficient in mathematics was 31.4 percent compared to the State proficiency rate of 43.0 percent.

When interviewed, the Director of School Improvement and the building principal indicated that multiple factors contributed to this decline in achievement. One elementary school experienced a significant drop in achievement which resulted in not achieving AYP. One factor addressed by the central office and school leadership was the reassignment of staff into positions for which the teachers were more comfortable with the curriculum. In 2010-2011, teachers were in Grade 4 positions they had not taught prior to that year. Only 19 percent of the students in these two Grade 4 classes were proficient in the reading subtest. Because of transfer and reduction in force (RIF) opportunities, these teachers were able to move to other positions for the 2011-2012 year. However, these students moved on to Calhoun Middle High School unprepared for the Grade 5 curriculum.

Another issue involved the culture in the schools. One school faculty included a group of 16 teachers having zero to two years of teaching experience, while the remainder of the faculty was experienced with over 20 years. Because of the issue with school culture (as validated by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Improvement), the focus has not been on student achievement, rather on addressing persistent culture issues first.

Chart 3

<b>ELEMENTARY MATHEMATICS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	36.7%	45.2%
White (W)	36.5%	45.9%
Black (B)	NA	32.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	24.8%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	32.1%	35.0%

Chart 4

<b>MIDDLE MATHEMATICS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	NA	43.3%
White (W)	NA	43.8%
Black (B)	NA	31.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	16.2%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	NA	32.4%

Note: Calhoun Middle/High School consists of grades 6 through 12; therefore, WESTEST2 results are reported at the high school level.

Chart 5

<b>HIGH SCHOOL MATHEMATICS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	31.4%	43.0%
White (W)	31.3%	43.5%
Black (B)	NA	29.7%
Special Education (SE)	NA	12.5%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	26.8%	31.5%

Student assessment performance in reading/language arts (Charts 6 and 8) was significantly lower for all subgroups than the 2010-2011 State percent proficient. Only 32.3 percent of the elementary school all students (AS) subgroup in Calhoun County were proficient in reading/language arts, which was significantly lower than the State percent proficient (48.2 percent).

In reviewing the data, the Team noted the lowest percent proficient in elementary reading occurred at the Grade 4 class level in one elementary school. Additionally, only 9 percent of the Grade 11 English students in the county were proficient in reading.

Chart 6

<b>ELEMENTARY READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	32.3%	48.2%
White (W)	32.1%	48.7%
Black (B)	NA	40.0%
Special Education (SE)	NA	21.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	29.5%	37.7%

Chart 7

<b>MIDDLE READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	NA	50.0%
White (W)	NA	50.3%
Black (B)	NA	41.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	16.0%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	NA	39.0%

Note: Calhoun Middle/High School consists of grades 6 through 12; therefore, WESTEST2 results are reported at the high school level.

Chart 8

<b>HIGH SCHOOL READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2010-2011</b>		
<b>Subgroup</b>	<b>District Percent Proficient</b>	<b>State Percent Proficient</b>
All Students (AS)	28.8%	43.7%
White (W)	29.1%	44.3%
Black (B)	NA	29.2%
Special Education (SE)	NA	10.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	27.6%	31.9%

### SAT/ACT Assessment Results

Chart 9 shows the Calhoun School District's Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) and American College Testing (ACT) results.

The SAT math mean score decreased from 553 in 2005-2006 to 448 in 2010-2011. The SAT reading score decreased from 468 in 2007-2008 to 466 in 2010-2011. The SAT writing score increased from 418 in 2007-2008 to 431 in 2010-2011. The percent of test takers decreased from 2007-2008 (7.8 percent), increased the following two years (2008-2009 11.4 percent and 2009-2010 11.0 percent), then decreased to 7.5 percent in 2010-2011

ACT trend data showed that the ACT Composite declined from 19.8 in 2005-2006 to 18.9 in 2010-2011. This has implications for guidance and counseling and teachers' preparing students for college level assessment and 21<sup>st</sup> century skill learning. The ACT is designed to assess high school students' general educational development and their ability to complete college level work.

Chart 9

<b>SCHOLASTIC APTITUDE TEST (SAT) - Calhoun County Schools</b>						
<b>County</b>	<b>2005-2006</b>	<b>2006-2007</b>	<b>2007-2008</b>	<b>2008-2009</b>	<b>2009-2010</b>	<b>2010-2011</b>
SAT Takers (%)	4.2%	Not listed	7.8%	11.4%	11.0%	7.5%
SAT Math Mean Score	553	Not listed	478	439	451	448
SAT Reading Score		Not listed	468	421	453	466
SAT Writing Score		Not listed	418	399	404	431
<b>AMERICAN COLLEGE TESTING (ACT) - Calhoun County Schools</b>						
ACT Takers (%)	56.3%	40.8%	48.6%	55.7%	65.9%	%
ACT Composite	19.8	20.3	19.9	18.9	20.3	18.9

NA – Less than 10 (Not Applicable)

Source: State, County and School Data, 2009-2010 West Virginia Report Cards, West Virginia Department of Education. 2010-2011 data provided by Calhoun County School District.

### ACT EXPLORE Assessment Results

According to the 2010-2011 Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 10, Calhoun County students showed an increase in the composite score as compared to the 2006-2007 results, with the exception of the 2009-2010 school year. Five years of trend data showed that scores increased in mathematics, science, English, and reading from 2006-

2007 to 2010-2011. Calhoun County performed lower than the State average in all academic areas and in the composite score.

Chart 10

<b>ACT EXPLORE RESULTS</b>					
<b>Grade 8</b>					
	<b>2006-2007</b>	<b>2007-2008</b>	<b>2008-2009</b>	<b>2009-2010</b>	<b>2010-2011</b>
English WV	14.2	14.3	13.9	14.1	14.1
English Calhoun	12.5	13.2	13.3	11.9	13.4
Mathematics WV	14.5	14.7	14.3	14.6	14.8
Mathematics Calhoun	13.6	12.9	13.4	12.9	14.2
Reading WV	13.9	13.9	13.6	14.0	14.1
Reading Calhoun	12.4	12.7	12.5	12.2	13.5
Science WV	15.9	16.0	15.6	15.8	15.9
Science Calhoun	14.7	14.8	14.9	13.8	15.5
Composite WV	14.8	14.9	14.5	14.8	14.8
Composite Calhoun	13.4	13.6	13.7	12.9	14.2

### ACT PLAN Assessment Results

Based on the 2010-2011 Grade 10 ACT PLAN results in Chart 11, Calhoun County test takers showed a decrease from 15.7 in 2006-2007 to 14.9 in 2010-2011 in the composite score. Five years of trend data showed a decrease in English, reading, science, and mathematics scores from 2006-2007 to 2010-2011. Calhoun County School District performed lower than the State in all academic areas and in the composite scores.

Chart 11

<b>ACT PLAN RESULTS</b>					
<b>Grade 10</b>					
	<b>2006-2007</b>	<b>2007-2008</b>	<b>2008-2009</b>	<b>2009-2010</b>	<b>2010-2011</b>
English WV	16.7	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.3
English Calhoun	15.1	15.3	14.6	14.5	14.1
Mathematics WV	16.6	16.3	16.3	16.2	16.2
Mathematics Calhoun	15.9	16.0	16.1	15.9	15.0
Reading WV	16.5	16.5	15.7	16.1	16.1
Reading Calhoun	15.1	15.9	14.6	14.5	15.0
Science WV	17.7	17.5	17.1	17.3	17.3
Science Calhoun	16.3	16.9	16.1	15.8	16.0
Composite WV	17.0	16.8	16.5	16.6	16.6
Composite Calhoun	15.7	16.2	15.5	15.3	14.9

**5.1.2. Participation rate.** A minimum of 95 percent in the current or a two or three year average of all students enrolled in a public school/county school district/state at the time of testing, including students in each subgroup as required by *NCLB* must participate in the statewide assessment WESTEST or the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) in reading/language arts or mathematics. Students with a significant medical emergency may be exempt by appeal from the calculation of participation rate for AYP provided that the county superintendent has proper documentation. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Calhoun County School District met the 95 percent WESTEST2 participation rate requirement with 100 percent participation rate at both elementary schools and 99.2 percent participation rate in mathematics and 99.5 percent in reading at the middle/high school.

