



EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

LINCOLN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

DECEMBER 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team.....	4
Initiatives For Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	5
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability	6
High Quality Standards.....	18
Capacity Building	68
Early Detection And Intervention.....	69
Approval Recommendation.....	70
School Summary	71

INTRODUCTION

After over a decade of State intervention in the operation of the Lincoln County School System, partial control was returned to the Lincoln County School District at the May 2009 State Board meeting. Local decision making was returned, except personnel and finances specific to personnel. A Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) that set forth an exit agreement that described the stipulations and parameters for the return of full authority to the Lincoln County Board of Education was signed May 2009 by the State Board President and members of the Lincoln County Board of Education. The MOU stated that the return of decision making authority was done on a provisional basis.

In a December 2010 West Virginia Board of Education meeting, the county was allowed to start making their own personnel decisions without having to submit them to the state for approval. The state was moving forward in the progression of the MOU.

The OEPA was directed to conduct a partial audit of personnel and hiring practices because of information suggesting that the county board had regressed in those areas. The Team reviewed personnel and hiring at the Lincoln County Board of Education office on March 30 and April 1, 2011. The Team returned May 10, 2011, and again May 18, 2011, to check additional personnel issues that included potential influence of a board member(s) in employment of personnel. The report was presented to the State Board at the July 2011 Board meeting. In July 2011, the Lincoln County Board of Education, while under Conditional Approval status, was found to not be in compliance with personnel laws.

At the July 2011 meeting, the West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) continued the Conditional Approval status and its provisional oversight of Lincoln County School District and required that the county submit monthly agendas of meetings and all official meeting minutes and a separate schedule listing all county personnel actions to the State Superintendent of Schools, through the Office of Legal Services, until such time as it is determined by another OEPA audit and upon action by the WVBE that the submission of the listed information is no longer needed.

The State Board directed the Office of Education Performance Audits (OEPA) to return to Lincoln County June 28, 2012, to assess progress relative to personnel issues identified in the July 2011 report to the West Virginia Board of Education.

An OEPA Team reviewed personnel areas at the Lincoln County Board of Education on June 28, 2012, to ascertain that the Lincoln County School District and the Lincoln County Board of Education were sustaining requirements of State Code, West Virginia Board of Education Policies, and county policies. The Team also followed up on county compliance with action taken by the West Virginia Board of Education in its July 2011 meeting relative to personnel matters.

In July 2012, the State Board continued the Conditional Approval status of the Lincoln County School District. In order to release Lincoln County from provisional oversight, the OEPA was directed to revisit Lincoln County in the fall of 2012 to ascertain the degree of compliances set forth in Policy 2320 and make a recommendation to the West Virginia Board of Education regarding the status of the Lincoln County School System.

Pursuant to the directions of the West Virginia Board of Education, the Office of Education Performance Audits conducted an audit of the Lincoln County School District and the schools October 23-25, 2012.

The Education Performance Audit Team interviewed the Lincoln County Board of Education President and members of the board of education, school district personnel including the superintendent, the director of personnel, finance official, finance employees, director of secondary education, director of elementary education, and other county office personnel. The Team examined documents including the Lincoln County Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan; minutes of meetings of the Lincoln County Board of Education; personnel documents; personnel evaluations; the school system policy manual; regulatory agency reviews, i.e., financial audit, the Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), etc.; and letters, faxes, and materials pertinent to the Education Performance audit.

This report presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings regarding the October 2012 Lincoln County School District OEPA audit.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Dr. Donna Davis

NAME	TITLE	COUNTY	CATEGORY
Dr. Monica Beane	Assistant Director Office of Research	West Virginia Department of Education	AYP/Strategic Plan/High Quality Standards- Curriculum
Randy Keathley	County Superintendent	Mingo County Schools	Personnel/Hiring
Laura Kiser	Consultant – Office of Professional Preparation	West Virginia Department of Education	Certification
Amy Downey	Treasurer	Roane County Schools	Finance
Laura Matheney	Treasurer	Jackson County Schools	Finance
Charles Callison	Audit Reviewer	Office of Education Performance Audits	Policies/Leadership
David Bailey	Heating, Ventilation, and Air Conditioning Technician	West Virginia Department of Education	Facilities
Carroll Staats	Audit Reviewer	Office of Education Performance Audits	Evaluation/Administration
Ken Pack	Administrative Assistant	Berkeley County Schools	Administrative Practices

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Lincoln County had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

1. Lincoln County School District established a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Southwestern Community Action Council, Inc., Child and Family Development Program and Head Start for the 2011-2012 and 2012-2013 school years.
2. Professional Learning Community (PLC). Weekly meetings of PLC teams were held at each school in Lincoln County through a West Virginia Board of Education waiver.
3. Math Support. Lincoln County School District employed two math support/instructional coaches located at Harts PK-8.
4. Lincoln County School District extended RESA 2 collaboration to provide technical assistance to Harts PK-8.
5. Lincoln County School District contracted with a retired West Virginia Department of Education employee to work with two School Improvement Grant (SIG) schools (Hamlin and Guyan Valley).
6. Lincoln County School District contracted Consulting4U as Instructional and Administrative Consultant for the school district. The consultant's area of focus is elementary mathematics and she also works with the Beginning Educator Mentoring program.
7. Lincoln County School District has extended the professional employee search to attending recruiting fairs, advertising on the West Virginia Department of Education website, utilizing the Transition to Teaching program, and establishing a partnership with Logan County Schools to continue to support the Transition to Teaching program beyond federal/state funding. The county utilized Title II funds to support this initiative.
8. Lincoln County School District was one of the first counties to implement a Universal Meals program during the 2011-2012 school year. The county participates in the Community Eligibility Option (CEO) whereby all students continue to receive free breakfast and lunch. In 2011, all nine Lincoln County schools received the Gold Award of Distinction for their work with the Healthier US School Challenge. In 2012, three Lincoln County schools received a reward for having the highest breakfast participation in the state. One school, Guyan Valley Middle School, had the highest increase in breakfast participation in West Virginia.

COUNTY PERFORMANCE

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and related student performance data. It also presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

5.1. ACCOUNTABILITY.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Adequate Yearly Progress

The No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data for the 2011-2012 school year identified that Lincoln County did not make adequate yearly progress (AYP). Lincoln County failed to achieve AYP for the last five consecutive years. Chart 1 shows the grade span/assessment and subgroup(s) that did not make AYP. It also shows the percent proficient for each grade span/assessment and subgroup.

The reviewer noted that when the performance of these subgroups listed in Chart 1 compared with the 2010-2011 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data, all subgroups except the elementary and secondary economically disadvantaged (SES) increased in mathematics performance. However, all subgroups declined in reading/language arts achievement.

Chart 1

WESTEST			
GRADE SPAN/ASSESSMENT	SUBGROUP	2011-2012 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2010-2011 PERCENT PROFICIENT
Mathematics – Middle	All Students	39.3%	36.6%
Mathematics – Secondary	All Students	32.0%	28.3%
Mathematics – Middle	White	39.1%	36.6%
Mathematics – Secondary	White	32.3%	28.1%
Mathematics – Middle	Special Education	17.3%	15.1%
Mathematics – Elementary	Economically Disadvantaged	43.4%	43.7%
Mathematics – Middle	Economically Disadvantaged	34.6%	31.3%
Mathematics – Secondary	Economically Disadvantaged	25.0%	26.0%
Reading – Middle	All Students	39.3%	41.4%
Reading – Secondary	All Students	25.0%	30.4%
Reading – Middle	White	39.2%	41.5%

Chart 1 (Continued)

WESTEST			
GRADE SPAN/ASSESSMENT	SUBGROUP	2011-2012 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2010-2011 PERCENT PROFICIENT
Reading – Secondary	White	25.3%	30.7%
Reading – Elementary	Special Education	26.2%	32.6%
Reading – Middle	Special Education	12.9%	13.9%
Reading – Middle	Economically Disadvantaged	34.2%	35.5%
Reading – Secondary	Economically Disadvantaged	20.7%	29.9%

Chart 2 shows that in the last five years, the number of Lincoln County's schools identified for not achieving AYP decreased from 2009 to 2010, but increased significantly in 2011. In 2011, only one of seven Lincoln County schools achieved AYP. While this number increased in 2012, only two schools (Ranger Elementary and West Hamlin Elementary) achieved AYP.

Chart 2

NUMBER OF SCHOOLS NOT ACHIEVING AYP		
Year	Number of Schools Not Achieving AYP/Total Schools	Percentage Achieving AYP
2008	5/7	28.57
2009	5/7	28.57
2010	4/7	42.85
2011	6/7	14.28
2012	4/6	33.33

Charts 3 through 8 provide a comparison of the 2011-2012 Lincoln County School District student percent proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts and the State.

Chart 3 indicated that the 2011-2012 Lincoln County School District elementary level all students (AS) subgroup percent proficient in mathematics at 47.4 percent was slightly lower than the State (50.2 percent). The racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup at 47.8 percent was also slightly lower than the State (50.9 percent). However, the special education (SE) subgroup at 40.0 percent proficient was substantially higher (+10.9 percent) than the State (29.1 percent). Additionally, the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup at 43.4 percent proficient performed higher than the State (40.1 percent).

Charts 4 and 5 indicated middle and secondary level students in Lincoln County performed lower than the State in mathematics in all subgroups.

Lincoln County School District student assessment performance in reading/language arts was above the 2011-2012 State percent proficient in the elementary special education (SE) and economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups. The percent proficient of the Lincoln County School District all students (AS) and racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups was slightly lower than the State (Chart 6).

Charts 7 and 8 indicated that middle and secondary level reading/language arts percent proficient was below the State in all subgroups.

Team interviews with the County Curriculum Team found that the Lincoln County School District implemented multiple interventions to combat the reading proficiency issue. The writing program the school district used will help improve reading as well. The county had a literacy coach, but Title II funding decreased and this position was eliminated. All secondary content teachers were trained in the Next Generation Standards. The reason for training all teachers was to develop ownership of the literacy standards throughout all content areas, not specifically English/language arts. Teams from each school attended the Teacher Leadership Institute (TLI) conducted by the West Virginia Department of Education. Additionally, Lincoln County School District held summer academies for Lincoln County teachers.

Chart 3

ELEMENTARY MATHEMATICS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	47.4%	50.2%
White (W)	47.8%	50.9%
Black (B)	NA	36.3%
Special Education (SE)	40.0%	29.1%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	43.4%	40.1%

Chart 4

MIDDLE MATHEMATICS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	39.3%	47.0%
White (W)	39.1%	47.6%
Black (B)	NA	34.6%
Special Education (SE)	17.3%	18.0%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	34.6%	36.5%

Chart 5

HIGH SCHOOL MATHEMATICS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	32.0%	47.1%
White (W)	32.3%	47.2%
Black (B)	NA	37.1%
Special Education (SE)	NA	16.3%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	25.0%	35.0%

Chart 6

ELEMENTARY READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	47.4%	49.9%
White (W)	47.5%	50.5%
Black (B)	NA	38.3%
Special Education (SE)	26.2%	23.4%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	43.4%	39.0%

Chart 7

MIDDLE READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	39.3%	49.7%
White (W)	39.2%	50.1%
Black (B)	NA	40.5%
Special Education (SE)	12.9%	16.2%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	34.2%	38.8%

Chart 8

HIGH SCHOOL READING/LANGUAGE ARTS 2011-2012		
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	25.0%	44.6%
White (W)	25.3%	45.0%
Black (B)	NA	34.2%
Special Education (SE)	NA	14.2%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	20.7%	32.7%

ACT EXPLORE Assessment Results

According to the 2011-2012 Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 9, Lincoln County students showed a modest increase in the composite score as compared to the 2007-2008 results. Five years of trend data showed no significant increase or decrease in the academic areas assessed.

