



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
SECTION I	
LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT	2
INTRODUCTION.....	2
ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY.....	4
SECTION II	
DATA ANALYSIS	14
SECTION III	
HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS	19
CAPACITY BUILDING.....	100
EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION	102
LOGAN COUNTY SUMMARY.....	103
LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SUMMARY	104

SECTION I
LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL DISTRICT

INTRODUCTION

An unannounced Education Performance Audit of the Logan County School District was conducted January 21-24, 2014. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to examine personnel and finance. The Team also reviewed district level high-quality standards specific to personnel and finance in accordance with appropriate procedures to make recommendations to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the high-quality standards as required by W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies.

Based on preliminary findings regarding personnel and finance presented verbally to the Logan County Superintendent of Schools and two members of Logan County Board of Education, the State Board directed the OEPA to conduct a comprehensive Education Performance audit of the Logan County School System and its schools. The review was conducted April 21 through April 25, 2014.

The Education Performance Audit Team interviewed the Logan County Board of Education President and members of the board of education, school district personnel including the superintendent, the director of personnel, finance official, finance employees, and other county office personnel. The Team examined documents including the Logan County Board of Education agendas and minutes of meetings; personnel documents; financial audit; finance records; and letters, faxes, and materials of interest to the Education Performance Audit.

This report presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings regarding the Logan County School District.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Donna Davis

NAME	TITLE	COUNTY	CATEGORY
Dr. Deedra Bolton	Superintendent	Grant County	Strategic Plan/High Quality Standards
Judy McCoy	Administrative Assistant	Mingo County	Strategic Plan/High Quality Standards
Kenneth Pack	Director Supportive Services	Berkeley County	Policies/Administrative Practices
Delores Ranson	OEPA	Jackson County	Hiring Practices
Carroll Staats	OEPA	Jackson County	Evaluation
Whitni Kines	Associate Director Business Office Student Affairs	West Virginia University	Finance
Joy Hubbard	Chief School Business Officer/ Treasurer	Mercer County	Finance
David Bailey	HVAC Technician Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities/Transportation
Ken Hughart	HVAC Technician Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities/Transportation
Madelaine Shultz	Mechanical Engineer Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities/Transportation
Dr. Gus Penix	Executive Director	OEPA	Leadership

COUNTY PERFORMANCE

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and related student performance data. It also presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

**Growth Model District Level Summary
All Students
Logan County
School Year 2013**

**Note: Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST 2 score.*

Low between 1-34th percentile
Typical between 35th-65th percentile
High between 66th-99th percentile

Location	Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
State	51165 (34.9%)	45256 (30.9%)	50057 (34.2%)	50	45.1%	50484 (34.6%)	45076 (30.9%)	50227 (34.5%)	50	48.7%
- District	1330 (38.3%)	1091 (31.4%)	1051 (30.3%)	46	36.9%	1312 (37.9%)	1100 (31.8%)	1052 (30.4%)	45	43.5%
-- Buffalo Elementary School	(NA)	(NA)	(NA)		32.4%	(NA)	(NA)	(NA)		51.4%
-- Chapmanville East Elementary School	20 (42.6%)	15 (31.9%)	12 (25.5%)	46	43.0%	13 (28.3%)	12 (26.1%)	21 (45.7%)	56	42.2%
-- Chapmanville Middle School	210 (36.2%)	202 (34.8%)	168 (29.0%)	47	42.8%	190 (32.9%)	177 (30.6%)	211 (36.5%)	50	50.4%
-- Chapmanville Regional High School	216 (44.7%)	144 (29.8%)	123 (25.5%)	40	26.4%	221 (45.7%)	147 (30.4%)	116 (24.0%)	37	36.1%
-- Holden Central Elementary School	18 (47.4%)	13 (34.2%)	7 (18.4%)	35	29.3%	10 (26.3%)	17 (44.7%)	11 (28.9%)	49	38.7%
-- Hugh Dingess Elementary School	3 (14.3%)	8 (38.1%)	10 (47.6%)	63	47.5%	8 (38.1%)	8 (38.1%)	5 (23.8%)	41	52.5%
-- Justice Elementary School	6 (35.3%)	4 (23.5%)	7 (41.2%)	44	45.2%	5 (29.4%)	5 (29.4%)	7 (41.2%)	48	38.1%
-- Logan Elementary School	13 (24.5%)	15 (28.3%)	25 (47.2%)	64	45.2%	12 (22.2%)	15 (27.8%)	27 (50.0%)	62	52.4%
-- Logan Middle School	270 (37.0%)	201 (27.6%)	258 (35.4%)	48	42.5%	316 (43.6%)	224 (30.9%)	184 (25.4%)	41	44.9%
-- Logan Senior High School	196 (36.8%)	179 (33.6%)	158 (29.6%)	48	29.8%	178 (33.5%)	162 (30.5%)	192 (36.1%)	50	42.2%
-- Man Elementary School	34 (30.1%)	34 (30.1%)	45 (39.8%)	56	39.0%	35 (31.0%)	35 (31.0%)	43 (38.1%)	55	36.7%
-- Man Middle School	209 (47.8%)	126 (28.8%)	102 (23.3%)	36	36.0%	185 (42.3%)	140 (32.0%)	112 (25.6%)	43	41.7%
-- Man Senior High School	88 (31.0%)	103 (36.3%)	93 (32.7%)	52	33.4%	90 (31.8%)	108 (38.2%)	85 (30.0%)	49	44.7%
-- Omar Elementary School	13 (30.2%)	16 (37.2%)	14 (32.6%)	49	33.7%	17 (39.5%)	12 (27.9%)	14 (32.6%)	49	40.7%
-- South Man Elementary School	(NA)	(NA)	(NA)		60.0%	(NA)	(NA)	(NA)		53.3%
-- Verdunville Elementary School	2 (8.3%)	11 (45.8%)	11 (45.8%)	59	51.0%	11 (45.8%)	9 (37.5%)	4 (16.7%)	35	49.0%
-- West Chapmanville Elementary School	32 (45.7%)	20 (28.6%)	18 (25.7%)	40	36.9%	21 (30.0%)	29 (41.4%)	20 (28.6%)	47	41.8%

The Growth Model District Level Summary Results chart identifies the percent proficient in each school compared to the county and the State averages for both mathematics and reading/language arts. In addition, growth is examined and determined to be low (red cells), typical (yellow cells), or high growth (green cells) based on previous performance. All schools demonstrated typical growth in mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics. As the chart indicates, the Logan County School District percent proficient in mathematics was 36.9 percent. A significant difference (30.7 percent) existed between the elementary school with the highest level proficiency (South Man Elementary School at 60.0 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Holden Central Elementary School at 29.3 percent). A much smaller difference (6.8 percent) was noted between the middle school with the highest level proficiency (Chapmanville Middle School at 42.8 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Man Middle School at 36.0 percent). A 7 percent gap existed between the high school with the highest level proficiency (Man Senior High School at 33.4 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Chapmanville Regional High School at 26.4 percent). Countywide, only two schools of the 17 schools in Logan County had more than 50 percent of their students proficient in mathematics (South Man Elementary School and Verdunville Elementary School).

Reading/Language Arts. As the chart indicates, the Logan County School District percent proficient in reading/language arts was 43.5 percent. A significant difference (16.6 percent) existed between the elementary school with the highest level proficiency (South Man Elementary School at 53.3 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Man Elementary School at 36.7 percent). A much smaller difference (8.7 percent) was noted between the middle school with the highest level proficiency (Chapmanville Middle School at 50.4 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Man Middle School at 41.7 percent). An 8.6 percent gap existed between the high school with the highest level proficiency (Man Senior High School at 44.7 percent) and the lowest level proficiency (Chapmanville Regional High School at 36.1 percent). Countywide, five schools had 50 percent or more of their students proficient in reading/language arts. (Buffalo Elementary School, Chapmanville Middle School, Hugh Dingess Elementary School, Logan Elementary School, and South Man Elementary School).

