



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

HOLDEN CENTRAL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JUNE 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability - Analysis	9
Education Performance Audit.....	10
High Quality Standards	10
Indicators Of Efficiency.....	12
Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies.....	13
Identification Of Resource Needs.....	14
Early Detection And Intervention	16
Education Performance Audit Summary	17

INTRODUCTION

An unannounced Education Performance Audit of Holden Central Elementary School in Logan County was conducted April 22, 2014. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was two-fold. The primary purpose was to investigate performance and progress as they relate to the standards outlined in Policy 2320. Secondly, the purpose was to make recommendations to the school, school system, as appropriate, and West Virginia Board of Education on such matters as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Instructional Technology – Mark Moore, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Dr. William Chapman	Director of Federal Programs	Roane County
Lexi Damous	Principal – Poca Elementary School	Putnam County
Leslie Alvin James	Principal – Daniels Elementary School	Raleigh County
R. David Boggs	Principal – Spencer Elementary School	Roane County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team’s findings.

45 LOGAN COUNTY

Phyllis Doty, Superintendent

209 HOLDEN CENTRAL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – FOCUS

Janice Williamson, Principal
Grades PK-04, Enrollment 216

In 2013, West Virginia received waiver approval from certain federal rules and deadlines under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). West Virginia received approval to use its own accountability system which was developed to more effectively identify struggling schools and better direct resources to these schools (2013 ESEA Results). Every public school in the state is designated as a **SUCCESS, TRANSITION, FOCUS, SUPPORT** or **PRIORITY** school.

The West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) designated Holden Central Elementary School a Focus school. Focus schools are those schools with persistent and pervasive subgroup achievement/graduation rate gaps. West Virginia’s methodology for identifying Focus schools differs by programmatic level. Elementary and middle schools will use the achievement gap component of the WVAI while high schools will use graduation rate gaps.

Designation Status for Holden Central Elementary School.

Designation:	FOCUS	Next Year’s Target:	50.7109
Index Score:	38.3723	Met at least 50% of targets in Mathematics and Reading:	YES
Index Target:	46.718	Met Participation Rate Indicator:	YES
Met Index Target:	NO		

Supporting Data

Proficiency (40% of the index score)	8.22
Achievement Gaps Closed (20% of the index score)	15.21
Observed Growth (15% of the index score)	5.63
Adequate Growth (20% of the index score)	4.50
<u>Attendance Rate 5% of the index score)</u>	<u>4.82</u>
Total Accountability Index (out of 100)	38.37

The West Virginia Accountability Index targets are set for each school to reach progressively higher performance on a defined set of data. Schools have an overall score based on multiple components of student and school performance. All schools

were required to meet the same end point, thus defining school-specific trajectories requiring higher rates of improvement for lower performing schools. Targets comprised of the five components listed above are set with a goal of all elementary schools in West Virginia reaching 74.6679 by 2020. Proficiency targets are set at 75 percent for all students in all subgroups by 2020.

Holden Central Elementary School did not achieve the Accountability Index Target for the 2012-2013 school year. When considering the index target of 50.71 for 2014 and the proficiency target of 75 percent of 2020, with a current index score of 38.37, Holden Central Elementary School has a steep trajectory to achieve both the short term and long term targets. A significant gap exists between current performance of each subgroup and the target of 75 percent.

- Holden Central Elementary earned 38.37 of the 100 points possible for the West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) for the 2012-2013 school year. (The target was 46.71 for 2013 and is 50.71 for 2014).
- At least 50 percent of the subgroups at Holden Central Elementary School met the targets in mathematics and reading.
- Holden Central Elementary School acquired 8.22 of 20 possible points for proficiency.
- Holden Central Elementary School acquired 15.21 points of the 20 possible for closing the achievement gap.
- Holden Central Elementary School acquired 5.63 of 15 possible points for observed growth.
- Holden Central Elementary School acquired 4.50 of 20 points possible for adequate growth.
- Holden Central Elementary School acquired 4.82 points of the 5 possible points for attendance.