Chart 9

ACT EXPLORE RESULTS Grade 8					
	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012
English WV	14.3	13.9	14.1	14.1	14.1
English Lincoln	13.7	13.3	12.4	13.1	13.9
Mathematics WV	14.7	14.3	14.6	14.8	14.6
Mathematics Lincoln	14.4	13.8	13.1	14.0	14.1
Reading WV	13.9	13.6	14.0	14.1	14.0
Reading Lincoln	13.3	13.0	12.5	13.6	13.4
Science WV	16.0	15.6	15.8	15.9	15.8
Science Lincoln	15.2	14.7	14.5	15.2	15.2
Composite WV	14.9	14.5	14.8	14.8	14.8
Composite Lincoln	14.2	13.9	13.2	14.1	14.3

ACT PLAN Assessment Results

Based on the 2011-2012 Grade 10 ACT PLAN results in Chart 10, Lincoln County test takers showed a slight decrease (15.7 to 15.5) in the composite score as compared to the 2007-2008 results. Five years of trend data showed a slight decrease in English, reading, mathematics and science results.

Chart 10

ACT PLAN RESULTS					
Grade 10					
	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012
English WV	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.0
English Lincoln	15.4	15.7	15.2	15.1	14.9
Mathematics WV	16.3	16.3	16.2	16.2	16.4
Mathematics Lincoln	15.4	15.8	15.6	14.7	15.1
Reading WV	16.5	15.7	16.1	16.1	16.1
Reading Lincoln	15.3	15.1	15.1	14.7	15.0
Science WV	17.5	17.1	17.3	17.3	17.3
Science Lincoln	16.5	16.3	16.8	16.1	16.3
Composite WV	16.8	16.5	16.6	16.6	16.6
Composite Lincoln	15.7	15.9	15.8	15.4	15.5

5.1.2. Participation rate. A minimum of 95 percent in the current or a two or three year average of all students enrolled in a public school/county school district/state at the time of testing, including students in each subgroup as required by *NCLB* must participate in the statewide assessment WESTEST or the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) in reading/language arts or mathematics. Students with a significant medical emergency may be exempt by appeal from the calculation of participation rate for AYP provided that the county superintendent has proper documentation. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Lincoln County School District exceeded the required minimum 95 percent participation rate in the statewide assessment program.

5.1.3. Attendance rate (Elementary/Middle). The student attendance rate for elementary and middle schools is at or above 90 percent or the percentage of students meeting the attendance rate show improvement from the preceding year. The student attendance rate will be adjusted for students excluded as a result of the Productive and Safe Schools Act (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1a) and school bus transportation interruptions (W.Va. 126CSR81), West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4110, *Attendance Policy*, (hereinafter Policy 4110). Additional exclusions include excused student absences, students not in attendance due to disciplinary measures, and absent students for whom the attendance director has pursued judicial remedies to compel attendance to the extent of his or her authority. For the AYP determination, the attendance rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the attendance rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 11 indicated the Lincoln County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last five reporting years. The reviewer noted that the attendance rate demonstrated an increasing trend from 2008-2011; but decreased slightly from 97.28 percent in 2011 to 96.88 percent in 2012. This still exceeded the State minimum requirement of 90 percent. Each school has an attendance plan detailing incentives for students who make attendance a priority.

Chart 11

ATTENDANCE RATE	
Year	Attendance Rate
2007-2008	95.54%
2008-2009	96.11%
2009-2010	96.63%
2010-2011	97.28%
2011-2012	96.88%

5.1.4. Graduation rate. The student graduation rate is 80 percent or the percentage of students meeting the student graduation rate shows improvement. The graduation rate is calculated according to the high school completer formula recommended by the NCES with the additional condition that graduates include only those students who receive a regular diploma in the standard number of years and does not include students receiving the GED. For the AYP determination, the graduation rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the graduation rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Beginning in school year (SY) 2010–2011, states are required to report a uniform, comparable, and accurate graduation rate known as a “four-year adjusted cohort rate,” which measures the percent of students in a ninth grade cohort that graduate with a regular diploma in four years or less. This rate also must be used for determining adequate yearly progress (AYP) beginning in SY 2011–2012. The regulations require states to report and use a “four-year adjusted cohort graduation rate” based on the following formula:

4-Year Adjusted Cohort Graduation Rate	=	$\frac{\text{\# of cohort members who earned a regular high school diploma by the end of the 2009-2010 school year}}{\text{\# of first-time 9th graders in fall 2006 (starting cohort) plus students who transfer in, minus students who transfer out, emigrate, or die during school years 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009, and 2009-2010}}$
---	---	---

The 2010-2011 graduation rate for the Lincoln County School District listed in Chart 12 provided the baseline graduation rate for the new adjusted graduation calculation in place in West Virginia.

Chart 12 showed that the Lincoln County School District graduation rate for 2011-2012 (75.20 percent) did not meet the minimum State requirement of 80 percent. Five year trend data showed that Lincoln County School District has not met the State minimum of 80 percent in four of the five years. Additionally, data indicated a three year decreasing trend beginning with the 2009-2010 school year.

Lincoln County School District was awarded a Dropout Prevention grant funded by the West Virginia Department of Education. This grant will provide funding to target at-risk students through additional counseling services.

The Team found, through interviews with the County Curriculum Team, that all Grade 9 and 10 students at Lincoln County High School are double blocked for both English language arts and mathematics. The basis for the remediation conducted during the extended block period was a combination of WESTEST2 performance, SRI scores, Lexile/Quantile measures, and teacher recommendations. The practice of double-blocking does not allow students to enroll in any concentration courses. Students who are not engaged during the day are more at-risk to drop out of school. Perhaps by

adjusting the double-block schedule, students will be able to find the purpose and motivation necessary to keep them in school and graduate as concentration completers.

Lincoln County High School implemented a teen pregnancy program during the 2011-2012 academic year. This program is aimed at providing assistance to pregnant teens and young mothers who are enrolled in Lincoln County High School so that they may graduate.

Lincoln County School District instituted an online early warning system to identify students who are behind in credits and uses Odyssey Credit Recovery to assist at risk students in making graduation a reality.

Lincoln County School District used their Safe Supportive Schools (S3) grant to conduct team meetings during which staff monitor student progress toward graduation.

Lincoln County High School has a 21st Century After School program and provides two faculty members as tutors. Additionally, a social worker is placed at the high school.

Chart 12

GRADUATION RATE	
Year	Graduation Rate
2007-2008	79.07%
2008-2009	75.61%
2009-2010	84.44%
2010-2011	77.35%
2011-2012	75.20%

Chart 13 demonstrated the number of Advanced Placement (AP®), Honors courses, and college credit courses offered in Lincoln County's high school.

Advanced Placement (AP®) and Dual Credit courses taken and the enrollment are listed in chart 13A.

Chart 13

NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED 2012-2013			
High School/County	Number of AP Courses Taken	Number of Honors Courses	Number of College Credit Courses
Lincoln County High School	5	7	2

Chart 13A

Advanced Placement	
Course	Number of Students Enrolled
AP Biology	14
AP Language	26
AP English Literature	14
AP US History	37
AP Calculus AB	15
Honors Course	
Course	Number of Students Enrolled
Honors English 9	57
Honors English 10	35
Honors Debate	10
Honors Geometry	43
Honors Algebra II	31
Honors Physical Science	46
Honors Biology	53
Dual Credit Course	
Course	Number of Students Enrolled
Communications I	9
English 101	11

Chart 14 provides college entrance testing information for the American College Test (ACT) and the advanced placement test (APT).

Data are listed for Lincoln County High School, the county, and the State. Lincoln County's percentage of test takers (54.2 percent) was lower than the State (61.1 percent). The ACT composite score for Lincoln County (18.7) was also below the State composite (20.6). The chart indicated the percent of AP test takers in Lincoln County School District in Grade 10 was higher than the State; however, the percent of AP test takers at Lincoln High School was lower than the county and the State. The percent of AP test takers in Grades 11 and 12 in Lincoln County and Lincoln County High School was substantially lower than the State averages.

Chart 14

COLLEGE-ENTRANCE TESTING INFORMATION – ACT & APT 2010-2011					
ACT(American College Test)			APT (Advanced Placement Test) Test Takers		
Schools	Test Takers	Composite Score	Tenth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Twelfth Grade
Lincoln County High	54.2%	18.7	0.4%	8.1%	8.7%
Lincoln County Schools	54.2%	18.7	3.4%	9.5%	16.3%
STATE	61.1%	20.6	1.8%	22.3%	22.4%

SAT/ACT Assessment Results

Chart 15 shows the Lincoln School District's Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) and American College Testing (ACT) results. The SAT math mean score decreased from 485 in 2006-2007 to 430 in 2010-2011. The SAT reading score declined from 504 in 2006-2007 to 477 in 2010-2011. The writing score showed an up and down trend from 2006-2007 to 2010-2011. The percentage of test takers showed considerable variation of 4.5 percent in 2006-2007 to 9.1. percent in 2008-2009, declined sharply to 1.6 percent in 2009-2010, then increased to 4.9 percent in 2010-2011.

ACT trend data showed a decrease in the composite score (19.1) in 2006-2007 to 18.7 in 2010-2011. However, the percentage of students taking the ACT decreased from 59.1 percent in 2006-2007 to 54.2 percent in 2010-2011.

Chart 15

SCHOLASTIC ACHIEVEMENT TEST (SAT) – Lincoln County Schools					
County	2006-2007	2007-2008	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011
SAT Takers (%)	4.5%	5.2%	9.1%	1.6%	4.9%
SAT Math Mean Score	485	432	462	0	430
SAT Reading Score	504	465	471	0	477
SAT Writing Score	482	495	469	0	480
AMERICAN COLLEGE TESTING (ACT) - Lincoln County Schools					
ACT Takers (%)	59.1%	55.2%	53.8%	51.0%	54.2%
ACT Composite	19.1	19.3	18.7	18.6	18.7

NA – Less than 10 (Not Applicable)

Source: State, County and School Data, 2011-2012 West Virginia Report Cards, West Virginia Department of Education.

The Lincoln County High School graduate overall college going rate in fall 2011 was 48.4 percent compared to the State's overall college going rate of 57.9 percent as presented in Chart 16. This represented a 9.5 percent negative difference in the college going rate of Lincoln County students and the State's college going rate.

Chart 16

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2011		
	Number of High School Graduates 2010-2011	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,001	57.9%
Lincoln County	192	48.4%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2011, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Lincoln County's percentage of students enrolled in developmental courses was measurably higher than the State's percentage of students taking both mathematics and English developmental courses in both 2010 and 2011 (Chart 17).