Based on the 2013 WESTEST2 scores, Logan County School System had three Priority Schools, two Focus Schools, two Support Schools, seven Transition Schools and three Success Schools. Chart 1 lists all Logan County Schools and the West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) designation.

Chart 1

Priority Schools	Focus Schools	Support Schools	Transition Schools	Success Schools
Buffalo Elementary	Holden Central Elementary	Man Middle	Chapmanville East Elementary	South Man Elementary
Chapmanville Regional High	Chapmanville Middle	Logan Senior High	Hugh Dingess Elementary	Verdunville Elementary
Man Senior High			Justice Elementary	Logan Middle
			Logan Elementary	
			Man Elementary	
			Omar Elementary	
			West Chapmanville Elementary	

ACT EXPLORE Assessment Results

Logan County School System's Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE data have been below the State results for the last three years. The composite score in 2012-2013 reflected the smallest gap of 0.4 and in 2011-2012 reflected the largest gap of 0.9. In English, the smallest gap of 0.3 occurred in 2012-2013 with the largest gap of 0.9 in 2011-2012. In science, the smallest gap of 0.4 occurred in 2012-2013 with the largest gap of 0.8 in 2011-2012. The ACT EXPLORE data in mathematics showed the largest gap of 0.9 in 2010-2011 with little change in 2012-2013. In reading, the smallest gap of 0.3 occurred in 2012-2013 with the largest gap of 0.9 occurring in 2011-2012.

In 2012-2013, Logan County School System's students exceeded the national benchmark in English; however, the scores were lower than the national benchmark in reading, mathematics, and science.

Benchmarks: English: 13 Reading: 15 Math: 17 Science: 20

Chart 2

ACT EXPLORE RESULTS			
Grade 8			
	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
English WV	14.1	14.1	14.3
English Logan	13.4	13.2	14.0
Mathematics WV	14.8	14.6	14.8
Mathematics Logan	13.9	13.9	14.0
Reading WV	14.1	14.0	14.0
Reading Logan	13.3	13.1	13.7
Science WV	15.9	15.8	16.0
Science Logan	15.2	15.0	15.6
Composite WV	14.8	14.8	14.9
Composite Logan	14.1	13.9	14.5

Source: http://wvde.state.wv.us/oaa/EXPLORE/EXPLORE_index.html

ACT PLAN Assessment Results

Grade 10 ACT PLAN results depicted in Chart 3 shows Logan County's scores were below the State in all tested areas, as well as the composite score. The county has seen a steady decrease in student performance in each of the academic areas each of the three years, except in English and science, where scores remained the same the last two years.

Gaps in Logan County student performance compared to the State increased progressively each of the three years: English – 0.70, 0.90, and 1.10; mathematics – 0.60, 1.10, and 1.40; reading – 0.50, 0.70, and 1.10; and science – 0.50, 0.80, and 0.90. This was reflected in the overall composite scores for Logan County students, which fell short of the State score by the following margins each year: 2010-2011 – 0.50; 2011-2012 – 0.90; and 2012-2013 – 1.10.

All scores for Logan County students each of the three years were below the national benchmarks, except in English, where scores ranged from 0.60 to 0.10 above the national benchmark.

Benchmarks: English: 15 Math: 19 Reading: 17 Science: 21

Chart 3

ACT PLAN RESULTS Grade 10			
	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
English WV	16.3	16.0	16.2
English Logan	15.6	15.1	15.1
Mathematics WV	16.2	16.4	16.4
Mathematics Logan	15.6	15.3	15.0
Reading WV	16.1	16.1	16.4
Reading Logan	15.6	15.4	15.3
Science WV	17.3	17.3	17.4
Science Logan	16.8	16.5	16.5
Composite WV	16.6	16.6	16.7
Composite Logan	16.1	15.7	15.6

Source: <http://wvde.state.wv.us/oaa/actplan.html>

5.1.2. Participation rate. A minimum of 95 percent in the current or a two or three year average of all students enrolled in a public school/county school district/state at the time of testing, including students in each subgroup as required by NCLB must participate in the statewide assessment WESTEST or the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) in reading/language arts or mathematics. Students with a significant medical emergency may be exempt by appeal from the calculation of participation rate for AYP provided that the county superintendent has proper documentation. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

The participation rate of all schools in Logan County exceeded the State requirement of 95 percent. All elementary schools had a 100 percent participation rate in mathematics and reading/language arts except for Man Elementary School which had a 99.44 percent participation rate.

Logan Middle School had the highest participation rate of 99.87 percent in mathematics and reading/language arts, followed by Chapmanville Middle School with a 99.67 percent participation rate, and then Man Middle School with a 99.35 percent participation rate. Further examination of individual subgroup participation revealed Chapmanville Middle School was below the required 95 percent participation rate in the Grade 7 white subgroup (94.41 percent) and in all grades in the special education subgroup (Grade 5 at 94.74 percent; Grade 6 at 94.12 percent; Grade 7 at 94.12 percent; and Grade 8 at 90.91 percent). At Logan Middle School, the special education subgroup fell below the 95 percent participation rate in Grade 5 (93.75 percent) and Grade 8 (87.50 percent). At Man Middle School, the Grade 6 white subgroup (94.29) fell below the 95 percent participation rate as did the Grade 7 special education subgroup (88.89 percent). The total participation rate for Grade 6 was 94.59 percent.

Man High School had the highest participation rate of 98.89 percent in mathematics and reading/language arts, followed by Chapmanville Regional High School (98.80 percent in mathematics and 99.40 percent in reading/language arts), and then Logan High School (97.83 percent). While overall participation rates were above the 95 percent threshold, subgroup participation varied by individual school. For example, the Grade 11 special education subgroup (92.31 percent) at Chapmanville Regional High fell just short of the required participation rate.

5.1.3. Attendance rate (Elementary/Middle). The student attendance rate for elementary and middle schools is at or above 90 percent or the percentage of students meeting the attendance rate show improvement from the preceding year. The student attendance rate will be adjusted for students excluded as a result of the Productive and Safe Schools Act (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1a) and school bus transportation interruptions (W.Va. 126CSR81), West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4110, *Attendance Policy*, (hereinafter Policy 4110). Additional exclusions include excused student absences, students not in attendance due to disciplinary measures, and absent students for whom the attendance director has pursued judicial remedies to compel attendance to the extent of his or her authority. For the AYP determination, the attendance rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the attendance rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 4

ATTENDANCE RATE	
Year	Attendance Rate
2010-2011	96.82%
2011-2012	95.68%
2012-2013	95.69%

Source: <http://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/pub/enroll/repstatgrar.cfm?xrep=2>

Chart 4 indicated the Logan County School District attendance rate had remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last three reporting years. The Team noted that the attendance rate declined in the 2011-2012 (1.14 percent) and 2012-2013 (1.13 percent) school years compared to the 2010-2011 school year. There was a slight increase in the attendance rate (0.01 percent) in the 2012-2013 school year compared to the 2011-2012 school year.

The West Virginia Department of Education NCLB site lists the attendance rate for the low socioeconomic disadvantaged (SES) population and special education populations. The attendance rate for these two populations follows.

Low SES		Special Education	
Year	Rate	Year	Rate
2010-11	96.26%	2010-11	96.32%
2011-12	95.28%	2011-12	95.52%
2012-13	95.07%	2012-13	95.77%

The low SES and special education populations met the attendance requirement of 90 percent for the last three reporting years. However, both student groups experienced steady declines in attendance during the three-year period: Low SES (1.9 percent) and special education (0.55 percent). There was a slight increase in the attendance rate (.25 percent) for special education students in the 2012-2013 school year compared to the previous school year, while low SES student attendance fell 0.21 percent during the same period.