**HOLDEN CENTRAL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Grade-Level Proficiency Data
School Year 2013**

Grade-Level and Subgroup		Mathematics			Reading/Language Arts		
Grade	Group	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient
3	White	91.18%	64.52%	35.48%	91.18%	58.06%	41.94%
3	Black	> 95%	>95%	< 5%	> 95%	50.00%	50.00%
3	Special Education	85.71%	83.33%	16.67%	85.71%	>95%	< 5%
3	Total	91.67%	66.67%	33.33%	91.67%	57.58%	42.42%
4	White	> 95%	73.53%	26.47%	> 95%	64.71%	35.29%
4	Black	> 95%	33.33%	66.67%	> 95%	33.33%	66.67%
4	Hispanic	> 95%	>95%	< 5%	> 95%	>95%	< 5%
4	Special Education	> 95%	>95%	< 5%	> 95%	>95%	< 5%
4	Total	> 95%	71.05%	28.95%	> 95%	63.16%	36.84%

Attendance Rate = 96.40%

The chart, Grade-Level Proficiency Data for School Year 2013, depicts participation, non-proficient, and proficient percentage rates by grade level and subgroup for mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics.

- Grade 3 students with a proficiency rate of 33.33 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 students (28.95 percent proficient).
- Grade 4 black students with a proficiency rate of 66.67 percent proficient outperformed Grade 3 black students (less than 5 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 special education students with a proficiency rate of 16.67 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 special education students (less than 5 percent proficient).
- Grade 4 Hispanic students demonstrated a proficiency rate less than 5 percent proficient.

Reading/Language Arts.

- Grade 3 students with a proficiency rate of 42.42 percent proficient outperformed Graded 4 students (36.84 percent proficient).

- Grade 4 black students with a proficiency rate of 66.67 percent proficient outperformed Grade 3 black students (50 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 and Grade 4 special education students demonstrated a proficiency rate less than 5 percent proficient.
- Grade 4 Hispanic students demonstrated a proficiency rate less than 5 percent proficient.

HOLDEN CENTRAL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Growth Model School Level Summary
Results by Sub-Group

**Note: Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST 2 score.*

Low	between 1-34th percentile
Typical	between 35th-65th percentile
High	between 66th-99th percentile

Subgroup		Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
		Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
All Sub-Group	School	18 (47%)	13 (34%)	7 (18%)	35.0	29.3%	10 (26%)	17 (45%)	11 (29%)	49.0	38.7%
	County	1,330 (38%)	1,091 (31%)	1,051 (30%)	46.0	36.9%	1,312 (38%)	1,100 (32%)	1,052 (30%)	45.0	43.5%
	State	51,165 (35%)	45,256 (31%)	50,057 (34%)	50.0	45.1%	50,484 (35%)	45,076 (31%)	50,227 (34%)	50.0	48.7%
Black Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	43.0	40.0%	*	*	*	68.0	60.0%
	County	38 (35%)	39 (36%)	31 (29%)	48.0	33.3%	41 (38%)	30 (28%)	36 (34%)	51.0	43.1%
	State	2,677 (37%)	2,180 (30%)	2,303 (32%)	47.0	32.1%	2,581 (36%)	2,216 (31%)	2,308 (32%)	48.0	38.5%
White Sub-Group	School	16 (47%)	12 (35%)	6 (18%)	35.0	29.0%	8 (24%)	17 (50%)	9 (26%)	49.0	37.7%
	County	1,279 (38%)	1,041 (31%)	1,013 (30%)	46.0	37.0%	1,263 (38%)	1,059 (32%)	1,004 (30%)	45.0	43.4%
	State	47,034 (35%)	41,704 (31%)	46,085 (34%)	50.0	45.7%	46,584 (35%)	41,462 (31%)	46,170 (34%)	50.0	49.2%
Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	16.0	5.6%	*	*	*	46.0	0.0%
	County	136 (43%)	110 (34%)	73 (23%)	41.0	13.7%	131 (41%)	98 (31%)	90 (28%)	45.0	12.6%
	State	7,956 (43%)	5,628 (31%)	4,781 (26%)	41.0	18.3%	7,406 (41%)	5,488 (30%)	5,291 (29%)	43.0	16.1%
Non-Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	11 (41%)	9 (33%)	7 (26%)	40.0	36.8%	5 (19%)	13 (48%)	9 (33%)	51.0	50.9%
	County	1,194 (38%)	981 (31%)	978 (31%)	47.0	39.8%	1,181 (38%)	1,002 (32%)	962 (31%)	45.0	47.3%
	State	43,209 (34%)	39,628 (31%)	45,276 (35%)	51.0	49.6%	43,078 (34%)	39,588 (31%)	44,936 (35%)	51.0	54.2%
LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	35.0	29.3%	*	*	*	46.0	38.7%
	County	534 (41%)	391 (30%)	384 (29%)	44.0	36.9%	535 (41%)	412 (32%)	356 (27%)	43.0	43.5%
	State	26,545 (38%)	21,619 (31%)	22,119 (31%)	47.0	37.5%	25,763 (37%)	21,435 (31%)	22,576 (32%)	47.0	40.7%
Non-LSES Sub-Group	School	10 (50%)	6 (30%)	4 (20%)	30.0	(NA)	6 (30%)	7 (35%)	7 (35%)	51.0	(NA)
	County	796 (37%)	700 (32%)	667 (31%)	48.0	(NA)	777 (36%)	688 (32%)	696 (32%)	47.0	(NA)
	State	24,620 (32%)	23,637 (31%)	27,938 (37%)	52.0	58.1%	24,721 (33%)	23,641 (31%)	27,651 (36%)	52.0	62.5%
Male Sub-Group	School	11 (52%)	7 (33%)	3 (14%)	33.0	28.2%	6 (29%)	10 (48%)	5 (24%)	49.0	28.2%
	County	707 (40%)	551 (31%)	502 (29%)	44.0	35.1%	702 (40%)	570 (32%)	485 (28%)	43.0	34.7%
	State	27,113 (37%)	22,439 (30%)	24,615 (33%)	48.0	44.3%	27,485 (37%)	22,259 (30%)	24,047 (33%)	47.0	41.0%
Female Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	39.0	30.6%	*	*	*	49.0	50.0%
	County	623 (36%)	540 (32%)	549 (32%)	48.0	38.8%	610 (36%)	530 (31%)	567 (33%)	48.0	52.8%
	State	24,052 (33%)	22,817 (32%)	25,442 (35%)	51.0	45.9%	22,999 (32%)	22,817 (32%)	26,180 (36%)	52.0	56.9%