Twenty seven (27) of Lincoln County's 76 first-time freshmen or 35.50 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2011 compared to the State total (16.70 percent). Thirty-eight (38) graduates or 50.00 percent were enrolled in Developmental Mathematics compared to the State (28.20 percent).

Additionally, the percentage of Lincoln County's first time freshmen enrolled in Developmental English increased from 23.20 percent in 2010 to 35.50 percent in 2011. The percentage of Lincoln County's first time freshmen enrolled in Developmental Mathematics decreased slightly from 50.70 percent in 2010 to 50.00 percent in 2011.

Lincoln County High School offers free tutoring for ACT and SAT college entrance testing preparation. To further provide students opportunities to be successful in college, students are placed in the Transition Math I class based on student achievement data derived from grades, standardized test scores, and ACT PLAN scores.

Chart 17

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2011					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7,457	1,247	16.70%	2,104	28.20%
Lincoln County High	76	27	35.50%	38	50.00%
Lincoln County	76	27	35.50%	38	50.00%
HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2010					
State	7,873	1,181	15.00%	2,209	28.10%
Lincoln County High	69	16	23.20%	35	50.70%
Lincoln County	69	16	23.20%	35	50.70%

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

Lincoln County School District based curriculum on the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs). Teams of educators from Lincoln County School District attended the West Virginia Department of Education sponsored training on the common core standards.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Findings

1. Lincoln County School District increased the number of advanced course offerings at Lincoln County High School. The number of advanced placement (AP®) courses demonstrated an increasing three year trend and the student enrollment also increased.
2. Through a partnership with Southern West Virginia Community & Technical College, Lincoln County School District offered dual credit courses at no cost to students enrolled at Lincoln County High School. Funding for dual credit courses was being provided through the GEAR-UP grant. Three year trend data indicated student enrollment in dual credit courses increased from 53 in 2008 to 57 in 2009 and 89 in 2010. However, data demonstrated a decreasing trend in student enrollment in dual credit courses from 2010 to 2011 (89 to 66). Only 20 students were enrolled in dual credit courses during the 2012 academic year. When interviewed, Lincoln County School District staff indicated the reason for the decline in student enrollment in dual credit courses was due to personnel and staffing issues. Two teachers no longer teach at Lincoln County High School and one teacher did not have a Masters Degree; therefore, the teacher lacked the credentials to teach the dual credit course for credit. This teacher previously taught the course; however, an accreditation audit of Southern West Virginia Community & Technical College could no longer allow this to count as college credit.

3. Through a partnership with Southern West Virginia Community & Technical College and the use of GEAR-UP funds, Lincoln County School District offered a “Fast Tract” program that allows students to take online college courses (not dual credit) after school. Students may elect to complete courses beyond the core courses funded by GEAR-UP funds, but they have to pay the fee for these courses.
4. Lincoln County School District offered an early release program for students who have met the minimum graduation requirements prior to the completion of their senior year.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

1. Lincoln County School District utilized the Learning Focused training program to target instructional strategies in all schools. This program has been used in Lincoln County for a number of years. Because of this, Lincoln County now has a resident expert located at each school. These resident experts are used as facilitators in countywide training sessions.
2. Lincoln County School District provided all administrators training in using the Instructional Practices Inventory (IPI) with their respective staffs. The Lincoln County School District also contracted services to provide the training to all schools.
3. Lincoln County School District contracted services of an instructional coach at each of the elementary schools in Lincoln County.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child’s weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

The Lincoln County School District emphasized student writing by adding a component involving the observation of student writing strategies to the Instructional Practices Inventory (IPI) conducted during walkthroughs by the school administrators and the county curriculum team at all schools.

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

Findings

Lincoln County School District increased the availability of instructional technologies in the schools. Additionally, Lincoln County High School operates a student-produced television broadcast for students and staff.

7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)

Findings

Each classroom had adequate textbooks and instructional materials to meet the instructional needs of the Lincoln County School District. Textbook need surveys are conducted annually and purchases are made accordingly. Lincoln County School District utilized STEP 7 funding to purchase necessary instructional materials. Additionally, Lincoln County School District personnel utilized online resources provided by the West Virginia Department of Education including, but not limited to the following: Teach21, Learn21, Acuity, and TechSteps.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

Four of the five Lincoln County Board members expressed a concern regarding the reduction of courses and pathways available for students. According to these board members, the number of courses has declined since the career technical center was replaced with a comprehensive high school.

Interviews reported that finding the qualified/certified teachers to teach these courses is a major obstacle in expanding career/technical courses and pathways.

Lincoln County used the LINKS program to provide guidance to students in selecting their concentrations at the end of Grade 8. Counselors used the ACT PLAN/EXPLORE results when they meet with students and their parents to plan students' program of study. Each school conducted a workshop, but the percentage of attendance has been low.

7.1.10. Approved elective offerings. An elective offering must be based on approved West Virginia Board of Education content standards and objectives, if available, or have written content standards and objectives that are approved by the county board. (Policy 2510)

Findings

A review of the Lincoln County Board of Education minutes indicated that elective courses have written content standards and objectives that were approved by the county board of education. The Team could not verify that all approved courses were aligned to West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2520. These are identified below.

- Love U 2 – a program regarding healthy marriages - Lincoln County High School. (January 17, 2012 Board Minutes)
- Mission WV, Inc. provides health instruction curriculum materials to students in Grade 9 and 10 at Lincoln County High School.

7.1.11. Guidance and advisement. Students are provided specific guidance and advisement opportunities to allow them to choose a career major prior to completion of grade 10. (Policy 2510)

Findings

1. Students attending Lincoln County High School were provided guidance and advisement opportunities to assist them in choosing a career major prior to completion of Grade 10. All Grade 10 students participate in programs such as career cruising during the Advisor/Advisee period at Lincoln County High School. All Grade 10 students participate in pre-vocational activities as part of their Advisor/Advisee period. Additionally, guidance counselors at Lincoln County High School meet with Grade 10 students to discuss the ACT PLAN results and provide guidance based on the results.
2. Data analysis of the ACT PLAN and ACT EXPLORE results were conducted by the school and district level staff as verified by the Staff Development Council minutes and counselor documentation.

7.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)

Findings

1. The Special Education Director and a team of teachers and administrators developed resources allowing instructional staff members to provide lessons and incorporate activities into lessons that have an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance. Additionally, Lincoln County School District provides informative sessions with students regarding Lincoln County's harassment policy.
2. A current Multicultural Plan was in place.

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va.Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Findings

Lincoln County School District submitted a school calendar to the West Virginia Department of Education with the minimum number of instructional days. Each school in Lincoln County submitted a schedule for their instructional day to Lincoln County School District's curriculum team. The schedules were reviewed by the curriculum team.

7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities. The technical and adult programs in the school are aligned with first local, and then state, then national job market opportunities. (Policy 2510)

Findings

Lincoln County High School's career technical education program offered 17 concentrations. The concentrations available to Lincoln County students included: Accounting, Interactive Game Design, E-Business Publishing, Administrative & Information; Automotive Technology, Electrical Technology, Electronics Technology, General Building Construction, Welding Technology, Graphic Design, Health Occupations Science Technology, Pro-Start Restaurant Management, JROTC, Plant Systems-Floriculture, Plant Systems – Horticulture, Animal Systems – Equine Science, and Animal Systems – Animal Science.

Of note, the percentage placement rate was 100 percent completers in five of the programs. Additionally, three programs enable students to experience real-world opportunities in selling products/services to outside entities. However, the number of completers had decreased, i.e., only three students completed one of the content areas.

Welding completers are employed by Chesapeake Oil/Gas. Students enrolled in the automotive technology/diesel technology programs at Lincoln County High School are employed as summer interns for South Western and conduct all maintenance on the school's vans and buses. The graphic design students sell products to the school/community.

The County Curriculum Team was unable to communicate the analysis with job market opportunities beyond the local level.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

Findings

1. The Lincoln County Five-Year Strategic Plan did an adequate job of analyzing data and identifying areas of need.
2. Goals and action steps included in the county Five-Year Strategic Plan were aligned with the identified areas of weakness.
3. Lincoln County School District submitted the county Five-Year Strategic Plan September 15, 2012. At the time of the audit, the county strategic plan and Lincoln County High School included incorrect data (high school graduation rate was incorrectly calculated). The County Curriculum Team was revising the county strategic plan and working with Lincoln County High School to revise the school strategic plan to include action steps for addressing the graduation rate.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

Findings

1. Lincoln County established a Counseling Collaborative program in 2008. This program was partially funded through a United States Department of Education Elementary and Secondary School Counseling grant. Because of this federal funding, Lincoln County was in a unique position to strategize counseling services countywide so that the students beginning in Kindergarten could have the counseling and support through high school graduation. Funding also supported a social worker at Lincoln County High School. Lincoln County wrote and secured an Innovation Zone and Dropout Prevention Grant to provide a coordinated, countywide student support system. This support system provided early intervention and sustained intercession with Lincoln County students so that they may attain high school graduation. Expected outcomes

include improved attendance, increased parent involvement, and fewer high school dropouts than in the baseline data for 2011-2012.

2. Lincoln County Schools received an Innovation/Dropout Prevention grant for the 2012-2013 school year. This grant provided funding for additional counselors.

7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Findings

Lincoln County Schools utilized a centralized process for lesson plan review. School level principals and members of the County Curriculum Team conducted walkthroughs weekly. As a component of the walkthroughs, lesson plans are observed and teachers are provided feedback through conferences. The Lincoln County School District administrative team meets weekly and analyzes walkthrough data, including lesson plan strengths and weaknesses.

7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)

Findings

The Team observed multiple examples of data analysis during the Education Performance Audit. Lincoln County School District used the following procedure for data analysis.

1. As soon as WESTEST2 data are received, the County Curriculum Team distributes the data to the school level administrations. School level curriculum teams then analyze data and begin student scheduling (based on achievement data) into the double-blocked English/language arts and mathematics courses for Grades 4 through 10.

2. Lincoln County School District implemented Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) at each school site. Each Wednesday, the county operates on a one-hour delay system so that faculty and staff may meet in their respective PLC. A member of the Lincoln County Curriculum Team meets with each school during the PLC time.
3. At the school level, data analyses are conducted using the following: Formative assessments, ACT EXPLORE/PLAN, SRI/SMI, Dibels, Acuity, benchmarking and classroom performance.
4. At the county level, the County Curriculum Team conducts data analyses using the following measures: Item analysis of WESTEST2, SRI/SMI, Dibels, and Common Formative Assessments (CFAs). Additionally, the Summer Academies provide data analysis support and follow-up sessions are conducted throughout the year.
5. Lincoln County School District contracted a retired West Virginia Department of Education employee to work with Guyan Valley staff to implement data rooms and data walls.

7.3. ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION.

7.3.1. Alternative education. Alternative education programs meet the requirements of Policy 2418. (W.Va. Code §18-2-6 and §18-5-19; Policy 2418)

Findings

Lincoln County School District offers an Alternative Learning Center (ALC) for students who violate the student code of conduct. The ALC is located in the same building as the Lincoln County School District central office. Students are placed for up to 45 days. Additionally, students in Grades 6-12 who are expelled or students on homebound instruction may attend the ALC. Typically, seven students are enrolled at one time, but the ALC has a maximum capacity of 12 students. A certified teacher utilizes software (Odyssey) for credit recovery.

