



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

VERDUNVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JUNE 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability - Analysis	8
Education Performance Audit.....	9
High Quality Standards	9
Indicators Of Efficiency	12
Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies.....	13
Identification Of Resource Needs.....	14
Early Detection And Intervention	16
Education Performance Audit Summary	17

INTRODUCTION

An unannounced Education Performance Audit of Verdunville Elementary School in Logan County was conducted April 22, 2014. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was two-fold. The primary purpose was to investigate performance and progress as they relate to the standards outlined in Policy 2320. Secondly, the purpose was to make recommendations to the school, school system, as appropriate, and West Virginia Board of Education on such matters as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Instructional Technology – Mark Moore, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Ann Smith	Principal – White Sulphur Elementary School	Greenbrier County
Greg Furrow	Principal – Whitethorn Elementary School	Mercer County
Dr. Sara Stankus	Principal – Union Elementary School	Upshur County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

45 LOGAN COUNTY

Phyllis Doty, Superintendent

221 VERDUNVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – SUCCESS

Bonnie Vance, Principal
Grades PK-04, Enrollment 134

In 2013, West Virginia received waiver approval from certain federal rules and deadlines under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). West Virginia received approval to use its own accountability system which was developed to more effectively identify struggling schools and better direct resources to these schools (2013 ESEA Results). Every public school in the state is designated as a **SUCCESS, TRANSITION, FOCUS, SUPPORT** or **PRIORITY** school.

The West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) designated Verdunville Elementary School a Success School. The majority of student subgroups are making academic progress against the annual academic goals in mathematics and reading/language arts; and the school has reached its goals in attendance or graduations rates. Success schools have demonstrated the ability to implement continuous improvement practices. The school must continue to increase student achievement each year to keep this designation. A school's designation is determined once a year based on prior school year data, including WESTEST2 results.

Designation Status for Verdunville Elementary School.

Designation:	SUCCESS	Next Year's Target:	54.722
Index Score:	66.7047	Met at least 50% of targets in Mathematics and Reading:	YES
Index Target:	51.3976	Met Participation Rate Indicator:	YES
Met Index Target:	YES		

Supporting Data

Proficiency (40% of the index score)	20.89
Achievement Gaps Closed (20% of the index score)	20.00
Observed Growth (15% of the index score)	8.44
Adequate Growth (20% of the index score)	12.50
<u>Attendance Rate (5% of the index score)</u>	<u>4.88</u>
Total Accountability Index (out of 100)	66.70

The WVAI targets are set for each school to reach progressively higher performance on a defined set of data. Schools have an overall score based on multiple components of

student and school performance. All schools were required to meet the same end point, thus defining school-specific trajectories requiring higher rates of improvement for lower performing schools. Targets comprised of the five components listed above are set with a goal of all elementary schools in West Virginia reaching 74.6679 by 2020. Proficiency targets are set at 75 percent for all students in all subgroups by 2020.

Verdunville Elementary School did achieve the Accountability Index Target for the 2012-2013 school year. The 2013 target was 51.39 and the 2014 target is 54.72. Verdunville Elementary has surpassed both targets and with continued growth is on track to reach the proficiency target of 75 percent by 2020.

- Verdunville Elementary earned 66.70 of the 100 points possible for the WVAI for the 2012-2013 school year. (The target was 51.39 for 2013 and is 54.72 for 2014.)
- At least 50 percent of the subgroups at Verdunville Elementary School met the targets in mathematics and reading.
- Verdunville Elementary School acquired 20.89 points of the 40 possible points for proficiency.
- Verdunville Elementary School acquired 20 points of the 20 possible points for closing the achievement gap.
- Verdunville Elementary School acquired 8.44 points of the 15 possible points for observed growth.
- Verdunville Elementary School acquired 12.50 of 20 possible points for adequate growth.
- Verdunville Elementary School acquired 4.88 points of the 5 possible points for attendance.

**VERDUNVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Grade-Level Proficiency Data
School Year 2013**

Grade-Level and Subgroup		Mathematics			Reading/Language Arts		
Grade	Group	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient
3	White	> 95%	56.52%	43.48%	> 95%	52.17%	47.83%
3	Special Education	83.33%	80.00%	20.00%	83.33%	80.00%	20.00%
3	Total	> 95%	56.52%	43.48%	> 95%	52.17%	47.83%
4	White	> 95%	40.00%	60.00%	> 95%	48.00%	52.00%
4	Special Education	> 95%	> 95%	< 5%	> 95%	> 95%	< 5%
4	Total	> 95%	40.00%	60.00%	> 95%	48.00%	52.00%

Attendance Rate = 97.60%

The chart, Grade-Level Proficiency Data for School Year 2013, depicts participation, non-proficient, and proficient percentage rates by grade level and subgroup for mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics.

- Grade 4 students with a proficiency rate of 60 percent proficient outperformed Grade 3 students (43.48 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 special education students with a proficiency rate of 20 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 special education students (less than 5 percent proficient).

Reading/Language Arts.

- Grade 4 students with a proficiency rate of 52 percent proficient outperformed Graded 3 students (47.83 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 special education students with a proficiency rate of 20 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 special education students (less than 5 percent proficient).

VERDUNVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Growth Model School Level Summary
Results by Sub-Group

**Note: Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST 2 score.*

Low	between 1-34th percentile
Typical	between 35th-65th percentile
High	between 66th-99th percentile

Subgroup		Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
		Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
All Sub-Group	School	2 (8%)	11 (46%)	11 (46%)	59.0	51.0%	11 (46%)	9 (38%)	4 (17%)	35.0	49.0%
	County	1,330 (38%)	1,091 (31%)	1,051 (30%)	46.0	36.9%	1,312 (38%)	1,100 (32%)	1,052 (30%)	45.0	43.5%
	State	51,165 (35%)	45,256 (31%)	50,057 (34%)	50.0	45.1%	50,484 (35%)	45,076 (31%)	50,227 (34%)	50.0	48.7%
White Sub-Group	School	2 (8%)	11 (46%)	11 (46%)	59.0	51.0%	11 (46%)	9 (38%)	4 (17%)	35.0	49.0%
	County	1,279 (38%)	1,041 (31%)	1,013 (30%)	46.0	37.0%	1,263 (38%)	1,059 (32%)	1,004 (30%)	45.0	43.4%
	State	47,034 (35%)	41,704 (31%)	46,085 (34%)	50.0	45.7%	46,584 (35%)	41,462 (31%)	46,170 (34%)	50.0	49.2%
Non-Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	2 (9%)	9 (41%)	11 (50%)	65.0	60.0%	10 (45%)	8 (36%)	4 (18%)	35.0	57.5%
	County	1,194 (38%)	981 (31%)	978 (31%)	47.0	39.8%	1,181 (38%)	1,002 (32%)	962 (31%)	45.0	47.3%
	State	43,209 (34%)	39,628 (31%)	45,276 (35%)	51.0	49.6%	43,078 (34%)	39,588 (31%)	44,936 (35%)	51.0	54.2%
LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	56.0	51.0%	*	*	*	53.0	49.0%
	County	534 (41%)	391 (30%)	384 (29%)	44.0	36.9%	535 (41%)	412 (32%)	356 (27%)	43.0	43.5%
	State	26,545 (38%)	21,619 (31%)	22,119 (31%)	47.0	37.5%	25,763 (37%)	21,435 (31%)	22,576 (32%)	47.0	40.7%
Non-LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	59.0	(NA)	*	*	*	23.0	(NA)
	County	796 (37%)	700 (32%)	667 (31%)	48.0	(NA)	777 (36%)	688 (32%)	696 (32%)	47.0	(NA)
	State	24,620 (32%)	23,637 (31%)	27,938 (37%)	52.0	58.1%	24,721 (33%)	23,641 (31%)	27,651 (36%)	52.0	62.5%
Male Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	65.0	47.8%	*	*	*	36.0	39.1%
	County	707 (40%)	551 (31%)	502 (29%)	44.0	35.1%	702 (40%)	570 (32%)	485 (28%)	43.0	34.7%
	State	27,113 (37%)	22,439 (30%)	24,615 (33%)	48.0	44.3%	27,485 (37%)	22,259 (30%)	24,047 (33%)	47.0	41.0%
Female Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	59.0	53.8%	*	*	*	35.0	57.7%
	County	623 (36%)	540 (32%)	549 (32%)	48.0	38.8%	610 (36%)	530 (31%)	567 (33%)	48.0	52.8%
	State	24,052 (33%)	22,817 (32%)	25,442 (35%)	51.0	45.9%	22,999 (32%)	22,817 (32%)	26,180 (36%)	52.0	56.9%

