



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

CALHOUN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JULY 2013

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced (five days in advance) Education Performance Audit of the Calhoun County School District was conducted on October 17-20, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate reasons the county had not achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) during four of the past five years, the county's achievement ranked in the lower ranking of the other school districts in West Virginia, and other existing circumstances that warranted an on-site review. The Team also reviewed district level high-quality standards in accordance with appropriate procedures to make recommendations to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the high-quality standards as required by W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of the Calhoun County School District was conducted March 26-28, 2013. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

This report presents comments from the previous Education Performance Audit Report and the follow-up review of Calhoun County School District and schools.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair - Dr. Gus Penix, Director

NAME	TITLE	COUNTY	CATEGORY
David Bailey	HVAC Technician Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities
Dr. Monica Bean	Assistant Director Office of Research	WV Department of Education	AYP/Five-Year Strategic Plan/High Quality Standards
Chris Derico	Director of Services	Lewis County Schools	Policies
Robyn Fitzsimmons	Personnel Director	Marshall County Schools	Personnel/Hiring Practices
Lori Buckhannon	Coordinator Office of Professional Preparation	WV Department of Education	Certification
Jody Lucas	Treasurer/Chief Business School Officer	Cabell County Schools	Finance
Carroll Staats	Audit Reviewer	OEPA	Evaluations/ Administrative Practices

COUNTY PERFORMANCE

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and related student performance data. It also presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

5.1. ACCOUNTABILITY.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Adequate Yearly Progress

The No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data for the 2010-2011 school year identified that Calhoun County did not achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP). Calhoun County failed to achieve AYP for four of the last five years. Additionally, the school district performed in the bottom ranking of all school districts in West Virginia. Chart 1 shows the grade span/assessment and subgroup(s) that did not achieve AYP. It also shows the percent proficient for each grade span/assessment and subgroup.

Compared to the 2010 scores, Calhoun County students showed a negligible increase in the elementary level mathematics percent proficient in the all students (AS) subgroup (35.3 percent to 36.7 percent) and in the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup (35.5 percent to 36.5 percent). The elementary economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup percent proficient decreased from 37.2 percent to 32.1 percent. Secondary level mathematics percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (27.4 percent to 31.4 percent), the W subgroup (27.5 percent to 31.3 percent), and the SES subgroup (22.1 percent to 26.8 percent).

Student proficient scores significantly decreased in elementary reading in the AS subgroup (40.4 percent to 32.3 percent), in the W subgroup (40.6 percent to 32.1 percent), and in the SES subgroup (40.7 percent to 29.5 percent). Secondary reading percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (21.6 percent to 28.8 percent) and the W subgroup (21.7 percent to 29.1 percent).

The Team noted the progress in achievement; however, the increased percent proficient was still well below the State average percent proficient.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

As noted in Chart 1, compared to the 2011 scores, Calhoun County students showed a decrease in the elementary level mathematics percent proficient in the all students (AS) subgroup (36.7 percent to 35.4 percent) and in the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup (36.5 percent to 35.4 percent). The elementary

economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup percent proficient decreased from (32.1 percent to 28.0 percent). Secondary level mathematics percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (31.4 percent to 37.4 percent), the W subgroup (31.3 percent to 37.4 percent), and the SES subgroup (26.8 percent to 35.7 percent).

Student proficient scores increased in elementary reading in the AS subgroup (32.3 percent to 33.1 percent), in the W subgroup (32.1 percent to 33.8 percent), and decreased in the SES subgroup (29.5 percent to 23.2 percent). Secondary reading percent proficient increased for the AS subgroup (28.8 percent to 34.1 percent) and the W subgroup (29.1 percent to 34.1 percent).

The Team noted the progress in secondary achievement; however, increased percent proficient was well below the State average percent proficient. In addition, the percent proficient decreased in all elementary subgroups, except the AS and W subgroups in reading.

NOTE: The West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE), Office of Special Programs, conducted a follow-up special education audit of Calhoun County School District March 4, 2013. The audit revealed that all findings had not been corrected as identified in the initial special education audit. Of note, the special education subgroup at both the elementary and secondary levels did not make adequate yearly progress (AYP) in reading or mathematics.

Chart 1

WESTEST				
GRADE SPAN/ASSESSMENT	SUBGROUP	2011-2012 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2010-2011 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2009-2010 PERCENT PROFICIENT
Elementary – Mathematics	All Students (AS)	35.4%	36.7%	35.3%
Elementary – Mathematics	White (W)	35.4%	36.5%	35.5%
Elementary – Mathematics	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	28.0%	32.1%	37.2%
Secondary - Mathematics	All Students (AS)	37.4%	31.4%	27.4%
Secondary - Mathematics	White (W)	37.4%	31.3%	27.5%
Secondary - Mathematics	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	35.7%	26.8%	22.1%
Elementary - Reading	All Students (AS)	33.1%	32.3%	40.4%
Elementary - Reading	White (W)	33.8%	32.1%	40.6%
Elementary - Reading	Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	23.2%	29.5%	40.7%
Secondary – Reading	All Students (AS)	34.1%	28.8%	21.6%
Secondary – Reading	White (W)	34.1%	29.1%	21.7%

Chart 2 shows that the number of Calhoun County’s schools identified for not achieving AYP increased since 2009.

In 2007 and 2008, one school did not make AYP. All schools in the county made AYP in 2009; however, since 2009, the number of schools not meeting AYP steadily increased from one in 2010 to two in 2011.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Chart 2 shows that the number of Calhoun County’s schools identified for not achieving AYP has steadily increased from one in 2010 to three in 2012. None of Calhoun County’s three schools achieved AYP in 2012.

Chart 2

NUMBER OF SCHOOLS NOT ACHIEVING AYP		
Year	Number of Schools Not Achieving AYP/Total Schools	Percentage Achieving AYP
2007	1/3	66.7%
2008	1/3	66.7%
2009	0/3	100.0%
2010	1/3	66.7%
2011	2/3	33.3%
2012	3/3	0%

Charts 3 and 5 indicated that the 2010-2011 Calhoun County School District student percent proficient in mathematics was substantially lower than the State percent proficient at both the elementary and secondary levels in mathematics. Calhoun County School District’s percent proficiency rate of the all students (AS) subgroup was 36.7 percent in elementary mathematics compared to the State proficiency rate of 45.2 percent. The percentage of Calhoun County AS secondary students proficient in mathematics was 31.4 percent compared to the State proficiency rate of 43.0 percent.

When interviewed, the Director of School Improvement and the building principal indicated that multiple factors contributed to this decline in achievement. One elementary school experienced a significant drop in achievement which resulted in not achieving AYP. One factor addressed by the central office and school leadership was the reassignment of staff into positions for which the teachers were more comfortable with the curriculum. In 2010-2011, teachers were in Grade 4 positions they had not taught prior to that year. Only 19 percent of the students in these two Grade 4 classes were proficient in the reading subtest. Because of transfer and reduction in force (RIF) opportunities, these teachers were able to move to other positions for the 2011-2012 year. However, these students moved on to Calhoun Middle High School unprepared for the Grade 5 curriculum.

Another issue involved the culture in the schools. One school faculty included a group of 16 teachers having zero to two years of teaching experience, while the remainder of the faculty was experienced with over 20 years. Because of the issue with school culture (as validated by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Improvement), the focus has not been on student achievement, rather on addressing persistent culture issues first.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Charts 3 and 5 indicated that the 2011-2012 Calhoun County School District student percent proficient in mathematics was substantially lower than the State percent proficient at both the elementary and secondary levels in mathematics. Calhoun County School District's all students (AS) subgroup percent proficient was 35.4 percent in elementary mathematics compared to the State proficiency rate of 50.1 percent. The percentage of Calhoun County's AS secondary students proficient in mathematics was 37.4 percent compared to the State proficiency rate (46.6 percent).

Elementary mathematics all students (AS) subgroup decreased from 36.7 percent proficient in 2010-2011 to 35.4 percent in 2011-2012. Secondary mathematics AS subgroup increased from 31.4 percent in 2010-2011 to 37.4 percent in 2011-2012. Of note, the secondary mathematics economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup increased significantly from 26.8 percent in 2010-2011 to 35.7 percent in 2011-2012.

The Director of School Improvement indicated that grade level data analysis revealed strengths and weaknesses. According to the director, previously noted personnel changes contributed to the increased Grade 4 mathematics achievement. However, the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE), Office of Assessment and Accountability, concluded that the WESTEST2 data for a particular grade level at a school in Calhoun County were not valid representations of the students' knowledge, skills, and abilities.

Central office and school level personnel indicated that the increased mathematics percent proficient at Calhoun Middle/High School was a direct result of a schoolwide focus on mathematics instruction that included: Reteach in Grades 6-12, tutoring, and targeted professional development.

Chart 3

ELEMENTARY MATHEMATICS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	35.4%	36.7%	50.1%	45.2%
White (W)	35.4%	36.5%	50.9%	45.9%
Black (B)	NA	NA	36.3%	32.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	29.1%	24.8%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	28.0%	32.1%	40.0%	35.0%

Chart 4

MIDDLE MATHEMATICS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	NA	NA	46.8%	43.3%
White (W)	NA	NA	47.4%	43.8%
Black (B)	NA	NA	34.2%	31.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	16.1%	16.2%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	NA	NA	36.1%	32.4%

Note: Calhoun Middle/High School consists of grades 6 through 12; therefore, WESTEST2 results are reported at the high school level.

Chart 5

HIGH SCHOOL MATHEMATICS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	37.4%	31.4%	46.6%	43.0%
White (W)	37.4%	31.3%	46.8%	43.5%
Black (B)	NA	NA	36.6%	29.7%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	12.7%	12.5%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	35.7%	26.8%	34.4%	31.5%

Student assessment performance in reading/language arts (Charts 6 and 8) was significantly lower for all subgroups than the 2010-2011 State percent proficient. Only 32.3 percent of the elementary school all students (AS) subgroup in Calhoun County were proficient in reading/language arts, which was significantly lower than the State percent proficient (48.2 percent).

In reviewing the data, the Team noted the lowest percent proficient in elementary reading occurred at the Grade 4 class level in one elementary school. Additionally, only 9 percent of the Grade 11 English students in the county were proficient in reading.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Charts 6 and 8 indicated that the 2011-2012 Calhoun County School District student percent proficient in reading/language arts was substantially lower for all subgroups than the State percent proficient at the elementary level. Only 33.1 percent of the elementary level all students (AS) subgroup in Calhoun County were proficient in reading/language arts, which was significantly lower than the State percent proficient (49.8 percent). Calhoun County School District's percent secondary reading/language arts proficiency rate of the AS subgroup was 34.1 percent compared to the State percent proficiency rate of 44.1 percent. Of note, Calhoun County School District's secondary reading percent proficient in the AS subgroup increased substantially from 28.8 percent in 2010-2011 to 34.1 percent in 2011-2012. Additionally, the secondary reading/language arts percent proficient in the SES subgroup increased from 27.6 percent in 2010-2011 to 32.0 percent in 2011-2012, which was the same as the State's percent proficient.

Chart 6

ELEMENTARY READING/LANGUAGE ARTS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	33.1%	32.3%	49.8%	48.2%
White (W)	33.8%	32.1%	50.5%	48.7%
Black (B)	NA	NA	38.2%	40.0%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	23.4%	21.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	23.2%	29.5%	39.0%	37.7%

Chart 7

MIDDLE READING/LANGUAGE ARTS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	NA	NA	49.5%	50.0%
White (W)	NA	NA	49.9%	50.3%
Black (B)	NA	NA	40.2%	41.9%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	14.6%	16.0%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	NA	NA	38.5%	39.0%

Note: Calhoun Middle/High School consists of grades 6 through 12; therefore, WESTEST2 results are reported at the high school level.