**Note: Schools are those schools that have at least a 4th grade.*

**Denotes cell size <20.*

The chart, Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group, identifies the percent proficient in each subgroup as compared to the county and the State averages. In addition, subgroup growth is examined and determined to be low, typical, or high growth based on previous performance.

Mathematics.

- The all, black, white, non-special education, low socioeconomic, and female subgroups demonstrated typical growth in mathematics. The special education, non-low socioeconomic, and male subgroups demonstrated low growth.
- 29.3 percent of the all subgroup was proficient in mathematics as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- 40 percent of black subgroup was proficient.
- The special education subgroup was 5.6 percent proficient compared to the non-special education subgroup (36.8 percent proficient), which indicated a 31.2 percent achievement gap.
- 29.3 percent of the low-socioeconomic subgroup was proficient in mathematics.
- 28.2 percent of the male subgroup was proficient in mathematics compared to the female subgroup (30.6 percent proficient).

Reading/Language Arts.

- The black subgroup demonstrated high growth in reading/language arts and the remaining subgroups demonstrated typical growth.
- 38.7 percent of all students were proficient in reading/language arts as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- 60 percent of the black subgroup was proficient in reading/language arts.
- 0.0 percent of the special education subgroup was proficient compared to the non-special education subgroup (50.9 percent proficient), which indicated a 50.9 percent achievement gap.
- The low socioeconomic subgroup at 38.7 percent proficient mirrored the all subgroup.
- 28.2 percent of the male subgroup was proficient compared to the female subgroup (50 percent proficient), which indicated a 21.8 percent gap.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY - ANALYSIS

Analysis of the data indicated that Holden Central Elementary School's index score of 38.3723 was significantly below the index target for 2012-2013 (46.718), but also the target score for 2013-2014 (50.7109). Overall, achievement scores were higher in reading/language arts than in mathematics. The data indicated a need to provide support to the staff in mathematics and reading/language arts.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Classroom Management Strategies for New Teachers.
2. New Teachers Reading Café.
3. Holden Elementary Policies and Procedures.
4. Holden Elementary Test Data Analysis.
5. SmartBoard Basics.
6. DIBELS Next.
7. New Teacher Academy.
8. Using Data from Diagnostic for School Improvement and to Guide Instruction.
9. Literacy Strategies.
10. Holden Online Writing. Assessment.
11. Instructional Practices Inventory.
12. Units of Study for Writing Assessment.
13. WESTEST2 Examiner Training.
14. Social Media.
15. McGrel Walk-through Training.
16. Kindergarten Writing Café.
17. Holden Elementary Professional Learning Community Training.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Two teachers did not vary instructional strategies. Teacher directed instruction was predominant in these classes and students were off task for extended amounts of time. The Team observed students disengaged from the educational process more than 10 minutes without being redirected by the teacher. Student attention waned during the observation session.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

At least one third of the teachers' lesson plans were incomplete or not written in advance. The lesson plans that were incomplete did not have enough information to instruct the entire class period and could not be followed by a substitute teacher to continue meaningful instruction.