**5.1.3. Attendance rate (Elementary/Middle).** The student attendance rate for elementary and middle schools is at or above 90 percent or the percentage of students meeting the attendance rate show improvement from the preceding year. The student attendance rate will be adjusted for students excluded as a result of the Productive and Safe Schools Act (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1a) and school bus transportation interruptions (W.Va. 126CSR81), West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4110, *Attendance Policy*, (hereinafter Policy 4110). Additional exclusions include excused student absences, students not in attendance due to disciplinary measures, and absent students for whom the attendance director has pursued judicial remedies to compel attendance to the extent of his or her authority. For the AYP determination, the attendance rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the attendance rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 12 indicated the Calhoun County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last five reporting years.

The Team inquired as to what the county school district was doing to increase the attendance rate in Calhoun County's schools. The attendance director indicated the most significant factor had been a change in procedure. The ten day school absence notices were changed to five day notices. Additionally, the Circuit Judges supported enforcing the State attendance laws. According to staff, truancy has steadily declined because of this enforcement. The county has issued a "Challenge" to students and through grant funding provides the following attendance incentives: A chance to win a \$250 scholarship for perfect attendance, a 9-week attendance award, and semester test exemption.

Chart 12

<b>ATTENDANCE RATE</b>	
<b>Year</b>	<b>Attendance Rate</b>
2006-2007	96.37%
2007-2008	95.53%
2008-2009	96.58%
2009-2010	96.62%
2010-2011	96.99%

**5.1.4. Graduation rate.** The student graduation rate is 80 percent or the percentage of students meeting the student graduation rate shows improvement. The graduation rate is calculated according to the high school completer formula recommended by the NCES with the additional condition that graduates include only those students who receive a regular diploma in the standard number of years and does not include students receiving the GED. For the AYP determination, the graduation rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the graduation rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 13 showed the Calhoun County School District graduation rate. The school district passed the graduation rate requirement.

Chart 13

<b>GRADUATION RATE</b>	
<b>Year</b>	<b>Graduation Rate</b>
2006-2007	80.7%
2007-2008	76.8%
2008-2009	82.4%
2009-2010	91.0%
2010-2011	87.0%

Chart 14 demonstrated the number of Advanced Placement (AP®), honors courses, and college credit courses offered in Calhoun County's high school.

Advanced Placement (AP®) Courses offered: Calculus AB, English Literature and Composition, Chemistry, and Physics. AP® courses taken: Calculus (AB) and Environmental Science through Virtual School.

The high school offered the minimum four AP® courses; however students take advantage of the dual credit opportunities more frequently than the AP® courses. All four AP® courses offered were approved by The College Board. Calhoun County formerly utilized grant funds to pay for students' AP® exams; however, this funding source has expired. Staff reported fewer students taking the exams.

Honors courses offered in which students are enrolled included: Honors English 9, Honors English 10, Honors English 11, and Honors English 12.

The high school offers the following Dual Credit Courses: English 101, English 102, College Algebra, College Trigonometry, Environmental Earth Science, Earth Science, and College 101.

Students have the opportunity to receive dual credit from Marshall University, Glenville State College, and West Virginia University. In 2010, Calhoun Middle/High School was the only school in the State to offer the West Virginia University Math 153 and 154 courses in Calculus 1A and 1B. Calhoun Middle/High School is currently part of the Blue Ribbon Calculus program being developed for 2011-2012, based upon their results from 2010-2011. Graduates of the high school had 677 college credit hours in 2010 and 419 college credit hours in 2011.

Chart 14

<b>NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED 2011-2012</b>			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered/Taken	Number of Honors Courses Offered/Taken	Number of College Credit Courses Offered/Taken
Calhoun Middle/High	4/2	4	7

Chart 15 provides college entrance testing information for the American College Test (ACT) and the advanced placement test (APT) for the 2009-2010 school year. Data are listed for Calhoun Middle/High School, the county, and the state. The percentage of Calhoun County School District's ACT test takers (65.9 percent) was higher than the State percentage (60.2 percent). Calhoun County's ACT composite score at 20.3 was lower than the State (20.7).

The 2009-2010 percent of AP® test takers was 0.0 percent for Grade 10 while the State percentage was 1.3 percent; the percent of Grade 11 Calhoun County test takers was 1.3 percent while the State percentage was 19.2 percent; and the percent of Grade 12 Calhoun County test takers was 15.3 percent while the State percentage was 20.1 percent.



Calhoun High School offers the Kaplan ACT prep class for two hours an evening, three evenings a week, for a period of six weeks. This has been funded through the Gear Up program. County staff reported that in 2010, 60 students took the ACT exam, which increased from 39 students in 2009. Sixty-seven percent of the students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in English, which increased from 46 percent the previous year. Thirty-two percent of students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in Mathematics, which increased from 28 percent in 2009. Forty-eight percent of students met the College Readiness Benchmark in Reading, which increased from 36 percent in 2009. Eighteen percent of students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in Science, which tied with the 2009 results. In addition, 13 percent of the students met all four Benchmarks, which was an increase of 3 percent over the 2009 scores.

Chart 15

<b>COLLEGE-ENTRANCE TESTING INFORMATION – ACT &amp; APT 2009-2010</b>					
<b>ACT(American College Test)</b>			<b>APT (Advanced Placement Test) Test Takers</b>		
<b>Schools</b>	<b>Test Takers</b>	<b>Composite Score</b>	<b>Tenth Grade</b>	<b>Eleventh Grade</b>	<b>Twelfth Grade</b>
Calhoun Middle/High	65.9%	20.3	0.0%	1.3%	15.3%
Calhoun County Schools	65.9%	20.3	0.0%	1.3%	15.3%
STATE	60.2%	20.7	1.3%	19.2%	20.1%

Chart 16 showed the percentage of AP® test takers from 2005-2006 to 2009-2010 in grades 10, 11, and 12. The percent of 11<sup>th</sup> grade test takers with a score of three or higher decreased from 9.7 percent in 2008-2009 to 1.3 percent in 2009-2010. Grade 12 test takers with a score of three or higher increased from 8.2 percent in 2008-2009 to 15.3 percent in 2009-2010.

Chart 16

<b>AP® TEST TAKERS</b>					
<b>Calhoun County</b>	<b>2005-2006</b>	<b>2006-2007</b>	<b>2007-2008</b>	<b>2008-2009</b>	<b>2009-2010</b>
10 <sup>th</sup> Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 <sup>th</sup> Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	9.7%	1.3%
12 <sup>th</sup> Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	8.2%	15.3%

The high school graduate overall college going rate for Calhoun County was 58.2 percent compared to the State's overall college going rate of 58.8 percent as presented in Chart 17. Over half of Calhoun County's high school graduates entered college in fall 2010.

Chart 17

<b>ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2010</b>		
	<b>Number of High School Graduates 2009-2010</b>	<b>Overall College Going Rate Percentage</b>
State	18,290	58.8%
Calhoun County	91	58.2%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2010, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Calhoun County's percent of students enrolled in developmental courses in fall 2010 was lower than the State's percentage of students taking both mathematics and English developmental courses (Chart 18).

Four (4) of Calhoun County's 41 first-time freshmen or 9.8 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2010 compared to the State (15.00 percent). Ten (10) graduates or 24.4 percent were enrolled in developmental mathematics compared to the State (28.10 percent).

Chart 18

<b>HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2010</b>					
	<b>1<sup>st</sup> Time WV Freshmen Total #</b>	<b>English Total #</b>	<b>% in Developmental English</b>	<b>Mathematics Total #</b>	<b>% in Developmental Mathematics</b>
State	7,873	1,181	15.00%	2,209	28.10%
Calhoun Middle/High	41	4	9.8%	10	24.4%
Calhoun County	41	4	9.8%	10	24.4%

Source: First-Time Freshmen, Previous Year WV High School Graduates in Developmental Courses by Type of Course Fall 2010 (census).

## HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

### 7.1. CURRICULUM.

**7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

#### Findings

Calhoun County Schools developed an electronic system to support teachers with aligning curriculum and instruction. The spreadsheet enabled teachers to directly link the content standards and objectives (Policy 2520) to their lesson planning tool. This also created an electronic checkpoint for administrators to use when conducting walkthrough observations in teachers' classrooms.

**7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)**

#### Findings

1. The middle/high school provided curriculum offerings for students that ranged from reteaching to enrichment. However, it was indicated that students had difficulty scheduling their courses due to: 1. Staff were shared between the middle and high school and 2. The use of the Calhoun-Gilmer Career Center. The Team stressed the need for professional development in the administrative practice of creating a master schedule.
2. Prior to 2009, Calhoun County Schools set aside a day in October, December, February, April, and June for instructional support and enhancement (ISE) at Calhoun Middle/High School. Two hours of these days were scheduled for students to meet with teachers for additional instruction, small group tutoring, making up missed work, or retesting on CSOs not mastered. Since this was conducted on an ISE day, student participation was limited. Therefore, Calhoun County Schools implemented an Evening of Enhancement and publicized the event via announcements, personal invitations, and local news media. All teachers participated by staying at school from 3:30 p.m. until the 6:00 p.m. activities bus departed. The results included 257 student contacts in October 2009; 185 student contacts in December 2009; 389 contacts in March 2010; 224 contacts in October 2010; and 217 contacts in March of 2011. Teachers continue to request these "Evening of Enhancement" sessions

3. The high school offered the Kaplan ACT prep class for two hours an evening, three evenings a week, for a period of six weeks. This has been funded through the Gear Up program.

**7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)**

**Findings**

1. Calhoun County Schools received a \$275,200 safe and supportive school grant (\$68,800 annually for four years) to improve school climate and culture. The administration created a student leadership team to promote student leadership in students. This contributes to the idea of student voice.
2. The faculty at Calhoun Middle/High School was involved with a book study through their Professional Learning Communities (PLC) that addressed climate and culture. They were studying *Teaching in Poverty*. The administration feels this will deepen the understanding the faculty has for their students.

**7.1.4. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, *Assuring the Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs* (hereinafter Policy 2510). (Policy 2510)**

**Findings**

1. The school lacked an elective offering for middle school band. Additionally, only two secondary students were able to schedule band during the day. The Team recommended that the school administration seek guidance in designing a master schedule that makes band available to students during the instructional day. Currently, the schedule resulted in unbalanced classes. While a representative from the career center is available during arena scheduling, more collaboration is necessary to ensure students may enroll in courses that fit their educational pursuits.
2. The principal indicated that the career technical center drives the schedule for the middle/high school. The Team recommended that the administration meet regularly with the director of the career center to collaboratively craft a master schedule that enables students to schedule classes.

**7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

### **Findings**

The individual Education Performance Audit School Teams observed teachers using appropriate instructional strategies during the audit. However, specific teachers were not using effective instructional strategies. These have been reported in the individual school audit findings.

**7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

### **Findings**

While both the county and school audit teams documented the evidence of writing instruction occurring in all three Calhoun County School District's schools, the common response for the lack of use of West Virginia Writes was the inadequate bandwidth at the middle/high school. On the day of the middle/high school audit, the Team witnessed this bandwidth issue.

**7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)**

### **Findings**

1. Calhoun County schools had adequate access to library and technology applications. However, the bandwidth issue prevented the level of use of technology applications by teachers and students.
2. Each classroom in Calhoun County Schools included an interactive whiteboard and projector.
3. All teachers had a laptop.
4. Each school has at least one Mobi; 18 teachers had a Mobi and student Mobis to include CPS units.

5. Other technology tools included: iPods, i-Pads, Netbooks, older CPS units, Elmos, Flip Cameras, MP4s, Video-Conferencing equipment and an electronic work order system.

**7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)**

### **Findings**

Calhoun County schools had adequate instructional materials to use to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. Additionally, Calhoun County schools applied for and received waivers from the West Virginia Board of Education (WVBOE) for the use of alternate textbooks and instructional materials not on the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) Multiple List of Instructional Materials.

**7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

### **Findings**

Calhoun County's schools were in alignment with Policies 2510 and 2520. Additionally, the middle/high school implemented an "Education" career path through the EDGE program beginning with the 2011-2012 school year. (Exception – Band available at the middle school level.)

According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510, middle school band (grades 5-8) was not being offered at Calhoun Middle/High School. Additionally, only two high school students were able to schedule high school band during the school day.

**7.1.11. Guidance and advisement. Students are provided specific guidance and advisement opportunities to allow them to choose a career major prior to completion of grade 10. (Policy 2510)**

### **Findings**

Calhoun County Schools exceeded the minimum requirements of Policy 2510 regarding guidance and advisement opportunities to allow them to choose a career major. Students were provided opportunities to select a career major and work toward completing the career major by the end of high school. The counselor and

administration worked collaboratively to provide information to students regarding post-secondary options available to them, beginning as early as middle school.

**7.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)**

### **Finding**

According to minutes of the Calhoun County Board of Education, discipline was an issue at the middle/high school. The administration of this school had taken a proactive approach to addressing the culture of the school by creating a Student Leadership Team. Additionally, multicultural activities were included at all programmatic levels. The county and each school had an updated Multicultural Plan.

**7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)**

### **Findings**

One elementary school did not comply with W.Va. Code §18-5-45 and Policy 2510 regarding the minimum 315 minutes instructional day for Kindergarten. One Kindergarten classroom had 295 minutes of scheduled instruction and the other classroom had 300 minutes of scheduled instruction. This daily 20 minute and 15 minute lost instruction combined with emergency school closures results in an extensive amount of lost instruction.

**7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities. The technical and adult programs in the school are aligned with first local, and then state, then national job market opportunities. (Policy 2510)**

### **Finding**

County and school personnel interviewed indicated the leading industry or employment opportunities available in Calhoun County included: Hospital/health care, education (Calhoun County Schools), oil and gas industry, and timber industry. As for the State job market options, the students were offered educational opportunities to prepare them for natural resources, education, health care, educational technology, and college credit for advanced professional track students. Calhoun County is located within a 30 mile radius of Glenville State College and a federal prison, which are both located in neighboring Gilmer County. Students will have the opportunity to enroll in a criminal justice program at the Calhoun-Gilmer Career Center. Additionally, a new concentration

focusing on digital imaging was offered at the Career Technical Center (CTC). These programs align with local, State and some national job market opportunities.

## **7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.**

**7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.**

### **Findings**

The Calhoun Middle/High School Principal of Instruction indicated that she checks grade books online every Sunday night. It is Calhoun County Board of Education policy to collect a grade weekly. Additionally, the staff used a Google Spreadsheet developed by Calhoun County Schools' staff to document the CSOs being addressed during the nine-week grading periods. The Principal of Instruction indicated the administration then used the data from the Google spreadsheets when conducting walkthrough observations. These walkthrough observations also align with the school strategic plan.

**7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)**

### **Findings**

Two counselors served Calhoun Middle/High School; one counselor served the middle school and one served the high school. No counselor was assigned to the two elementary schools.

**7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)**



## Findings

Calhoun County School District required all teachers (including Pre-K through Grade 12) to participate in data analysis sessions. The data analyzed included: WESTEST2, ACT Plan/Explore, Armed Services Vocational Aptitude Battery (ASVAB), Benchmark, Acuity, Discipline, Attendance, ACT, SAT, and graduation data. The analysis guided the strategic plans at the school and county levels. A review of the strategic plans for each of the three schools and the county school district indicated that the data analysis was conducted and used to establish activities aligned with the identified areas of deficiency.

### **7.3. ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION.**

**7.3.1. Alternative education. Alternative education programs meet the requirements of Policy 2418. (W.Va. Code §18-2-6 and §18-5-19; Policy 2418)**

#### **Findings**

1. Calhoun County Schools received an Alternative Learning Center grant for \$184,910 annually for three years to provide an alternative learning center at the middle school. The grant provided funding for a teacher, a counselor, and an aide.
2. The Collaborative Learning Center (CLC) is a team approach for parents, students, and the school to work together to enhance student success. The CLC team consisted of an administrator (assistant principal), a certified counselor, licensed professional counselor, paraprofessional, and a general education teacher certified in multi-categorical special education. Each student in the CLC was assigned a laptop computer for use in all core subjects.
3. Calhoun County Schools used Plato for Credit Recovery for students identified as at risk.