Chart 8

HIGH SCHOOL READING/LANGUAGE ARTS				
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient		State Percent Proficient	
	2011-2012	2010-2011	2011-2012	2010-2011
All Students (AS)	34.1%	28.8%	44.1%	43.7%
White (W)	34.1%	29.1%	44.5%	44.3%
Black (B)	NA	NA	33.7%	29.2%
Special Education (SE)	NA	NA	10.4%	10.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	32.0%	27.6%	32.0%	31.9%

SAT/ACT Assessment Results

Chart 9 shows the Calhoun County School District's Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) and American College Testing (ACT) results.

The SAT math mean score decreased from 553 in 2005-2006 to 448 in 2010-2011. The SAT reading score decreased from 468 in 2007-2008 to 466 in 2010-2011. The SAT writing score increased from 418 in 2007-2008 to 431 in 2010-2011. The percent of test takers decreased from 2007-2008 (7.8 percent), increased the following two years (2008-2009 11.4 percent and 2009-2010 11.0 percent), then decreased to 7.5 percent in 2010-2011

ACT trend data showed that the ACT Composite declined from 19.8 in 2005-2006 to 18.9 in 2010-2011. This has implications for guidance and counseling and teachers' preparing students for college level assessment and 21st century skill learning. The ACT is designed to assess high school students' general educational development and their ability to complete college level work.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

According to Chart 9, the SAT math mean score decreased from 539 in 2010-2011 to 440 in 2011-2012. The SAT reading mean score increased from 489 in 2010-2011 to 500 in 2011-2012. The SAT writing mean score decreased from 496 in 2010-2011 to 413 in 2011-2012. The percent of test takers decreased from 8.0 percent in 2010-2011 to 4.2 percent in 2011-2012.

The ACT Composite score increased from 18.9 in 2010-2011 to 19.5 in 2011-2012. The percentage of students taking the ACT decreased from 52.8 percent in 2010-2011 to 42.5 percent in 2011-2012.

Interviews with Calhoun County School District administrators at both the central office and Calhoun Middle/High School revealed that the majority of Calhoun County students take the ACT because they plan to attend a West Virginia institution of higher education.

Chart 9

County	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012
SAT Takers (%)	7.8%	11.4%	11.0%	8.0%	4.2%
SAT Math Mean Score	478	439	451	539	440
SAT Reading Score	468	421	453	489	500
SAT Writing Score	495	399	404	496	413
ACT Takers (%)	48.6%	55.7%	65.9%	52.8%	42.5%
ACT Composite	19.9	18.9	20.3	18.9	19.5

NA – Less than 10 (Not Applicable)

Source: State, County and School Data, 2009-2012 West Virginia Report Cards, West Virginia Department of Education. 2010-2012 data provided by Calhoun County School District.

ACT EXPLORE Assessment Results

According to the 2010-2011 Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 10, Calhoun County students showed an increase in the composite score as compared to the 2006-2007 results, with the exception of the 2009-2010 school year. Five years of trend data showed that scores increased in mathematics, science, English, and reading from 2006-2007 to 2010-2011. Calhoun County performed lower than the State average in all academic areas and in the composite score.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Based on the 2011-2012 Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 10, Calhoun County students showed a decrease from 14.2 in 2010-2011 to 12.6 in 2011-2012 in the composite score. However, the 2012-2013 student performance on the ACT Explore indicated an increase from 12.6 to 13.9 in the composite score as compared to the 2011-2012 results. Calhoun County performed lower than the State average in all academic areas and in the composite score.

Chart 10

ACT EXPLORE RESULTS Grade 8							
	2006-2007	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
English WV	14.2	14.3	13.9	14.1	14.1	14.1	14.3
English Calhoun	12.5	13.2	13.3	11.9	13.4	11.7	13.2
Mathematics WV	14.5	14.7	14.3	14.6	14.8	14.6	14.8
Mathematics Calhoun	13.6	12.9	13.4	12.9	14.2	12.7	14.4
Reading WV	13.9	13.9	13.6	14.0	14.1	14.0	14.0
Reading Calhoun	12.4	12.7	12.5	12.2	13.5	11.8	12.6
Science WV	15.9	16.0	15.6	15.8	15.9	15.8	16.0
Science Calhoun	14.7	14.8	14.9	13.8	15.5	13.6	14.9
Composite WV	14.8	14.9	14.5	14.8	14.8	14.8	14.9
Composite Calhoun	13.4	13.6	13.7	12.9	14.2	12.6	13.9

Source: WVDE Office of Assessment and Accountability

ACT PLAN Assessment Results

Based on the 2010-2011 Grade 10 ACT PLAN results in Chart 11, Calhoun County test takers showed a decrease from 15.7 in 2006-2007 to 14.9 in 2010-2011 in the composite score. Five years of trend data showed a decrease in English, reading, science, and mathematics scores from 2006-2007 to 2010-2011. Calhoun County School District performed lower than the State in all academic areas and in the composite scores.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Based on the 2011-2012 Grade 10 ACT PLAN results in Chart 11, Calhoun County test takers showed a decrease from 14.9 in 2010-2011 to 14.8 in 2011-2012 in the composite score. The 2012-2013 student performance on the ACT PLAN indicated an increase from 14.8 to 15.8 in the composite score as compared to the 2011-2012 results. Calhoun County performed lower than the State average in all academic areas and in the composite score.

Chart 11

ACT PLAN RESULTS Grade 10							
	2006-2007	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
English WV	16.7	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.0	16.2
English Calhoun	15.1	15.3	14.6	14.5	14.1	14.1	14.7
Mathematics WV	16.6	16.3	16.3	16.2	16.2	16.4	16.4
Mathematics Calhoun	15.9	16.0	16.1	15.9	15.0	15.3	15.6
Reading WV	16.5	16.5	15.7	16.1	16.1	16.1	16.4
Reading Calhoun	15.1	15.9	14.6	14.5	15.0	13.7	15.5
Science WV	17.7	17.5	17.1	17.3	17.3	17.3	17.4
Science Calhoun	16.3	16.9	16.1	15.8	16.0	15.9	17.0
Composite WV	17.0	16.8	16.5	16.6	16.6	16.6	16.7
Composite Calhoun	15.7	16.2	15.5	15.3	14.9	14.8	15.8

Source: WVDE Office of Assessment and Accountability

5.1.2. Participation rate. A minimum of 95 percent in the current or a two or three year average of all students enrolled in a public school/county school district/state at the time of testing, including students in each subgroup as required by NCLB must participate in the statewide assessment WESTEST or the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) in reading/language arts or mathematics. Students with a significant medical emergency may be exempt by appeal from the calculation of participation rate for AYP provided that the county superintendent has proper documentation. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Calhoun County School District met the 95 percent WESTEST2 participation rate requirement with 100 percent participation rate at both elementary schools and 99.2 percent participation rate in mathematics and 99.5 percent in reading at the middle/high school.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Calhoun County School District met the 95 percent WESTEST2 participation rate requirement in the all students (AS) subgroup with 100 percent participation rate at both elementary schools and 99.48 percent participation rate in mathematics and 99.48 percent in reading at the middle/high school.

5.1.3. Attendance rate (Elementary/Middle). The student attendance rate for elementary and middle schools is at or above 90 percent or the percentage of students meeting the attendance rate show improvement from the preceding year. The student attendance rate will be adjusted for students excluded as a result of the Productive and Safe Schools Act (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1a) and school bus transportation interruptions (W.Va. 126CSR81), West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4110, *Attendance Policy*, (hereinafter Policy 4110). Additional exclusions include excused student absences, students not in attendance due to disciplinary measures, and absent students for whom the attendance director has pursued judicial remedies to compel attendance to the extent of his or her authority. For the AYP determination, the attendance rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the attendance rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 12 indicated the Calhoun County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last five reporting years.

The Team inquired as to what the county school district was doing to increase the attendance rate in Calhoun County's schools. The attendance director indicated the most significant factor had been a change in procedure. The ten day school absence notices were changed to five day notices. Additionally, the Circuit Judges supported enforcing the State attendance laws. According to staff, truancy has steadily declined because of this enforcement. The county has issued a "Challenge" to students and through grant funding provides the following attendance incentives: A chance to win a \$250 scholarship for perfect attendance, a 9-week attendance award, and semester test exemption.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Chart 12 indicated the Calhoun County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last six reporting years. While Calhoun County’s elementary schools’ attendance rates steadily increased, the overall Calhoun County attendance rate decreased slightly from 96.85 percent in 2010-2011 to 96.36 percent in 2011-2012. Calhoun County School District’s attendance director continued to implement the grant targeting student attendance.

Chart 12

ATTENDANCE RATE	
Year	Attendance Rate
2006-2007	96.37%
2007-2008	95.53%
2008-2009	96.39%
2009-2010	96.45%
2010-2011	96.85%
2011-2012	96.36%

5.1.4. Graduation rate. The student graduation rate is 80 percent or the percentage of students meeting the student graduation rate shows improvement. The graduation rate is calculated according to the high school completer formula recommended by the NCES with the additional condition that graduates include only those students who receive a regular diploma in the standard number of years and does not include students receiving the GED. For the AYP determination, the graduation rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the graduation rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 13 showed the Calhoun County School District graduation rate. The school district passed the graduation rate requirement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Central Office staff indicated that while Calhoun County School District met the graduation rate requirement, a three year decreasing trend in graduation rate prompted the county leadership team to become proactive in addressing efforts to increase the graduation rate. Calhoun County School District implemented the GED option pathway. Previously, the Calhoun/Gilmer Career Technical Center offered this option to students, but had discontinued this service. Calhoun County boasts the 10th highest graduation rate in the State for 2011-2012.

Chart 13

GRADUATION RATE	
Year	Graduation Rate
2008-2009	82.35%
2009-2010	91.0%
2010-2011	87.0%
2011-2012	85.54%

Chart 14 demonstrated the number of Advanced Placement (AP®), honors courses, and college credit courses offered in Calhoun County's high school.

Advanced Placement (AP®) Courses offered: Calculus AB, English Literature and Composition, Chemistry, and Physics. AP® courses taken: Calculus (AB) and Environmental Science through Virtual School.

The high school offered the minimum four AP® courses; however students take advantage of the dual credit opportunities more frequently than the AP® courses. All four AP® courses offered were approved by The College Board. Calhoun County formerly utilized grant funds to pay for students' AP® exams; however, this funding source has expired. Staff reported fewer students taking the exams.

Honors courses offered in which students are enrolled included: Honors English 9, Honors English 10, Honors English 11, and Honors English 12.

The high school offers the following Dual Credit Courses: English 101, English 102, College Algebra, College Trigonometry, Environmental Earth Science, Earth Science, and College 101.

Students have the opportunity to receive dual credit from Marshall University, Glenville State College, and West Virginia University. In 2010, Calhoun Middle/High School was the only school in the State to offer the West Virginia University Math 153 and 154 courses in Calculus 1A and 1B. Calhoun Middle/High School is currently part of the Blue Ribbon Calculus program being developed for 2011-2012, based upon their results from 2010-2011. Graduates of the high school had 677 college credit hours in 2010 and 419 college credit hours in 2011.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Calhoun County School District continued to meet the minimum requirements of West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 2510 by offering students access to 20 advanced placement (AP®) courses available via the West Virginia Virtual Schools program. Currently, 12 Calhoun Middle/High School students are enrolled in four AP® courses during both the fall and spring semesters. Advanced placement courses offered included:

Art History	French Language
Biology	Macroeconomics
Calculus AB	Microeconomics
Calculus BC	Physics B
Chemistry	Psychology
Computer Science A	Spanish Language
English Language	Statistics
English Literature	U.S. Government & Politics
Environmental Science	U.S. History
European History	World History

Calhoun Middle/High School offered the following Honors Courses: Honors English 9, Honors English 10, and Honors English 11.