7.4. REGULATORY AGENCY REVIEWS.

7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)

Finance

The financial audit of the Lincoln County Board of Education for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2011, was completed by the Chief Inspector Division of the West Virginia State Auditor's Office. The 2011 audit report was unqualified and contained no material weaknesses or deficiencies regarding internal controls related to financial reporting nor any noncompliance material relative to the financial statements.

Findings

In the annual audit of Lincoln County Schools, the auditors noted the following conditions.

1. The 2011 audit report did include several significant deficiencies in regard to internal controls relative to federal programs.
 - Repeated for several federal programs were numerous instances of purchase orders not being properly canceled to prevent duplicate payment. Lincoln County Board of Education purchased "PAID" stamps for use to cancel the invoice. **The Team sampled the current invoice files and found the "PAID" stamp on all invoices reviewed.**
 - Repeated for several federal programs were several instances of expenditures without evidence of approval by the program director. The "PAID" stamps now being used provide signature lines for approval of payment. All of the invoices the Team sampled had appropriate documentation of approval by different program directors. **The Team interviewed program directors and verified their role in the approval process.**

- Repeated for several federal programs were a few instances of confirming purchase orders where the purchase order date was after the invoice date. **Three of the invoices the Team sampled were dated before the invoice date; however, none of these involved federal projects.**
 - One instance was reported for child nutrition, one instance was reported for a school improvement grant, and one instance was reported for an educational technology grant where no supporting documentation was available for expenditures. **All of the expenditures the Team sampled had appropriate supporting documentation.**
 - Four instances were reported where the invoice was paid after the due date. **All of the expenditures the Team sampled were paid by the specified due date.**
2. The 2011 audit report included a noncompliance item regarding the Title I and Title II programs because Lincoln County Board of Education did not meet the requirements regarding highly qualified teachers. **The county reported making progress in this area, but reportedly will never have 100 percent of teachers highly qualified due to location and salary.**
 3. The 2011 audit report included an audit finding because expenditures were made from child nutrition funds for which underlying supporting documentation was not provided and/or maintained. Further, the audit report maintained that internal controls were not being utilized to safeguard this program. In a corrective action plan, the program director contended she was not asked for this information and that monitoring by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Child Nutrition, proved she was in compliance. This individual is no longer the child nutrition director, but interviews with the board treasurer and current child nutrition coordinator indicated that she was uncooperative and unavailable to the auditors. The current child nutrition coordinator was able to provide copies of school inventory records, orders from cooks, and verification of merchandise delivery to individual schools. **Due to the time the Team was actually in schools, reviewers were unable to verify that production records, inventory records, food orders and transfers were being maintained at the schools; however, the Donated Foods Program Review did not indicate any problems with the inventory records.**
 4. The Lincoln County Board of Education approved a contract with RESA II for child nutrition supervision services in the approximate amount of \$1,100 per month. The prior child nutrition director resigned in June 2012. There was one contract for the remainder of 2011-2012 and another contract approved for 2012-2013. **The Team's understanding of this arrangement was that the Cabell County child nutrition director was being paid by RESA II to provide these services in order for Lincoln County to meet the requirements for a child nutrition director. The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Child Nutrition, provided a letter validating this arrangement.**

Education Performance Audit Findings

1. The Team reviewed the monthly financial information provided to the Lincoln County Board of Education as well as the procedure regarding board approval prior to release of payment of invoices. The Team determined that Lincoln County followed the appropriate procedures.
2. The Lincoln County School District reported a positive balance of approximately \$1.3 million on their Annual Financial Report for the fiscal year ended June 30, 2012. However, the beginning budget required a carryover balance of approximately \$1.4 million. The additional funds needed were obtained appropriately from Medicaid funding. The treasurer has cautioned the board regarding the financial position, including the number of personnel employed over the State aid formula as well as an additional \$500,000 which was required to complete the Harts PK-8 construction. The Lincoln County Board of Education did reduce staff from the fiscal year, but additional cuts may be required to avoid a deficit.
3. For the 2012-2013 school year, the funding for the Title I Director's position was provided by a combination of Title I and Title II funds. The preliminary federal monitoring report issued in December 2010, indicated a noncompliance issue because the Title I Director was handling universal preschool at that time and being paid with a combination of Title I and Title II funds. The noncompliance item was not included in the final federal monitoring report because the county hired a preschool specialist (paid half with county funds and half with Title II funds) to take over the Title I Director's preschool duties. Since that time, however, it is the Teams understanding, that an assistant superintendent with responsibilities including curriculum and instruction as well as another instructional director have left and their positions eliminated or not filled. If these circumstances have left the Title I Director as the only administrator with instructional/curriculum responsibilities, then the county will need to determine if it is appropriate for her entire salary to be paid with Title I and Title II funds. Clarification should be sought from the West Virginia Department of Education federal programs personnel. Title II funds can be used to provide professional development/coaching but the employee has to be a coach, not an administrator.

Time and effort documentation was provided and was generally adequate. The Title I Director's time and effort sheet showed the same hours each day split between Title I and Title II. This lack of variation is unlikely, but not impossible.

4. A review of individual school financial procedures was conducted at Lincoln County High School.
 - The school provided a copy of the strategic plan and demonstrated that school funds had been expended in support of a professional development activity in the plan. Very few school-specific resources were included in the plan.

- The 2011 audit report included several noncompliance items. A review of the current operating procedures indicated that the findings had NOT been corrected. The OEPA review took place on October 24, 2012, and the most recent receipt written was October 12, 2012. The secretary also admitted that bank deposits were not being made in a timely manner. The Team also noted that funds were left for the school secretary in an unlocked, open file tray outside the secretary's office door. A confirming purchase order was noted. Ticket reconciliation reports were not being completed by the gate workers and no profit/loss reports had been submitted to date. Segregation of duties was non-existent at this school.
 - The faculty senate was meeting as required, and minutes were maintained of each meeting. Records were maintained of the amounts allocated to each member and any carryover of funds by members was approved by the faculty senate. The Lincoln County School District distributed funds for faculty senates based on \$200 per individual member, and the faculty senate accepted the listing provided by the county as the budget. **Faculty senate funds were distributed in October rather than in September as required. Faculty senate funds were maintained in the school's general fund**
5. A review of individual school financial procedures was conducted at Hamlin PK-8.
- The school provided a copy of the strategic plan and demonstrated that school funds had been expended in support of the parent involvement activities included in the plan.
 - The 2011 audit report included a few isolated noncompliance items. **The Team's review of the current operating procedures indicated that funds were being remitted to the office on a daily basis with appropriate supporting documentation, receipts were being written as funds were received, deposits were being made in a timely manner, bank reconciliations were being completed promptly, and purchase orders were being issued and invoices paid in the correct manner. All audit findings had been resolved. Funds for the school's parent-teacher organization were being processed through the school's general fund.**
 - The faculty senate was meeting as required and minutes were maintained of each meeting. Records were maintained of the amounts allocated to each member, and any carryover of funds by members was approved by the faculty senate. The Lincoln County School District distributed funds for faculty senates based on \$200 per individual member, and the faculty senate accepted the listing provided by the county as the budget. **Faculty senate funds were distributed in October rather than in September as required. Faculty senate funds are maintained in the school's general fund.**

Facilities

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Lincoln County Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), interviewed the Director of School Facilities, and the county superintendent, and conducted facility reviews of each county school. A narrative of the Team's observations follows.

Duval Elementary/Middle School

Duval Elementary was relocated to this site in modular units due to a flood. The modular classrooms are not a long term option to house the students. The modular units limit classroom space and lack facility features typically found in elementary schools. Potential access safety issues with the students traveling between the buildings are inherent to the layout of the modular units. The staff appeared to manage the access safety as best as possible. The exterior doors were locked. The thermostats in the portable classrooms were set with the supply air fan switches in the auto position. The supply air fans should be set to the "on" position while students are present to provide ventilation air to the classroom spaces.

The original construction at the middle school was completed in 1953 with updates and additions in 1960, 1965, 1980, and 1983. The building included a combination of heating, air conditioning systems. Many of the classrooms were served by window air conditioners and did not have mechanical ventilation capabilities. The custodian manually controlled the main air fan for the Columbus furnace. There were a few stained ceiling tiles. Some minor wall cracks were located in the stairwell area near the cafeteria. A few exterior windows were open. The teachers opened the windows to compensate for poor classroom temperature control. Some aesthetic improvements had been made since the 2009 OEPA review that improved the atmosphere of the building interior. Many opportunities exist to improve the facility. **This facility is dated and will require substantial investment to bring it to current standards.**

Guyan Valley Middle School

Original construction of this facility was completed in 1926 with additions in 1952, 1963, and 1978. The facility did not have central air conditioning; window air conditioners were installed. The existing mechanical system did not provide mechanical ventilation. The heating, air conditioning system was being manually controlled/operated by the principal. A large portion of the basement classrooms were not being utilized for instruction. Some of the classrooms appeared to be used for storage. The storage must be maintained in an orderly fashion. Due to a lack of mechanical ventilation and poor temperature/humidity control, this basement area could promulgate mold growth. During the spring/summer months when the ambient relative humidity levels exceed 60 percent (RH), weekly walkthrough inspections should be performed in the basement classrooms. Aesthetic improvements have been made at this facility since the 2009 audit. **This facility would benefit from a complete heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) renovation.**

Hamlin PK-8

Original construction of this facility was completed in 1956 with additions in 1971, 1980, 1983, and 1992. Due to current traffic patterns in the building, some of the exterior doors had to remain unlocked. The interior had been painted and appeared to be generally cleaner in appearance. There were a few stained tiles throughout the building. An awning had been installed between the main building and the cafeteria. Some new flooring had been installed. The 1st floor boys' rest room needed attention, but the other rest rooms appeared much cleaner. A new ceiling grid and lighting had been installed in the Art Room. The windows in the elementary section of the building needed to be replaced. The gas supply issues at this school had been resolved. Monitors had been installed to verify that the boilers receive the proper volume of gas to operate properly. The Boiler Room did not have a carbon monoxide detector installed. Central air conditioning and mechanical ventilation were not provided to the entire campus. The fire extinguisher tags indicated they were not receiving the monthly inspections. Functional and aesthetic improvements had been made to this facility since the 2009 audit. **This facility requires capital investment to bring it to current standards.**

Harts PK-8

Harts PK-8 is a new, modern facility. The building is under warranty until November 2012. Several deficiencies were identified that needed to be resolved. The Lincoln County maintenance director has identified issues to be resolved and will have those issues documented and scheduled to be corrected at the 11th month walkthrough prior to the warranty expiration. This facility closed Harts Primary School and Harts Intermediate School.

Midway Elementary School

Original construction of this facility was completed in 1951 with additions in 1963, 1980, and 1998 and modular units were added around 1999. The original section of this facility utilized window air conditioning units. These units did not provide adequate ventilation. The site area did not meet the minimum size requirement for K-04 school facilities. The site was not large enough for future expansion. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal has reviewed this facility and approved the exiting. The portables at this facility were beyond their expected life. Some new roofing has been installed on the portable units. The downspouts terminate at the ground. There are no vapor barriers under the portable units. The Art Room portable unit was poorly maintained inside. Some painting had been done in the main building. An intercom communication system had been installed between the portable units and the main building.

