



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

GRANDVIEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

KANAWHA COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JULY 2009

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Grandview Elementary School in Kanawha County was conducted on January 16, 2008.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Grandview Elementary School in Kanawha County was conducted April 3, 2009. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

39 KANAWHA COUNTY

Dr. Ronald E. Duerring, Superintendent

231 GRANDVIEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Sherrie Davis, Principal

Grades K - 05

Enrollment 249 (2nd month 2006-2007 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2006-2007

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	98	105	105	100.00	58.16	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
White	75	80	80	100.00	61.33	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	23	25	25	100.00	47.82	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	79	86	86	100.00	51.89	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	22	23	23	100.00	27.27	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	98	105	105	100.00	64.28	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
White	75	80	80	100.00	66.66	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	23	25	25	100.00	56.52	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	79	86	86	100.00	60.75	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	22	23	23	100.00	27.27	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 96.3%

39 KANAWHA COUNTY
Dr. Ronald E. Duerring, Superintendent
231 GRANDVIEW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed
Cindy Cummings, Principal
Grades K - 05
Enrollment 232 (2nd month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	94	97	97	100.00	59.57	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	70	73	73	100.00	58.57	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	24	24	24	100.00	62.50	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	76	79	79	100.00	56.57	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	20	21	21	100.00	30.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	94	97	97	100.00	65.95	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	70	73	73	100.00	65.71	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	24	24	24	100.00	66.66	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	76	79	79	100.00	61.84	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	20	21	21	100.00	20.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 94.0%

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

5.1.1. Achievement.

Grandview Elementary School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval and/or averaging. It is further noted that the racial/ethnicity black (B) subgroup and the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored far below the State's percent proficient level in mathematics and reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 47.06 percent in mathematics and 35.29 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 46.43 percent in mathematics and 35.71 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 33.33 percent in mathematics and 36.11 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

Results from the 2006-2007 West Virginia Writing Assessment revealed a dramatic deficiency at Grade 4. West Virginia had 70 percent of the students at or above mastery, as compared to 68 percent for Kanawha County and 13 percent for Grandview Elementary School. The school must continue to address this issue by implementing a writing rubric to address the West Virginia Writing Assessment and assure that all teachers provide appropriate feedback to all students at least weekly.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Grandview Strategic Planning.
2. Teach First – Understanding Student Failures.
3. High Performing 21st Century Skills.
4. WESTEST Analysis.
5. Monitoring for Achievement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

MET STANDARD. Grandview Elementary School again achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) on the 2007-2008 WESTEST in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval and/or averaging. The county curriculum staff and school staff had worked together to address achievement in mathematics and reading/language arts in these subgroups through staff training in effective instructional strategies and analyzing student data

from the WESTEST and benchmarking tests to determine student learning weaknesses. Information on these weaknesses was used by the classroom teachers and support teachers in planning instruction to address individual student weaknesses. The school had used the county reading coach and mathematics coach to provide training and support to school staff.

Results from the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment were not distributed in the 2007-2008 school year. The staff had adopted the 6 plus 1 writing process to be used schoolwide. Teachers in the primary grades also instructed students in writing with the writing component of the reading/language arts program. Teachers interviewed reported student writing was a central focus of instruction throughout the school and writing was being taught by all teachers. The Team reviewed student writing folders and displays of students' writing throughout the school. An emphasis on student writing was evident in all classrooms.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While teachers discussed instruction in writing, neither a writing rubric nor a system was in place to sufficiently address the low percent (13 percent) of the school's students at or above mastery on the West Virginia Writing Assessment. Additionally, teachers in the primary grades were not providing sufficient feedback to students on students' writing responses.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The school staff had received training in the 6 plus 1 writing program and had adopted this program with its writing rubric for use throughout the school. Student writing had become a central instructional focus and students were writing on a daily basis. A review of student writing folders revealed teachers were providing detailed feedback on students' writing responses.

RECOMMENDATION

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. A Kindergarten teacher and an Overage teacher were working together in a Kindergarten classroom. One teacher was teaching and the other teacher functioned more as a support teacher/assistant in the classroom. While both teachers were making efforts to co-teach, the Team recommended that the Kindergarten teacher and the Overage teacher receive professional development in team teaching.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Staff development on techniques of co-teaching had been provided by the Kanawha County Schools for those teachers who work together in classrooms.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Grandview Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Kanawha County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Kanawha County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Through staff interviews and observations, the Team noted that the administration and staff were aware of the low percent of students in mathematics and reading and were making changes in the teaching strategies to address the mastery levels. Extensive data analysis had been conducted and all teachers could relate the changes that had been made to improve student achievement. The Team strongly recommended that the school continue to investigate and implement high quality programs and research-based practices to ensure that all students achieve success.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

The school staff had continued their efforts to improve student achievement through the use of test result analysis to identify weaknesses and prepare instructional activities to address these weaknesses. Additional training on effective instructional strategies had been received from the county mathematics and reading coaches. The staff was anxiously awaiting the results from the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment and WESTEST for this school year.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Grandview Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The writing process must become an area of extreme importance at the school. With only 13 percent of students at or above mastery, Grandview Elementary School is far behind the county and state average. All teachers must conduct instruction in writing activities at least weekly and provide feedback to all students to increase student achievement.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

Student writing had become a central instructional focus for the entire teaching staff. All teachers were conducting writing activities at least weekly and many were conducting writing activities daily. Teacher feedback on writing activities was being provided to all students.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of

facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility did not have two deep sinks, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas. The music facility did not have a podium or acoustical treatment. The physical education facility did not have a drinking fountain or a display case.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

No Change.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the achievement levels of students in the all students (AS), racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups, and the fact that the school achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) only by application of the confidence interval and/or averaging, Grandview Elementary School and Kanawha County must continue to implement high yield instructional practices and instruction that will improve students' achievement. Kanawha County must actively pursue assistance from RESA III, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY

The Kanawha County central office administration continued to provide support and assistance to the Grandview Elementary School staff through additional training in implementing high yield, effective instructional strategies designed to improve student achievement. RESA III also provided assistance through training the school staff in implementing Acuity and Writing Road Map programs. The West Virginia Department of Education provided staff training in implementing 21st Century learning skills. The school staff was using the skills from these trainings to continue the data analysis and used this information in planning instructional interventions that addressed student individual achievement weaknesses.

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
39-231 Grandview Elementary	Full Accreditation			