



**Office of Education  
Performance Audits**

**FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**FOR**

**DODDRIDGE COUNTY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL**

**DODDRIDGE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**JULY 2009**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

## **INTRODUCTION**

An announced Education Performance Audit of Doddridge County Elementary School in Doddridge County was conducted on February 4, 2008.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Doddridge County Elementary School in Doddridge County was conducted March 30, 2009. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

## SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

**18 DODDRIDGE COUNTY**  
Janice Michels, Superintendent

**211 DODDRIDGE COUNTY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed**

Dr. Gregory M. Kuhns, Principal  
Grades K - 04

Enrollment 465 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2005-2006 enrollment report)

### WESTEST 2005-2006

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	168	177	177	100.00	64.88	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	168	177	177	100.00	64.88	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	116	122	122	100.00	57.75	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	51	57	57	100.00	41.17	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	168	177	177	100.00	71.42	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	168	177	177	100.00	71.42	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	116	122	122	100.00	63.79	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	51	57	57	100.00	49.01	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**  
**Attendance Rate = 97.8%**

**18 DODDRIDGE COUNTY**  
Janice Michels, Superintendent  
**211 DODDRIDGE COUNTY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**  
Dr. Gregory M. Kuhns, Principal  
Grades K - 04  
Enrollment 460 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2006-2007 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2006-2007**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	150	160	159	99.37	68.45	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	149	159	158	99.37	68.24	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	106	114	113	99.12	60.00	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	37	39	39	100.00	51.35	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	150	160	160	100.00	72.66	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	149	159	159	100.00	72.48	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	106	114	114	100.00	64.15	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	37	39	39	100.00	37.83	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year  
\* -- 0 students in subgroup  
\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed  
Attendance Rate = 98.1%**

**18 DODDRIDGE COUNTY**  
Janice Michels, Superintendent  
**211 DODDRIDGE COUNTY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**  
Dr. Gregory M. Kuhns, Principal  
Grades K - 04  
Enrollment 453 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2007-2008**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	152	167	167	100.00	67.10	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	150	165	165	100.00	66.66	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	98	107	107	100.00	57.14	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	36	39	39	100.00	38.88	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	152	167	167	100.00	71.71	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	150	165	165	100.00	71.33	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	98	107	107	100.00	66.32	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	36	39	39	100.00	38.88	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed  
Attendance Rate = 97.1%**

## ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

### 5.1.1. Achievement.

This is the 1<sup>st</sup> year that Doddridge County Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement: The economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in both mathematics and reading/language arts. In accordance with the Sections 10.5 and 10.6 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the school was notified of any subgroup that initially did not make AYP in one year on any indicator. Doddridge County Elementary School and Doddridge County were encouraged to revise the school and county Five-Year Strategic Plans when a subgroup is identified in any one year.

The Team determined that the Five-Year Strategic Plan had been revised to address achievement.

Also, the school achieved AYP in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored below the State's percent proficient level in mathematics and reading/language arts.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class data indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 31.88 percent in mathematics; Grade 4 – 31.25 percent in mathematics and 30.86 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

Results from the 2006-2007 West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment revealed a deficiency at Grade 4. West Virginia had 70 percent of the students at or above mastery schoolwide compared to 32 percent for Doddridge County Elementary School. The school must continue to address the low mastery level by developing a writing rubric or consistent method to teach writing skills that address student weaknesses on the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment and assure that all teachers provide appropriate feedback to all students at least weekly.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Reading First.
2. Doddridge County Reading Academy.
3. GradeQuick.
4. Bullying and Harassment.
5. Dynamic Mathematics Assessments.
6. Reading Fluency and Instruction.

7. West Virginia Reading Conference.
8. West Virginia Department of Education Reading Research Symposium.
9. International Reading Association Conference.

### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**STANDARD NOT MET.** Doddridge County Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the 2007-2008 school year. The assessment standard was not met in the economic disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in mathematics. The assessment standards were met in mathematics in the all students (AS) and racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups through application of the confidence interval. The assessment standards were met in reading/language arts in the AS, the W, and the SES subgroups with application of the confidence interval.

The school had adopted the Power Writing program as their schoolwide writing program. Teachers also continued to use the McMillian Writing program and the Writing Roadmap writing program. The West Virginia Writing Assessment for the 2008-2009 school year had been administered to students at Doddridge County Elementary School but results were not yet available.

Doddridge County Elementary School received funding for a grant that provided a mathematics consultant to work with the teachers and students to improve achievement in mathematics. Teachers were benchmarking students in mathematics every three weeks and regrouping for instruction based on student needs as shown on the benchmark tests.

The grade level teams were holding monthly meetings with the Title I teachers and special education teachers to review student progress and plan effective instructional interventions.

Teachers had been instructed in the use of technology and how to effectively integrate its use into classroom instruction. Visits to the classrooms verified technology was being used to instruct students throughout the school.

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

**Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress to Meet the Standard (5.1.1. Achievement – SES).**

#### 7.1. Curriculum

**7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Instruction in writing was occurring at least one time per week in all classrooms; however, teachers were using the Macmillan reading series writing component, which does not specifically address the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment. The Team recommended that the school develop a consistent approach or method to address the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment to increase the percent of students performing at or above mastery.

#### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** The faculty adopted Power Writing for the schoolwide writing program and all teachers were using it to teach writing at least one time a week. Some teachers also used Writing Roadmap to supplement the writing program.

**7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Due to a lack of physical education facilities, three classes per day were being taught at the top of the stairwell which contained the Title I and special education classes. Physical education classes were also taught in general education classrooms. Although the required time for physical education was met, the quality of the program was questionable. The Team observed students skipping rope in the hallways and minimal physical education classes were taught in the general education classrooms.

#### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** The Doddridge County Board of Education had presented a request to the West Virginia School Building Authority for funds to build an addition to Doddridge County Elementary School which, pending funding, would provide sufficient space to house the physical education program and space to move the Title I and special education classes out of the hallways. Meanwhile, the physical education classes had been moved



back into the multipurpose room at lunchtime where the multipurpose room will be shared for lunch and physical education. The Title I and special education classes were still meeting in the hallways by the stairs.

**7.1.13. Instructional day.** Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

The Team could not verify that all classes were achieving the 315 required instructional minutes. Several of the classes did not have transition time between classes and lunch. Individual classrooms included non-instructional activities, such as, rest room breaks, roll call, morning announcements, etc., during the required instructional time.

#### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** All noninstructional times had been identified and separated from instructional time in the school master schedule and all classes were receiving at least 315 instructional minutes per day.

### **7.2. Student and School Performance**

**7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.** Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

All teachers' lesson plans were not checked by the administration at least one time per quarter. Approximately eight teachers did not have principal feedback or initials for the first quarter.

#### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** The Team reviewed records of lesson plans and records of lesson plan reviews in the principal's office and randomly checked teacher lesson plan books in the classrooms and interviewed teachers to verify lesson plans were being reviewed quarterly, as required, by the principal. Everything was found to be in order.

## INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Doddridge County Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Doddridge County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Doddridge County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.**

The administration and teachers were aware of the low WESTEST scores in reading/language arts and had investigated the reason for the scores. After several discussions and investigations, the school staff determined that the Houghton-Mifflin series was not meeting the students' needs. Staff reported the reading series contained inaccuracies and typographical errors and was not addressing the areas of students' need. The school changed to the Macmillan series this school year (2007-2008) and reported a great deal of success thus far.

Staff further indicated that the Saxon Mathematics series was not adequate in addressing the mathematics curriculum and that supplemental materials were needed. When asked if a different mathematics series was going to be implemented, the teachers stated that the county would have to purchase the series and money was not available.

The Team noted a modest increase in student scores from the 2005-2006 school year to the 2006-2007 school year. The staff was striving to meet the needs of the students and had changed their teaching strategies to increase student achievement.

Physical education was held in the "cafetorium", but was conducted in vacant classrooms during the lunch periods. Three physical education classes per day were being taught in the stairwell (Title I and special education class areas). Other physical education classes were taught in the general education classrooms. The Team observed students skipping rope in the hallways and minimal physical education classes in the classrooms. Although the school provided the required time of physical education, the lack of facilities impeded delivering a quality program.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**With grant funds received to improve instruction in mathematics, the school had provided mathematics manipulatives and other resources to supplement the Saxon Math program.**

**Staff training had been provided on effective instructional strategies to assist teachers with lesson planning and instruction.**

**The lack of facilities for physical education and special services still existed. The Doddridge County Board of Education had presented a request to the West Virginia School Building Authority for funding for a building addition which would alleviate this problem, but had not yet received funding.**

### **BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES**

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team determined that Doddridge County Elementary School and Doddridge County have the capacity to correct the achievement deficiencies. However, it will be difficult to provide a high quality physical education program due to limited facilities. The administration and staff had conducted extensive analysis of the low student achievement scores and had taken steps to increase student achievement.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**Student achievement increased some during the 2007-2008 school year but the increase was not enough for the school to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in all subgroups. The staff continued to strive to improve student achievement.**

## IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

**19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The site was not large enough for future expansion. The topography was not varied enough to provide a desirable appearance but without steep inclines and the site did not have a stable, well-drained soil free of erosion.
- 19.1.3. Teachers' workroom.** The teachers' workroom was not of adequate size and did not provide access to communication's technology.
- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** All classrooms did not have adequate storage.

- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility did not have a ceramic kiln or black-out areas. The music facility was not located away from quiet areas of the building and did not have music stands, a podium, or acoustical treatment. The physical education facility was not of adequate size and did not have a drinking fountain, provisions for two or more teaching stations, a display case, or a bulletin board.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service area did not have seating for dining and study purposes, a chalkboard and bulletin board, or a teachers' dining area of adequate size. Food and non-food storage was not adequate.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**The facility resource needs remained as identified in the original Education Performance Audit report.**

## **EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION**

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Achievement scores had increased modestly from the 2005-2006 school year to the 2006-2007 school year and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup remained below adequate yearly progress (AYP). Doddridge County Elementary School and Doddridge County must continue to implement high yield instructional practices and instruction that will improve achievement. Doddridge County must actively pursue assistance from RESA VII, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

### **FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY**

**Doddridge County Elementary School continued implementing effective instructional strategies to improve student achievement. The Doddridge County superintendent and office staff had continued to support Doddridge County Elementary School by providing curriculum pacing guides and a consultant to work with the staff on improving reading achievement. The West Virginia Department of Education had provided support by assisting the school prepare a grant in which it received funding for mathematics and technology. RESA VII had provided training in implementing the Response to Intervention (RTI) program and will provide a workshop on techSteps in June 2009.**

### SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
18-211 Doddridge County Elementary	Conditional Accreditation		5.1.1 SES	May 31, 2012

### Education Performance Audit Summary

W.Va. Code §18-2E-5(n) School accreditation. (3). provides Conditional accreditation status shall be given to a school when the school's performance and progress are below the level required for full accreditation, but the school's electronic strategic plan . . . has been revised to improve performance and progress by a date certain and the plan is meeting the objectives and timeline specified in the revised plan.

Pursuant to W.Va. Code §18-2E-5, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education upgrade the accreditation status of Doddridge County Elementary School from Temporary Accreditation to Conditional Accreditation with a May 31, 2012 Date Certain to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).