This facility (main building) is dated and requires a high level of capital improvements to modernize the facility. The portable classrooms should be taken out of service as soon as possible.

Ranger Elementary School

Original construction of this facility was completed in 1958 with additions in 1990. Indirect gas-fired furnaces were located in the classrooms. One wall hung packaged unit and several roof top units comprised the heating system at this facility. Window air conditioners were present in various classrooms for cooling. Most of the heating, air conditioning systems at this facility did not have outside air capabilities and did not provide the required outside air ventilation. Carbon monoxide detectors/alarms were not installed in classrooms or boiler rooms. Carbon dioxide levels were elevated in all classrooms due to a lack of outside air ventilation. Temperature control issues existed in multiple classrooms that shared a common thermostat. The majority of the heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) controls at this facility were local controls and did not have energy saving strategies. A mercury containing thermostat was located in the kitchen storage area. The site area did not meet the minimum size requirement for K-04 school facilities. The site was not large enough for future expansion and was not located away from undesirable noise and traffic. Space was not dedicated for a teachers' workroom. No area was dedicated as a media center. The Kindergarten classroom areas were not adequate in size. No area was dedicated for an Art Room. No area was dedicated as for a Music Room. The Multipurpose Room served as the physical education facility. The food service area lacked a teachers' dining area and locker/dressing rooms for the kitchen staff. The health services unit was not adequate in size and lacked curtained or small rooms with cots, toilets, lavatories, and a refrigerator with locked storage. Some roof work had been completed.

West Hamlin Elementary

This facility was constructed in 2000. The main facility appeared to be clean and well maintained. Several classrooms had elevated carbon dioxide levels. There were numerous complaints of poor temperature control in the classrooms. The Mechanical and Electrical Rooms were being utilized for storage. The Boiler Room did not have a carbon monoxide detector. An exterior light was broken outside door #8. Four portable classrooms were installed at the back of this facility. They were used portables and near the end of their expected life. There was no covered walkway to the portable units. The Lincoln County maintenance department was installing new roofs and gutters on the portable units. The portable units did not have vapor barriers installed in the crawl space.

These portable units are not a long term solution to house students.

Lincoln County High School

This facility was constructed in 2008. Overall the facility appeared clean. Several room numbers/signage were missing from the walls outside the classrooms. The facility was well ventilated. The Mechanical Rooms were being used for storage. The storage was excessive and disorderly. The mechanical equipment could not be accessed due to clutter. The glass on Exit Door #4 was broken and a piece of plywood was installed until the glass is replaced. The building had a few stained ceiling tiles. The duct

insulation had fallen off the bottom of the duct on AHU-2c4 in Mechanical Room 2114. Several air handlers had the chilled water line insulation compromised due to strainer replacements. The vendor did not restore the insulation to a like new state. The air handling coils were not excessively dirty, but will need to be cleaned in the spring.

Countywide Observations/Recommendations

1. Several facilities had fire extinguishers that were not receiving monthly inspections. This process needs to be reviewed with the custodian staff at each facility to ensure the fire extinguishers receive proper inspections as required by the West Virginia State Fire Code.
2. Every facility, with the exception of Lincoln County High School, has received an EPA Energy Star Award. This is a good indicator that Lincoln County has made energy conservation a priority. This reduction in energy consumption and costs will allow money to be available for facility improvements.
3. Several buildings did not have carbon monoxide detectors installed in areas where combustion equipment was present. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 6200 requires carbon monoxide detectors in all areas where combustion equipment is present. This includes: Kitchens, boiler rooms, storage rooms, and classrooms. Lincoln County will need to review each facility to identify and install carbon monoxide detectors as required.
4. A large number of mercury containing thermostats had been replaced countywide; however, a few mercury containing thermostats were still being utilized. The remaining thermostats will need to be replaced with programmable digital thermostats and the mercury containing devices disposed according to United States Environmental Protection Agency protocol.
5. The Team observed several indicators that the mechanical equipment was not receiving adequate service and maintenance. Several heating, air conditioning systems were being operated manually in some capacity. Lincoln County School District has agreed to participate in the statewide preventive maintenance program sponsored by the West Virginia Department of Education and West Virginia School Building Authority. Developing and implementing a documented preventive maintenance program will be critical to maximizing equipment efficiency and longevity. This should be a priority of the Lincoln County School District.
6. Many of the facilities had antiquated/inadequate heating, air conditioning systems that will need to be brought up to standard if the facilities will be utilized in the long term facilities plan. These upgrades will require substantial capital investment. The Team recommended that Lincoln County explore performance contracting as a possible funding source to facilitate some of the equipment upgrades required to bring each system to current standards. The Team also recommended that Lincoln

County prioritize the county needs and continue to pursue School Building Authority (SBA) funding as a means to upgrade facilities.

7. Several facility improvements have been made countywide since the 2009 Education Performance Audit. Several facilities have received paint, floor tile, ceiling tile, and other improvements that could be completed within the county budget. The Team recommended that the county continue to walk through the facilities on a quarterly basis and prioritize each facility's needs. After the individual facility needs are identified, those needs should be prioritized at the county level and then it should be determined how to maximize the budget to address as many needs as possible.

7.5. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICES AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS.

7.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information. Staff members provide parents and the community with understandable information and techniques for helping students learn.

Findings

Lincoln County School District utilized numerous effective ways of communicating with parents and the community.

1. The county website contained a link to “parent resources” where parents can access valuable materials to help understand the school system and provide assistance to their children.
2. Each school had a website for parents and community members to access information.
3. Parent Advisory Councils provided parents the opportunity to actively participate in the school system.
4. The middle schools and high school provided Edline for direct communication between parents and their children’s teachers.
5. Ads were being placed in the local paper to inform parents and the community of many important Lincoln County School District policies.
6. Phone Messenger was being used to telephone groups of parents and others in emergency situations and to advise of upcoming events at the schools.
7. Each school provided student handbooks that contain important policies which students and parents need to know.

7.5.2. Codes of conduct. The county and schools implement, investigate, and monitor the code of conduct for students and the code of conduct for employees. (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5; Policy 4373; Policy 5902)

Findings

The Team reviewed documentation showing that the codes of conduct for students and employees were being implemented and proper investigations were being made of violations. These activities were being monitored by the principals and county office staff and appropriate records were being kept.

7.5.3. Statewide assessment. Test security measures are in place for the WESTEST. All students in the school participate in the statewide assessment program that includes state content assessments on the WESTEST or West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) at grades 3-8 and 10 and the Writing Assessment at grades 4, 7, and 10. Students with disabilities who have an IEP or a Section 504 Plan may be assessed on the state content assessments under one of the following conditions: standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, or non-standard conditions with modifications. Students unable to participate in the standardized assessment under these conditions and who meet the alternate assessment criteria will participate in the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA). Education Performance Audit teams will verify the eligibility of any student tested under standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, alternate assessment, or medical emergency student exemptions. Students who are continuously enrolled in the public school from the fifth instructional day of school to the spring assessment administration will be considered in the accountability system. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Findings

A review of the testing procedures provided evidence that the student testing program was being implemented according to policy requirements.

7.5.4. Physical Assessment. The school participates in the appropriate statewide physical assessment program.

Findings

The Team reviewed information that showed students in all schools that included Grades 4 through 9 had been administered the Fitnessgram during the 2011-2012 year and the results were recorded on West Virginia Education Information System (WVEIS).

7.6. PERSONNEL.

7.6.1. Hiring. County boards follow hiring practices set forth in W.Va. Code. (W.Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and 18-2E-3a)

Findings

Generally, the Team observed that the Lincoln County School District followed hiring practices set forth in West Virginia Codes.

The Team had unresolved questions regarding one central office position. In early October 2012, one former central office employee began substituting for the Coordinator of Special Projects vacancy at the central office. The person filling this job was employed as the principal at Lincoln County High School at the beginning of October. As of the on-site review, this position was posted for 140 days per year, which would allow the employee to fill the job without endangering retirement benefits. The Coordinator of Special Projects is not paid from any special project. The question that needs to be addressed is the legitimacy of a position being posted for less than a 200 day employment term. The Team advised the personnel director to seek advice from legal counsel on this issue and make appropriate position posting and employment as advised.

This was the only possible questionable employment practice that the Team had.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team conducted a detailed review of the certified list, WVEIS Master Course Schedule, and the West Virginia Department of Education Certification Database.

Commendations

1. The Team commended Lincoln County School District for **no certification** noncompliance findings. It was apparent that Lincoln County had worked diligently to reach this milestone.
2. The Team commended Lincoln County School District for the multiple trainings provided central office and school administrative staff during the summer and fall. The trainings were conducted by the West Virginia Department of Education and RESA 2 staffs and offered at various sites across the county. The trainings related to data entry/editing, data collection, data interpretation and strategies for continuous improvement of reporting staff assignments and

certification. Thus, resulting in an OEPA report with no certification findings regarding staff assignments to areas of specialization for which educators are approved.

- The Team commended Lincoln County School District for working diligently to employ fully certified staff for all professional positions. This has resulted in a drastic decrease of professional staff holding emergency credentials (First Class Permits and Out of Field Authorizations).

The Team also examined educators authorized to teach by West Virginia Code and State Board policy, but did not meet the highly qualified federal definition and educators credentialed to teach based upon permits. This information may connect to other issues in this report affecting student achievement.

During the review of educators to determine if teachers were properly credentialed for their assignments, the Team reported that the following schools had teachers who held the appropriate credentials to teach, but did not meet the definition for highly qualified. **Guyan Valley Middle – six educators, Hamlin PK-8 – two educators, Lincoln County High – nine educators, Midway Elementary – three educators, Ranger Elementary – one educator, West Hamlin Elementary – two educators, Harts PK-8 – five educators.** Chart 20 provides a detailed description of the educators who did not meet the highly qualified definition is found in Appendix B of this report.

The Team also identified educators teaching with permits at the following schools: **Guyan Valley Middle – three educators, Lincoln County High – eight educators, Midway Elementary – one educator, Ranger Elementary – one educator, Harts PK-8 – two educators.** A detailed description of educators teaching on permits is listed in Chart 21.

Note: Some educators may appear on both the Highly Qualified and Permit reports and are duplicates for both licensure areas.