5.1.4. Graduation rate. The student graduation rate is 80 percent or the percentage of students meeting the student graduation rate shows improvement. The graduation rate is calculated according to the high school completer formula recommended by the NCES with the additional condition that graduates include only those students who receive a regular diploma in the standard number of years and does not include students receiving the GED. For the AYP determination, the graduation rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the graduation rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Beginning in school year (SY) 2010–2011, states are required to report a uniform, comparable, and accurate graduation rate known as a “four-year adjusted cohort rate,” which measures the percent of students in a ninth grade cohort that graduate with a regular diploma in four years or less. This rate also must be used for determining adequate yearly progress (AYP) beginning in SY 2011–2012. The regulations require states to report and use a “four-year adjusted cohort graduation rate” based on the following formula:

4-Year Adjusted Cohort Graduation Rate	=	$\frac{\text{\# of cohort members who earned a regular high school diploma by the end of the 2009-2010 school year}}{\text{\# of first-time 9th graders in fall 2006 (starting cohort) plus students who transfer in, minus students who transfer out, emigrate, or die during school years 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009, and 2009-2010}}$
---	---	---

The 2010-2011 graduation rate for the Logan County School District listed in Chart 5 served as the baseline graduation rate for the new adjusted graduation calculation in place in West Virginia.

Chart 5

GRADUATION RATE		
Year	Logan County	West Virginia
2010-2011	80.04%	76.45%
2011-2012	79.23%	77.88%
2012-2013	77.04%	79.32%

Source: <http://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/pub/enroll/repstatgr.cfm?xrep=1&sy=12>

As depicted in Chart 5, an inverse relationship existed between the Logan County School System's graduation rate and the State rate. The State graduation rate increased each year, which Logan County's graduation rate decreased. Since 2010-2011, the graduation rate for Logan County students decreased three percent.

Chart 5A

ACCOUNTABILITY YEAR - GRADUATION RATE				
WVEIS#	School Name	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
45-501	Chapmanville Regional High	83.24%	86.01%	84.38%
45-502	Logan Senior High	77.44%	77.66%	75.00%
45-503	Man Senior High	79.57%	69.31%	69.07%

Source: <http://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/pub/enroll/repstatgr.cfm?xrep=1&sy=12>

With regard to graduation rate for each of the three high schools in Logan County (Chart 5A), Chapmanville Regional High School had the highest graduation rate 84.38 percent followed by Logan Senior High School (75 percent) and Man Senior High School (69.07%). Each of the three schools experienced a decrease in graduation rate from 2011-2012 to 2012-2013: Chapmanville Regional High School decreased (1.63 percent); Logan Senior High School decreased (2.66 percent); and Man Senior High School decreased (0.24 percent).

The West Virginia Department of Education's NCLB site lists the graduation rate for the low SES population and special education population for Logan County. The graduation rate for these two populations follows.

Low SES		Special Education	
Year	Rate	Year	Rate
2010-11	75.40%	2010-11	68.60%
2011-12	71.62%	2011-12	64.62%
2012-13	71.00%	2012-13	46.90%

As shown by the data above, graduation rate for low socioeconomic (SES) students decreased each of the last three years as much as 4.40 percent. However, special education students experienced the most significant decrease from 2010-2011 to 2012-2013 (21.7 percent). Based upon this data, it is imperative Logan County School System implement programs and strategies to increase high school graduation rates, particularly for the low SES and special education populations.

Drop-Out Rate

Year	County	State
2010-11	2.0	2.2
2011-12	2.6	1.7
2012-13	2.0	1.5

SECTION II
DATA ANALYSIS

Chart 6 demonstrated the number of advanced placement (AP®), honors courses, and college credit courses offered in Logan County’s high schools. All three high schools offered AP® courses. Policy 2510, *Assuring Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs*, states, “A minimum of four College Board AP® Courses (at least one from each core content areas of English Language Arts, mathematics, science, and social studies) or the IB Program must be offered annually.” Chapmanville Regional High School and Man Senior High did not offer an AP® course in science, and Logan Senior High did not offer an AP® course in mathematics. Two of the three high schools offered honors courses. All three high schools offered the dual credit classes English 101 and 102, and Logan Senior High offered 5 additional dual credit classes in American History and Computer Science. College credit courses were being provided on campus at each of the high schools through Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College.

Chart 6

NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED/TAKEN 2013-1014			
High School/County	Number of AP® Courses	Number of Honors Courses	Number of College Credit Courses
Chapmanville Regional High	7	0	2
Logan Senior High	4	4	7
Man Senior High	6	5	2

Source: Data Provided by Logan County.

Advanced Placement (AP®) and Dual Credit courses offered by each high school, and number of students enrolled are listed below.

Chart 7 provides college entrance testing information for the American College Test (ACT) and the advanced placement test (APT). Data are listed for each high school, the county, and the State.

Logan County School District’s percentage of ACT test takers (63.6 percent) was above the State percentage of test takers (61.0 percent) by 2.6 percent. The percentage of Chapmanville Regional High School test takers (70.9 percent) exceeded the State average of test takers (61.0 percent) by 9.9 percent, while the percentage of test takers at Logan Senior High School (60.6 percent) and Man High School (55.2 percent) fell below the State percentage: 0.4 percent and 5.8 percent, respectively.

The ACT composite score for Logan County Schools (19.4) was lower than the State composite score (20.6) by 1.2. Composite scores for all three high schools fell below the State ACT composite score by the following margins: Logan Senior High (1.6); Chapmanville Regional High (1.2); and Man Senior High (0.2).

Data indicated the percentage of Logan County students taking the Advanced Placement Test (APT) in Grade 10 (9.4 percent) exceeded the State average (2.6 percent) by 6.8 percent. In Grade 11 the percentage of students taking the APT (23.0 percent) was 0.8 percent below the State average (23.8 percent). The percentage of Logan County students taking the APT in Grade 12 (8.3 percent) was substantially below the State average (24.9 percent) by 16.6 percent. Curriculum directors indicated that many of the AP classes were scheduled in Grades 10 and 11 to allow students in Grade 12 to enroll in dual credit courses. According to county curriculum staff, dual credit offerings in Grade 12 at Logan Senior High and Chapmanville Regional High affected the county percentage of APT test takers in Grade 12.

Chart 7

COLLEGE-ENTRANCE TESTING INFORMATION – ACT & APT 2011-2012					
ACT(American College Test)			APT (Advanced Placement Test) Test Takers		
Schools	Test Takers	Composite Score	Tenth Grade	Eleventh Grade	Twelfth Grade
Chapmanville Regional High	70.9%	19.4	12.8%	30.3%	9.4%
Logan Senior High	60.6%	19.0	5.1%	7.5%	1.0%
Man Senior High	55.2%	20.4	13.0%	37.5%	21.8%
Logan County Schools	63.6%	19.4	9.4%	23.0%	8.3%
STATE	61.0%	20.6	2.6%	23.8%	24.9%

Source: <http://wweis.k12.wv.us/nclb/pub/rpt1112/pickreportcard.cfm?rptnum=99>

Chart 7A

AP® TESTS TAKEN 2012-2013		
SCHOOL	Total # of tests taken.	# scoring 3 or higher
Chapmanville Regional High	113	7
Logan Senior High	99	11
Man Senior High	75	9

Source: Provided by Logan County Central Office.

Currently, Logan County School District pays for all Advanced Placement AP® examinations to enable all students to take the exam. Logan County Central Office curriculum staff provided data for the number of AP® tests taken at each high school

and the number of student exams with a score of 3 or higher during 2012-2013. A score of 3 or higher indicates students receive college credit for the particular class in which the score was obtained. Chart 7A provides the total number of AP® tests taken and the number of tests at each county high school in which a 3 or higher was scored. Of 287 AP® examinations taken in Logan County, only 27 students received a score of 3 or higher. Seven AP® exams out of the 113 tests taken by students at Chapmanville Regional High School scored 3 or higher, 11 tests of the 99 completed at Logan Senior High School received a score of 3 or higher, and nine of 75 tests taken at Man Senior High received a score of 3 or higher.