7.6. PERSONNEL.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Professional Preparation, reviewed professional educators' licensure. The results involved two different teachers.

1. One unidentified teacher had an invalid social security number and incomplete information.
2. One teacher did not have the appropriate endorsement for the preschool class taught.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

One teacher left the class of students unattended for five minutes. This practice leaves students open to potentially dangerous situations and the teacher and school open to potential legal issues.

In the annex, teachers either had to leave the class to take students to the rest room, give students a key to the building, or rely on teachers in the main building to let the students into the building to go to the rest room. This procedure made it extremely likely that students were not being properly observed at all times.

Through the interview process, one teacher stated that she was not permitted to discipline students. If a discipline issue arose in this teacher's specialized class, the issue was to be reported to the regular classroom teacher for disciplinary action. It is imperative that students have consistent discipline buildingwide and that all teachers have the capability to enforce all classroom and school rules.

RECOMMENDATION

7.1.7. Library/technology access and technology application. While students were using the computer laboratory, they were not permitted to use the SmartBoards or other presentation stations in the classroom. The Team recommended that students have the opportunity to use all forms of technology in the laboratories and classrooms to ensure maximum education value of the software and hardware.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Holden Central Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Logan County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Logan County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

It is imperative that all teachers challenge all students in all classrooms to ensure maximum learning opportunities for all students. A variety of teaching modalities must be utilized in all classrooms.

Teachers had been provided a wide array of professional development/training sessions, and the principal must ensure that these sessions are implemented properly in the classrooms. The principal and the Logan County Director of Curriculum must continually monitor student achievement and ensure that the professional development is implemented that addresses student needs.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Holden Central Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

Building Capacity – Focus School

A Focus Assistance Support Team (FAST) will be comprised of members from the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE), the Regional Education State Agency (RESA) and the local education agency (LEA). The Team will work closely to assist the school in implementing the West Virginia School Improvement Framework. This will ensure the efforts are aligned and focused to support appropriate interventions to improve student sub group achievement and graduation rates.

Holden Central Elementary School met the target for participation rate and at least 50 percent of the subgroups met targets in mathematics and reading/language arts; however, the school failed to meet the index target due to low proficiency rates. The school will determine interventions and will be supported by the Logan County Central Office. The school will complete a targeted strategic plan and will be monitored occasionally for progress. The local school system may partner with RESA 2 and others to provide monitoring, professional development, technical assistance, and interventions.

With an index score of 38.3723 and a target index of 46.718, the staff of Holden Central Elementary School must develop the capacity to increase student achievement. The principal must elicit assistance from the Logan County Central Office, RESA 2, the West Virginia Center for Professional Development, and the West Virginia Department of Education to investigate schoolwide areas of weakness and provide professional development sessions to eliminate these areas of weakness.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** There was no centralized library, as the classrooms had individual classroom libraries. There were no electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, on-line periodical indexes, copying equipment, or capacity for on-line research. (May adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.9. Grades K-12 remedial.** The location of the remedial areas was not adjacent to the general instruction areas. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The physical education facilities did not have a network connection or Internet access. (May adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health services unit of adequate size was not provided. There were no curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board,

toilet, lavatory, scales, medicine chest, refrigerator with locked storage, first aid kit, work counter, desk and chair, or locked medication box. (May adversely impact student health and safety.)

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Strengthening the core curriculum will be instrumental in increasing student achievement. While the Team observed excellent examples of teaching, it is imperative that the principal continue to monitor classroom instruction and ensure that all teachers exhibit high expectations for all students. Next Generation Standards and data analysis must be the foundation in educational decisions, and results of both formal and informal student data must be the basis of any curricular changes in the classrooms. Vertical teaming and results from the school's Instructional Practices Inventory must continue to be strengthened and fully implemented.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Holden Central Elementary School's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Holden Central Elementary School in improvement efforts.

The Team identified four high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies.

7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.

7.6.2. Licensure.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations.

The Team presented one recommendation (7.1.7. Library/technology access and technology application), noted an indicator of efficiency (8.1.1. Curriculum), offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Holden Central Elementary School and Logan County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.