Calhoun Middle/High School offered the following College/Dual Credit courses: College 101, College Algebra, College Trigonometry, College Calculus 1A, and College Calculus 1B.

Due to staffing changes, Calhoun Middle/High School decreased the number of college courses available to students. However, 2012 graduates of Calhoun Middle/High School had a combined 405 college credit hours upon graduation from high school. While only the College 101 course is offered via Pierpont College, Calhoun Middle/High School students were able to earn EDGE and college credit hours via West Virginia University (WVU).

Chart 14

NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED 2011-2012			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered/Taken	Number of Honors Courses	Number of College Credit Courses
Calhoun Middle/High	4/2	4	7
NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED 2012-2013			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered/Taken	Number of Honors Courses	Number of College Credit Courses
Calhoun Middle/High	20/4	3	5

Chart 15 provides college entrance testing information for the American College Test (ACT) and the advanced placement test (APT) for the 2009-2010 school year. Data are listed for Calhoun Middle/High School, the county, and the state. The percentage of Calhoun County School District's ACT test takers (65.9 percent) was higher than the State percentage (60.2 percent). Calhoun County's ACT composite score at 20.3 was lower than the State (20.7).

The 2009-2010 percent of AP® test takers was 0.0 percent for Grade 10 while the State percentage was 1.3 percent; the percent of Grade 11 Calhoun County test takers was 1.3 percent while the State percentage was 19.2 percent; and the percent of Grade 12 Calhoun County test takers was 15.3 percent while the State percentage was 20.1 percent.

Calhoun High School offers the Kaplan ACT prep class for two hours an evening, three evenings a week, for a period of six weeks. This has been funded through the Gear Up program. County staff reported that in 2010, 60 students took the ACT exam, which increased from 39 students in 2009. Sixty-seven percent of the students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in English, which increased from 46 percent the previous year. Thirty-two percent of students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in Mathematics, which increased from 28 percent in 2009. Forty-eight percent of students met the College Readiness Benchmark in Reading, which increased from 36 percent in 2009. Eighteen percent of students tested met the College Readiness Benchmark in Science, which tied with the 2009 results. In addition, 13 percent of the students met all four Benchmarks, which was an increase of 3 percent over the 2009 scores.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Chart 15 indicated the percentage of Calhoun County School District’s American College Test (ACT) test takers decreased from 65.9 percent in 2009-2010 to 52.8 percent in 2010-2011. The percentage of ACT test takers decreased again in 2011-2012 to 42.5 percent.

Calhoun County’s ACT composite score decreased from 20.3 in 2009-2010 to 18.9 in 2010-2011 and increased to 19.5 percent in 2011-2012. Three year trend data indicated that Calhoun County’s ACT composite score was consistently lower than the State composite score.

Chart 15
COLLEGE-ENTRANCE TESTING INFORMATION – ACT & APT

Schools	ACT(American College Test)		APT (Advanced Placement Test) Test Takers		
	2009-2010		2009-2010		
	Test Takers	Composite Score	Tenth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Twelfth Grade
Calhoun Middle/High	65.9%	20.3	0.0%	1.3%	15.3%
Calhoun County Schools	65.9%	20.3	0.0%	1.3%	15.3%
STATE	60.2%	20.7	1.3%	19.2%	20.1%
2010-2011		2010-2011			
Calhoun Middle/High	52.8%	18.9	0.0%	1.4%	20.8%
Calhoun County Schools	52.8%	18.9	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
STATE	61.1%	20.6	1.8%	22.3%	22.4%
2011-2012		2011-2012			
Calhoun Middle/High	42.5%	19.5	0.0%	0.0%	5.6%
Calhoun County Schools	42.5%	19.5	0.0%	0.0%	5.6%
STATE	61.0%	20.6	2.6%	23.8%	24.9%

Chart 16 showed the percentage of AP® test takers from 2005-2006 to 2009-2010 in grades 10, 11, and 12. The percent of 11th grade test takers with a score of three or higher decreased from 9.7 percent in 2008-2009 to 1.3 percent in 2009-2010. Grade 12 test takers with a score of three or higher increased from 8.2 percent in 2008-2009 to 15.3 percent in 2009-2010.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Chart 16 indicated the percent of Calhoun Middle/High School’s students who took an advanced placement (AP®) exam from 2005-2006 through 2011-2012. Calhoun Middle/High School’s percent of AP® test takers increased from 15.3 percent in 2009-2010 to 20.8 percent in 2010-2011. Calhoun Middle/High School’s

percent of AP® test takers decreased from 20.8 percent in 2010-2011 to 5.6 percent in 2011-2012.

Chart 16

AP® TEST TAKERS							
Calhoun Middle/High	2005-2006	2006-2007	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012
10 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	9.6%	1.3%	1.4%	0.0%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	8.2%	15.3%	20.8%	5.6%

The high school graduate overall college going rate for Calhoun County was 58.2 percent compared to the State’s overall college going rate of 58.8 percent as presented in Chart 17. Over half of Calhoun County’s high school graduates entered college in fall 2010.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The high school graduate overall college going rate for Calhoun County School District was 47.2 percent in 2010-2011 compared to the State’s overall college going rate of 57.9 percent in 2010-2011 as presented in Chart 17. While State graduation rate data were not available on the day of the audit, Calhoun County School District’s college going rate for 2011-2012 was calculated at 34.2 percent.

Nearly half (47.2 percent) of Calhoun County’s high school graduates entered college in the fall of 2011. Of note, Calhoun County School District’s college going rate decreased by 13 percent from 47.2 percent in 2010-2011 to 34.2 percent in 2011-2012.

Chart 17

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2010		
	Number of High School Graduates 2009-2010	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,290	58.8%
Calhoun County	91	58.2%
	Number of High School Graduates 2010-2011	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,001	57.9%
Calhoun County	72	47.2%
	Number of High School Graduates 2011-2012	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,335	56.4%
Calhoun County	73	34.2%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2010, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Calhoun County's percent of students enrolled in developmental courses in fall 2010 was lower than the State's percentage of students taking both mathematics and English developmental courses (Chart 18).

Four (4) of Calhoun County's 41 first-time freshmen or 9.8 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2010 compared to the State (15.00 percent). Ten (10) graduates or 24.4 percent were enrolled in developmental mathematics compared to the State (28.10 percent).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Calhoun County's percent of students enrolled in developmental courses in fall 2011 and fall 2012 was higher than the State's percentage of students taking both mathematics and English developmental courses (Chart 18).

Nine (9) of Calhoun County's 24 first-time freshmen or 37.5 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2011 compared to the State (16.7 percent). Eleven (11) graduates or 45.8 percent were enrolled in Developmental Mathematics compared to the State (28.2 percent).

Nine (9) of Calhoun County's 24 first-time freshmen or 37.5 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2012 compared to the State (17.4 percent). Eleven (11) graduates or 45.83 percent were enrolled in Developmental Mathematics compared to the State (28.83 percent).

Chart 18

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES					
FALL 2010					
	1st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7,873	1,181	15.00%	2,209	28.10%
Calhoun Middle/High	41	4	9.8%	10	24.4%
Calhoun County	41	4	9.8%	10	24.4%
FALL 2011					
	1st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7,457	1,247	16.70%	2,104	28.2%
Calhoun Middle/High	24	9	37.5%	11	45.8%
Calhoun County	24	9	37.5%	11	45.8%
FALL 2012					
	1st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7,708	1,341	17.40%	2,222	28.83%
Calhoun Middle/High	24	9	37.50%	11	45.83%
Calhoun County	24	9	37.50%	11	45.83%

Source: First-Time Freshmen, Previous Year WV High School Graduates in Developmental Courses by Type of Course Fall 2010 (census).

7.1.4. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, *Assuring the Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs* (hereinafter Policy 2510). (Policy 2510)

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

1. The school lacked an elective offering for middle school band. Additionally, only two secondary students were able to schedule band during the day. The Team recommended that the school administration seek guidance in designing a master schedule that makes band available to students during the instructional day. Currently, the schedule resulted in unbalanced classes. While a representative from the career center is available during arena scheduling, more collaboration is necessary to ensure students may enroll in courses that fit their educational pursuits.

COMPLIANCE. The schedule was revised to offer required middle school band. Students in Grades 5-8 and in Grades 9-12 were enrolled in band.

2. The principal indicated that the career technical center drives the schedule for the middle/high school. The Team recommended that the administration meet regularly with the director of the career center to collaboratively craft a master schedule that enables students to schedule classes.

COMPLIANCE. Calhoun County School District and central office administrators met with the Director of the Calhoun/Gilmer Career and Technical Center and discussed needs and made adjustments according to the student needs served by both facilities.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The individual Education Performance Audit School Teams observed teachers using appropriate instructional strategies during the audit. However, specific teachers were not using effective instructional strategies. These have been reported in the individual school audit findings.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The individual School Education Performance Audit Teams observed teachers using appropriate instructional strategies during the audit.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While both the county and school audit teams documented the evidence of writing instruction occurring in all three Calhoun County School District's schools, the common response for the lack of use of West Virginia Writes was the inadequate bandwidth at the middle/high school. On the day of the middle/high school audit, the Team witnessed this bandwidth issue.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Bandwidth was increased in the spring of 2012 for Calhoun Middle/High School and during the summer of 2012 at the elementary schools and Calhoun-Gilmer Career and Technical Center. As a result, Calhoun County's schools utilized West Virginia Writes more frequently, as verified by individual school reports provided by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Assessment and Accountability. Calhoun County School District completed the 2013 Online Writing Assessment without problems.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Calhoun County's schools were in alignment with Policies 2510 and 2520. Additionally, the middle/high school implemented an "Education" career path through the EDGE program beginning with the 2011-2012 school year. (Exception – Band available at the middle school level.)

According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510, middle school band (grades 5-8) was not being offered at Middle/High School. Additionally, only two high school students were able to schedule high school band during the school day.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Calhoun Middle/High School students in Grades 5-12 were currently enrolled in band courses during the school day.

7.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)

According to minutes of the Calhoun County Board of Education, discipline was an issue at the middle/high school. The administration of this school had taken a proactive approach to addressing the culture of the school by creating a Student Leadership Team. Additionally, multicultural activities were included at all programmatic levels. The county and each school had an updated Multicultural Plan.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The principal for instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School prepared and presented monthly updates to the Calhoun County Board of Education regarding student discipline. Board minutes reflected a decrease in student discipline referrals.

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

One elementary school did not comply with W.Va. Code §18-5-45 and Policy 2510 regarding the minimum 315 minutes instructional day for Kindergarten. One Kindergarten classroom had 295 minutes of scheduled instruction and the other classroom had 300 minutes of scheduled instruction. This daily 20 minute and 15 minute lost instruction combined with emergency school closures results in an extensive amount of lost instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The individual School Education Performance Audits verified that the minimum instructional time was provided.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

Two counselors served Calhoun Middle/High School; one counselor served the middle school and one served the high school. No counselor was assigned to the two elementary schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team verified that one middle school counselor at Calhoun Middle/High School was assigned to Pleasant Hill and Arnoldsburg Elementary schools. Individual school Education Performance Audit Teams verified counselor logs.

7.4. REGULATORY AGENCY REVIEWS.

7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)

Finance

Deficit Fund Balance

According to Calhoun County Schools' unaudited financial statements for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011, the district had a deficit uncommitted fund balance of (\$101,448) at year end, exclusive of the OPEB liability. This compares to a positive unreserved balance of \$151,285, also exclusive of OPEB, at June 30, 2010, a decrease of \$252,733. In a county the size of Calhoun this is a dramatic shift in the year-end carry-over balance that the board has available in just one year. A further analysis of the district's statement of revenues and expenditures for the year ended June 30, 2011 showed that expenditures, exclusive of OPEB, exceeded revenues by over \$262,000 during the year. This obviously accounts for the decrease in fund equity.