These scores indicated that Logan County School System central office staff and school staffs needed to examine the rigor of Advanced Placement classes, preparation of teachers to teach these classes, and effectiveness of the classes to prepare students for success in their performance on the AP® examinations.

SAT/ACT Assessment Results

Chart 8 shows the Logan School District's Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) and American College Testing (ACT) results from 2010-2011 through 2012-2013. In 2010-2011 the SAT math mean score for students of Logan County Schools was 437 and in 2012-2013 it was 294, a decrease of 143 points. Similarly, the SAT reading score from 2010-2011 (437) fell 133 points in 2012-2013 (313). Writing scores also declined during the same period from 408 to 304, a decline of 104 points. While the percentage of test takers increased since 2010-2011, a slight decrease (0.60 percent) was experienced in 2012-2013 compared to 2011-2012.

With regard to the American College Testing (ACT) assessment, composite scores increased for Logan County Schools students 0.50 points from 2010-2011 to 2012-2013. Conversely, the percentage of students completing the ACT exam dropped 3.7 percent during the same period.

Chart 8

SCHOLASTIC APTITUDE TEST (SAT) – LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOLS			
County	2010-2011	2011-2012	2012-2013
SAT Takers (%)	7.5%	9.7%	9.1%
SAT Math Score	437	436	294
SAT Reading Score	446	476	313
SAT Writing Score	408	462	304
AMERICAN COLLEGE TESTING (ACT) – LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOLS			
ACT Takers (%)	61.2%	63.6%	57.5%
ACT Composite	18.8	19.4	19.3

Source: State, County and School Data, 2011-2012 West Virginia Report Cards, West Virginia Department of Education. 2012-2013 data provided by Logan County Central Office.

Chart 9 showed the estimated college going rate for graduates of Logan County schools in fall 2012 was 59.8 percent compared to the State's overall college going rate of 56.4 percent. Logan County exceeded the State's overall college going rate by 3.4 percent. Of the 388 high school graduates, 232 entered college in the fall of 2012.

Chart 9

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2012		
	Number of High School Graduates 2011-2012	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,335	56.4%
Logan County	388	59.8%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2012, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Logan County's percentage of students enrolled in developmental courses was measurably higher than the State's percentage of students taking both mathematics and English developmental courses (Chart 10). Sixty-five (65) of Logan County's 190 first-time freshmen or 34.21 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2012 compared to the State (17.40 percent). Ninety (90) graduates or 47.37 percent were enrolled in developmental mathematics compared to the State (28.83 percent).

Among the high schools, Man Senior (40.00 percent) had the highest percentage of students enrolling in developmental English, followed by Logan Senior (38.30 percent) and Chapmanville Regional High (27.80 percent). Logan Senior High (58.00 percent) had the highest percentage of students enrolling in developmental mathematics, followed by Chapmanville Regional High (43.00 percent) and Man Senior High (30.00 percent).

Chapmanville Regional and Logan Senior High are Priority Schools and Man Senior High is a Support School. On the 2013 WESTEST2, Man Senior High had the highest rate of proficient students in mathematics (33.40 percent), followed by Logan Senior High with 29.80 percent proficient, and Chapmanville Regional High School with 26.40 percent proficient. Percentages of students proficient in reading/language arts were appreciably higher than those in mathematics. Proficiency rates for each of the high schools in reading/language arts follow: Man Senior High - 44.70 percent; Logan Senior High - 42.20 percent; and Chapmanville Regional High - 36.10 percent.

Chart 10

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2012					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7,708	1,341	17.40%	2,222	28.83%
Logan County	190	65	34.21%	90	47.37%
Chapmanville Regional High	79	22	27.80%	34	43.00%
Logan Senior High	81	31	38.30%	47	58.00%
Man Senior High	30	12	40.00%	9	30.00%

The percentages of Logan County Schools students enrolled in developmental classes, as well as WESTEST2 results, are indicative of the critical need of the county to examine and adjust curriculum and instruction to improve student success.

SECTION III
HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

1. Although the Logan County Superintendent of Schools and curriculum and instruction directors stipulated that State approved content standards and objectives (CSOs) were adopted in all classrooms, no central office oversight was indicated as to whether or not it was actually occurring.

After further inquiry, the Team was provided printed and bound copies of the Next Generation Content Standards that were provided by the county to all teachers and given to beginning teachers at the start of each school year. The bound, document was titled “Logan County Schools, Creating 21st Century Learners Next Generation Content Standards and Objectives.”

2. Curriculum directors indicated that principals assured CSOs were used in every school via walkthroughs. However, directors reported some principals opted not to use the central office provided walkthrough form. School level teams reported that evidence was not provided at all schools to indicate walkthroughs were occurring on a regular basis to assure the State approved CSOs were used.
3. Curriculum staff indicated teachers had been trained in the West Virginia Next Generation Content Standards in summer academies, professional development on continuing education days, and after-school sessions throughout the school year. However, professional development lists submitted by individual schools did not reflect participation in on-going professional development to support the implementation of the standards in all schools.
4. Logan County tracks the number of walkthroughs that were conducted in each school and the number of walkthroughs conducted by each administrator. The total reported number of walkthroughs conducted in Logan County Schools from August 1, 2013 to April 22, 2014, was 1,160 walkthroughs. It was not conveyed, nor did individual school audit teams find, that the results of walkthroughs were used to adjust curriculum and instruction.

5. The Director of Title I (who actually does elementary curriculum and instruction), Director of Secondary Education, and Special Education Director seemed knowledgeable in their respective fields regarding CSOs and the curriculum. Nevertheless, school Teams could not verify the duties and responsibilities of central office curricular staff. It was not clear as to who was responsible for what and who answered to whom. Directors lacked a mechanism to bring about change. The strength of some schools was due to the leadership of the principals. Schools that lacked strong leadership were struggling. The schools performing well had taken the initiative to embrace the programs that had been offered by the various Logan County School System offices in spite of the lack of a county level focus.
6. Curriculum staff indicated pacing guides in mathematics and English language arts were provided to the teachers and included content standards and objectives. However, school Teams found no evidence of pacing guides being used in classroom instruction.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Findings

1. Directors of Title I, secondary curriculum, and special education were able to describe what high expectations in schools were/should be in their respective areas. However, they did not feel empowered to ensure that those high expectations were being followed at the school level.
2. All high schools offered AP® courses and all high schools, except Chapmanville Regional High School, offered honors courses. High schools provided samples of syllabi for AP® courses, but the Team did not receive documentation of extended curriculum for honors courses.
3. Logan County School System pays for AP® tests to enable students enrolled in AP® classes take the AP® test. In the 2012-2013 school year, 287 students took the AP exam and 10 percent (27 students) scored 3 or higher on the test.
4. Two principals reported attendance of teachers and custodian staff was a significant issue that directly impacted both instruction and learning environment for students. Substitute teachers, some who were not certified in the areas of instruction, provided instruction frequently, which directly impacted student achievement.
5. The walkthrough data collected by school administrators and presented to county office administrators was not analyzed to assist teachers in making necessary adjustments to their planning, instruction, and level of student engagement.

6. The county office staff was not prepared to present information pertinent to verify high quality standards were being met. This failed to indicate high expectations for student and school performance.

