



EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

NUTTER FORT PRIMARY SCHOOL

HARRISON COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2013

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Exemplary Programs & Practices.....	7
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	11
High Quality Standards	12
Indicators of Efficiency	12
Early Detection and Intervention	14
Education Performance Audit Summary	15

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Nutter Fort Primary School in Harrison County was conducted March 7, 2013. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. Section 4.5.2 of Policy 2320 discusses accountability of Kindergarten through Grade 2 schools. “The accountability of public schools without grades assessed (i.e., K-2 schools) will be based on attendance and test scores from the feeder school unless the West Virginia Board of Education specifically directs an on-site review of such schools which would substitute for AYP for a three (3) year period.”

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Rhonda Crowley, Coordinator,
Office of Early Learning

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Wendy R. Clutter	Elementary School Principal	Cameron Elementary School Marshall County
Krista A. DeVaughn	Elementary School Principal	Sistersville Elementary School Tyler County
Don E. Johnson	Elementary School Principal	Sutton Elementary School Braxton County
Timothy M. Via	Elementary School Principal	Davis Elementary School Braxton County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

33 HARRISON COUNTY

Susan Lee Collins, Superintendent

232 NUTTER FORT PRIMARY SCHOOL

Joann Gilbert, Principal

Grades PK-02, Enrollment 708 (2nd month 2011-2012 enrollment report)

DIBELS NEXT STUDENT ACHIEVEMENT DATA

SCHOOL LEVEL (% BENCHMARK)				
	<i>BOY</i>	<i>MOY</i>	<i>EOY</i>	<i>% GROWTH</i>
2011-2012	62%	62%	62%	0%
2012-2013	58%	58%		0%

KINDERGARTEN (% BENCHMARK)				
	<i>BOY</i>	<i>MOY</i>	<i>EOY</i>	<i>% GROWTH</i>
2011-2012	48%	54%	65%	+17%
2012-2013	51%	46%	%	-5%

GRADE 1 (% BENCHMARK)				
	<i>BOY</i>	<i>MOY</i>	<i>EOY</i>	<i>% GROWTH</i>
2011-2012	67%	67%	56%	-11%
2012-2013	55%	60%	-	+5%

GRADE 2 (% BENCHMARK)				
	<i>BOY</i>	<i>MOY</i>	<i>EOY</i>	<i>% GROWTH</i>
2011-2012	72%	66%	65%	-7%
2012-2013	69%	69%	-	0%

Nutter Fort Primary uses DIBELS Next Benchmark assessment to show the percentage of students at benchmark level at the Beginning of Year (BOY), Middle of Year (MOY), and End of Year (EOY) and the percentage of growth of each grade.

mCLASS MATH STUDENT ACHIEVEMENT DATA

SCHOOL LEVEL (% BENCHMARK)				
	BOY	MOY	EOY	% GROWTH
2011-2012	27%	48%	45%	+18%
2012-2013	18%	34%	-	+16%

KINDERGARTEN (% BENCHMARK)				
	BOY	MOY	EOY	% GROWTH
2011-2012	20%	58%	66%	+46%
2012-2013	11%	44%	%	+33%

GRADE 1 (% BENCHMARK)				
	BOY	MOY	EOY	% GROWTH
2011-2012	45%	50%	36%	-9%
2012-2013	28%	44%	-	+16%

SECOND GRADE (% BENCHMARK)				
	BOY	MOY	EOY	% GROWTH
2011-2012	16%	37%	32%	+16%
2012-2013	16%	21%	-	+5%

Nutter Fort Primary uses mClass Math to benchmark student achievement at the Beginning of Year (BOY), Middle of Year (MOY), and End of Year (EOY). Data show a positive percentage of growth for all grades of students achieving at the benchmark level in 2012-2013.