## **7.4. REGULATORY AGENCY REVIEWS.**

**7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)**

### **Finance**

#### **Deficit Fund Balance:**

According to Calhoun County Schools' unaudited financial statements for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011, the district had a deficit uncommitted fund balance of (\$101,448) at year end, exclusive of the OPEB liability. This compares to a positive unreserved balance of \$151,285, also exclusive of OPEB, at June 30, 2010, a decrease of \$252,733. In a county the size of Calhoun this is a dramatic shift in the year-end carry-over balance that the board has available in just one year. A further analysis of the district's statement of revenues and expenditures for the year ended June 30, 2011 showed that expenditures, exclusive of OPEB, exceeded revenues by over \$262,000 during the year. This obviously accounts for the decrease in fund equity.

According to W.Va. Code §11-8-26, a local governmental entity is prohibited from expending funds or incurring obligations: "... in excess of funds available for current expense." In addition, the West Virginia Department of Education recommends that county boards maintain a 3-5 percent carry-over balance at year end to provide for any unforeseen expenses that may be incurred.

The Calhoun County Board of Education is required to develop a corrective action plan as to how it will resolve the deficit that has been incurred and to strive to build up its carry-over balance to the minimum recommended by the West Virginia Department of Education.

#### **Annual Financial Statements:**

Furthermore, a review of the financial statements disclosed that they were not presented in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Standards (GAAP).

According to Statement 54 issued by the Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB), all governmental entities were to begin classifying fund equity into the following categories beginning with the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011: Nonspendable, Restricted, Committed, Assigned and Unassigned. The fund equity classifications used by Calhoun County Schools were those used in previous years, but subsequent to the Office of Education Performance Audits review, the board treasurer revised the board's financial statements to comply with the new GAAP requirements.

### **Monthly Financial Report to the Board:**

The monthly financial reports to the board did not contain all of the information required by State Board Policy 8100. The treasurer did report to the board the condition of the General Current Expense Fund, such as expenditures, encumbrances, budget and remaining budget balances, but did not include similar information for the other funds, i.e., special revenue, ARRA special revenue, bond construction and capital projects funds. The monthly reports to the board also did not "indicate by fund, the beginning cash balance, the current month's receipts, the current month's disbursements, and the current month's ending cash balances" as outlined on Page 53 of State Board Policy 8100.

The Team recommended that the treasurer adopt a financial statement template that includes all of the required information prescribed in the policy. A sample format can be downloaded from the West Virginia Department of Education website.

### **Accounts Payable:**

During the review of paid invoices, the Team noted three transactions which were not in compliance with the requirements of State Board Policy 8100.

These included:

- Invoice Number 2697 from Athletic Outfitters dated 9-11-11 was paid 10-11-11 from Purchase Order Number 1200359. The purchase order was dated 9-13-11 and therefore obviously issued after the invoice was received.
- An allowed discount was not taken on Invoice Number 61602 from Lawson's Products dated 10-11-11 and paid by Check Number 43513.
- The Team noted the following issues with Invoice Number 11078 from LinquaCare Associates dated 6-30-11, paid by check issued 8-09-11 from Purchase Order Number 1200262 dated 7-28-11 using FY 2012 Federal Special Education funds. The purchase order was issued after the date of invoice, the expense was charged to FY 2012 project funds with FY 2011 funds still

unexpended, and the payment should have been reported as a FY 2011 expenditure and as an accounts payable at June 30, 2011, as required by GAAP.

**Other:**

No record could be found of the County Board approving school support organizations, as required by State Board Policy 1224.1.

**Review of School Accounting Transactions**

- A review of the individual schools' accounting records disclosed the following.

**Calhoun Middle/High School**

- The audit for the 2010-2011 year was complete and a corrective action plan to resolve audit findings was on file.
- The September bank statement had been reconciled.
- Several stale dated checks were listed on the outstanding check list. The Team recommended that the school staff ascertain why the checks have not been cashed and clear the checks by either canceling the stale dated checks and reissuing new checks or determining the checks unclaimed property and remit the amount of the checks to the State Treasurer's office.
- Purchase Order Number 183 used to encumber funds for the payment of an invoice from the Secondary Schools Athletic Commission (SSAC) was dated after the date of the invoice, which was 9-19-11.
- The balance of faculty senate funds allocated to teachers which were not spent by the end of the school year were allowed to remain with the teacher to be carried forward into the new school year. According to W.Va. Code §18-5A-5, funds allocated to teachers not expended during the school year are to be returned to the school's faculty senate. Of course the faculty senate of the subsequent year can, through its budget for the year, reestablish the balances of the teachers from the previous year, but this discretion lies with the new faculty senate.

### **Arnoldsburg Elementary**

- Based on a review of the bank reconciliation and accounting transactions for September, it appears that financial activities were performed in compliance with State Board Policy 1224.1.
- The audit of the 2010-2011 year had been completed and was on file.

### **Pleasant Hill Elementary**

- Based on a review of the bank reconciliation and accounting transactions for September, it appeared that all financial activities were performed in compliance with Policy 1224.1.
- The audit of the 2010-2011 year had been completed and was on file.
- The balance of faculty senate funds allocated to teachers which were not spent by the end of the school year were allowed to remain with the teacher to be carried forward into the new school year. According to W.Va. Code §18-5A-5, funds allocated to teachers not expended during the school year are to be returned to the school's faculty senate. Of course the faculty senate of the subsequent year can, through its budget for the year, reestablish the balances of the teachers from the previous year, but this discretion lies with the new faculty senate.

### **Commendation**

All school booster groups are required to deposit their funds in the schools' bank accounts. This requirement assures accountability for those funds and increases confidence of the general public that those funds are being used for their intended purpose and are accounted for properly. The school staffs have worked many extra hours to implement and assure compliance with this requirement. They, as well as all booster organization volunteers, are commended for their efforts in this endeavor.

### **Facilities**

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Calhoun County Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), interviewed the Director of School Facilities, the county superintendent, and visited two schools. A new facility is under construction to replace Arnoldsburg Elementary School and the Team did not visit that school. A narrative of the Team's observations follows.

### **Arnoldsburg Elementary**

School Building Authority (SBA) funding has been secured and this building will be replaced. This will remove the oldest building from the county inventory. This facility was outdated and had a history of flooding.

### **Pleasant Hill Elementary**

The original building was constructed in 1978 with an addition in 1983. Major renovations replaced a collapsed drain line and resolved some structural issues with settling under the floor. The building was in good condition. According to the CEF, this site has 6 usable acres (12 acres total) and is sufficient for expansion. The heating and air conditioning system is multi-zone rooftop units which were at the end of their expected life and needed to be replaced. The CEF rated the HVAC system "below average". The roof membrane was installed in 1992 and rated as "average" in the CEF. The maintenance director reported the sewer plant was outdated. Parking at this facility was inadequate. Some staining on the exterior walls needed to be cleaned. The food storage refrigerator/freezer was located outside and required the cooks to leave the building to retrieve items. A comprehensive documented preventive maintenance plan for this facility was not in place. Some preventive maintenance was being performed, but much of the maintenance was reactive in nature. The current CEF indicated the building utilization at 53 percent; 85 percent is desirable.

### **Calhoun Middle/High School**

Calhoun Middle/High School was constructed in 1998. The total site has 88 actual acres with 20 acres listed as usable. The building was in good condition. The heating and cooling system consisted of unit ventilators, rooftop units, two boilers, and a chiller. The equipment was original to the building. Some preventive maintenance was being performed at this facility. However, a comprehensive documented preventive maintenance plan was not in place and much of the maintenance at this facility was reactive in nature.