7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)

Findings

1. All schools conduct parent, student, and teacher surveys at the end of each school year. These surveys are submitted to the superintendent. The majority of the schools use a survey that can be completed on-line. Some schools developed their own parent open-ended survey to assess parent satisfaction. Also, some schools conducted the West Virginia Department of Education School Climate Survey.
2. Diagnostic Reviews were conducted in Priority and Focus Schools by teams from RESA 2 and WVDE. One elementary Priority School and one elementary Focus School had taken the results of the WVDE Diagnostic Report and embraced the recommended changes for school improvement. However, one school did not utilize the information in the diagnostic reports to revise the strategic plan.
3. The elementary curriculum director stated the *Leader in Me* program was being implemented in all elementary schools. This student management program provides students with self-confidence and skills for the 21st century, improves student achievement, and increases engagement between the parents and the school. The Team could not verify the *Leader in Me* program was being implemented in three elementary schools

7.1.4. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, *Assuring the Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs* (hereinafter Policy 2510). (Policy 2510)

Findings

Curriculum directors said that all schools complied with the programmatic definitions of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510. However, examination of Advanced Placement course offerings at the high schools revealed that each was not meeting the requirement of Policy 2510, which states, "A minimum of four College Board AP® Courses (at least one from each core content areas of English Language Arts, mathematics, science, and social studies) or the IB Program must be offered annually." Chapmanville Regional High School and Man Senior High did not offer an AP® course in science and Logan Senior High did not offer an AP® course in mathematics.

Two elementary schools were not offering social studies and science in the manner required by the programmatic definition of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

1. Logan County School District offered various professional development sessions on the integration of technology in the classroom such as iPad training, Compass, Apple TV, and SmartBoard training; however, application of these professional development sessions was not evident in the classrooms. Furthermore, teachers requested additional training in technology integration.
2. Central office staff reported principals are responsible for assuring teachers use a variety of instructional strategies through classroom walkthroughs. However, there was no evidence in individual schools of this data being used to bring about changes in classroom instruction. Central office staff also could not identify how they were ensuring principals were tracking and using this data effectively.
3. While school administrators and teachers utilized the correct language when discussing support for personalized learning (SPL) being provided at the middle school level, the Teams discovered the implementation of SPL did not follow recommended guidelines; therefore, anticipated positive results may not be realized. Teachers did not analyze data to the student-specific level, provide consistent instruction in specific skills over an extended period of time, and conduct benchmarking and progress monitoring frequently enough to make appropriate decisions regarding mastery of skills. Students in the targeted instruction classes were grouped weekly based on class assessments and provided a re-teach model of instruction. Elementary Teams noted that most elementary teachers were doing a good job providing support for personalized learning.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

1. The Title I Director was able to speak to her expectation that all elementary schools would have direct daily instruction in the writing process. The director indicated Lucy Calkins, Units of Writing, had been implemented in all elementary schools in Grades K-1. The school level Education Performance Audit Teams

could not verify that all schools were utilizing the program consistently and pervasively.

2. According to the secondary curriculum director, a purchased writing program has not been implemented in the middle and high schools. This was evident, particularly at the high school level, where writing was primarily being implemented by English language arts teachers, and teachers of other subjects self-reported not implementing writing in their instruction.

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

Findings

High school and middle school libraries were funded with county funds. Elementary schools had classroom libraries funded with Title I and county funds. The county recently purchased approximately \$500,000 of leveled books for the elementary schools through Book Source.

The Logan County Superintendent of Schools and county directors office indicated that the county technology plan was unilaterally written by the Technology Director with their indirect input. They were unaware of data which examined such things as equity of technology across schools, how much money was spent on technology, etc.

One of the goals of the strategic plan was to increase the one-to-one technology initiative by 10 percent; however, according to the curriculum directors, the one-to-one initiative had not been implemented in the Logan County School District. The implementation was postponed because it was determined that further study of the one-to-one implementation is needed.

Logan County School District has done an excellent job in technology hardware and infrastructure deployment. Although a few schools were lacking in technology, most schools had a deployment of hardware which included the following hardware.

- Educator Equipment: Laptop, Data Projector, iPad, AppleTV, SmartBoard, and Elmo Document Camera.
- Student Equipment: Dedicated computer laboratories with desktop personal computers (PCs) and Mobile laptop laboratories shared between departments.

The network infrastructure seemed well implemented and bandwidth at most locations showed high Internet speed with ample bandwidth. It was revealed that some locations experience occasional issues with their network.

- Verdunville Elementary School - Weather seemed to degrade network speeds or connectivity.
- Man High School – The day prior to the audit, the network was down and was not fully restored until next morning.
- Logan Elementary School - Weather seemed to degrade network speeds or connectivity.

The prevalent countywide concern was the integration of technology within the curriculum. There seemed to be very little integration of technology within the teaching strategies used by the teachers. A common practice that the Education Performance Audit Team observed was using the data projector with Elmo document camera to project worksheets or other printed materials on the SmartBoard. School Team observations found the interactive features of the SmartBoard were not utilized and the SmartBoards were only being used as projection screens.

The Team noted that professional development needed to be provided that will build more knowledge and skills of integrating technology into the curriculum of all content areas.

7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)

Findings

Central office staff and the superintendent were asked who was in charge of textbooks, several answers were given. The only thing they all agreed upon was who actually kept the textbooks and reordered them as needed, the Textbook/Warehouse Director.

Administrators and teachers indicated having an abundance of materials, programs, and supplies; however, it was not clear which are required and which are optional and some programs were not being used to full potential. A lack of adequate science laboratory facilities at the middle school level could have a significant impact on the delivery of the science curriculum.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Findings

When asked for a written program of study for each programmatic level, the curriculum directors were unaware of any. The superintendent however, stated they were in existence and the guidance director oversaw this. Directors stated programs of study

were not provided/given out to schools or used by staff/students/parents this school year. Individual School Education Performance Audit Teams verified schools did not have written programs of study.

Chapmanville Regional High School and Man Senior High School did not offer an AP® course in science. Logan Senior High School did not offer an AP® course in mathematics. According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510, "A minimum of four College Board AP® Courses (at least one from each core content areas of English Language Arts, mathematics, science, and social studies) or the IB Program must be offered annually."

Two elementary schools were not offering social studies and science in the manner required by the programmatic definition of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510.

A review of master schedules revealed two of the three middle schools did not offer a foreign language to Grades 7 and 8 as required. One Spanish teacher had retired and the other had taken another job in 2011-2012, leaving no certified teacher to provide consistent Spanish instruction for 2012-2013. As a temporary measure, alternate means were implemented to provide the Grade 8 students the second year of Spanish during 2012-2013. Still having difficulty finding qualified teachers, the schools continued with alternate means to provide Spanish A to Grade 7 in 2013-2014. Since Spanish A was not provided the previous year, there lacked a need for providing Spanish B this school year.

7.1.10. Approved elective offerings. An elective offering must be based on approved West Virginia Board of Education content standards and objectives, if available, or have written content standards and objectives that are approved by the county board. (Policy 2510)

Findings

According to the Logan County Superintendent of Schools, there were no elective courses which needed county board of education approval and no current waivers were in effect. However, the curriculum directors indicated that one course, a JROTC addition, had been State approved and a waiver granted.

After reviewing WVEIS schedules, elective courses were being offered in Logan County high schools that required written content standards and objectives with board of education approval. The secondary curriculum director explained that the process had been done in previous years and these documents may be on file in the schools. No documentation of CSOs for these elective courses or documentation of board approval was supplied to the review team.

7.1.11. Guidance and advisement. Students are provided specific guidance and advisement opportunities to allow them to choose a career major prior to completion of grade 10. (Policy 2510)

Findings

According to the Director of Guidance and Testing, the counselors had training on the Comprehensive Developmental Guidance and Counseling Policy.

Itinerant counselors submitted schedules to the director. Three counselors served the county's elementary schools: One counselor served three elementary schools and the other two counselors served four elementary schools.

High Schools participated in the following advisor-advisee (AA) programs: Logan High School used Rachel's Curriculum and S3; Chapmanville Regional High School and Man High used LINKS. Most middle schools used LINKS or a program similar to LINKS.