According to W.Va. Code §11-8-26, a local governmental entity is prohibited from expending funds or incurring obligations: "... in excess of funds available for current expense." In addition, the West Virginia Department of Education recommends that county boards maintain a 3-5 percent carry-over balance at year end to provide for any unforeseen expenses that may be incurred.

The Calhoun County Board of Education is required to develop a corrective action plan as to how it will resolve the deficit that has been incurred and to strive to build up its carry-over balance to the minimum recommended by the West Virginia Department of Education.

Annual Financial Statements

Furthermore, a review of the financial statements disclosed that they were not presented in conformity with Generally Accepted Accounting Standards (GAAP). According to Statement 54 issued by the Governmental Accounting Standards Board (GASB), all governmental entities were to begin classifying fund equity into the following categories beginning with the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011: Nonspendable, Restricted, Committed, Assigned and Unassigned. The fund equity classifications used by Calhoun County Schools were those used in previous years, but subsequent to the Office of Education Performance Audits review, the board treasurer revised the board's financial statements to comply with the new GAAP requirements.

Monthly Financial Report to the Board

The monthly financial reports to the board did not contain all of the information required by State Board Policy 8100. The treasurer did report to the board the condition of the General Current Expense Fund, such as expenditures, encumbrances, budget and remaining budget balances, but did not include similar information for the other funds, i.e., special revenue, ARRA special revenue, bond construction and capital projects funds. The monthly reports to the board also did not "indicate by fund, the beginning cash balance, the current month's receipts, the current month's disbursements, and the current month's ending cash balances" as outlined on Page 53 of State Board Policy 8100.

The Team recommended that the treasurer adopt a financial statement template that includes all of the required information prescribed in the policy. A sample format can be downloaded from the West Virginia Department of Education website.

Accounts Payable

During the review of paid invoices, the Team noted three transactions which were not in compliance with the requirements of State Board Policy 8100.

These included:

- Invoice Number 2697 from Athletic Outfitters dated 9-11-11 was paid 10-11-11 from Purchase Order Number 1200359. The purchase order was dated 9-13-11 and therefore obviously issued after the invoice was received.
- An allowed discount was not taken on Invoice Number 61602 from Lawson's Products dated 10-11-11 and paid by Check Number 43513.

- The Team noted the following issues with Invoice Number 11078 from LinquaCare Associates dated 6-30-11, paid by check issued 8-09-11 from Purchase Order Number 1200262 dated 7-28-11 using FY 2012 Federal Special Education funds. The purchase order was issued after the date of invoice, the expense was charged to FY 2012 project funds with FY 2011 funds still unexpended, and the payment should have been reported as a FY 2011 expenditure and as an accounts payable at June 30, 2011, as required by GAAP.

Other

No record could be found of the County Board approving school support organizations, as required by State Board Policy 1224.1.

Review of School Accounting Transactions

- A review of the individual schools' accounting records disclosed the following.

Calhoun Middle/High School

- The audit for the 2010-2011 year was complete and a corrective action plan to resolve audit findings was on file.
- The September bank statement had been reconciled.
- Several stale dated checks were listed on the outstanding check list. The Team recommended that the school staff ascertain why the checks have not been cashed and clear the checks by either canceling the stale dated checks and reissuing new checks or determining the checks unclaimed property and remit the amount of the checks to the State Treasurer's office.
- Purchase Order Number 183 used to encumber funds for the payment of an invoice from the Secondary Schools Athletic Commission (SSAC) was dated after the date of the invoice, which was 9-19-11.
- The balance of faculty senate funds allocated to teachers which were not spent by the end of the school year were allowed to remain with the teacher to be carried forward into the new school year. According to W.Va. Code §18-5A-5, funds allocated to teachers not expended during the school year are to be returned to the school's faculty senate. Of course the faculty senate of the subsequent year can, through its budget for the year, reestablish the balances of the teachers from the previous year, but this discretion lies with the new faculty senate.

Arnoldsburg Elementary

- Based on a review of the bank reconciliation and accounting transactions for September, it appears that financial activities were performed in compliance with State Board Policy 1224.1.
- The audit of the 2010-2011 year had been completed and was on file.

Pleasant Hill Elementary

- Based on a review of the bank reconciliation and accounting transactions for September, it appeared that all financial activities were performed in compliance with Policy 1224.1.
- The audit of the 2010-2011 year had been completed and was on file.
- The balance of faculty senate funds allocated to teachers which were not spent by the end of the school year were allowed to remain with the teacher to be carried forward into the new school year. According to W.Va. Code §18-5A-5, funds allocated to teachers not expended during the school year are to be returned to the school's faculty senate. Of course the faculty senate of the subsequent year can, through its budget for the year, reestablish the balances of the teachers from the previous year, but this discretion lies with the new faculty senate.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Deficit Fund Balance

According to Calhoun County School District revised unaudited financial statements for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2012, the district had a deficit uncommitted fund balance of (\$327,587) at year end, exclusive of the OPEB liability. This compares to a negative unassigned balance of (\$101,742), also exclusive of OPEB, at June 30, 2011, a decrease of \$225,845. In a county the size of Calhoun, this is a dramatic shift in the year-end carry-over balance that the board has available in just one year.

According to W.Va. Code §11-8-26, a local governmental entity is prohibited from expending funds or incurring obligations: “. . . in excess of funds available for current expense.” In addition, the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) recommends that county boards maintain a 3-5 percent carry-over balance at year end to provide for any unforeseen expenses that may be incurred.

The Board has developed a corrective action plan as to how it will resolve the deficit that has been incurred and to strive to build up its carry-over balance to the minimum recommended by the WVDE.

Monthly Financial Report to the Board

NONCOMPLIANCE. The monthly financial reports to the board did not contain all information required by State Board Policy 8100. The treasurer reported the board expenditures, encumbrances, budget and remaining budget balances for the various funds, but did not report the beginning cash balance and the ending cash balance for the current month as outlined on Page 53.

November 2012 was the most current report to the board. Policy 8100 requires a “periodic report, at least monthly, of investment activities to be provided by the treasurer to the county board of education.” The Team could not find a record of an investment report to the board.

A review of cash balances reported to the board in November 2012 could not be matched to reconciled bank statements for the same period. Furthermore, no record of cash invested from either bond proceeds or investments at the Municipal Bond Commission for debt service were included in the November 2012 report to the board.

The Team recommended that the treasurer adopt a financial statement template that includes all of the required information prescribed in the policy. A sample format can be downloaded from the West Virginia Department of Education website.

Cash Receipt Procedures

NONCOMPLIANCE. The Team could not find where taxes received by the Municipal Bond Commission for Debt Service had been receipted into the county financial records during this fiscal year. Office staff could not verify amount of taxes received for this purpose.

Cash Management

NONCOMPLIANCE. Disbursements from the Municipal Bond Commission for interest and fees this fiscal year had not been posted into the county financial records.

Budget Maintenance

NONCOMPLIANCE. The current budget had provisions for a deficit beginning balance of \$62,866.13 compared to a beginning projected deficit of \$81,093.76. No reason was found for this difference. Regardless, the revised unaudited statements showed a deficit ending unassigned balance of \$327,587 exclusive of OPEB. The Team did not find that the current budget had been reduced to reflect the increased deficit. Management should act immediately to align planned expenditures in the general fund to accommodate this significant difference in projected deficit balance.

Bank Reconciliation

NONCOMPLIANCE. The Team found the latest bank reconciliation was for November 2012. Policy 8100 requires that reconciliation of bank statements must be done at least monthly and immediately upon receipt of bank statements. In light of the deficit the county is suffering. The Team strongly recommended immediate action to reconcile all bank statements monthly to make sure adequate cash is available to cover disbursements and to comply with State Board of Education policy.

Indirect Cost

REQUIRES ATTENTION. The county has an approved restricted indirect cost rate of 1.51 percent. As of the Team's visit, no indirect cost had been charged to federal projects. The county should charge these projects, where allowed, immediately to assist with cash flow and to ensure these dollars are not lost. Costs should be charged at least monthly in the future.

Accounts Payable

NONCOMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed 12 checks issued by accounts payable and found three transactions which were not in compliance with the requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8100. These included:

- Check number 46132 issued for invoice 161. Invoice showed type of services received, but did not show the date these services were provided.
- Check number 45242 issued September 6, 2012, in the amount of \$600 for invoice dated August 24, 2012. Services were provided August 10, 2012. Purchase order was issued August 13, 2012, after the date of services.
- Check 45345 was issued October 3, 2012, for invoice dated August 8, 2012. Purchase order was issued October 1, 2012, well after the date of invoice.

Other

NONCOMPLIANCE.

- E. Monthly financial reports were not being provided to key management personnel, such as, project and budget directors.**

- M. Corrective action plans from recent school audits were not on file in the central office.**

Review of School Accounting Transactions

A review of the individual schools' accounting records disclosed the following.

Calhoun Middle/High School

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE.

- **The audit for the 2011-2012 year was complete and a corrective action plan to resolve audit findings was on file.**
- **The February bank statement had been reconciled. The principal did not sign or date February bank statement. Prior month bank statements had been signed and dated by the principal.**
- **A current copy of the *Accounting Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia* was not available. The secretary said she was not aware of new policy.**
- **A review of bank deposits during February revealed that some were not made in a timely manner:**
 - **Deposit of \$1,679.00 into bank on February 8, 2013, receipted February 4, 2013.**
 - **Deposit of \$1,415 into bank on February 6, 2013, receipted January 28, 2013.**
 - **Deposit number 873 greater than \$500 into bank February 25, 2013, cash summary report dated February 18, 2013.**
- **A review of Faculty Senate minutes and financial records showed compliance with Policy 8100 and W.Va. Code §18-5A-5.**

Arnoldsburg Elementary

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE.

- The audit for the 2011-2012 year was complete and a corrective action plan to resolve audit findings was on file.
- The February bank statement had been reconciled
- *The Accounting Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia* was on file.
- Invoice approval was not shown on any invoices examined. Verbal approval was given by the principal, but not shown by signature and date on invoice. The Team recommended that the school use a stamp with provisions for approval signature, date, check number, and date paid as suggested in policy.
- A review of Faculty Senate minutes and financial records showed compliance with Policy 8100 and W.Va. Code §18-5A-5.

Pleasant Hill Elementary

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE.

- The February bank statement had been reconciled.
- A copy of the monthly financial statement signed by the preparer and the principal was not available.
- The audit of the 2011-2012 year had been completed and was on file.
- A review of Faculty Senate minutes and financial records showed compliance with Policy 8100 and W.Va. Code §18-5A-5.

Commendation

All school booster groups are required to deposit their funds in the schools' bank accounts. This requirement assures accountability for those funds and increases confidence of the general public that those funds are being used for their intended purpose and are accounted for properly. The school staffs worked many extra hours to implement and assure compliance with this requirement. They, as well as all booster organization volunteers, are commended for their efforts in this endeavor.

Facilities

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Calhoun County Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), interviewed the Director of School Facilities, the county superintendent, and visited two schools. A new facility is under construction to replace Arnoldsburg Elementary School and the Team did not visit that school. A narrative of the Team's observations follows.

Arnoldsburg Elementary

School Building Authority (SBA) funding has been secured and this building will be replaced. This will remove the oldest building from the county inventory. This facility was outdated and had a history of flooding.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PROGRESSING. The new Arnoldsburg Elementary is under construction. Calhoun County tentatively expects to occupy the new building in December 2013.