WRITING STUDENT ACHIEVEMENT DATA

Nutter Fort Primary teachers have developed their own Writing Benchmarks to use at the Beginning of Year (BOY), Middle of Year (MOY), and End of Year (EOY) along with rubrics to assess the Benchmarks. Data from each Benchmark are analyzed and monitored for growth. For the 2011-2012 school year, EOY data showed 98 percent of Kindergarten students scored Proficient and above; Grade 1 EOY data showed 66 percent of students scored Proficient and above.

For the 2012-2013 school year, MOY data showed Kindergarten students at 77 percent Proficient or above; MOY Grade 1 students at 50 percent Proficient or above; and MOY Grade 2 students at 29 percent Proficient or above.

KINDERGARTEN				
	BELOW	BASIC	PROFICIENT	ADVANCED
FY12 BOY	20%	37%	43%	0%
FY12 EOY	1%	1%	29%	69%
FY13 BOY	18%	67%	15%	0%
FY13 MOY	7%	17%	57%	20%

GRADE 1				
	BELOW	BASIC	PROFICIENT	ADVANCED
FY12 BOY	27%	40%	30%	3%
FY12 EOY	7%	27%	45%	21%
FY13 BOY	50%	44%	5%	1%
FY13 MOY	18%	32%	45%	5%

GRADE 2				
	BELOW	BASIC	PROFICIENT	ADVANCED
FY12 BOY				
FY12 EOY				
FY13 BOY	20%	66%	13%	1%
FY13 MOY	9%	62%	24%	5%

For the 2011-2012 school year, Grade 2 students were assessed using West Virginia Writes. Results from West Virginia Writes showed 28 percent of Grade 2 students at Mastery or above. This was the first year to include Grade 2 in West Virginia Writes and a Grade 3 level prompt and scoring were used; therefore, the school staff felt this may not be an accurate representation of students' writing performance.

GRADE 2					
WEST VIRGINIA WRITES –SECOND GRADE FY12					
	NOVICE	BELOW MASTERY	MASTERY	ABOVE MASTERY	DISTINGUISHED
2011-2012	14%	58%	25%	3%	0%
2012-2013					

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
2. Tee Off to a Great Year.
3. Data Day.
4. Guided Reading/Positive Behavior Support/Technology/Legal Updates.
5. DIBELS Next Training for New Teachers.
6. mClass Math Training for New Teachers.
7. How to Work with Parents.
8. Guided Reading/Math Talks Book Study.
9. Kagan Strategies.
10. Math Workstations/Math Talks Book Study.

Exemplary Programs & Practices

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.

Title: Standards-Based Report Cards

Description of Program

Nutter Fort Primary requested a waiver from the Harrison County Board of Education April 16, 2012, to implement an alternative grading process for the 2012-2013 school year. The request was granted for Nutter Fort Primary to develop and implement a Standards-Based Report Card and assessment practices for Grades 1 and 2. Additionally, Nutter Fort Primary was awarded a \$5,000 grant through the Fairmont State/Professional Development School Partnership for this initiative. The grant was used for teacher stipends, book resources, and iPads for the new assessment process.

Professional development sessions were held to research and develop a standards-based report card aligned with West Virginia Next Generation Common Core Standards. Staff developed a rubric which clearly defined proficiency levels for each standard. The standards make it clear to students, parents, and teachers the concepts and skills required at each grade level. These learning standards shape curriculum, instruction, assessment, and student learning. With this change in grading, Nutter Fort Primary teachers reflect more on their teaching practices, how students learn, and what changes need to be made to meet the requirements of the new State standards. This enables teachers to create more individualized instruction and parents can easily discern the strengths and weaknesses in every component of each academic area.

Summary of Results

The Nutter Fort Primary teachers agreed this new grading assessment is an accurate and in-depth report of student progress. The parent response to the new Standards-Based Report Card has been favorable as well. Two parent meetings were held to introduce parents to Nutter Fort Primary's new Standards-Based Report Card and to discuss any concerns with this new assessment tool. Survey results are depicted in the following chart.