- The heating and cooling system was rated "above average" in the CEF.
- The roof membrane was rated "average".
- Some mercury thermostats were still in use and needed to be removed.
- The gymnasium currently did not have air conditioning. The county has secured funding to add air conditioning to the gymnasium. Because this facility is funded with SBA funds, it is reviewed annually by the West Virginia State Department of Education Office of School Facilities.

- This facility has been cited since 2007 for poor housekeeping practices, especially in the rest room areas. There have been some minor improvements, but overall a more aggressive housekeeping program must be implemented.
- Some areas needed to be painted. Several stained and dirty ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the building. The tiles around the air diffusers had collected dirt and needed to be replaced.
- Several of the plastic signs that marked classrooms, rest rooms, etc., were broken or completely missing.
- Other minor issues existed, such as loose door hardware, etc.

The current program utilization is 47 percent; 85 percent is desirable.

### **Countywide**

Creating a comprehensive preventive maintenance plan should be a priority. The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, will be rolling out a state wide preventive maintenance program to assist counties with procuring a software package to implement a preventive maintenance program. The Team strongly recommended that Calhoun County participate in this program.

The specifications for the new Arnoldsburg Elementary should include a comprehensive preventive maintenance plan to be provided to Calhoun County at the completion of the project.

### **Facility Recommendations**

1. The Team recommended that the county explore performance contracting opportunities to upgrade existing equipment and implement energy saving measures.
2. The Team recommended that the county explore implementing an Internet based automated work order system. This type of system would make it easier for teachers and administrators to request maintenance. It would also provide some accountability and visibility for the maintenance process. The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, can provide assistance in exploring this option.



## **7.5. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICES AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS.**

**7.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information. Staff members provide parents and the community with understandable information and techniques for helping students learn.**

### **Findings**

The county school did an adequate job of providing information to parents and the community.

1. Calhoun County Schools provided the following mechanisms for communicating with parents and community.
  - A county website with information about the school system,
  - School websites with information about the schools, and a
  - Parent Link, an automated phone calling system, which allowed a fast communicating system to provide parents information in emergency and non-emergency situations.
2. Each teacher at the Calhoun Middle/High School participated in Edline. This is a two way electronic, password protected communication system between teachers and parents who have children enrolled in their classes. Information on Edline such as grades, assignments, etc., is updated at least weekly and provides parents the opportunity to communicate with their children's teachers by e-mail.
3. The Parent Educator Resource Center (PERC) provided parents learning packets to use with their children at home.
4. Classes were held to provide parents the opportunity to learn how to use the technologies their children are using in school.
5. The county superintendent and school principals regularly prepared news releases for the local papers to provide school information to parents and community members.

**7.5.2. Codes of conduct. The county and schools implement, investigate, and monitor the code of conduct for students and the code of conduct for employees. (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5; Policy 4373; Policy 5902)**

### **Findings**

1. According to minutes of the Calhoun County Board of Education, discipline was an issue at Calhoun Middle/High School.
2. The Calhoun Middle/High School used the Respect and Protect discipline program which provided positive reinforcements for positive behaviors.

3. A code of expected student behaviors and consequences of misbehavior was used in the schools.
4. A system of recording student misbehaviors and discipline administered to students was kept on WVEIS. Information for the 2010-2011 school year showed an increase in the number of times students were disciplined for “Aggressive Behavior” (136 in 2010 to 179 in 2011) and “Failure to Obey Rules” (222 in 2010 to 338 in 2011).
5. The number of students reported “Tardy or Truant” decreased during the 2010-2011 school year from 115 in 2010 to 18 in 2011.
6. Employees were annually provided training in the Employee Code of Conduct expectations and processes. Procedures were in place to address employee violations of the Code of Conduct and were used as needed.

**7.5.3. Statewide assessment. Test security measures are in place for the WESTEST. All students in the school participate in the statewide assessment program that includes state content assessments on the WESTEST or West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) at grades 3-8 and 10 and the Writing Assessment at grades 4, 7, and 10. Students with disabilities who have an IEP or a Section 504 Plan may be assessed on the state content assessments under one of the following conditions: standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, or non-standard conditions with modifications. Students unable to participate in the standardized assessment under these conditions and who meet the alternate assessment criteria will participate in the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA). Education Performance Audit teams will verify the eligibility of any student tested under standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, alternate assessment, or medical emergency student exemptions. Students who are continuously enrolled in the public school from the fifth instructional day of school to the spring assessment administration will be considered in the accountability system. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)**

## **Findings**

1. According to staff interviews, the WESTEST2 was administered to all students in Grades 3-11 who met the guidelines for the assessment. Students who qualified for alternate assessment were identified and tested in compliance with policy.
2. Staff indicated that test security measures were in place and testing materials were handled in a secure manner that met the policy requirement.
3. Staff involved with the administration of the WESTEST2 was trained annually.
4. All Grade 8 students participated in the ACT EXPLORE assessment with accommodations/modifications provided for students who qualified.

5. All Grade 10 students participated in the ACT PLAN assessment with accommodations/modifications provided for students who qualified.

**7.5.4. Physical Assessment. The school participates in the appropriate statewide physical assessment program.**

#### **Findings**

1. Students in Grades 4 through 10 participated in the FitnessGram testing.
2. Results of the testing from all three schools were entered into the WVEIS as required.
3. The Team reviewed FitnessGram testing results for all schools and found that all aspects of the assessment had been completed.

## 7.6. PERSONNEL.

### 7.6.1. Hiring. County boards follow hiring practices set forth in W.Va. Code. (W.Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and 18-2E-3a)

#### Findings

The Team observed the following discrepancies in hiring practices.

1. There were no official bid forms for service or professionals posted positions. Employees e-mail or write their name on a posting stating that they are interested in the job. New applicants fill out an application and submit the application as a bid.
2. A matrix with applicant information was found in some files but the files did not contain verification of the applicant's criteria. The secretary said she got the information out of the employee file. The Team could not determine verification that the highest qualified applicant received the job.
3. Evidence did not exist of who participated on the interview committees. A set of interview questions was provided by the middle/high school which was used for all interviews during the summer of 2011. The criteria questions in W.Va. Code were not part of the interview, although they were on the matrix in the folder. No documents showed the response by the applicants or the information needed in the W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a criteria.
4. Teachers were transferred to other positions after the 5<sup>th</sup> day prior to the instructional term without written notification to the State Superintendent of Schools.
5. Professional seniority was listed with a date rather than a quantity W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a (i). Service seniority listed initial employment date rather than seniority date within the classification. The same seniority date was maintained even when the personnel transferred into another classification.
6. The county did not employ a half time attendance director as required by State Code. Instead, this job is a duty the principal of instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School in addition to duties as a full time principal.

The Team observed the following discrepancies in postings.

1. All postings were not dated. A numbering/coding system for the postings existed that distinguished postings as: Service, professional, coaching, extra-curricular, etc.
2. A posting for a music teacher listed the salary as \$1.00; although, the back of the posting stated that the salary will be "State Basic". This position appeared to be an extra-curricular position, but it was not stated on the postings (State Minimum Salary W.Va. Code §18A-4-2).
3. Qualifications on service postings such as satisfactory evaluations and successfully pass the classification test were not stated on the postings (W.Va. Code §18A-4-8b).
4. Service postings are required to have work hours and days of the week on the postings.

**7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)**

The Team reported the following violations of (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2 and WVBE Policy 5202). Chart 20 explains the certification issues the Team observed through a detailed review of the certified list, WVEIS Master Course Schedule, and the WVDE Certification Database. The Team did note that the credentials of professional personnel were consistent with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies a few exceptions that are listed in Chart 20.

Chart 20

Calhoun County OEPA Visit October 20, 2011					
School	Educator	WVEIS Assign	Current Certification	Correction Needed	County Action
014 201 Arnoldsburg	8HIL S			Identify teacher of record or remove from master schedule or STU240	
	Educator	3004-MATH 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 4004-ENG LA 4 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 6004-SCIENCE 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 7004-SOC ST 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04	Out-of-Field Authorization 4500 -Gifted Grds: 01-12 Elem Ed 0K-6 Multi Cat 0K-6	OH needs to be designated in the 6 <sup>th</sup> digit of the course code if these students are case managed by this teacher.	
014 203 Pleasant Hill	8CUN A			Identify teacher of record and/or remove from master schedule.	
	Educator	8013-COLTCH-GIFT 0 G-GIFTED:1-8 Grades:	Professional Teaching Certificate Elementary Education K-06 Reading Endorsement K-06	Coded 8013 therefore need to apply for a gifted authorization.	