Pleasant Hill Elementary

The original building was constructed in 1978 with an addition in 1983. Major renovations replaced a collapsed drain line and resolved some structural issues with settling under the floor. The building was in good condition. According to the CEFP, this site has 6 usable acres (12 acres total) and is sufficient for expansion. The heating and air conditioning system is multi-zone rooftop units which were at the end of their expected life and needed to be replaced. The CEFP rated the HVAC system “below average”. The roof membrane was installed in 1992 and rated as “average” in the CEFP. The maintenance director reported the sewer plant was outdated. Parking at this facility was inadequate. Some staining on the exterior walls needed to be cleaned. The food storage refrigerator/freezer was located outside and required the cooks to leave the building to retrieve items. A comprehensive documented preventive maintenance plan for this facility was not in place. Some preventive maintenance was being performed, but much of the maintenance was reactive in nature. The current CEFP indicated the building utilization at 53 percent; 85 percent is desirable.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PROGRESSING. Calhoun County secured emergency funding from the School Building Authority (SBA) to renovate the sewage plant at this facility. The outdated Heating, Ventilation and Air Conditioning (HVAC) system and aging roof were the two biggest issues at this facility that will need to be addressed within the next five years. The interior of the facility was clean and well maintained. Two breaker panels were unlocked and breakers were missing. Those panels were addressed and secured the day of the visit.

Calhoun Middle/High School

Calhoun Middle/High School was constructed in 1998. The total site has 88 actual acres with 20 acres listed as usable. The building was in good condition. The heating and cooling system consisted of unit ventilators, rooftop units, two boilers, and a chiller.

The equipment was original to the building. Some preventive maintenance was being performed at this facility. However, a comprehensive documented preventive maintenance plan was not in place and much of the maintenance at this facility was reactive in nature.

- The heating and cooling system was rated “above average” in the CEFPP.
- The roof membrane was rated “average”.
- Some mercury thermostats were still in use and needed to be removed.
- The gymnasium currently did not have air conditioning. The county has secured funding to add air conditioning to the gymnasium. Because this facility is funded with SBA funds, it is reviewed annually by the West Virginia State Department of Education Office of School Facilities.
- This facility has been cited since 2007 for poor housekeeping practices, especially in the rest room areas. There have been some minor improvements, but overall a more aggressive housekeeping program must be implemented.
- Some areas needed to be painted. Several stained and dirty ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the building. The tiles around the air diffusers had collected dirt and needed to be replaced.
- Several of the plastic signs that marked classrooms, rest rooms, etc., were broken or completely missing.
- Other minor issues existed, such as loose door hardware, etc.

The current program utilization is 47 percent; 85 percent is desirable.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE/NEW FINDINGS. The gymnasium air conditioning project had been completed. The direct digital control system for the entire building was upgraded as part of the gymnasium project. Vandalism in the rest rooms at this facility has historically been an issue, and still appeared to be occurring. The vandalism not only degraded the facility aesthetically, but created an additional workload on the maintenance staff. The vandalism needs to be addressed through improved monitoring of the rest rooms by the administration and staff. This facility would benefit from a more aggressive housekeeping program (campus-wide). Three classrooms had elevated carbon dioxide (CO²) levels and two rooms had noisy unit ventilators. The rooms with elevated CO² levels and

noisy unit ventilators will be reported to the county and addressed through the School Building Authority (SBA) review process.

Countywide

Creating a comprehensive preventive maintenance plan should be a priority. The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, will be rolling out a state wide preventive maintenance program to assist counties with procuring a software package to implement a preventive maintenance program. The Team strongly recommended that Calhoun County participate in this program.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PROGRESSING. Calhoun County enrolled in the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, statewide preventive maintenance program. Calhoun County is in the process of collecting the required information to begin documenting a preventive maintenance program. The Office of School Facilities is assisting Calhoun County in developing and implementing the program.

The specifications for the new Arnoldsburg Elementary should include a comprehensive preventive maintenance plan to be provided to Calhoun County at the completion of the project.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

UPDATE. The Arnoldsburg facility will have a two year maintenance contract as outlined by the School Building Authority (SBA) guidelines. The county will need to evaluate that contract at the end of the initial two year period to determine whether to continue the existing contract, or perform the preventive maintenance utilizing in-house maintenance staff. Regardless, this facility will be integrated into the preventive maintenance program being implemented through the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities.

Facility Recommendations

1. The Team recommended that the county explore performance contracting opportunities to upgrade existing equipment and implement energy saving measures.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Calhoun County has explored performance contracting for the three facilities. Arnoldsburg will be a new facility and there are not enough

upgrade opportunities at Pleasant Hill Elementary School and Calhoun Middle/High School to justify a performance contract project.

2. The Team recommended that the county explore implementing an Internet based automated work order system. This type of system would make it easier for teachers and administrators to request maintenance. It would also provide some accountability and visibility for the maintenance process. The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, can provide assistance in exploring this option.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Calhoun County has implemented an automated work order system. That system is in place and being utilized to generate and track work orders.

7.5.3. Statewide assessment. Test security measures are in place for the WESTEST. All students in the school participate in the statewide assessment program that includes state content assessments on the WESTEST or West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) at grades 3-8 and 10 and the Writing Assessment at grades 4, 7, and 10. Students with disabilities who have an IEP or a Section 504 Plan may be assessed on the state content assessments under one of the following conditions: standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, or non-standard conditions with modifications. Students unable to participate in the standardized assessment under these conditions and who meet the alternate assessment criteria will participate in the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA). Education Performance Audit teams will verify the eligibility of any student tested under standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, alternate assessment, or medical emergency student exemptions. Students who are continuously enrolled in the public school from the fifth instructional day of school to the spring assessment administration will be considered in the accountability system. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Findings

1. According to staff interviews, the WESTEST2 was administered to all students in Grades 3-11 who met the guidelines for the assessment. Students who qualified for alternate assessment were identified and tested in compliance with policy.
2. Staff indicated that test security measures were in place and testing materials were handled in a secure manner that met the policy requirement.
3. Staff involved with the administration of the WESTEST2 was trained annually.
4. All Grade 8 students participated in the ACT EXPLORE assessment with accommodations/modifications provided for students who qualified.
5. All Grade 10 students participated in the ACT PLAN assessment with accommodations/modifications provided for students who qualified.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE/FINDING NOTED - RESOLVED. Testing procedures were followed according to West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 2340; Policy 2419; and Policy 2510, with one exception.

With regard to WESTEST2 data for a particular grade level at a school in Calhoun County, the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE), Office of Assessment and Accountability, concluded that the data were not valid representations of the students' knowledge, skills and abilities. The investigation led to the invalidation of test scores of 13 students in a single school.

7.6. PERSONNEL.

7.6.1. Hiring. County boards follow hiring practices set forth in W.Va. Code. (W.Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and 18-2E-3a)

Findings

The Team observed the following discrepancies in hiring practices.

1. There were no official bid forms for service or professional posted positions. Employees e-mail or write their name on a posting stating that they are interested in the job. New applicants fill out an application and submit the application as a bid.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. Bid forms had been developed for service, professional and extra-curricular positions. The Team reviewed folders after July 1, 2012, and found evidence that the new bid forms were used for service employees, but were not used for the professional employees. Applicants currently employed in the county continued to e-mail a central office staff member indicating that they were applying for a position. E-mails may not be received for various reasons. Bid forms were in the schools and available on the county website. Therefore, individuals bidding on positions by e-mail should be directed to fill out the appropriate bid form in order to be considered for a position. It is difficult to change in the middle of the year, but the Team recommended the change occur for all bids July 1, 2013.

2. A matrix with applicant information was found in some files but the files did not contain verification of the applicant's criteria. The secretary said she got the information out of the employee file. The Team could not determine verification that the highest qualified applicant received the job.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Posting folders contained a matrix that verified the applicant's qualifications.

3. Evidence did not exist of who participated on the interview committees. A set of interview questions was provided by the middle/high school which was used for all interviews during the summer of 2011. The criteria questions in W.Va. Code were not part of the interview, although they were on the matrix in the folder. No documents showed the response by the applicants or the information needed in the W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a criteria.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Data from interviews was documented on the matrix and the applicant's information was within the job posting file. Qualifications of the applicants were much easier to determine during the follow-up visit.

4. Teachers were transferred to other positions after the 5th day prior to the instructional term without written notification to the State Superintendent of Schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Calhoun County Superintendent of Schools sent a letter to the State Superintendent of Schools as a result of allowing a teacher to change job assignments after the 20 days prior to the instructional term occurred.

5. Professional seniority was listed with a date rather than a quantity W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a (i). Service seniority listed initial employment date rather than seniority date within the classification. The same seniority date was maintained even when the personnel transferred into another classification.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The professional employee seniority list was changed to reflect a quantity. The professional seniority list included the areas of certification for each of the employees. The service seniority list was also changed to reflect the original seniority date and the seniority date within the current classification.

6. The county did not employ a half time attendance director as required by State Code. Instead, this job is a duty the principal of instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School in addition to duties as a full time principal.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The county posted a half-time attendance director (P12-001-010) on June 12, 2012. It was advertised on the State website. The superintendent recommended an individual to the board on June 22, 2012. The board approved the recommendation on July 2, 2012. The posting required an attendance director certificate or administrative certificate. The sole applicant had administrative certification. Per W.Va. Code, the applicant is not required to obtain an attendance director's certificate.

The Team observed the following discrepancies in postings.

1. All postings were not dated. A numbering/coding system for the postings existed that distinguished postings as: Service, professional, coaching, extra-curricular, etc.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Postings were dated and numbering/coding had been added to the postings.

2. A posting for a music teacher listed the salary as \$1.00; although, the back of the posting stated that the salary will be "State Basic". This position appeared to be an extra-curricular position, but it was not stated on the postings (State Minimum Salary W.Va. Code §18A-4-2).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The position for an assistant band director was clearly posted as an extracurricular position with a salary listed on the posting as \$750.00. No one bid on the job. The employee that had been in the position during the first visit held the extra-curricular position as choir director for a salary listed on the posting as \$2,000.00. These positions had been posted as extra-curricular since the Team's first visit.

3. Qualifications on service postings such as satisfactory evaluations and successfully pass the classification test were not stated on the postings (W.Va. Code §18A-4-8b).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE/RECOMMENDATION. Work hours and days were listed on the cook and custodian postings and work hours were listed on the para-professional, bus operators, multi-classified and maintenance posting. If hours are unknown, a qualifying statement with approximate times and what will be used to determine the hours will need to be included on the postings.

4. Service postings are required to have work hours and days of the week on the postings.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Seniority, satisfactory evaluations and successfully passing the classification test were listed on the posting.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team reported the following violations of (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2 and WVBE Policy 5202). Chart 20 explains the certification issues the Team observed through a detailed review of the certified list, WVEIS Master Course Schedule, and the WVDE Certification Database. The Team did note that the credentials of professional personnel were consistent with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies a few exceptions that are listed in Chart 20.

Chart 20

Calhoun County OEPA Visit October 20, 2011					
School	Educator	WVEIS Assign	Current Certification	Correction Needed	County Action
014 201 Arnoldsburg	8HIL S			Identify teacher of record or remove from master schedule or STU240	
	Educator	3004-MATH 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 4004-ENG LA 4 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 6004-SCIENCE 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 7004-SOC ST 4 0 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04	Out-of-Field Authorization 4500 -Gifted Grds: 01-12 Elem Ed 0K-6 Multi Cat 0K-6	OH needs to be designated in the 6 th digit of the course code if these students are case managed by this teacher.	
014 203 Pleasant Hill	8CUN A			Identify teacher of record and/or remove from master schedule.	
	Educator	8013-COLTCH-GIFT 0 G-GIFTED:1-8 Grades:	Professional Teaching Certificate Elementary Education K-06 Reading Endorsement K-06	Coded 8013 therefore need to apply for a gifted authorization.	