RESPONSE QUESTIONS	<i>Strongly agree</i>	<i>Mostly agree</i>	<i>Not sure</i>
The SBRC gives me a clearer academic picture of what my child is learning in school.	75%	25%	
I am better able to understand my child's strengths and weakness in each academic area.	80%	20%	
The new SBRC is easy to understand.	65%	30%	5%
I understand my child's learning behaviors vs. academic indicators.	70%	30%	
It is clear that the rubric does not equate to A, B, C, D grades.	80%	15%	5%
I prefer the new SBRC compared to the traditional report card.	50 %	30 %	15 %

Contact: Joann Gilbert, Principal Phone: 304-326-7524
 Email: jmgilber@access.k12.wv.us

Exemplary Programs & Practices

Standard: 7.1.6. Instruction in writing.

Title: Writers' Workshop

Description of Program

The Nutter Fort Primary School staff values and incorporates writing instruction as an essential element of literacy development. Writers' Workshop is a daily component in the K-2 master schedule. The writing program at Nutter Fort Primary School focuses on the Common Core Writing Standards. The daily Writers' Workshop includes structured best practices to engage students in the writing process. Writing Benchmarks have been developed to use BOY (beginning of year), MOY (middle of year), and EOY (end of year) and grade level rubrics to assess the Benchmarks. Data from each Benchmark are analyzed and monitored for growth. Ongoing professional development sessions on scoring, recording, conferencing, and administering Benchmark prompts provided vital information to guide instructional practices in writing to meet the students' needs.

Summary of Results

The rigorous writing program implemented at Nutter Fort Primary School has resulted in improved student writing evidenced by the Benchmark scores shown below.

K	1 ST				2 ND									
	FY12 BOY	FY12 EOY	FY13 BOY	FY13 MOY	FY12 BOY	FY12 EOY	FY13 BOY	FY13 MOY						
ADVANCED	0%	69%	0%	20%	ADVANCED	3%	21%	1%	5%	ADVANCED			1%	5%
PROFICIENT	43%	29%	15%	57%	PROFICIENT	30%	45%	5%	45%	PROFICIENT			13%	24%
BASIC	37%	1%	67%	17%	BASIC	40%	27%	44%	32%	BASIC			66%	62%
BELOW	20%	1%	18%	7%	BELOW	27%	7%	50%	18%	BELOW			20%	9%

Contact: Joann Gilbert, Principal Phone: 304-326-7524
 Email: jmgilber@access.k12.wv.us

Exemplary Programs & Practices

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.

Title: Mustang Stables

Description of Program

Beginning during the 2012-2013 school year, Nutter Fort Primary staff began using a schoolwide Intranet site called “Mustang Stables”. This site was created by Nutter Fort Primary’s computer teacher to house data and other information about the school. Key information on the needs of the teachers, administration, and staff is placed on this internal website. The site creates a sense of community among the staff for them to collaborate and communicate with one another in a safe and friendly environment. It also conserves teachers time by centralizing valuable and up-to-date information.

This website is password protected and secured from outside visitors. Information that can be accessed by the staff includes: Daily memoranda, announcements, technology sign out calendars, weekly team planners, discussions, schoolwide calendar, school directory, resources (templates, schedules, etc.), links, poles, and more. All staff members were trained on how to navigate and upload information to the site and all staff understands the importance of checking the site daily for updates.

Summary of Results

Nutter Fort Primary School staff has expressed positive feedback about this site. To date, 27,987 visits have been logged.