**7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)**

**Findings**

The Team reviewed new teacher hire logs for 2009-2010, 2010-2011, and 2011-2012, to determine the 0-3 years' experience for required observations/evaluations and compiled an alphabetical listing of personnel and matched the list with current personnel files.

The Team also reviewed personnel evaluations for professional personnel with 4-5 years' experience, other professional personnel, support personnel, service personnel, coaches, etc., to determine that the evaluation process was conducted according to W.Va. Code §18A-2-12, West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, and county policy.

A random review of professional evaluations disclosed the following.

**Teachers**

1. Three teachers (Pleasant Hill School, Pleasant Hill School/Arnoldsburg School, and Calhoun Middle/High School) did not have evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires two evaluations for teachers with 0-2 years of experience.
2. One teacher (Calhoun Middle/High School) was evaluated one time in the 2010-2011 school year. The teacher was a first year teacher and should have been evaluated two times.
3. One teacher's (Calhoun Middle/High School) first evaluation was completed 2-11-11. Calhoun County School District procedures required that the first evaluation be completed by January 15 for personnel to be evaluated two times per year.

**Administrators**

1. One school administrator (Central Office) received one evaluation in each of the first three years of employment. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires two evaluations per year for the first three years of employment for a school administrator.
2. One school administrator (Arnoldsburg School) had written goals for the 2010-2011 school year, but the page showing the goals had not been signed by the supervisor showing mutual agreement on the goals.

3. One school administrator (Calhoun Middle/High School) did not have an evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year.
4. One teacher signed a form provided by the principal in August 2009 to gather information from the staff on evaluations for the school year indicating they would be on performance evaluation for the 2009-2010 school year. The only record of the evaluation process performed for this teacher for the 2009-2010 school year was a Teacher Observation/Data Collection form completed on September 23, 2009.

The following year, 2010-2011, a Teacher Observation/Data Collection form was completed on October 20, 2010, for this teacher by the high school assistant principal. Another Teacher Observation/Data Collection form was completed for this teacher on November 17, 2010, by the principal of Calhoun Middle/High School. No further observation/evaluation information was completed for this teacher during the 2010-2011 school year. At the conclusion of the 2010-2011 school year, this teacher was notified by letter dated June 8, 2011, from the principal of Calhoun Middle/High School that he/she was being placed on performance evaluation status for the 2011-2012 school year.

A random review of support personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

### **Findings**

1. One school counselor did not have an evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year.
2. One speech therapist was last evaluated in the 2005-06 school year. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires that professional support personnel with more than three years of experience be evaluated a minimum of once every three years.
3. One counselor who had been employed for five years did not have any evaluations.

A random review of coaches' evaluations disclosed the following:

### **Findings**

1. Completed observation forms were not on file for the coaches' evaluations the Team reviewed. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires that two observations be completed for each evaluation of a coach.
2. Two coaches' did not have evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year.
3. Two coaches' evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year were not completed within four weeks of the end of the sport seasons as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.



A random review of service personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

## Findings

1. Calhoun County School District's procedures for evaluating School Personnel Not Covered by State Board Policy 5310 states, regular school service employees are to be evaluated at least once per year and "each written evaluation must be based upon a minimum of two observations". Calhoun County administrators who evaluated service personnel did not complete the county required observation forms.
2. Two secretaries had only one evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year. Calhoun County School District's evaluation procedures required two evaluations for service personnel with 0-2 years of experience.
3. One custodian, one teacher aide, and two cooks (Pleasant Hill School) had not been evaluated during the 2010-2011 school year as required by Calhoun County School District's personnel evaluation procedures.

**7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)**

## Findings

Mentor positions were posted and filled by qualified applicants. A lag time of almost two months occurred from the hiring of the new teacher to the assignment of a mentor. No evidence of the monthly support team meetings or the final evaluation of the mentor by the principal was found at the county office or at the Calhoun Middle/High School (Policy 5900).

No evidence showed that the requirements in Policy 5900, *Beginning Educator Internship Program*, (Section 6. Program Requirements) had been followed in implementing the mentor program. The nine requirements of the beginning educator internship program are listed below.

### Requirement 1

- A professional support team shall be comprised of the following:
- The school principal, who shall be the chair of the professional support team.
- A member of the county professional staff development council.

- An experienced classroom teacher at the school who teaches the same or similar subject and grade level as the beginning teacher (if possible), and who shall serve as a mentor for the beginning teacher.

#### Requirement 2

- An orientation program for the beginning teacher shall be conducted prior to the beginning of the instructional term, but within the employment term, supervised by the mentor teacher.

#### Requirement 3

- Joint planning periods, when possible, shall be scheduled for the mentor and beginning teacher throughout the school year.

#### Requirement 4

- When possible, the mentor shall observe the beginning teacher's classroom teaching skills for at least one hour per week during the first half of the school year. Observation time may be reduced at the discretion of the mentor to one hour every two weeks during the second half of the school year.

#### Requirement 5

- Weekly meetings between the mentor and the beginning teacher shall occur at which the mentor and the beginning teacher discuss the performance of the beginning teacher and any needed improvements. These meetings may be reduced, at the discretion of the mentor, to biweekly meetings during the second half of the school year.

#### Requirement 6

- Monthly meetings of the professional support team shall occur to discuss the performance of the beginning teacher. These meetings may include all mentor members of all professional support teams at the school if helpful in the judgment of the participants.

#### Requirement 7

- In-service professional development programs shall be provided through the professional development project of the center for professional development for beginning teachers and for mentors, both of which will be held in the first half of the school year.

### Requirement 8

- The mentor teacher shall be released from regular duties, as agreed to by the principal and the mentor teacher, and a yearly stipend of at least six hundred dollars for the mentor teacher for duties as a mentor teacher.

### Requirement 9

A final evaluation of the performance of the beginning teacher shall be completed by the principal on a form developed by the state board of education. The final evaluation form shall be submitted by the principal to the county school superintendent and shall include one of the following recommendations:

- Full professional status: A recommendation of full professional status indicates that the beginning teacher has successfully completed the internship program and in the judgment of the principal has demonstrated competence as a professional educator;
- Continuing internship status: A recommendation of continuing internship status indicates that in the judgment of the principal the beginning teacher requires further supervision and further employment in the district should be conditioned upon successful completion of an additional year under a beginning teacher internship program; or
- Discontinue employment: A recommendation to discontinue employment indicates that in the judgment of the principal the beginning teacher has completed two years of employment under supervision in a beginning teacher internship program, has not demonstrated competence as professional educator and will not benefit from further supervised employment in the district.

Mentor data stipend was submitted and approved for reimbursement. It was reported that in the past the county did not have principals with five years of experience to serve as mentors for new principals.

Calhoun County Schools did not meet the basic requirement of West Virginia Board of Education Policy which requires documentation of meetings with the mentor. However, Calhoun County Schools initiated a beginning teacher program for 16 teachers with zero to two years of experience. This program, *Emerging Educators*, is a year-long course designed to support the growth of teachers new or relatively new to the profession and is intended to strengthen the operation of the professional learning community within the school. The goal is that participants will gain an understanding of the systemic nature of school improvement and their role to continual improvement. This program challenges participants to sharpen their focus on student learning of the West Virginia content standards and objectives, the delivery of engaging instruction,

and the need for a system of balanced assessment. Led by RESA 5, Professional Development Director, this course meets six times (monthly) for two hours each.

## **7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.**

**7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)**

### **Findings**

Board minutes indicated that some parents and board members had concerns regarding discipline at Calhoun Middle/High School.

**7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)**

W.Va. Code §18A-1-12a (17) states, "All official and enforceable personnel policies of a county board must be written and made available to its employees."