7.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)

Findings

No documentation of a county multicultural plan or school multicultural plans was supplied to the Education Performance Audit Team although requested several times. Individual School Education Performance Audit Teams observed evidence of multicultural activities integrated through the curriculum.

The Logan County Superintendent of Schools indicated a County Multicultural Plan was developed and all schools had multicultural plans. The superintendent indicated the plans are principal approved and "submitted at the end of the year;" however, no plans were produced for previous school years.

Directors indicated that they were not a part of developing or implementing a multicultural plan at the county or school levels this year.

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Findings

The Logan County Superintendent of Schools indicated that the Director of Title 1 and Director of Secondary Education were responsible for oversight and assuring that priority was given to teaching and learning, the instructional day is protected, and instructional day minimum requirements are met.

However, curriculum directors indicated that the elementary director and assistant superintendent collected master and instructional day schedules. The Team found that each director collected his/her own information from the schools that was pertinent to his/her individual decision-making. All curriculum directors indicated that it is the principal who provides the oversight and compliance. The directors expressed they felt they lacked the oversight to ensure instructional time was protected and met time requirements..

Curriculum directors indicated principals submit a report of accrued instructional time on a monthly basis. After reviewing the school and bell schedules, the Team noted differences between the school schedules and teacher schedules relating to the start and ending times of instruction. These schedules should be checked thoroughly to verify that the teacher schedule correlates with the school schedule to assure consistency in instructional time, non-instructional time, and accrued time.

Classroom observations, lesson plan reviews, and a review of master schedules revealed many classes did not have lesson plans for the Advisory/Advisee (AA) period or the intervention classes. This reduced the number of instructional minutes to 315 at Logan Middle School causing it to be under the required 330 minutes per day of instruction. Further review of activities showed Man Middle School, while meeting the required minutes per day at 336 even after subtracting the AA period, did not have adequate banked time to incorporate the non-academic activities into their calendar.

7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities. The technical and adult programs in the school are aligned with first local, and then state, then national job market opportunities. (Policy 2510)

Findings

According to the secondary curriculum director, the largest industry in Logan County is the fast food service industry. Due to the change in the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) rulings and the transition to natural gas by the power companies, the mining industry was no longer the major industry in Logan County.

The advisory council met in the fall and spring of the 2013-2014 school year.

Simulated workplace has been implemented in the Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center.

Ninety-six (96) percent of the CTE completers in 2013 had positive placement; 76 percent were placed in job fields; and 65 percent had continuing education in field. While the technical center exceeded required levels for positive placement (90) and jobs in field (60), experienced a significant drop in continuing education in field, from 87 percent in 2010-2011 to 65 percent in 2012-2013. While still slightly above the requirement, this indicated a 22 percent drop in three years. Based on this data, the Team determined it imperative that staff at Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center conduct surveys and follow-up with graduates to determine why numbers were declining in the area of continuing education in field.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

Findings

The Team examined the county Five-Year Strategic Plan and determined the plan had not been developed by the county as a team, nor did plan development include involvement of the Logan County Board of Education or community/business partners.

According to the curriculum directors and the superintendent, the Logan County Five-Year Strategic Plan was periodically reviewed in staff meetings throughout the school year and in principal meetings.

Central office directors were assigned to one or two schools to visit weekly. The directors reviewed the school strategic plans, edited and commented on plans and reviewed revisions. However, after reviewing school strategic plans and conducting interviews, the Team found significant differences in the level of knowledge of the process, ability to articulate goals, and awareness of teachers' roles in implementing the plans.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

Findings

The Director of Testing/Counseling maintained all counseling data. The Education Performance Audit Team was supplied documentation, the 2013-2014 Counselor Direct Counseling Percentages, which indicated that all counselors averaged 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students excluding one counselor. This counselor's average was 71.69 percent. The Team noted that no percentages of direct counseling were listed for her from December 2013 to the date of the audit.

7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

Findings

Curriculum directors indicated that a county lesson plan template had been developed; however, only Pre-K and Title I teachers were required to use it. The Logan County Superintendent of Schools indicated a procedure for lesson plan development was in place and all teachers are required to use it. Curriculum directors indicated it is the principals' responsibility to ensure lesson plans are completed.

Education Performance Audit Teams at the elementary schools observed a heavy reliance on teacher manuals in place of lesson plans. Some lesson plans lacked focus on delivery of approved instructional objectives and did not adequately cover the instructional time allotted. School Teams at the middle and high schools observed principals did not provide sufficient feedback to assist teachers in improving their lesson planning and instruction.

7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)

Findings

The Logan County Superintendent of Schools and curriculum directors indicated that data were reviewed by county office staff prior to the school year. Data included that presented by the Guidance/Testing Director. The Team found no indication that other pertinent information, such as financial, facilities, transportation, etc., were reviewed.

According to the curriculum directors, data were analyzed at the school level during professional learning communities (PLCs), content and grade level team, and leadership team meetings. County curriculum directors, along with consultants, analyzed data for the Priority and Focus Schools during FAST team meetings.

The school improvement director maintained benchmark data on the wall of her office and updated the data after each benchmark assessment in order to see the progress of each individual school approaching their individual index target. However, at the school level, with the exception of most elementary schools, data were not analyzed to the

student level for use in delivery of classroom instruction and interventions through support for personalized learning (SPL).

The attendance director supplied monthly attendance and discipline data to all schools and central office staff.

The Title I director supplied DIBELS, Reading 3D, and BURST data to all elementary schools after each benchmark assessment. The county office Education Performance Audit Team noted that a unified plan had not been orchestrated to bring about county improvement.

7.3. ALTERNATIVE EDUCATION.

7.3.1. Alternative education. Alternative education programs meet the requirements of Policy 2418. (W.Va. Code §18-2-6 and §18-5-19; Policy 2418)

Findings

The Logan County alternative education program is housed within the Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center and operates from 3:00 P.M. to 7:00 P.M. four days per week. Six students were enrolled in the program. Students were provided instruction in the four core areas (math, English, science, and social studies), and one of the instructors reported the expectation is for students to spend an hour per subject each day. All instruction was self-paced. When asked about the curriculum provided for students, the instructor opened two large filing cabinets filled with three-ring binders labeled by subject. A review of the binders revealed they were filled with worksheets, e.g., black line masters of quizzes, reading passages, and math problems, which come with many textbooks. The instructor reported there was no curriculum developed for the program, and these materials were compiled by the alternative education instructors.

One instructor reported the alternative education program created its own report cards and students were provided grades in the four core areas (math, English, science, and social studies). When asked how this would translate into specific subject grades for students in their home schools, the instructor stated the grades were shared with the guidance counselors at each student's school.

The instructor indicated many of the students in the program lacked basic skills and were also students with individualized education programs (IEPs). The instructor reported that she and the other teacher work to strengthen students' reading and math skills by seeking out reading materials from teachers of students with disabilities, which are at a lower difficulty level, and teaching students the multiplication tables.

A row of desktop computers was located along the back wall of the classroom. When asked if students used the computers as part of their instruction, the instructor reported students were not permitted to use the computers because they could not be "trusted" to stay on educational sites. The Team observed all computer screens were facing toward the facilitators and could be easily monitored. This should not be problematic with two teachers and six students.

When asked how students were transitioned back into their home schools following their time in the alternative education program, the instructor reported a call was made to the principals at the students' respective schools to let them know the students would be returning. There was no specific transition plan in place for reentry.

The Team had concerns about the quality of instruction students were receiving in the alternative program. The Team was particularly concerned about students who return

to their home schools. If they are assigned a grade at their home school for the appropriate math course, such as Algebra I, without experiencing rigorous content, it is questionable they are prepared to advance to the next course. The Team observed the alternative program was not using computerized programs with students, such as Odyssey. This program will allow students to use headphones and even read passages aloud to them if needed.