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. The Team reported the following educator licensure issues. The chart explains the certification issues the Team observed through a detailed review of the certified list, WVEIS Master Course Schedule, and the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) Certification Database.

APPENDIX A

Calhoun County OEPA - March 2013 Final Report

Certification

School	Teacher	Schedule	Credential	Findings	Recommendations
Arnoldsburg	EDUCATOR	4809-TITLE I READ 0 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 2210 - Physical Education Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2014	Doesn't hold appropriate certification for 4809 Title I Reading **Hired as a Long Term Substitute	If eligible apply for additional endorsements in Elem Ed and Reading Specialist; apply for permit; or remove from schedule
Calhoun Middle/High	EDUCATOR	1664-A+ ESSENTIALS 0 Grades: 11 12 1665-A+ PRACT APPS 0 Grades: 11 12	99 Short Term Substitute Permit 4800 - General Substitute Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	General Short Term Sub. Doesn't hold appropriate certification for schedule.	Continue to post job for fully certified applicant.
	EDUCATOR	0101-INTR AG FOOD & NAT RES 0 Grades: 12 0183-FOREST MGMT 0 Grades: 12 0200-NAT'L RESC MGMT 0 Grades: 12 2494-LAND MGT SURV 0 Grades: 12	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 07-09 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 07-12 Exp:	Doesn't hold appropriate endorsement for class schedule **Hired as a substitute teacher	If eligible, apply for appropriate additional endorsement; apply for permit; or remove from schedule.

			<p>Permanent 32 Professional Student Support Certificate 0005 - Counselor Grds: 05-12 Exp: Permanent 51 Middle Childhood Authorization 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 05-08 Exp: Permanent 51 Middle Childhood Authorization 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-08 Exp: Permanent</p>		
	EDUCATOR	<p>3005-MATH 5 5 T- MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 3006-MATH 6 6 T- MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 06 3007-MATH 7 7 T- MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 07 3008-MATH 8 8 T- MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 08 4005-ENG LA 5 5 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 7656- RETEACH/ENRCH 0 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 7821-PLANNING 3</p>	<p>99 Short Term Substitute Permit 4800 - General Substitute Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013 81 First- Class/Full- Time Permit 4115 -Multi- Categorical (LD, BD, MI) Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013</p>	<p>On Permit for 4115 Multi Cat. Doesn't hold appropriate endorsement for Math and English No content exams Certified in 8017 courses</p>	<p>Verify content exam for Multi Cat or 21 hours for academic major</p>

		Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED 0 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades:			
	EDUCATOR	2801-AP CMPTR SCI V Grades: 10 3007-MATH 7 0 Grades: 07 3021-ALGEBRA I 0 Grades: 09 10 3046-PRE-CALC V Grades: 4041-AP ENG LANG V Grades: 11 4042-AP ENG LIT 0 Grades: 4042-AP ENG LIT V Grades: 12 5631-GERMAN I V Grades: 5639-AP GERMAN V Grades: 6011-PHYSSCI9 0 Grades: 09 10 6041-PHYSICS 0 Grades: 10 11 12 6121-AP BIOLOGY V Grades: 6221-AP ENV SCI V Grades: 11 7046-AP US HSTRY V Grades: 7047-AP PSYCHOLOG V Grades: 11 12 7676-LINKS 1 Grades: 12 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	90 Long Term Substitute Permit 0600 - Business Education Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2015	On Permit, not HQ Doesn't hold appropriate endorsement for non- virtual classes.	Apply for appropriate permit for non-virtual courses or remove from schedule. Continue to post position for fully certified applicant.
	EDUCATOR	4009-ENG LA 9 0 Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 0 Grades: 09 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 0 Grades: 09 12 7676-LINKS 1 Grades: 10 12 7821-PLANNING 3	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 1000 - English Grds: 07-12 Exp: Permanent	Doesn't hold appropriate endorsement for 7010 World Studies ***Retired teacher working as a	If eligible apply for additional endorsement in social studies 5-AD; apply for permit; or remove from schedule

		Grades:		substitute	
	EDUCATOR	3005-MATH 5 5 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 3005-MATH 5 5 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 3007-MATH 7 7 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 07 3008-MATH 8 8 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 08 4005-ENG LA 5 5 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 4007-ENG LA 7 7 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 07 4008-ENG LA 8 8 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 08 6005-SCIENCE 5 5 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 6006-SCIENCE 6 6 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 6007-SCIENCE 7 7 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 07 6008-SCIENCE 8 8 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 08 7005-US HST-5 5 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 7007-WRLD GEO-7 7 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 07	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 2000 -Music Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2015	Doesn't hold appropriate certification for anything on schedule. **Hired as a long term substitute	Apply for permit for Multi Cat, Math, English, and Social Studies or remove from schedule.

		7008-WV STUDIES-8 8 T- MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 08 7633-DVLP GUID 0 Grades: 05 7633-DVLP GUID 0 Grades: 07 7633-DVLP GUID 0 Grades: 08			
	EDUCATOR	3005-MATH 5 0 Grades: 05 4005-ENG LA 5 0 Grades: 05 6005-SCIENCE 5 0 Grades: 05 7005-US HST-5 0 Grades: 05 7633-DVLP GUID 0 Grades: 05 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 2205 -Health Education Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2015 21 Professional Teaching Certificate 2210 - Physical Education Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2015	Doesn't hold the appropriate endorsement for schedule— Elem Ed; Multi Subjects; or all of the individual content (Math, Eng., Science, Social Studies) **Hired as a long term substitute	Apply for appropriate permit or remove from schedule.
Pleasant Hill	Corrected issues-no findings				

7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

The Team reviewed new teacher hire logs for 2009-2010, 2010-2011, and 2011-2012, to determine the 0-3 years' experience for required observations/evaluations and compiled an alphabetical listing of personnel and matched the list with current personnel files.

The Team also reviewed personnel evaluations for professional personnel with 4-5 years' experience, other professional personnel, support personnel, service personnel, coaches, etc., to determine that the evaluation process was conducted according to W.Va. Code §18A-2-12, West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, and county policy.

A random review of professional evaluations disclosed the following.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The Team reviewed many personnel evaluations. Even though there were some findings in the personnel evaluations reviewed, the overall personnel evaluation process was much improved.

A review of a random selection (which included the evaluations of the teachers cited above) of 15 teacher evaluations produced the following findings.

Teachers

1. Three teachers (Pleasant Hill School, Pleasant Hill School/Arnoldsburg School, and Calhoun Middle/High School) did not have evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires two evaluations for teachers with 0-2 years of experience.

PROGRESSING. Thirteen (13) of the 15 teacher evaluations reviewed met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education Policy on personnel evaluations.

2. One teacher (Calhoun Middle/High School) was evaluated one time in the 2010-2011 school year. The teacher was a first year teacher and should have been evaluated two times.

NONCOMPLIANCE. One Calhoun Middle/High School teacher's evaluations did not meet the timeline requirements of the Calhoun County Board of Education policy on personnel evaluations which requires when a teacher receives two evaluations, the first evaluation to be completed on or before January 15th. This teacher's first evaluation was dated March 26, 2012, and the second evaluation was dated May 30, 2012.

3. One teacher's (Calhoun Middle/High School) first evaluation was completed 2-11-11. Calhoun County School District procedures required that the first evaluation be completed by January 15 for personnel to be evaluated two times per year.

NONCOMPLIANCE. Another Calhoun Middle High teacher's evaluation did not meet this timeline requirement as this teacher's first evaluation was dated May 14, 2012, and the second evaluation was dated May 24, 2012.

Administrators

1. One school administrator (Central Office) received one evaluation in each of the first three years of employment. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires two evaluations per year for the first three years of employment for a school administrator.

COMPLIANCE. The school administrator cited was no longer an employee of the Calhoun County School District.

2. One school administrator (Arnoldsburg School) had written goals for the 2010-2011 school year, but the page showing the goals had not been signed by the supervisor showing mutual agreement on the goals.

COMPLIANCE. The school administrator and all other administrator evaluations reviewed by the Team met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on evaluation of personnel.

3. One school administrator (Calhoun Middle/High School) did not have an evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year.

COMPLIANCE. The school administrator cited was no longer an employee of Calhoun County School District.

4. One teacher signed a form provided by the principal in August 2009 to gather information from the staff on evaluations for the school year indicating they would be on performance evaluation for the 2009-2010 school year. The only record of the evaluation process performed for this teacher for the 2009-2010 school year was a Teacher Observation/Data Collection form completed on September 23, 2009.

COMPLIANCE.

The following year, 2010-2011, a Teacher Observation/Data Collection form was completed on October 20, 2010, for this teacher by the high school assistant principal. Another Teacher Observation/Data Collection form was completed for this teacher on November 17, 2010, by the principal of Calhoun Middle/High School. No further observation/evaluation information was completed for this teacher during the 2010-2011 school year. At the conclusion of the 2010-2011 school year, this teacher was notified by letter dated June 8, 2011, from the principal of Calhoun Middle/High School that he/she was being placed on performance evaluation status for the 2011-2012 school year.

A random review of support personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

1. One school counselor did not have an evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year.

COMPLIANCE. The school counselor cited had been evaluated in 2011-2012, and the evaluation met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on personnel evaluations.

2. One speech therapist was last evaluated in the 2005-06 school year. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires that professional support personnel with more than three years of experience be evaluated a minimum of once every three years.

NONCOMPLIANCE. The speech therapist cited did not have an evaluation in 2011-2012 and was last evaluated in 2005-2006. This did not meet the requirement of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on personnel evaluations that professional support personnel with six or more years of experience be evaluated at least every three years.

3. One counselor who had been employed for five years did not have any evaluations.

COMPLIANCE. The school counselor cited had been evaluated in 2011-2012, and the evaluation met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on personnel evaluations.

The evaluations of all other professional support personnel the Team sampled met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on personnel evaluations.

A random review of coaches' evaluations disclosed the following:

1. Completed observation forms were not on file for the coaches' evaluations the Team reviewed. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires that two observations be completed for each evaluation of a coach.
2. Two coaches' did not have evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year.
3. Two coaches' evaluations for the 2010-2011 school year were not completed within four weeks of the end of the sport seasons as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed a sampling of 12 coach evaluations, including the coaches in Numbers 2 and 3 above, and found all coach evaluations had been done well and met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Calhoun County Board of Education policy on evaluation of personnel.

A random review of service personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

1. Calhoun County School District's procedures for evaluating School Personnel Not Covered by State Board Policy 5310 states, regular school service employees are to be evaluated at least once per year and "each written evaluation must be based upon a minimum of two observations". Calhoun County administrators who evaluated service personnel did not complete the county required observation forms.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. The finding remained a problem as many of the service personnel evaluations for 2011-2012 reviewed did not contain the required observation. The number of observations required for service personnel evaluations had been changed from two to one. There appeared to be some confusion caused by the "evaluation/observation form" used to evaluate and observe job performance of service personnel; therefore, the Team recommended that the county superintendent review this form and consider developing two forms with one clearly marked for evaluations and the other clearly marked for observation of performance.

2. Two secretaries had only one evaluation for the 2010-2011 school year. Calhoun County School District's evaluation procedures required two evaluations for service personnel with 0-2 years of experience.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. One secretary who should have had two evaluations had only one evaluation in 2011-2012. The other secretary had the necessary evaluations for 2011-2012, but neither secretary had the required observation for their evaluations.