### **Findings**

The Calhoun County School District Policy Manual was well organized and policies were easy to locate. The policy manual was also posted on the Calhoun County School District webpage. The on-line version was also easy to navigate.

### Missing or Incomplete Policies

- Leave Donation Policy. This policy is required by W.Va. Code §18A-4-10f. Calhoun County Schools adopted a Personal Leave Bank that was last revised on April 16, 2002.
- Purchasing Procedures. A policy on purchasing procedures was not in place as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200 (Section 4.1).
- Veteran's Funerals Band Students to Play Taps. This policy is required by W. Va. Code §18-2E-8e.

## Recommendation

Several policies had never been reviewed in recent years. Policies should be reviewed periodically to determine if changes or updates are appropriate. The following policies are specific examples of those that need to be reviewed and updated.

- Educational Records was last reviewed in 2003.
- Discipline-1999.
- Mission, Goals and Objectives-April 5, 1999.
- Tobacco Control policy was adopted April 5, 1999 and had not been reviewed or updated. The last part of the policy indicated the policy will be reviewed every two years.
- Alternative Education-Adoption Date was not listed.
- Special Education Chapter 3 Instruction-Adopted April 5, 1999.
- Test Security Chapter 3 Instruction-Adopted April 5, 1999.

### Policy reference incorrect for West Virginia Board of Education Policy.

This primarily takes place in policies that have not been reviewed for an extensive time.

- AIDS Education – Chapter 3 Instruction references West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2422.2, which was adopted on April 5, 1999. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2422.2 is Driver's Education. The correct reference is Policy 2422.4

### Policies No Longer In Practice

Some policies were no longer in practice. These policies needed to be updated or deleted. The following are examples:

- In School Suspension Coverage (Chapter 2 – Administration). This policy was adopted on April 5, 1999 with no reviews or revisions. Calhoun County personnel interviewed stated that parts of this policy are no longer in practice. Additionally, any policy related to in-school suspension could be part of the new West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4373, *Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools* (Effective July 1, 2012).
- Grievance Procedures – Chapter 5 – Personnel – This policy was approved on April 5, 1999. This policy is no longer applicable and needed to be up updated.

## **Commendation**

Student handbooks were consistent across the county and contained policies and procedures that students and parents needed to be informed. The Calhoun County Board of Education reviews the student handbooks each year.

## 7.8. LEADERSHIP.

### **7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)**

W.Va. Code §18A-2-12a (1) provides “The effective and efficient operation of the public schools depends upon the development of harmonious and cooperative relationships between county boards and school personnel.”

### **Findings**

The Team interviewed all five Calhoun County Board of Education members, the Superintendent of Calhoun County Schools, the Director of School Improvement, and the Calhoun Middle/High School Principal of Instruction. The Team also reviewed the Calhoun County Policy Manual and two years of Board meeting minutes.

1. Board members and the superintendent expressed pride in the teamwork of the county board and superintendent and expressed determination to improve the academic performance of students attending Calhoun County’s schools.
2. The Calhoun County Board of Education completed the superintendent’s evaluation from the West Virginia School Boards Association and the superintendent’s goals were established based on the needs of the school system.
3. The board members recently received the on-line self-assessment and members were in the process of completing it during the education performance audit.
4. The Calhoun County Board of Education members and the county superintendent were fully aware of the problem with two schools not achieving AYP and the third school achieving AYP through the confidence interval. The board and superintendent demonstrated major commitment to improve by reorganizing the Calhoun Middle/High School administration configuration to include a Principal of Instruction and providing on-going embedded professional development opportunities based on student needs. The county superintendent and the Calhoun Middle/High School Principal for Instruction reported that one data coach had been hired and the superintendent had posted a position for another.
5. With support from the central office, the Calhoun Middle/High School established a Professional Learning Community (PLC) with teacher-led focus groups. Outcomes of the focus groups included the adoption of a schoolwide Instructional Plan format that teachers had identified as a communication need.

6. The Calhoun County Board of Education was a well-functioning board in which meetings were conducted according to State Code, West Virginia Board of Education policies, and county policies. Board members were knowledgeable of and practiced good board membership. Board meeting minutes verified that public meeting protocols were followed, meetings were conducted in a professional and respectful manner, and the board was transparent in its actions.
7. The Calhoun Middle/High School had organized a Student Focus Group of 50 students from different backgrounds and interests. This Leadership Team was working to build a sense of ownership and community in the school in order to build a strong foundation for positive climate and culture.

### Recommendations

1. The Calhoun County Board of Education policy on School Board Effectiveness was adopted in 2003. The attached Goals and Objectives were adopted in 1999. The board needs to revisit and update this policy.
2. A review of board meeting minutes indicated little recognition of staff and student accomplishments throughout the year. The board and administrators should establish processes to recognize academic successes.
3. Interviews with administrators indicated that several programs had been initiated in the past two to three years. While it takes time for new programs to take effect, strategies should be incorporated to determine which initiatives are making an impact. For example, it was reported that the district had purchased Measures of Academic Progress (MAP) for three years. The district should find out if the program is making an impact and if not, discern the reasons. The county should then incorporate needed changes.
4. The Calhoun County School District appointed a Director of School Improvement at the central office and a Principal of Instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School. However, these positions have been assigned too many other responsibilities to focus on the targets their titles imply. The district leaders should determine the time commitment required to be successful in these positions and explore ways to provide the resources needed.
5. School administrators could report several initiatives and programs implemented at the Calhoun Middle/High School. However, administrators and board members were not as informed about the two elementary schools. In fact, one board member reported that one elementary school was doing fine because it achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP). The school achieved AYP by application of the confidence interval. Another board member thought that one elementary school caused the county to not achieve AYP. The district should closely examine student achievement at the elementary level to determine how better to equip



students with the skills necessary to succeed at the higher grades. The Team recommended that the board members receive specific achievement information about each school and the county.

## Findings

1. Annually the board is to meet with each school's Local School Improvement Council (LSIC) and at this meeting a quorum of the Local School Improvement Council is to be in attendance. Meetings with the Calhoun County Board of Education and each school's LSIC were held as required by W.Va. Codes §§18-5-14 and 18-5A-2. Each school LSIC provided a report that addressed items designated by the county that were specified in W.Va. Code §18-5-14(a)(1)(B). These included: School performance, Curriculum, Status of the school in meeting the school improvement plan, and status of the school in meeting the county plan. Minutes of the Calhoun County Board of Education meeting minutes did not show that a quorum was present. Generally, the principal represented the LSIC in presenting the report.
2. In a review of the last two years of Calhoun County Board minutes, it was determined that the superintendent had not signed five sets of minutes and another eight signatures were stamped.
3. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism (Policy 5500.03). District leaders expressed a written vision of high expectations through the Calhoun County Board of Education's Goal One: Ensure Quality Education. Objective 1 is, "Create a strong culture of commitment to educational excellence." The first goal of the superintendent is, "To ensure that the Calhoun County School System's primary emphasis is on improving the instructional process in order to maximize student achievement." However, interviews at all levels indicated a lack of diligence in holding all teachers and administrators accountable for providing high levels of instruction in all classrooms. The county WESTEST2 percent proficiency indicated a severe need to approach the intervening issues that impede countywide education in a concerted and systematic manner. While staff at all levels of the educational system identified areas that resulted in the low student, school, and school district performance, solutions to real and sustained school improvement remained elusive. Educators will need to actively embrace the concept and practice that each is responsible for student achievement and work toward this.

## **8.1. INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY.**

**8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.**

### **Findings**

1. Calhoun County regularly seeks external funding and options for student curriculum enhancement. Located within a 30 mile radius of Glenville State College, Calhoun County Schools uses this college for Earn a Degree Graduate Early (EDGE) credits and dual credit courses. The Team interviewed several students on the day of the audit and learned that several juniors and seniors had accumulated a substantial number of college credits. One student indicated she will be graduating with enough credits to be enrolled as a junior at Glenville State College beginning with the fall 2012 semester.
2. As a result of an interest survey, the administration at Calhoun Middle/High School added an education concentration at the Calhoun-Gilmer Career Center that counts toward EDGE credit.