**Note: Schools are those schools that have at least a 4th grade.*

**Denotes cell size <20.*

The chart, Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group, identifies the percent proficient in each subgroup as compared to the county and the State averages. In addition, subgroup growth is examined and determined to be low, typical, or high growth based on previous performance.

Mathematics.

- The non-special education and male subgroups demonstrated high growth in mathematics and all other subgroups demonstrated typical growth.
- 51 percent of all students were proficient in mathematics as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- 51 percent of the low-socioeconomic subgroup was proficient in mathematics which mirrored the all subgroup.
- 47.8 percent of the male subgroup was proficient in mathematics and 53.8 percent of the female subgroup was proficient, which indicated a gap of 6 percent.

Reading/Language Arts.

- All subgroups demonstrated typical growth in reading/language arts with the exception of the non low-socioeconomic subgroup which demonstrated low growth.
- 49 percent of all students were proficient in reading/language arts as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- The low socioeconomic subgroup was 49 percent proficient which mirrored the all subgroup.
- 39.1 percent of the male subgroup was proficient and 57.7 percent of the female subgroup was proficient, which indicated an 18.6 percent gap.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY - ANALYSIS

Analysis of the data indicated that Verdunville Elementary School's index score of 66.7047 exceeded not only the index target for 2012-2013 (51.3976), but also the target score for 2013-2014 (54.722). The school demonstrated more growth in the area of mathematics, while reading/language arts scores were slightly lower in all subgroups except the female subgroup.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Assessment and Grading.
2. Policies and Procedures.
3. Test Data Analysis.
4. Teacher Evaluations.
5. Units of Study of Writing Cadre.
6. On-line Writing Training.
7. WESTEST2 Training.
8. Pre-K Showcase.
9. New Teacher Academy.
10. Burst Training in Reading.
11. First in Math.
12. Classroom Management Strategies for New Teachers.
13. DIBELS Next.
14. McGrel Walkthrough Training.
15. Kindergarten ELS Reliability Test Training.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While the Team observed excellent instruction buildingwide and a variety of instructional strategies, two teachers did not vary instruction. Teacher directed instruction was predominant in these classrooms. In order to ensure high levels of student attention and allow students to utilize a wider array of modalities, all teachers must employ a greater number of instructional strategies.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team could not verify that all teachers were conducting writing assignments at least one time per week. During teacher interviews, nearly half of the teachers stated that they were not conducting writing assignments at least one time per week. Many samples of student work observed showed that writing was approximately one year behind level.

The principal told a Team member that students were required to write when sent to the office for disciplinary reasons. This practice is detrimental to the writing process as students begin to see writing as a form of punishment.

7.1.11. Guidance and advisement. Students are provided specific guidance and advisement opportunities to allow them to choose a career major prior to completion of grade 10. (Policy 2510)

The school is served by a substitute counselor and the teachers could not verify that the counselor was accessible for student issues. It was reported by the principal and teachers that the counselor was scheduled to be at the school one day per week. No counseling programs could be discussed by teachers which was indicative of a lack of engagement by the counselor

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

During teacher interviews, none of the teachers could discuss the goals and action steps of the schools Five-Year Strategic Plan. The goals of the plan must be a guiding force behind curriculum delivery in the classrooms. Teachers must be aware of the needs of the school as defined in the plan and be able to discuss the variety of programs and practices employed to enable the school to meet the goals.

7.6. PERSONNEL.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

One teacher did not hold the appropriate endorsement for elementary education or LD/MI. Four teachers were not highly qualified for the position they taught.