3. One custodian, one teacher aide, and two cooks (Pleasant Hill School) had not been evaluated during the 2010-2011 school year as required by Calhoun County School District's personnel evaluation procedures.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. The custodian, the teacher aide, and the two cooks were all evaluated during the 2011-2012 school year. The evaluations met the requirements, except for the required number of observations of performance.

COMPLIANCE. All other service personnel evaluations in the sample reviewed by the Team met the requirements of Calhoun County Board of Education personnel evaluation policies except for the number of observations done for the evaluations.

7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)

Mentor positions were posted and filled by qualified applicants. A lag time of almost two months occurred from the hiring of the new teacher to the assignment of a mentor. No evidence of the monthly support team meetings or the final evaluation of the mentor by the principal was found at the county office or at the Calhoun Middle/High School (Policy 5900).

No evidence showed that the requirements in Policy 5900, *Beginning Educator Internship Program*, (Section 6. Program Requirements) had been followed in implementing the mentor program. The nine requirements of the beginning educator internship program are listed below.

Requirement 1

- A professional support team shall be comprised of the following:
 - The school principal, who shall be the chair of the professional support team.
 - A member of the county professional staff development council.
- An experienced classroom teacher at the school who teaches the same or similar subject and grade level as the beginning teacher (if possible), and who shall serve as a mentor for the beginning teacher.

Requirement 2

- An orientation program for the beginning teacher shall be conducted prior to the beginning of the instructional term, but within the employment term, supervised by the mentor teacher.

Requirement 3

- Joint planning periods, when possible, shall be scheduled for the mentor and beginning teacher throughout the school year.

Requirement 4

- When possible, the mentor shall observe the beginning teacher's classroom teaching skills for at least one hour per week during the first half of the school year. Observation time may be reduced at the discretion of the mentor to one hour every two weeks during the second half of the school year.

Requirement 5

- Weekly meetings between the mentor and the beginning teacher shall occur at which the mentor and the beginning teacher discuss the performance of the beginning teacher and any needed improvements. These meetings may be reduced, at the discretion of the mentor, to biweekly meetings during the second half of the school year.

Requirement 6

- Monthly meetings of the professional support team shall occur to discuss the performance of the beginning teacher. These meetings may include all mentor members of all professional support teams at the school if helpful in the judgment of the participants.

Requirement 7

- In-service professional development programs shall be provided through the professional development project of the center for professional development for beginning teachers and for mentors, both of which will be held in the first half of the school year.

Requirement 8

- The mentor teacher shall be released from regular duties, as agreed to by the principal and the mentor teacher, and a yearly stipend of at least six hundred dollars for the mentor teacher for duties as a mentor teacher.

Requirement 9

A final evaluation of the performance of the beginning teacher shall be completed by the principal on a form developed by the state board of education. The final evaluation form shall be submitted by the principal to the county school superintendent and shall include one of the following recommendations:

- Full professional status: A recommendation of full professional status indicates that the beginning teacher has successfully completed the internship program

and in the judgment of the principal has demonstrated competence as a professional educator;

- Continuing internship status: A recommendation of continuing internship status indicates that in the judgment of the principal the beginning teacher requires further supervision and further employment in the district should be conditioned upon successful completion of an additional year under a beginning teacher internship program; or
- Discontinue employment: A recommendation to discontinue employment indicates that in the judgment of the principal the beginning teacher has completed two years of employment under supervision in a beginning teacher internship program, has not demonstrated competence as professional educator and will not benefit from further supervised employment in the district.

Mentor data stipend was submitted and approved for reimbursement. It was reported that in the past the county did not have principals with five years of experience to serve as mentors for new principals.

Calhoun County Schools did not meet the basic requirement of West Virginia Board of Education Policy which requires documentation of meetings with the mentor. However, Calhoun County Schools initiated a beginning teacher program for 16 teachers with zero to two years of experience. This program, *Emerging Educators*, is a year-long course designed to support the growth of teachers new or relatively new to the profession and is intended to strengthen the operation of the professional learning community within the school. The goal is that participants will gain an understanding of the systemic nature of school improvement and their role to continual improvement. This program challenges participants to sharpen their focus on student learning of the West Virginia content standards and objectives, the delivery of engaging instruction, and the need for a system of balanced assessment. Led by RESA 5, Professional Development Director, this course meets six times (monthly) for two hours each.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The positions for mentors were posted in a timely manner, but the lack of interested applicants created difficulty in filling the positions quickly. The positions were filled as soon as qualified applicants were found.

The Team reviewed the mentoring program at Calhoun Middle/High School and found all phases of the program as outlined in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5900 were being implemented. Mentors for all new teachers and administrators were in place and were meeting regularly with the mentees.

The beginning teacher program initiated by Calhoun County Schools with support from RESA 5 has had a name change to “Best Practices for Learning”, and serves all teachers at Calhoun Middle/High School. The teachers meet monthly with Dr. David Scragg, Director of Professional Development, for RESA 5 to continue their learning and discuss implementation of the best practices for learning.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

Board minutes indicated that some parents and board members had concerns regarding discipline at Calhoun Middle/High School.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Calhoun County School District has developed and adopted an Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools policy. This policy, as well as other parent and student policies and information, was provided to students and parents via student/parent handbooks. The Calhoun County Board of Education reviewed and approved the student/parent handbooks.

7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

W.Va. Code §18A-1-12a (17) states, "All official and enforceable personnel policies of a county board must be written and made available to its employees."

The Calhoun County School District Policy Manual was well organized and policies were easy to locate. The policy manual was also posted on the Calhoun County School District webpage. The on-line version was also easy to navigate.

Missing or Incomplete Policies

- Leave Donation Policy. This policy is required by W.Va. Code §18A-4-10f. Calhoun County Schools adopted a Personal Leave Bank that was last revised on April 16, 2002.
- Purchasing Procedures. A policy on purchasing procedures was not in place as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200 (Section 4.1).
- Veteran's Funerals Band Students to Play Taps. This policy is required by W. Va. Code §18-2E-8e.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Calhoun County School District reviewed the policy manual and developed a systematic strategy to review policies. Several policies had been reviewed and/or updated throughout this school year (2012-2013). A list of policies to be reviewed in the near future was provided to the Team. Included in that list are Purchasing Procedures and Veteran's Funerals Band Students Play Taps. A Leave Donation Policy, mentioned above, was adopted on March 11, 2013.

Recommendation

Several policies had never been reviewed in recent years. Policies should be reviewed periodically to determine if changes or updates are appropriate. The following policies are specific examples of those that need to be reviewed and updated.

- Educational Records was last reviewed in 2003.
- Discipline-1999.
- Mission, Goals and Objectives-April 5, 1999.
- Tobacco Control policy was adopted April 5, 1999 and had not been reviewed or updated. The last part of the policy indicated the policy will be reviewed every two years.
- Alternative Education-Adoption Date was not listed.
- Special Education Chapter 3 Instruction-Adopted April 5, 1999.
- Test Security Chapter 3 Instruction-Adopted April 5, 1999.

Policy reference incorrect for West Virginia Board of Education Policy.

This primarily takes place in policies that have not been reviewed for an extensive time.

- AIDS Education – Chapter 3 Instruction references West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2422.2, which was adopted on April 5, 1999. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2422.2 is Driver's Education. The correct reference is Policy 2422.4

Policies No Longer In Practice

Some policies were no longer in practice. These policies needed to be updated or deleted. The following are examples:

- In School Suspension Coverage (Chapter 2 – Administration). This policy was adopted on April 5, 1999 with no reviews or revisions. Calhoun County personnel interviewed stated that parts of this policy are no longer in practice. Additionally, any policy related to in-school suspension could be part of the new West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4373, *Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools* (Effective July 1, 2012).
- Grievance Procedures – Chapter 5 – Personnel – This policy was approved on April 5, 1999. This policy is no longer applicable and needed to be up updated.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Calhoun County has been working on reviewing and updating policies as necessary throughout the year. The majority of the policies mentioned in this section have been reviewed and updated where necessary.

The Release of Educational Records Policy was reviewed and updated on March 11, 2013.

On December 10, 2012, the Mission, Goals, and Objectives of the Board of Education, the Tobacco Control Policy, and policy regarding AIDS Education were all reviewed and updated December 10, 2012.

On June 11, 2012, (prior to the start of the 2012-2013 school year) Calhoun County School District adopted an Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools Policy that incorporated updated discipline procedures and alternative education procedures. The In-School Suspension Coverage was eliminated from Chapter 2. In-School Suspension was addressed and is a disciplinary option within the Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools Policy.

The list of policies to be reviewed and updated included Special Education and Testing Security, both located in Chapter 3.

Commendation

Student handbooks were consistent across the county and contained policies and procedures that students and parents needed to be informed. The Calhoun County Board of Education reviews the student handbooks each year.

7.8. LEADERSHIP.

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

W.Va. Code §18A-2-12a (1) provides “The effective and efficient operation of the public schools depends upon the development of harmonious and cooperative relationships between county boards and school personnel.”

The Team interviewed all five Calhoun County Board of Education members, the Superintendent of Calhoun County Schools, the Director of School Improvement, and the Calhoun Middle/High School Principal of Instruction. The Team also reviewed the Calhoun County Policy Manual and two years of Board meeting minutes.

Recommendations

1. The Calhoun County Board of Education policy on School Board Effectiveness was adopted in 2003. The attached Goals and Objectives were adopted in 1999. The board needs to revisit and update this policy.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Goals and Objectives were reviewed and revised by the Calhoun County Board of Education on July 3, 2012.

2. A review of board meeting minutes indicated little recognition of staff and student accomplishments throughout the year. The board and administrators should establish processes to recognize academic successes.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Numerous staff and student recognitions have occurred during the Calhoun County Board of Education meetings.

3. Interviews with administrators indicated that several programs had been initiated in the past two to three years. While it takes time for new programs to take effect, strategies should be incorporated to determine which initiatives are making an impact. For example, it was reported that the district had purchased Measures of Academic Progress (MAP) for three years. The district should find out if the program is making an impact and if not, discern the reasons. The county should then incorporate needed changes.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. According to the Director of School Improvement, monitoring of the Measures of Academic Progress (MAP) program and other programs was being done through analysis of data and input from personnel.

4. The Calhoun County School District appointed a Director of School Improvement at the central office and a Principal of Instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School. However, these positions have been assigned too many other responsibilities to focus on the targets their titles imply. The district leaders should determine the time commitment required to be successful in these positions and explore ways to provide the resources needed.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION PARTIALLY FOLLOWED. In regard to the Director of School Improvement's job responsibilities, some of the duties (Gear UP, Achieve 21, home schooling, and student transfers) had been removed. The Calhoun County Board of Education employed a half-time attendance director to alleviate some of the duties of the Principal of Instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School.

5. School administrators could report several initiatives and programs implemented at the Calhoun Middle/High School. However, administrators and board members were not as informed about the two elementary schools. In fact, one board member reported that one elementary school was doing fine because it achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP). The school achieved AYP by application of the confidence interval. Another board member thought that one elementary school caused the county to not achieve AYP. The district should closely examine student achievement at the elementary level to determine how better to equip students with the skills necessary to succeed at the higher grades. The Team recommended that the board members receive specific achievement information about each school and the county.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The Calhoun County Board of Education received achievement information about each school and the county. Information was provided by the superintendent and the director of instruction during board meetings. In addition, the co-principals of Calhoun Middle/High School regularly attend board of education meetings to share information/data on student performance and student dispositions.