**8.1.2. Transportation. The school district evaluates the cost containment and effectiveness of the transportation system and provides students efficient transportation services consistent with State laws and policies.**

### **Findings**

On the day of the audit, the Team observed students standing outside Calhoun Middle/High School prior to the opening of the school waiting for entry. A student approached a member of the School Education Performance Audit Team and asked if the Team could do anything about them standing outside when they were released from the bus in the morning and were not permitted inside the school building. The principal indicated this was a scheduling issue and the bus driver should not release students until the school doors open. On the day of the audit, the weather was rainy and cold. With severe weather issues, this could be potentially hazardous to students who are exposed to the elements for this period of time. The Team recommended that the transportation director, bus drivers, and school administration coordinate a schedule for students exiting the bus and entering the school and eliminate the need for students to wait outside in severe weather.

**8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative**

**services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.**

**Findings**

1. The central office administration did not adequately assess the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree of services provided to support high quality curriculum and instructional services. While an employee was hired as a “Director of School Improvement” for Calhoun County Schools, this individual is not provided adequate time to focus on instruction and curriculum because of multiple duties. Other duties included: Technology director, county test coordinator, professional staff development, Title II and Rural and Low Income Schools (RLIS) director, oversight of several grants (Gear Up, Heads Up [the 21st century grant], S3 grant and ALC pilot grant at CMHS), Critical Skills, Achieve 21, WVEIS county contact, textbook adoption and oversight of instructional material purchases (including STEP 7), contact for FRN, and coordinates the five-year strategic planning process for all schools. This individual is also responsible for administrative tasks, such as, homeschooling, student transfers, college collaborative for dual credit courses, revision and implementation of State and county board policies, and interviewing substitute teacher candidates. Realistically, it is impossible to perform all of these administrative duties well, while focusing on student achievement and school improvement. The Team feels other duties impeded time for school improvement and many of those duties were not the best use of this director’s time or skills.
2. The Team noted that the personnel functions were being handled by the county superintendent’s secretary. The volume of work and professional development required for this responsibility paired with the role of the superintendent’s secretary is difficult for one person to manage in an effective manner. Personnel findings supported this statement.
3. The county office administration worked with the Calhoun County Board of Education to restructure the administration at Calhoun Middle/High School. The previous structure included a principal and two assistant principals. The school now has two full-time principals and one assistant principal. One full time principal is responsible for curriculum and instruction while the other is responsible for all things not related to curriculum and instruction. The assistant principal is responsible for discipline. While this structure may seem practical, it was not well-thought out and has caused some confusion as to the primary principal of the school and who is responsible for evaluating whom. Currently, the superintendent evaluates the administrators of the schools. Additionally, the principal of instruction also serves as the county attendance director. This is not allowable under W.Va. Code as each county is required to employ at least a half-time attendance director. This principal is full time and is also doing the half-time attendance director work. The superintendent indicated this was only for the

2011-2012 year and the attendance director position will be posted for the 2012-2013 year. However, this is in violation of State Code.

**8.1.5. Personnel. The school district assesses the assignment of personnel as based on West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies to determine the degree to which instructional and support services provided to the schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.**

### **Findings**

1. The county posted a vacancy for Assistant Music Teacher at Calhoun Middle/High School for an annual salary of \$1. This violates the State minimum salary requirement.
2. The county did not employ a half time attendance director as required by State Code. Instead, this job is a duty of the principal of instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School in addition to duties as a full time principal.

**8.1.6. Regional Education Service Agency. The school district effectively utilizes Regional Education Service Agency programs and services or other regional services that may be initiated between and among county boards.**

### **Findings**

1. Calhoun County Schools regularly uses RESA 5 services. The Director of Professional Development indicated on the day of the audit that of the amount of time he spends in schools located in the eight RESA 5 counties, he is in Calhoun Middle/High School approximately 80 percent of this time. He indicated the major issue with achievement at Calhoun Middle/High School is that many teachers were not connecting teaching with meeting the learning needs of the students. He said that the Instructional Practices Inventory (IPI) data collected thus far showed only 12 percent of the classrooms observed at Calhoun Middle/High School engaged students at levels above the level of predominately teacher led instruction. However, he did indicate that the culture had improved since the focus on this area was implemented.
2. Calhoun County School District contracted with RESA 5 for a dedicated technology technician to serve all three building sites in Calhoun County and an electronic repair request system was in place.
3. Calhoun County Schools worked with the RESA 5 Coordinator of Special Education to implement the IPI data collection process.

4. Calhoun County School District also worked with RESA 5 in the following areas: New teacher academy; use of the Charlotte Danielson's book, *A Framework for Teaching*; David Langford's book, *Tool Time for Education*; Stephen Covey's book, *The Seven habits of Highly Effective Teens*; and other RESA services for implementing the following: High Quality Standards teacher self-evaluation matrix, Professional Learning Communities (PLCs), and Culture Improvement.

## **CAPACITY BUILDING**

**18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building efforts in Calhoun County Schools are overshadowed by the internal issues regarding administrative practices and support for school administrators in following through with teacher evaluation procedures. While the limited county staff relayed excellent ideas for school improvement and had taken steps toward improving student achievement, it is difficult for the county to plan for sustainability beyond grant funding and no excess levy funding to support such efforts. Additionally, the Team noted quality employees located at the school and central office levels; however, they were encumbered by too many administrative responsibilities to focus on achievement.

## **EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION**

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Calhoun County Schools utilized the critical skills funding to target struggling students in Grades 3 and 8. Additionally, Calhoun County Schools has participated in the Reading First grant, which targeted struggling readers in elementary school. Students reading proficiency increased somewhat in Grade 8.

The Calhoun County School District is the lowest achieving district in the state of West Virginia. Much support has been given to Calhoun Middle/High School from the West Virginia Department of Education and RESA 5. Issues which influence student achievement have been identified as discussed throughout this report. Staff development and programs and practices have been provided to improve student achievement. Even with all these endeavors, student achievement remained below standard.

Now that Calhoun County and State agencies have diagnosed the reasons for low achievement, an urgency exists for the county "all staff" and stakeholders to align a common force that combats the current inertia of the school system. The educational system (Grades PK-12 and post-secondary) must be adjusted to produce a proper relationship that is translated into student, school, and school system improvement. Performance data and the findings in this report indicate that the Office of Education Performance Audits (OEPA) must not mistake activity (most teachers in all schools were observed providing good instruction) for achievement. Therefore, it is the

assessment of the OEPA that teachers and administrators need intense content area development for instruction.

### **CALHOUN COUNTY SUMMARY**

The Team identified significant issues of the Calhoun County Board of Education that will require extensive examination and overhaul. Student, school, and school district achievement was low. The county had a casual financial deficit for FY2011 and the on-site review revealed financial audit findings. Personnel, particularly hiring practices and licensure, were problematic. Personnel evaluations did not follow State Code and State Board Policy, and the Beginning Educator Internship Program was not being followed.

The essential issue confronting the Calhoun County School District is the district and schools are not adequately preparing students. This conclusion is born by the performance data in this report. The data link student and school performance and progress to graduation rate and college and career readiness.

Numerous intervening factors affect student achievement of Calhoun County School District's students. Foremost, county office level staff conduct administrative responsibilities according to past structures, policies, and procedures. Examples include instruction, hiring practices, county policies, personnel evaluations, and finance. Calhoun County and its schools will need to move into a 21<sup>st</sup> Century school system that operates according to current statutory and State Board of Education policies and procedures.

Secondly, Calhoun Middle/High School has received and continues to receive support and assistance from the West Virginia Department of Education and RESA 5, yet the school has not fully embraced application of State and regional support.

It is the determination of the Office of Education Performance Audits that the Calhoun County Board of Education is a high functioning board and the county superintendent possesses the leadership necessary to lead the county. However, it is essential that Calhoun County's leaders ensure new requirements, standards, and best practices are instituted countywide.

### **OEPA RECOMMENDATION**

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audits and the revised strategic plans, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education approve the reports and the revised strategic plans and direct Calhoun County and the schools to correct the findings noted in the reports by the next accreditation cycle and improve student, school, and school district student performance.