Chart 20

Highly Qualified					
School	Teacher	Schedule	Certification	Findings	Recommendation
Guyan Valley Middle	Educator	7007-WRLD GEO-7 3 Grades: 07	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 1000 -English Grds: 05-12 Exp: 06/30/2015	Listed as not HQ in 2012 for History.	Verify that there is a Praxis test or 21 hours academic major
		7008-WV STUDIES-8 3 Grades: 08 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 08 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-08 Exp: 06/30/2015		
	Educator	7658-EXP/ENRCH 3	21 Professional	Permit for	If this is a reading

		Grades: 07 08 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades: 8015-COLTCH-SEC 3 Grades:	Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2013 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 4300 - Reading Specialist Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Reading Specialist not HQ	specialist, check course codes to indicate such instead of using co-teaching code.
	Educator	3006-MATH 6 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 4006-ENG LA 6 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 6006-SCIENCE 6 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 7006-WRLD REGN-6 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 06 07 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 2210 -Physical Education Grds: 0K- 12 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 2210 - Physical Education Grds: PK-AD Exp: Permanent	Permit pending Not HQ for permit	N/A
	Educator	3006-MATH 6 3 Grades: 06 3007-MATH 7 3 Grades: 07 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 07 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 1900 -Mathematics Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2015	No Praxis scores to determine HQ status.	Principal needs to acquire Praxis scores or 21 hours of academic major before HQ window opens.
	Educator	6007-SCIENCE 7 3 Grades: 07 6008-SCIENCE 8 3 Grades: 08 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 08 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2016 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3603 -Early Education Grds: PK- 0K Exp: 06/30/2016	Permit. Not HQ.	N/A
	Educator	6006-SCIENCE 6 3	22 Professional	No Praxis	Principal needs to

		<p>Grades: 06 6007-SCIENCE 7 3 Grades: 07 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 06 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:</p>	<p>Teaching Certificate 2900 -General Science Grds: 05- AD Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3440 -School Librarian/Media Grds: PK-AD Exp: Permanent</p>	<p>content exam data to determine HQ</p>	<p>acquire Praxis test results or verification of 21 hours academic major before HQ window opens.</p>
<p>Hamlin PK-8</p>	<p>Educator</p>	<p>3006-MATH 6 3 B- BEHAVIOR DISORDERS Grades: 06 3006-MATH 6 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 06 3007-MATH 7 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 07 3007-MATH 7 3 R- SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 07 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades:</p>	<p>21 Professional Teaching Certificate 4115 -Multi- Categorical (LD, BD, MI) Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2015 78 Content for Special Education 1000 -English Grds: 05-AD Exp: Permanent</p>	<p>Will not be HQ until she has a restricted content for Math.</p>	<p>N/A</p>
	<p>Educator</p>	<p>2625-SLFCNT RG ED D Grades: 03 3003-MATH 3 0 Grades: 03 3203-ART 3 0 Grades: 3603-GEN MUSIC 3 0 Grades: 4003-ENG LA 3 0 Grades: 03 4403-SPELL 3 0 Grades: 03 4803-DEVLP READ 3 0 Grades: 03 6003-SCIENCE 3 0 Grades: 03 6603-PHYS ED 3 0 Grades: 6903-HEALTH 3 0 Grades: 03 7003-SOC ST 3 0</p>	<p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 1700 Vocational Home Economics Grds: 07-AD Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01- 06 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3605 -Multi-Subjects Grds: 0K-08 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4300 -Reading Specialist Grds: 0K- 12 Exp: Permanent</p>	<p>No data exists for Praxis content exam.</p>	<p>Principal needs to acquire content exam score or verification of 21 hours of academic major.</p>

		Grades: 03	59 Permanent Authorization 4300 - Reading Specialist Grds: PK-AD Exp: Permanent		
Lincoln Co High	Educator	7009-US STUDIES - 09 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 10 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 09 10 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 09 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 09 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 11 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 11 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 12 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 11 12 13 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 11 12 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 11 12 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 8017-COLTCH-	81 First-Class/Full-Time Permit 4115 - Multi-Categorical (LD, BD, MI) Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit is not HQ	

		SPED 3 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades:			
	Educator	3052-COLLTRNMATH 1 Grades: 11 12 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	Form 01 Full Time Permit/OOF 08/10/2013	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	5661-SPANISH I 1 Grades: 09 10 11 13 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 12 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1500 -Spanish Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1500 - Spanish Grds: 05- AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	4009-ENG LA 9 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 3 R- SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 09 4010-ENG LA 10 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 10 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 10 11 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7866- 3 Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades:	90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1000 -English Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2014 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1055 -Theater Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2014 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3900 -Journalism Grds: 09-AD Exp: 06/30/2014	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	3044-CNCPTL	81 First-Class/Full-	Permit is not	

		MATH 1 Grades: 10 11 12 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 10 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 10 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	Time Permit 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	HQ	
	Educator	4009-ENG LA 9 1 Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 1 Grades: 09 4011-ENG LA 11 1 Grades: 10 11 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2015 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1000 - English Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	3041-ALGEBRA II 1 Grades: 09 10 11 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	Form 1 Permit	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit is not HQ	
	Educator	7009-US STUDIES - 09 1 Grades: 09 10 11 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 1 Grades: 10 11 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 1 Grades: 11 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 10 11 12 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2014	No Praxis content exam information	Principal needs to acquire Praxis results or verification of 21 hours academic major
Midway Elem	Educator	2630-SPED SLFCNT 6 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 03	99 Short Term Substitute Permit 4800 -General Substitute Grds: PK- AD Exp: 06/30/2014	Sub permit is not HQ	

	Educator	3001-MATH 1 1 Grades: 01 4001-ENG LA 1 1 Grades: 01 4401-SPELL 1 1 Grades: 01 4801-DEVL P READ 1 1 Grades: 01 6001-SCIENCE 1 1 Grades: 01 7001-SOC ST 1 1 Grades: 01	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01- 08 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3601 -Early Childhood Grds: 0K- 03 Exp: Permanent	No Praxis content exam information to determine HQ status	Principal needs to acquire Praxis results before the HQ window opens
	Educator	2620- KINDERGARTEN D Grades: 0K	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2014	No Praxis content exam information to determine HQ status	Principal needs to acquire Praxis results before the HQ window opens
Ranger Elem	Educator	8017-COLTCH- SPED D M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED D T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED D U- AUTISTIC Grades:	02 Professional Administrative Certificate 0012 - Elementary/Middle/J unior High School Principal Grds: 0K- 08 Exp: Permanent 02 Professional Administrative Certificate 0013 - Middle/Junior/Senior High School Principal Grds: 05- 12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01- 06 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4100 -Mental Retardation Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 7066 Coordinator Cooperative Education Grds: 07- 12 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 0012 - Elementary/Middle/J unior High School Principal Grds: PK- 08 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 0013 -	Permit is not HQ	

			Middle/Junior/Senior High School Principal Grds: 05-AD Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 4100 - Mental Retardation Grds: 0K-AD Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 7066 Coordinator Cooperative Education Grds: 07-AD Exp: Permanent		
West Hamlin Elem	Educator	2625-SLFCNT RG ED D Grades: 01 3001-MATH 1 3 Grades: 01 4001-ENG LA 1 3 Grades: 01 4801-DEVLP READ 1 3 Grades: 01	NB National Board NB08 NB Literacy: Reading-Language Arts Grds: 95-96 Exp: 11/18/2021 21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K-06 Exp: 06/30/2014 21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3603 -Early Education Grds: PK-0K Exp: 06/30/2014 21 Professional Teaching Certificate 4300 -Reading Specialist Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2014	No Praxis content exam for elementary ed information is available for HQ status	Principal needs to acquire elementary praxis content results before the HQ window opens
	Educator	3001-MATH 1 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 3001-MATH 1 3 J-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 3001-MATH 1 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 3001-MATH 1 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 3002-MATH 2 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 3002-MATH 2 3 M-	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01-06 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4105 -Specific Learning Disabilities Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4112 -Behavioral Disorders excluding Autism Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4113 -Mentally	Previous HQ status was for collaborative. No Praxis content information available for elementary ed to determine HQ status	Principal needs to acquire information on elementary praxis content results before the HQ window opens

		<p>OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 4800-DEVLP READ K 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 4800-DEVLP READ K 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 4801-DEVLP READ 1 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 4801-DEVLP READ 1 3 J-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 4801-DEVLP READ 1 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 4801-DEVLP READ 1 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 4802-DEVLP READ 2 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 4802-DEVLP READ 2 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 4803-DEVLP READ 3 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 4803-DEVLP READ 3 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades:</p>	<p>Impaired-Mild-Moderate Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent</p>		
Harts PK-8	Educator	<p>4809-TITLE I READ 3 Grades: 5661-SPANISH I V Grades: 08</p>	<p>Long/Short Term Sub Permit pending</p>	<p>Permit is not HQ</p>	
	Educator	<p>3006-MATH 6 3 J-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 3008-MATH 8 3 J-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 4006-ENG LA 6 3 J-MENTALLY</p>	<p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3605 -Multi-Subjects Grds: 0K-08 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4104 -Severe Disabilities Grds: 0K-AD Exp:</p>	<p>Needs restricted content endorsements to be HQ in any content area above 6th grade</p>	<p>Apply on Form 26 ASAP</p>

		<p>IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 4008-ENG LA 8 3 J-MENTALLY</p> <p>IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 6008-SCIENCE 8 3 J-MENTALLY</p> <p>IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades: 7008-WV STUDIES-8 3 J-MENTALLY</p> <p>IMPAIRED:MODERATE Grades:</p>	<p>Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4113 -Mentally Impaired-Mild-Moderate Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent</p>		
	Educator	<p>2625-SLFCNT RGED D Grades: 05</p> <p>4005-ENG LA 5 D Grades: 05</p> <p>4805-DEVLP READ 5 D Grades: 05</p> <p>7005-US HST-5 D Grades: 05</p>	<p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01-06 Exp: Permanent</p>	No Praxis content exam information for elementary education	Principal needs to acquire Praxis content scores before the HQ window opens
	Educator	<p>4002-ENG LA 2 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 02</p> <p>4003-ENG LA 3 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 03</p> <p>4004-ENG LA 4 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 04</p> <p>4005-ENG LA 5 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 05</p> <p>4006-ENG LA 6 3 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades:</p> <p>4007-ENG LA 7 3 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 07</p> <p>4008-ENG LA 8 3 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 08</p> <p>4802-DEVLP READ 2 D T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades: 02</p> <p>4803-DEVLP READ 3 D T-MULTI-</p>	<p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01-06 Exp: Permanent</p> <p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3603 -Early Education Grds: 0N-0K Exp: Permanent</p> <p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4105 -Specific Learning Disabilities Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent</p> <p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4112 -Behavioral Disorders excluding Autism Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent</p> <p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4113 -Mentally Impaired-Mild-Moderate Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent</p> <p>59 Permanent Authorization 4105 - Specific Learning Disabilities Grds: 0K-AD Exp: Permanent</p>	No Praxis content exam information for elementary education	Principal needs to acquire Praxis content scores before the HQ window opens

		<p>CATEGORICAL Grades: 03 4804-DEVL P READ 4 D T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 04 4805-DEVL P READ 5 D T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 05 4806-DEVL P READ 6 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 4807-DEVL P READ 7 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 07 4808-DEVL P READ 8 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 08</p>	<p>59 Permanent Authorization 4112 - Behavioral Disorders excluding Autism Grds: 0K-AD Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 4113 - Mentally Impaired- Mild-Moderate Grds: 0K-AD Exp: Permanent</p>		
	Educator	<p>3006-MATH 6 3 Grades: 06 3008-MATH 8 3 Grades: 08 7656- RETEACH/ENRCH 3 Grades: 06 07 08</p>	<p>90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013</p>	Permit is not HQ	

Chart 21

Permits					
School	Teacher	Schedule	Certification	Findings	Recommendation
Guyan Valley Middle	Educator	<p>7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 07 08 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades: 8015-COLTCH-SEC 3 Grades:</p>	<p>21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2013 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 4300 - Reading Specialist Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013</p>	Permit	N/A
	Educator	<p>3006-MATH 6 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 4006-ENG LA 6 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07</p>	<p>22 Professional Teaching Certificate 2210 -Physical Education Grds: 0K- 12 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 2210 - Physical Education</p>	Permit	N/A