7.4. REGULATORY AGENCY REVIEWS.

7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)

1. Finance

In the annual audit of Logan County Schools, the auditors noted the following conditions

FINANCE - SUMMARY

Logan County School District has experienced a budget increase during the past five years. The chart below depicts the Unreserved Fund Balances for the past five years (FYE 6/3/09 through 6/30/13).

Unreserved Fund Balances

County	FYE 6-30-09	FYE 6-30-10	FYE 6-30-11	FYE 6-30-12	FYE 6-30-13
Logan County	11,240,048	15,276,329	19,790,019	17,324,391	21,998,342

Source: County Boards of Education Unrestricted (Previously Unreserved) Fund Balances History – Adjusted to Exclude OPEB Liability and Encumbrances General Current Expense Fund FYE 6-30-09 Through 6-30-13.

Findings

- At the time of the January 21-24, 2014, Education Performance Audit, the Team reported the following findings. Individual schools were audited in a timely manner, and the individual school checklist was a part of that review. Corrective action plans were requested from the schools with audit findings, but only one school responded in each of the last two years. All individual schools must be required to submit and implement corrective action plans in response to any audit findings.

APRIL 21-25, 2014 EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

Each school with a finding for the year ending June 30, 2013, had completed a Corrective Action Plan and submitted it to the central office finance department.

2. The Team randomly selected and reviewed accounts payable records during the Education Performance Audit, and no confirming purchase orders were noted. The Team noted that dates were being changed on purchase orders which resulted in dates and purchase order numbers not running in sequential order. For example, a purchase order was being issued on the day of the Team visit, but it was being dated the date of requisition which was in the previous week. The purchasing process will need to be altered to assure that purchase orders are obtained prior to goods or services being ordered.

APRIL 21-25, 2014 EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

The Purchasing Department manually stamps a purchase order number on the blank purchase order form. The purchase order form is then completed by hand and input into WVEIS as soon as possible or as time permits, using the date and purchase order number from the hand written purchase order.

The WVEIS Purchasing System was not being utilized to assign sequential purchase order numbers and the purchase order date was not always the date of entry into WVEIS. This method of manually assigning purchase order numbers resulted in purchase order numbers and dates not being sequential. This will result in encumbrances being back dated to a closed month. This is a weakness in the internal control system.

3. The Team randomly selected individuals and reviewed their salaries to determine if they were being paid in accordance with board approved salary schedules. No county supplement schedule was available for central office administrators. Additionally, some positions on the service personnel county supplement schedule were not being paid in accordance with the schedule provided. Therefore, an up-to-date supplement schedule and administrative index will need to be compiled and approved annually by the Logan County Board of Education to validate the supplements which employees are being paid.

APRIL 21-25, 2014 EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

According to the chief school business official (CSBO)/treasurer, no changes had been made to the county supplement schedule.

4. Seven school buses were donated in 2013 to an organization called Duty International Ministries. The website for Duty International Ministries indicated it is a 501(c)3 charitable organization. A review of the Internal Revenue Service

website, the West Virginia Secretary of State's website, and West Virginia State Tax Department's website found that Duty International Ministries was not included as a charitable organization. The Chief School Business Officer (CSBO) called Steve Duty at Duty International Ministries and requested proof of the tax exempt status, but none was received by the time the Team departed the county. Churches may not be required to receive a declaration of their exempt status; however, the Team was uncertain if this organization qualified as a church. Therefore, the Logan County Board of Education must obtain proof of the tax exempt status of any organization prior to donating any additional items.

APRIL 21-25, 2014 EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

A. The Team was provided a IRS 501(c)(3) letter for Duty International Ministries DBA Steven Duty Ministries. This organization is registered on the West Virginia Secretary of State website but with a DBA Operation Restoration with an effective date of May 29, 2013. Duty International Ministries DBA Steven Duty Ministries was not found on the IRS website of charitable organizations.

B. Per the West Virginia Board of Education Purchasing Policy 8200, vehicles that have been declared surplus may be contributed to a 501(c)(3) organization for a nominal fee. There was no evidence that Duty International Ministries paid Logan County Board of Education a nominal fee.

School Findings

During the April 2014 Education Performance Audit, the Team visited two schools, Chapmanville Elementary and Chapmanville High School and noted the following exceptions.

1. Itemized Claim for Payment. Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Schools in West Virginia 1-20, Itemized Claim for Payment, schools are not permitted to expend any funds unless an itemized claim (invoice) for payment is filed by the claimant (vendor). The Invoice must identify the kind of service, date service was performed, person performing the service, address and amount due. If a claim is for materials, equipment or supplies, the invoice must identify in detail the vendor, address, phone number, items provided, quantity, date provided, to whom provided and the amount due.

Chapmanville High School - Incomplete or No Invoice

03/06/14	Check #3302	WVSSAC	125.00
03/06/14	Check #3305	Austin Jones	75.00
03/06/14	Check #3307	Dave Bowles	125.00
03/06/14	Check #3308	John Badgley	75.00
03/10/14	Check #3311	Coca-Cola Bottling	567.16
03/10/14	Check #3312	Screen Graphics	72.00
03/10/14	Check #3321	Tolsia High School	652.66

2. Payment for Personal Services. Several checks were issued for personnel services provided during the basketball sectional tournament. Some of these payees are employees. Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Public Schools 1-22 Payment for Personal Services, All payments made by a school to an individual for services rendered are to be considered wages and are to be paid through the normal payroll process at the central board office. The only exceptions are payments made to athletic officials as permitted by the IRS and State Attorney General's Opinion dated March 3, 1986.

03/10/14	Check #3313	George Carver	250.00
03/10/14	Check #3315	Lynn Bledsoe	100.00
03/10/14	Check #3318	Kevin Gertz	100.00
03/10/14	Check #3320	James Barker	100.00
03/14/14	Check #3342	Kevin Gertz	35.00
03/14/14	Check #3343	James Barker	35.00
03/14/14	Check #3347	George Barker	125.00

3. Travel.

A. During the Team's review at Chapmanville High School, there was a travel reimbursement to an employee for travel to Huntington and Wayne. Per Logan County Board of Education Travel Policy VI.7, out-of-county travel must be authorized 10 days prior to the travel and the reimbursement rate is \$.40 per mile. No out-of-county authorization was attached to the Travel Reimbursement Form and an employee was reimbursed at a rate of \$0.47 per mile.

B. Logan County Board of Education check #82623 dated 04/11/14 to an employee in the amount of \$375.10. An out of county authorization was approved for this trip. This amount represents mileage reimbursed at a \$0.47 rate, not the \$.40 rate per the Logan County Board of Education Travel Policy VI 7.

4. Unauthorized Expenditure.

A Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Schools Authorized Expenditures, schools and school clubs may not make a contribution to charitable or private non-profit organization unless a fund raiser is conducted specifically for that purpose. Chapmanville Regional High issued check #3350 dated 03/14/14 in the amount of \$100 to the American Heart Association. This expenditure was coded to the Boys Basketball account. There was no evidence that a specific fund raiser was completed for this donation.

B. Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Schools Authorized Expenditures, schools can expend funds for recognition of students, staff, or community if the funds are raised for that purpose and notice is given that the funds will be used for that purpose when the fund raiser is taking place. Any funds raised for this purpose must be kept in a separate subaccount for that purpose. West Chapmanville Elementary purchased a cake for teacher appreciation with purchase order #13-14-684 in the amount of \$46. A separate fund raiser was not completed for this purpose.

5. Disbursements.

Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Schools Disbursements, every check and check stub must be completely filled out at the time the check is issued. Chapmanville Regional High School issued check #3417 to Sam's dated 04/08/14 in the amount of \$450.00. The purchase order was issued for \$450.00. The total of the Sam's receipt was \$475.36 and Sam's processed the check for a total \$475.36; \$25.36 more than the actual check amount.