7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

The principal was not conducting observations for all teachers that needed them. The evaluation process is prescriptive in identifying the number of observations and evaluations that each teacher needs. The principal must be aware of the evaluation process as defined in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, *Performance Evaluation of School Personnel*, and follow the policy.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

There was no organized discipline plan that could be discussed by the teachers. Teachers discussed a color coded plan, but there was no organized process of implementation including consequences for student violations. All students must have a clear and thorough knowledge of school rules and the consequences of violating the rules throughout the entire school day.

7.8. LEADERSHIP.

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

The principal has been in the position for two years; however, during the interview process the principal was unable to support answers to many of the questions asked. The Team determined that the principal possesses the desire to be the leader of the school and expressed the true desire for each student to excel. The Logan County Central Office director of professional development is strongly urged to provide the principal necessary training and mentorship to enable the principal to transform into the leader of the school. While student achievement scores were relatively high, strong leadership is needed to ensure continued success of the school.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Verdunville Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Logan County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Logan County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

While Verdunville Elementary School displayed relatively high student achievement, this status is likely to decline if staff is not provided the guidance to ensure that all areas of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 are fully implemented. All teachers must utilize a wide array of instructional strategies and provide high quality writing assignments at a minimum of once weekly. The goals and action steps from the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan must be implemented in each classroom as this document identifies the overall weaknesses in student achievement. The principal must actively address the areas found deficient in the Education Performance Audit and continue to monitor classroom curriculum delivery and fully implement the necessary observations and evaluations that are required.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Verdunville Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

While the capacity to facilitate adequate student achievement had been shown, all staff must implement the high quality professional development necessary, as guided by the areas of weakness defined in the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan. The principal must elicit assistance from the Logan County Central Office, RESA 2, the West Virginia Center for Professional Development, and the West Virginia Department of Education in determining the course of action necessary to correct the deficiencies and ensure greater student achievement.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not five usable acres and was not large enough for future expansion. The site was not easily accessible and conveniently located and there was not sufficient on-site, solid surface parking for staff, visitors, and individuals with disabilities. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** There was not a reception/waiting area and the administrative personnel did not have sufficient work space and privacy. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.3. Teachers' workroom.** A teachers' work area of adequate size was not provided. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** The counselor's office did not have adequate size, privacy, or easy access to student records. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)

- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** There was no library/resource/media center. Students did not have access to computer work stations, on-line research, electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, on-line periodical indexes, copying equipment, or other materials that are adequate for general reading and reference. (May adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** There was no specified art room. The music facilities were not located away from quiet areas of the building and did not have music stands, music chairs with folding arms, or acoustical treatment. The physical education facility did not have forced ventilation, provisions for two or more teaching stations, or a data projector or 50 inch screen monitor. (May adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service did not have the recommended seating area of 8-14 square feet per person, drinking water, or a chalkboard or bulletin board. A teachers' dining area of adequate size was not provided. The kitchen was not adequate in size to meet food production needs and meal service type. There was no locker/dressing room, lavatory, chairs, or toilet. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health services area of adequate size was not provided. There were no curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board, toilet, lavatory, scales, medicine chest, refrigerator with locked storage, first aid kit, work counter, desk and chair, or locked medication box. (May adversely impact student health and safety.)

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

WESTEST2 revealed relatively high student achievement; however, the issues found in the Education Performance Audit were indicative of possible impending leadership issues. The deficiencies found must be corrected immediately and the principal must monitor classroom curriculum delivery and ensure that all teachers are following the required State and local policies.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Verdunville Elementary School's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Verdunville Elementary School in improvement efforts.

The Team identified eight high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

- 7.1.5. Instructional strategies.
- 7.1.6. Instruction in writing.
- 7.1.11. Guidance and advisement.
- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.
- 7.6.2. Licensure.
- 7.6.3. Evaluation.
- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations.
- 7.8.1. Leadership.

The Team noted an indicator of efficiency (8.1.1. Curriculum), offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Verdunville Elementary School and Logan County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.