		6006-SCIENCE 6 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 7006-WRLD REGN-6 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 06 07 08 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 06 07 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	Grds: PK-AD Exp: Permanent Permit Pending		
	Educator	6007-SCIENCE 7 3 Grades: 07 6008-SCIENCE 8 3 Grades: 08 7658-EXP/ENRCH 3 Grades: 08 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7829-TEACHER DUTY 3 Grades: 7888- 3 Grades:	22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2016 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3603 -Early Education Grds: PK- 0K Exp: 06/30/2016 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 2900 - General Science Grds: 05-09 Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit	
Lincoln Co High	Educator	7009-US STUDIES - 09 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 10 7009-US STUDIES - 09 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 09 7009-US STUDIES - 09 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 10 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 09 10 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 09 7010-WORLD STUDIES - 10 3 R-	81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 4115 - Multi-Categorical (LD, BD, MI) Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit	

		<p>SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 09 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 11 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 7011-CONTEMP STUDIES 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 12 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 I-MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 11 12 13 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 11 12 7031-CIVICS NEXT GEN 3 R-SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 11 12 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 8017-COLTCH-SPED 3 T-MULTI-CATEGORICAL Grades</p>			
	Educator	<p>3052-COLLTRNMATH 1 Grades: 11 12 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:</p>	<p>Form 01 Full Time Permit/OOF 08/10/2013</p>	Permit.	
	Educator	<p>5661-SPANISH I 1 Grades: 09 10 11 13 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 12 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:</p>	<p>90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1500 -Spanish Grds: PK-AD Exp: 06/30/2013 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3000 -Social Studies</p>	Permit	

			Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1500 - Spanish Grds: 05- AD Exp: 06/30/2013		
	Educator	4009-ENG LA 9 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 3 M- OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 3 R- SPECIFIC LEARNING DISA Grades: 09 4010-ENG LA 10 3 I- MENTALLY IMPAIRED:MILD Grades: 10 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 10 11 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades: 7866- 3 Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED 3 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades:	90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1000 -English Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2014 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 1055 -Theater Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2014 90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3900 -Journalism Grds: 09-AD Exp: 06/30/2014	Permit	
	Educator	3044-CNCPTL MATH 1 Grades: 10 11 12 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 10 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 10 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit	
	Educator	4009-ENG LA 9 1 Grades: 09 4009-ENG LA 9 1 Grades: 09 4011-ENG LA 11 1 Grades: 10 11 7811-MENTORSHIP 0 Grades: 09 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	21 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 0K- 06 Exp: 06/30/2015 81 First-Class/Full- Time Permit 1000 - English Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit	
	Educator	3041-ALGEBRA II 1 Grades: 09 10 11 3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09	Form 1 Permit	Permit	

		3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:			
	Educator	3107-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 3108-ASST MATH 1 Grades: 09 7811-MENTORSHIP 1 Grades: 09 10 7821-PLANNING 3 Grades:	81 First-Class/Full-Time Permit 1900 - Mathematics Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Permit	
Midway Elem	Educator	2630-SPED SLFCNT 6 T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 03	99 Short Term Substitute Permit 4800 -General Substitute Grds: PK- AD Exp: 06/30/2014	Permit	
Ranger Elem	Educator	8017-COLTCH- SPED D M-OTHER HEALTH IMPAIRED Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED D T-MULTI- CATEGORICAL Grades: 8017-COLTCH- SPED D U-AUTISTIC Grades:	02 Professional Administrative Certificate 0012 - Elementary/Middle/J unior High School Principal Grds: 0K- 08 Exp: Permanent 02 Professional Administrative Certificate 0013 - Middle/Junior/Senior High School Principal Grds: 05- 12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 3600 -Elementary Education Grds: 01- 06 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 4100 -Mental Retardation Grds: 0K-12 Exp: Permanent 22 Professional Teaching Certificate 7066 Coordinator Cooperative Education Grds: 07- 12 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 0012 - Elementary/Middle/J unior High School	Permit	

			Principal Grds: PK-08 Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 0013 - Middle/Junior/Senior High School Principal Grds: 05-AD Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 4100 - Mental Retardation Grds: 0K-AD Exp: Permanent 59 Permanent Authorization 7066 Coordinator Cooperative Education Grds: 07-AD Exp: Permanent		
West Hamlin Elem	No permits				
Harts PK-8	Educator	4809-TITLE I READ 3 Grades: 5661-SPANISH I V Grades: 08	Pending Long/Short Term sub permit	Permit	
	Educator	3006-MATH 6 3 Grades: 06 3008-MATH 8 3 Grades: 08 7656-RETEACH/ENRCH 3 Grades: 06 07 08	90 Long Term Substitute Permit 3000 -Social Studies Grds: 05-AD Exp: 06/30/2013	Sub Permit	

7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

The Team reviewed new teacher hire logs for 2009-2010, 2010-2011, and 2011-2012 to determine the 0-3 years experience for required observations/evaluations and compiled an alphabetical listing of personnel and matched the list with current personnel files.

The Team also reviewed personnel evaluations for professional personnel with 4-5 years experience, other professional personnel, support personnel, service personnel, coaches, etc., to determine that the evaluation process was conducted according to W.Va. Code §18A-2-12, West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, and county policy.

A random review of teacher evaluations disclosed the following:

The Team reviewed 21 teacher evaluations conducted during the 2011-2012 year.

1. Sixteen teacher evaluations reviewed met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 4220.
2. One first year teacher at Lincoln County High School had not been evaluated.
3. One evaluation from Harts Elementary was incomplete. The evaluation and observation forms were not signed by the evaluator.
4. Three evaluations (one teacher at Ranger Elementary and two teachers at Lincoln County High School) did not have the required number of observations.

A random review of professional support personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

The Team reviewed 10 professional support personnel evaluation files.

1. Six professional support personnel evaluations reviewed met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 4220.
2. One speech therapist at Midway Elementary with more than five years of experience had not been evaluated since 2001-2002. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires professional support personnel with five or more years of experience who have not received an unsatisfactory rating, receive a minimum of one evaluation every three years.

3. A school nurse at Harts Elementary had an incomplete evaluation in 2011-2012. No written evaluation was completed following the end of year conference.
4. A speech therapist at Duval PK-8 with three years of service did not have an evaluation in the personnel file.
5. A counselor at Lincoln County High School who transferred from a teacher position to the counselor position in 2006-2007 had not been evaluated as a counselor.

A random review of school administrator evaluations disclosed the following:

The Team reviewed evaluations for 11 school administrators. All administrator evaluations reviewed met the basic requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, but the recording of the evaluation conference needed to be improved. State Board Policy 5310 states, "The supervisor will schedule an evaluation conference with the administrator to share findings and prepare the written evaluation . . .". The conferences were scheduled and some notes were taken, but the written evaluations were not in the files.

A random review of coach evaluations disclosed the following:

The Team reviewed evaluations for 18 coaching positions.

1. Ten evaluations met all requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.
2. Two coach evaluations reviewed (Harts-Cheerleading and Lincoln County High School-Cheerleading) did not have evaluations for the 2011-2012 year.
3. One evaluation (Lincoln County High School-Tennis) did not have a completion date on the evaluation or dates on the signatures of the evaluator and coach.
4. Two evaluations (Lincoln County High School-Girls Track and Girls Basketball) did not have dates showing the completion of the evaluations.
5. Four evaluations (Harts-Softball and Baseball; Guyan Valley-Girls basketball; and Duval-Softball) did not have observations. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 requires two observations for each evaluation.

A random review of service personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

The Team reviewed 23 service personnel evaluation files. The sample of personnel files included: Cooks, aides, secretaries, maintenance personnel, county office personnel, bus operators, etc. The sample of personnel files reviewed also included service personnel from each school in the county. The evaluation review was

completed in accordance with the requirements of the Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 4220, *Staff Evaluation Policy*, which specified, "Evaluations shall be conducted of each service personnel staff member".

Findings:

1. Fifteen of the service personnel evaluations reviewed met all requirements of the Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 4220. Subsequent to the review, the county produced evaluations showing that all service personnel evaluations met requirements of State and local policies.
2. One bus operator was last evaluated on May 25, 2006. Subsequent to the review, the county produced the current evaluation which was not contained in the employee's personnel office at the time of the audit.
3. One mechanic was last evaluated on May 21, 2007. Subsequent to the review, the county produced the current evaluation which was not contained in the employee's personnel file at the time of the audit.
4. One member of the maintenance staff had not been evaluated in the 2011-2012 year. Subsequent to the review, the county produced the evaluation which was not contained in the employee's personnel office at the time of the audit.
5. One secretary at Hamlin had not been evaluated in the 2011-2012 year. Subsequent to the review, the county produced the evaluation which was not contained in the employee's personnel office at the time of the audit.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

Findings

Lincoln County School District met the requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510 and Policy 4373 and clearly communicated school rules, procedures, and expectations to students, parents, and staff. Additionally, Lincoln County School District maintained a parent page on the county website. This provided links to policies, rules, procedures, and expectations.

7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

W.Va. Code §18A-1-12a (17) states, "All official and enforceable personnel policies of a county board must be written and made available to its employees."

Findings

1. The Lincoln County Board of Education adopted a county policy (4373) that aligned perfectly with West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4373; however, several county policies will need to be revised and reflect the provisions in the State Board policy. Lincoln County Board of Education Policies 2417, 5512, 5530, 5517, 5571 and 5500 reference State Board policies that were abolished with the implementation of State Board Policy 4373.
2. Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 5500 used terms for inappropriate behaviors that do not align with the terms used in State Board Policy 4373, *Effective Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools*, or Lincoln County Board of Education Policy 4373.
3. Lincoln County Board Policy 5600 listed inappropriate behaviors that do not align with the county or State Board Policy 4373. Additionally, Lincoln County Policy 5600 listed out of school suspension as a consequence under Level I infractions which is prohibited in State Board Policy 4373.
4. The Lincoln County policy governing bullying and harassment should be developed within the guidelines of State Board Policy 4373. This includes

providing for community input that address bullying and harassment inclusive of cyber-bullying and harassment through electronic means.

5. Lincoln County Board of Education did not have a policy governing recovery of credit for failed high school courses as required in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, Sections 5.6.h.4 and 7.3.h.

7.8. LEADERSHIP.

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

W.Va. Code §18A-2-12a (1) provides “The effective and efficient operation of the public schools depends upon the development of harmonious and cooperative relationships between county boards and school personnel.”

Findings

Lincoln County Board of Education

1. Minutes of the Lincoln County Board of Education showed that the board meetings were conducted according to statutory provisions regarding public meetings.
2. Each Lincoln County Board of Education member expressed that board members work well together, have a good working relationship, and communicate and collaborate effectively. Several board members pointed out that “board member relationship hasn’t always been this way”.
3. The board members spoke positively about their working relationship with the county superintendent and supported the superintendent.
4. Board members expressed that they “proved they can do their job” as a decision-making body and asserted that the board members are determined to continue this path. The members assured the Team that political elements would not be permitted to influence personnel decisions. It was stated, “We realize the State could take over again and we don’t want that to happen.”
5. Board members expressed a common goal of improving the county and shared a common focus of improving student performance.