Contact: Jaclyn Loss Phone: 304-326-7524 Email: jcloss@access.k12.wv.us

Exemplary Programs & Practices

7.1.12. Multicultural activities.

Title: Chinese Program

Description of Program

The Chinese Program is in its fourth year at Nutter Fort Primary School. In collaboration with the Asian Hanban Society, Chinese guest teachers have been an addition to Nutter Fort Primary during the 2009-2010; 2010-2011; 2011-2012; and 2012-2013 school years - two days a week. Students have learned basic greetings, colors, numbers, and other character trait phrases. Nutter Fort Primary School students practice the Chinese language skills they acquire through engagement activities with classmates and teachers. This partnership prepares Nutter Fort Primary students for the 21st Century through global awareness and appreciation of diversity. Other benefits of this program include developing relationships with Asian students and strengthening school-community connections. In addition to the guest teacher program, Nutter Fort Primary is in its second year of the West Virginia Department of Education Language Leaper Program with a focus on Chinese language.

Summary of Results

Nutter Fort Primary students have an increased awareness and understanding of the Chinese language and culture through experiences with the Chinese Program. West Virginia Department of Education Language Leaper Chinese SOPA Results (Spring 2012) ranked Nutter Fort Primary number three out of the seven West Virginia Language Leaper schools rated for proficiency in the Chinese language.

Contact: Joann Gilbert, Principal; Jaclyn Loss, Nancy Maunz
Phone: 304-326-7524 Email: jmgilber@access.k12.wv.us

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Nutter Fort Primary School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

- 7.1.3. **Learning environment.** The learning environment at Nutter Fort Primary School was positive, nurturing, clean, safe, and educationally stimulating. A plethora of student work was displayed and staff constructed entertaining and interesting decorations to support learning.
- 7.1.7. **Library/educational technology access and technology application.** The Team observed excellent technology applications in every classroom and in the computer laboratory. The school had iPads, iPods, computers, Smart Boards, Elmos, and laptops for teacher and student use and it was evident that students used the technology on a regular basis.
- 7.5.1. **Parents and the community are provided information.** The Team commended the Nutter Fort Primary School staff for the numerous and unique ways in which parents and the community are provided information to help students learn. Parents are brought into the school once each nine weeks to participate in classroom instruction to observe educational activities occurring at the school.

The school developed the Mustang Pride Program, in which the staff takes food to needy children's families on a regular basis. Additionally, backpacks of food are sent home with needy kids on weekends. Several community groups donate food and clothing for the school's students.

- 7.8.1. **Leadership.** The principal and assistant principal provided excellent school leadership. All teachers stated that the administration was extremely supportive and helpful and provided necessary materials and professional development to support teachers. The principal was keenly aware of the school and student needs and held high expectations for students, staff, and herself. The classroom teachers provided excellent classroom leadership and challenged all students to do their best work.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

None identified.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Nutter Fort Primary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Harrison County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Harrison County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The administration and staff of Nutter Fort Primary School utilized formal and informal data, high quality professional development, and high expectations to guide the classroom curriculum and increase student achievement. Regular adjustments were made to accommodate the wide variety of learning styles and abilities of students.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Nutter Fort Primary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Nutter Fort Primary demonstrated the capacity to provide a safe, nurturing, educationally stimulating atmosphere that was conducive to the learning process.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority.

This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing “Need” for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site did not have stable, well-drained soil free of erosion and all playground/recreational areas were not separated from streets and parking. (Does not adversely impact or impair the delivery of a high quality educational program)
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility did not have mechanical ventilation, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas. The music facility did not have music chairs with folding arms, music stands, or a podium. (Does not adversely impact or impair the delivery of a high quality educational program)
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service area did not have a dry erase board and bulletin board. (Does not adversely impact or impair the delivery of a high quality educational program)

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Nutter Fort Primary School was providing high quality instruction for all students to ensure that all students achieve at high levels. Staff development was provided to target any areas of concern that the staff had regarding curriculum and student behavior.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team presented four Exemplary Programs (7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives, 7.1.6. Instruction in writing, 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application, and 7.1.12. Multicultural activities). The Team also presented four commendations (7.1.3. Learning environment, 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application, 7.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information, and 7.8.1. Leadership).

The Team noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Accreditation status of Nutter Fort Primary School.