Findings

1. Annually the board is to meet with each school's Local School Improvement Council (LSIC) and at this meeting a quorum of the Local School Improvement Council is to be in attendance. Meetings with the Calhoun County Board of Education and each school's LSIC were held as required by W.Va. Codes §§18-5-14 and 18-5A-2. Each school LSIC provided a report that addressed items designated by the county that were specified in W.Va. Code §18-5-14(a)(1)(B). These included: School performance, Curriculum, Status of the school in meeting the school improvement plan, and status of the school in meeting the county plan. Minutes of the Calhoun County Board of Education meeting minutes did not show that a quorum was present. Generally, the principal represented the LSIC in presenting the report.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. The Calhoun County Board of Education conducted a board meeting with the Local School Improvement Council (LSIC) of each school in the district. Minutes of those board meetings reflected a large number of persons in attendance (by name); however, the minutes did not reflect that a quorum of the school's LSIC was present for the meeting. The superintendent indicated that a quorum of LSIC members was present at each meeting.

2. In a review of the last two years of Calhoun County Board minutes, it was determined that the superintendent had not signed five sets of minutes and another eight signatures were stamped.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All Calhoun County Board of Education minutes were personally signed by both the superintendent and the board president.

3. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism (Policy 5500.03). District leaders expressed a written vision of high expectations through the Calhoun County Board of Education's Goal One: Ensure Quality Education. Objective 1 is, "Create a strong culture of commitment to educational excellence." The first goal of the superintendent is, "To ensure that the Calhoun County School System's primary emphasis is on improving the instructional process in order to maximize student achievement." However, interviews at all levels indicated a lack of diligence in holding all teachers and administrators accountable for providing high levels of instruction in all classrooms. The county WESTEST2 percent proficiency indicated a severe need to approach the intervening issues that impede

countywide education in a concerted and systematic manner. While staff at all levels of the educational system identified areas that resulted in the low student, school, and school district performance, solutions to real and sustained school improvement remained elusive. Educators will need to actively embrace the concept and practice that each is responsible for student achievement and work toward this.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PROGRESSING. This is a work in progress. Through the work of the director of instruction, individual school principals and the academic coaches assigned to each Calhoun County School, educators were being made aware of their role in improving student achievement.

FOLLOW-UP LEADERSHIP SUMMARY

Based on interviews with the superintendent and board members, the Calhoun County Board of Education was working with each other in a respectful manner with the common goal of providing the best education opportunities for the students of Calhoun County. The board was working with the superintendent and was supportive of him in his leadership role. Furthermore, board members indicated that board meetings were well-organized, productive, and conducted within a reasonable amount of time.

The board was keenly aware of the major issues facing the Calhoun County School District, in particular, low student achievement and the district's deficit financial condition. This school year, the board and the superintendent provided three academic coaches to work with teachers in each school on covering the West Virginia content standards and objectives (CSOs), effective instructional practices, and improving student achievement. In regard to the continuing and increasing deficit financial situation, the board has employed a new treasurer to work diligently with the superintendent and the board to restore financial stability to the district.

8.1.2. Transportation. The school district evaluates the cost containment and effectiveness of the transportation system and provides students efficient transportation services consistent with State laws and policies.

On the day of the audit, the Team observed students standing outside Calhoun Middle/High School prior to the opening of the school waiting for entry. A student approached a member of the School Education Performance Audit Team and asked if the Team could do anything about them standing outside when they were released from the bus in the morning and were not permitted inside the school building. The principal indicated this was a scheduling issue and the bus driver should not release students until the school doors open. On the day of the audit, the weather was rainy and cold. With severe weather issues, this could be potentially hazardous to students who are exposed to the elements for this period of time. The Team recommended that the transportation director, bus drivers, and school administration coordinate a schedule for students exiting the bus and entering the school and eliminate the need for students to wait outside in severe weather.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. This issue had been resolved.

8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

Findings

1. The central office administration did not adequately assess the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree of services provided to support high quality curriculum and instructional services. While an employee was hired as a "Director of School Improvement" for Calhoun County Schools, this individual is not provided adequate time to focus on instruction and curriculum because of multiple duties. Other duties included: Technology director, county test coordinator, professional staff development, Title II and Rural and Low Income Schools (RLIS) director, oversight of several grants (Gear Up, Heads Up [the 21st century grant], S3 grant and ALC pilot grant at CMHS), Critical Skills, Achieve 21, WVEIS county contact, textbook adoption and oversight of instructional material purchases (including STEP 7), contact for FRN, and coordinates the five-year strategic planning process for all schools. This individual is also responsible for administrative tasks, such as, homeschooling, student transfers, college collaborative for dual credit courses, revision and implementation of State and county board policies, and interviewing substitute

teacher candidates. Realistically, it is impossible to perform all of these administrative duties well, while focusing on student achievement and school improvement. The Team feels other duties impeded time for school improvement and many of those duties were not the best use of this director's time or skills.

2. The Team noted that the personnel functions were being handled by the county superintendent's secretary. The volume of work and professional development required for this responsibility paired with the role of the superintendent's secretary is difficult for one person to manage in an effective manner. Personnel findings supported this statement.
3. The county office administration worked with the Calhoun County Board of Education to restructure the administration at Calhoun Middle/High School. The previous structure included a principal and two assistant principals. The school now has two full-time principals and one assistant principal. One full time principal is responsible for curriculum and instruction while the other is responsible for all things not related to curriculum and instruction. The assistant principal is responsible for discipline. While this structure may seem practical, it was not well-thought out and has caused some confusion as to the primary principal of the school and who is responsible for evaluating whom. Currently, the superintendent evaluates the administrators of the schools. Additionally, the principal of instruction also serves as the county attendance director. This is not allowable under W.Va. Code as each county is required to employ at least a half-time attendance director. This principal is full time and is also doing the half-time attendance director work. The superintendent indicated this was only for the 2011-2012 year and the attendance director position will be posted for the 2012-2013 year. However, this is in violation of State Code.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. The Director of School Improvement position replaced another director position that had responsibility for many duties. This position was eliminated and many of the duties were incorporated into the Director of School Improvement position. The intent was to focus more attention on school improvement, but these other duties still had to be covered. A few of the other duties, such as Gear Up, Achieve 21, home schooling and student transfers were no longer performed by the Director of School Improvement. The employment of a half-time attendance director has helped with some of these duties. The Director of School Improvement indicated a year of experience with these duties has made it easier and less time consuming to perform them and that has made it better.

The school system still does not have a personnel director. A new position, Payroll Supervisor/Human Resources Assistant, was established which provided additional help to the personnel department and finance department.

8.1.5. Personnel. The school district assesses the assignment of personnel as based on West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies to determine the degree to which instructional and support services provided to the schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

1. The county posted a vacancy for Assistant Music Teacher at Calhoun Middle/High School for an annual salary of \$1. This violates the State minimum salary requirement.

COMPLIANCE. This position was clearly posted as an extra-curricular position this year. No one bid on the posting although the salary was listed as \$750.00. A person was employed as noted in our prior visit when the contract stated \$1.00 and the posting stated "state basic". That person is currently employed in an extra-curricular position as choir director for a salary of \$2,000.00. Postings were clearly marked as Service, Professional, and Extra-Curricular.

2. The county did not employ a half time attendance director as required by State Code. Instead, this job is a duty of the principal of instruction at Calhoun Middle/High School in addition to duties as a full time principal.

COMPLIANCE. The county posted for a half-time attendance director in June 2012 and employed an individual. Qualifications listed an attendance director certification or administrative certification. The individual employed was the only person that bid on the job and held an administrative certificate. State Code does not require her to obtain attendance director certification.

CAPACITY BUILDING

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

Capacity building efforts in Calhoun County Schools are overshadowed by the internal issues regarding administrative practices and support for school administrators in following through with teacher evaluation procedures. While the limited county staff relayed excellent ideas for school improvement and had taken steps toward improving student achievement, it is difficult for the county to plan for sustainability beyond grant funding and no excess levy funding to support such efforts. Additionally, the Team noted quality employees located at the school and central office levels; however, they were encumbered by too many administrative responsibilities to focus on achievement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The Calhoun County School District Superintendent reviewed job responsibilities and alignment; however, minimal changes in responsibilities were demonstrated at the time of the audit. Recently passed legislation requires central office professional employees who hold teacher certification to substitute at least three days during the year. This will further limit the amount of time available for responsibilities to be completed.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Calhoun County Schools utilized the critical skills funding to target struggling students in Grades 3 and 8. Additionally, Calhoun County Schools has participated in the Reading First grant, which targeted struggling readers in elementary school. Students reading proficiency increased somewhat in Grade 8.

The Calhoun County School District is the lowest achieving district in the state of West Virginia. Much support has been given to Calhoun Middle/High School from the West Virginia Department of Education and RESA 5. Issues which influence student achievement have been identified as discussed throughout this report. Staff development and programs and practices have been provided to improve student achievement. Even with all these endeavors, student achievement remained below standard.

Now that Calhoun County and State agencies have diagnosed the reasons for low achievement, urgency exists for the county “all staff” and stakeholders to align a common force that combats the current inertia of the school system. The educational system (Grades PK-12 and post-secondary) must be adjusted to produce a proper relationship that is translated into student, school, and school system improvement. Performance data and the findings in this report indicate that the Office of Education Performance Audits (OEPA) must not mistake activity (most teachers in all schools were observed providing good instruction) for achievement. Therefore, it is the assessment of the OEPA that teachers and administrators need intense content area development for instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Calhoun County Schools has increased its focus on student achievement and taken several action steps toward reaching this goal. Of note, the State ranking of Calhoun County School District’s achievement increased from 55th to 46th in West Virginia.

CALHOUN COUNTY SUMMARY

The Team identified significant issues of the Calhoun County Board of Education that will require extensive examination and overhaul. Student, school, and school district achievement was low. The county had more than a casual financial deficit for FY2011 and the on-site review revealed financial audit findings. Personnel, particularly hiring practices and licensure, were problematic. Personnel evaluations did not follow State Code and State Board Policy, and the Beginning Educator Internship Program was not being followed.

The essential issue confronting the Calhoun County School District is the district and schools are not adequately preparing students. This conclusion is born by the performance data in this report. The data link student and school performance and progress to graduation rate and college and career readiness.

Numerous intervening factors affect student achievement of Calhoun County School District's students. Foremost, county office level staff conduct administrative responsibilities according to past structures, policies, and procedures. Examples include instruction, hiring practices, county policies, personnel evaluations, and finance. Calhoun County and its schools will need to move into a 21st Century school system that operates according to current statutory and State Board of Education policies and procedures.

Secondly, Calhoun Middle/High School has received and continues to receive support and assistance from the West Virginia Department of Education and RESA 5, yet the school has not fully embraced application of State and regional support.

It is the determination of the Office of Education Performance Audits that the Calhoun County Board of Education is a high functioning board and the county superintendent possesses the leadership necessary to lead the county. However, it is essential that Calhoun County's leaders ensure new requirements, standards, and best practices are instituted countywide.

FOLLOW-UP SUMMARY

Several issues found in the initial audit of Calhoun County Schools remained prevalent: low student achievement, more than a casual financial deficit for FY2012, and professional certification issues. While there has been some progress in improving student achievement, particularly at the middle/high school level, the county's financial deficit has worsened.

The Office of Education Performance Audits concludes that the Calhoun County Board of Education and the Superintendent have the leadership capacity and the commitment to bring about needed improvements in student academic performance and make the necessary decisions to restore financial solvency to the county.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audits and the revised strategic plans, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education approve the reports and the revised strategic plans and direct Calhoun County and the schools to correct the findings noted in the reports by the next accreditation cycle and improve student, school, and school district student performance.

RECOMMENDATION

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Approval status of the Calhoun County School District. However, due to Calhoun County's escalating financial deficit, the Office of Education Performance Audits will continue to monitor the financial conditions through annual financial statements for improvement. Should the county's financial condition not improve within one year, the Office of Education Performance Audits will recommend to the West Virginia Board of Education that a financial review be conducted.