Areas stated included: Want to improve every year; Would live to move forward; Would like to expand vocational programs; Want to improve honors classes; Want to improve graduation rate, etc.

6. Board members were aware of the specific needs of Lincoln County in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. The following list includes concerns stated by board members.
 - Employing certified teachers, especially math and science teachers.
 - Staff movement.

- Low achievement at Harts PK-8. Last year (2011-2012) the school had a high number of new teachers which may have been a contributing factor in the low WESTEST2 percent proficient rate.
 - Lack of continuity of the administrative staff at Lincoln County High School and new principals at other county schools.
7. Board members conveyed a number of accomplishments and expressed pride in the board's relationships.
- Lincoln County is financially sound and we are staying within our boundaries.
 - West Hamlin Elementary was named a School of Excellence.
 - The county provides an excellent breakfast and lunch program.
 - Lincoln County has an up-to-date high school facility and a new modern PK-8 school (Harts PK-8).
 - The board members are getting along now and the board is moving in the right direction.
 - The board is working toward addressing school facilities through a school improvement bond. Passage of the bond is essential for upgrading schools.

District Leadership

1. The overall financial status of Lincoln was healthy and the county superintendent is vigilant regarding county level actions to sustain fiscal solvency.
2. The superintendent and staff have instituted programs and initiatives to improve student achievement. Numerous federal and state grants have been procured to provide personnel and programs dedicated to identified school needs. These are enumerated throughout this report.
3. All the evidence gathered from by board of education minutes; local media articles; and board members, superintendent, and staff interviews showed that the Lincoln County School District worked well with the Lincoln County Board of Education as well as school staff and the community.
4. The superintendent exhibited knowledge and awareness of the county's needs and is addressing those needs, i.e., an approved Ten-Year Comprehensive Educational Facilities described the facility needs and the board has scheduled a bond for February 2013 for community support of further school renovation and construction. The district has obtained School Building Authority funding. Many of the facility issues identified in this report are contingent upon passage of the bond.

8.1. INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Findings

Lincoln County School District's Curriculum Team conducts annual curriculum audits through meeting with each school's administrative team (principal/counselor). The proposed master schedule is compared with West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510 and revisions are made accordingly. The county utilizes distance learning to offer Spanish and Japanese via the West Virginia Virtual Schools program.

The Education Performance Audit Team found that county contact(s) were not assigned to elementary curriculum or secondary curriculum. The Lincoln County Board of Education website listed the Director of Federal Programs as "Director of Federal Programs" with the following responsibilities: Title I, Title II, Title VI and Preschool. However, when the Team opened curriculum, the Director of Federal Programs was listed as a contact for curriculum. Federal program funds cannot be used to pay the salary for a curriculum director.

Without central office leadership assigned to oversee the areas of curriculum, student achievement cannot be a focus for the county.

8.1.3. Facilities. Schools are operated efficiently, economically, and without waste or duplication, and the number and location of schools efficiently serves the student population. (W. Va. Code §18-9D-15 and §18-9D-16 (d))

Findings

The OEPA Team observed that Lincoln County is operating the county's school more effectively and efficiently with a modern, up-to-date, and energy efficient high school. A new facility, Harts PK-8, replaced two schools (Harts Intermediate and Harts Primary). The remaining schools have received much needed updates and maintenance. Lincoln County has demonstrated substantial improvement in school facilities that are operated effectively and efficiently to serve the students. Much work lies ahead to enable all students to attend schools in facilities that have appropriate size classrooms and other required areas with adequate space, equipment, and infrastructure to support the use of various technologies and approaches in delivering curriculum.

Lincoln County School District identified the county's school facility needs and identified them in the Ten Year Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEPP). Many of the facilities issues will be resolved with the passage of a school improvement bond, scheduled to come before the voters February 23, 2013. The West Virginia School Building Authority (SBA) has dedicated funding to the Lincoln County project, provided the bond is passed.

8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

Findings

The Lincoln County School District assigned administrative personnel adequately to provide services to schools and support high quality curriculum and instructional services. However, the county has experienced a troubling turnover of administrators at Lincoln County High School for the past three years. A new principal and two new assistant principals were hired last year (2011-2012). At the end of the school year, two assistant principals and the principal left Lincoln County High School, which necessitated employing yet another new principal and two assistant principals. This lack of continuity of administrators at the high school may have a direct relationship to the establishment and support of high quality curriculum and instructional services. Other county schools have also experienced a change in school administration.

Central office curriculum leadership regarding an individual assigned specifically to lead county level curriculum efforts has hindered the Lincoln County School District from maintaining curriculum momentum. The county is poised to reestablish curriculum as a priority and will need to focus efforts on a countywide curriculum leader.

8.1.5. Personnel. The school district assesses the assignment of personnel as based on West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies to determine the degree to which instructional and support services provided to the schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

Findings

The treasurer presented monthly financial reports to the Lincoln County Board of Education. During one report the treasurer cautioned the board regarding their financial position including the number of personnel over the State aid formula. The Lincoln County Board of Education reduced staff but additional cuts may be required to avoid a deficit. The central office is beginning the process of examining positions for the next fiscal year (2013-2014).

The school district used available federal funds, grant resources, and State grants to provide personnel to support schools and identified academic areas. The following are examples of personnel instructional support provided.

1. Two math instructional coaches were employed at Harts PK-8.
2. A retired West Virginia Department of Education employee was contracted to work with Hamlin and Guyan Valley schools.
3. An instructional/administrative consultant was contracted to focus on elementary mathematics and work with the Beginning Educator Mentoring program.
4. Lincoln County was using the Transition to Teaching program.
5. The 21st Century After School program provided two tutors for Lincoln County High School and a social worker was placed at the school.
6. An Innovation Zone/Dropout Prevention grant provided funding for two counselors for the 2012-2013 school year.

8.1.6. Regional Education Service Agency. The school district effectively utilizes Regional Education Service Agency programs and services or other regional services that may be initiated between and among county boards.

Findings

Lincoln County School District utilized RESA 2 on a consistent basis. RESA 2 provided technical assistance in program development, special education, wellness, computer repair, audiology, WVEIS, and professional development. Lincoln County School District has received specialized support in the following areas: Response to Intervention (RtI) to Support for Personalized Learning (SPL); Restraint Training; Food Service; Technology Repair; Instructional Coaches; English Pathways for Alternative Certification, and School Improvement. Since Harts is not a School Improvement Grant (SIG) school, RESA 2 staff members work directly with the staff at Harts PK-8. The following details the RESA 2 assistance provided to Lincoln County for September of the 2012-2013 academic year:

1. Lincoln County Administrative Team, the Harless Center, principals at Guyan Valley Middle, Hamlin PK-8, and West Hamlin Elementary meeting regarding Technical Assistance (September 24, 2012).
2. Harts Administrative Staff meeting regarding Technical Assistance (September 7 and 24, 2012).
3. Title I Director meeting regarding Technical Assistance in EveryDay Math and Carnegie Mathematics Diagnostic for Harts PK-8 (September 24, 2012).
4. Lincoln County Board of Education presentation (September 18, 2012).

Program Development

- RESA 2 staff attend Harts PK-8 Professional Learning Community (PLC) weekly meetings and met with principals to finalize school improvement technical assistance
- Developed school improvement technical assistance plan for Harts PK-8 to include diagnostic visit.
- Attended Lincoln County Board of Education meeting to observe RESA 2 overview and build relationships.

Wellness

- Provided technical assistance to Duval PK-8 and Guyan Valley PK-8 schools regarding completing the HEAP assessment.
- Delivered physical activity equipment to Duval PK-8, Hamlin PK-8, Guyan Valley Middle School, Ranger Elementary, and Midway Elementary.
- Provided physical activity technical assistance to Midway Elementary.

Special Education

- Conducted Harts Pre K-8 Data Analysis and held strategic plan discussions with administrators (September 6, 2012).
- Participated in ongoing communication with the Director of Special Education.

CAPACITY BUILDING

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

The Team found that Lincoln County School District continued to fail to make adequate yearly progress. Programs and initiatives were in place to address the needs of students; however, the county needed to develop an organizing mechanism to prioritize and align their innovation solutions to produce a continuum of school improvement.

In the past year, the Lincoln County Board of Education and the county superintendent demonstrated the capacity to improve the culture and climate at the central office level. The board and superintendent are now focused on school and school district performance.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Lincoln County School District established a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Southwestern Community Action Council, Inc., Child and Family Development Program and Head Start for the 2011-12 and 2012-13 school years. By providing educational services to students at a young age and by providing additional educational support to students identified with special needs, Lincoln County School District demonstrated an understanding of the importance of early detection. Pre-School education was a component of the county Five-Year Strategic Plan.

Secondary education was a deficient area in Lincoln County. Student achievement was deficient in all indicators of assessment. Effective leadership and high quality teaching go hand in hand. The secondary school was challenged by having three principals in three years and two new assistant superintendents last school year and this school year. To maintain leadership stability, The OEPA suggested that Lincoln County develop leadership skills in staff that will foster stability and continuity at the high school.

Board of education members were concerned about attracting and retaining certified teachers, particularly in mathematics and science. This report presents information regarding educators teaching on permit or that do not meet the definition of highly qualified. This is not only a local dilemma, but a State issue. However, Lincoln County experienced this to a greater degree than several contiguous school districts. This licensure will need to be addressed at both the local level and the State levels.

Finally, a void existed in central office staff designated to orchestrate and align curriculum to the strategic plan.

RECOMMENDATION

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, it is recommended and a motion is requested that the Lincoln County Board of Education be released from provisional oversight and the county be issued full approval status.

SCHOOL SUMMARY
EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

School	Findings	Recommendations
43-101 Duval PK-8	7.1.13; 7.6.4	None Identified
43-102 Hamlin PK-8	7.1.2.	None Identified
43-103 Harts PK-8	7.1.7; 7.2.1; 7.2.3; 7.6.4	7.1.12.
43-212 Midway Elementary School	7.1.4; 7.1.5; 7.1.7	7.1.3; 7.1.6; 7.1.12
43-214 Ranger Elementary School	7.1.4; 7.1.5; 7.6.4	None Identified
43-215 West Hamlin Elementary School	None Identified	7.2.2.
43-301 Guyan Valley Middle School	7.1.1; 7.1.2; 7.1.5; 7.2.1; 7.2.3; 7.2.4; 7.6.4	None Identified
43-506 Lincoln County High School	7.2.3.	None Identified

The Education Performance Audit of the individual schools in Lincoln County was conducted October 23-25, 2012. School audits consisted of an examination of the 2012 WESTEST2 results and the structures in place for delivering curriculum. Audit Teams also took note of indicators of efficiency, capacity building resources, and early detection and intervention concerns.

The chart summarizes the education performance findings and recommendations by school. An accreditation status for each school has not been recommended as the Office of Education Performance Audits and West Virginia Department of Education are reviewing performance data for the Annual Report of School District Approval Status and School Accreditation Status.

Four of the eight Lincoln County Schools were deficient in High Quality Standard – 7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship.

Three of the eight Lincoln County Schools were deficient in High Quality Standard – 7.1.5. Instructional strategies.

Three of the eight Lincoln County Schools were deficient in High Quality Standard – 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.

Based on the results of the Education Performance Audits, it is recommended that the West Virginia Board of Education approve the individual school reports.