6. Child Nutrition - Field Trips.

West Chapmanville Elementary School had field trips to Wendy's and Burger King, PO #13-14-651 and PO #13-14-653. The Kindergarten and Grade 3 classes went to the restaurants for lunch. There were cash summary sheets to record the funds collected from students to pay for their lunches. Based on the Team's information, this was just a field trip for lunch. This may be a violation of the Child Nutrition Policy 4321.1, which in part states,

3.4. Competitive foods are defined as all foods and beverages sold, served or distributed in competition with meals served under the United States Department of Agriculture's (USDA) Child Nutrition Programs in the food service areas during the meal service periods.

5.1.3. Foods and beverages shall not be offered as a reward or used as a means of punishment or disciplinary action for any student during the school day.

7. Collections and Disbursements.

Chapmanville Regional High School receipted funds on a cash summary sheet dated 03/28/14 for a softball game. The total collected for gate and concession was \$662.35, only \$245 was deposited. A notation on the cash receipts summary "Turned in \$245 for gate, used concession for Sam's". A Sam's receipt was not attached for \$487.97. This does not comply with 2.5 and 2.6 as listed below.

Per Accounting Procedures Manual for Schools:

2.5. Collections - All moneys collected should be receipted and deposited intact daily into one of the organization's depository accounts.

2.6. Disbursements - All disbursements must be made by check, except for those from petty cash.

Accounting Practices

General Comments

1. All required reference manuals were available and provided.
2. A WVEIS balance sheet and financial reports were provided monthly to the Logan County Board of Education as required.
3. There were no audit findings for the Logan County Board of Education in fiscal year 2011, fiscal year 2012, or fiscal year 2013. The audits were performed by the certified public accounting firm of Perry & Associates.
4. The Logan County Board of Education had a significant balance of approximately \$21,000,000 in the general current expense fund. This balance has grown from approximately \$7,000,000 at June 3, 2008. The Chief School Business Officer (CSBO) attributed this increase to changes in the State Aid Formula, the privatization of the workers' compensation program, and the efficient operation of the system. Additional funds were available in the permanent improvement fund.
5. The preliminary State Aid Computations for Fiscal Year 2015 indicated Logan County Board of Education had approximately 26 professional educators over formula compared to approximately six for fiscal year 2014. Preliminary computations for fiscal year 2015 indicated Logan County Board of Education was approximately 56 service personnel over the formula compared to approximately 30 for fiscal year 2014.

Federal Regulatory Review Findings

1. The Consolidated Federal Programs Monitoring Report contained two Title I findings. The first was in regard to less than 100 percent of highly qualified teachers in Title I Schools. The second was in regard to the development of written contracts and required invoices.
2. The Consolidated Federal Program Monitoring Report contained six Title II findings.
 - The first two were again associated with the percentage of core classes taught by highly qualified teachers.
 - The third finding indicated Logan County Board of Education had exceeded the maximum administrative cost percentage of five percent, and the Logan County Board of Education immediately changed the Title II coordinator's percentage of time charged to the Title II project.
 - The fourth finding required the Logan County Board of Education to seek repayment from RESA II for the payment of \$80,260 for technical assistance services for low-performing schools prior to the services being received.
 - The fifth finding dealt with noncompliance with the budget transfer approval process and the accurate coding of expenditures.
 - The sixth finding was in regard to the development of written contracts and required invoices.

APRIL 21-25, 2014 EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

The overpayment of \$80,260 was refunded by RESA 2 to Logan County Board of Education

The Consolidated Federal Programs Monitoring Report contained one finding in regard to Title III which dealt with highly qualified teachers.

Accounting Practices Findings

1. The Logan County Board of Education adopted a county policy prescribing the accounting procedures for individual schools in the county. Schools submit monthly financial reports, and schools had been audited in a timely manner. Corrective action plans had been requested from the schools with audit findings, but only one school responded for each of the last two years. All schools are required to submit and implement corrective action plans in response to any audit findings.
2. The Team reviewed purchasing and payment procedures with the CSBO and the accounts payable staff. The Logan County Board of Education was presented a

list of invoices for approval prior to payment being released. The Team randomly reviewed accounts payable records during January 21-24, 2014, and no confirming purchase orders were noted during the review. However, the Team noted that dates were being changed on purchase orders which resulted in dates and purchase order numbers not running in sequential order. For example, a purchase order was being issued on the day of the Team's visit, but it was being dated the date of requisition which was in the previous week. Therefore, the Team included a statement at the beginning of this report for Logan County Board of Education to alter the purchasing process to assure that purchase orders are obtained prior to goods or services being ordered.

3. The Team randomly reviewed salaries on the certified list and verified the EMS records and salary tables matched the information submitted. The Team also verified random 200-day employees were being paid in accordance with the salary tables.

Verification of salaries of employees who were receiving a supplement caused some concern. There was no county supplement schedule or administrative index for county office administrators. The explanation provided was that when someone was hired at a certain salary, their supplement was determined by whatever the difference was between the amount derived from their degree, years' experience, and employment term. The supplement would stay the same and the individual would continue to receive their annual step increment. The Team could not determine if the supplement was accurate without finding the board minutes where an individual was hired and reconstructing the salary at year one.

This information was contradicted somewhat by another explanation that all directors were provided the same supplement. Another explanation offered when the Team asked why a coordinator did not receive a supplement was that the coordinator in question did not supervise anyone.

When the Team questioned further about county supplements, the payroll supervisor eventually provided two schedules, one dated 2002-2003 and an undated (but older) principals' county supplement schedule. These schedules also produced questions. The WVEIS set-up for Technology Foreman showed a supplement of \$6,622.35, but the supplement sheet indicated \$3,915.00. The Team found two positions coded 595 foreman on the certified list. Neither was paid at either of the specified rates. One appeared to be a bus foreman for which the supplement schedule provided indicated should be \$2,359.44; however, his supplement was a 200 day base of \$2,878.83. The other was a child nutrition supervisor who was receiving a supplement, but was not included on the supplement schedule.

The Logan County Board of Education will need to approve a county supplement schedule and/or administrative index to validate the supplements which employees are being paid.

Logan County School System Purchasing Issues

West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 8200, *Purchasing Policies and Procedures Manual for Local Educational Agencies*, lists the following requirements for procuring architectural or engineering services.

- 11.1.2 For projects estimated to cost \$250,000 or more, architectural and engineering firms are to be encouraged to submit an expression of interest, which shall include a statement of qualifications and performance data, and may include anticipated concepts and proposed methods or approach to the project. All jobs must be announced by public notice published as a Class II legal advertisement in compliance with **WV §59-1-2**, et seq.
- 11.1.3 A committee of three (3) to five (5) representatives of the LEA shall evaluate these statements and select three firms, which, in the committee's opinion, are best qualified to perform the desired service, provided that, on projects funded wholly or in part by the West Virginia School Building Authority, two (2) of the three (3) firms selected must have had offices within the state for at least one year prior to submitting the expression on interest.
- 11.1.4 The committee shall then rank, in order of preference, no less than three (3) of the firms selected, and shall commence negotiations with the firms in the order of preference the scope of services and price for the work to be performed.

Documentation was not provided to verify that West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200 or **W. Va. Code §5G-1-1** was followed to select an architectural firm for the projects designed during the fiscal year ended June 30, 2014.

Architectural Firm Contracted	Project	Estimated \$ Amount of Project	Contract Date
ZMM, Inc.	Demo 3 Schools	\$574,000	Has not gone to bid
ZMM, Inc.	Champman MS HVAC	\$565,000	10/28/13

Potential Federal Title II Questioned Costs.

The following expenditures had been coded to Title II project codes 40311. Based upon review of the documentation it appeared that these costs were associated with central office administrative staff attendance at seminars pertaining to personnel legal issues.

Vendor Name	Attended by	Check Date	Check #	Amount Questioned
Bowles Rice LLP	Superintendent	9/13/13	079341	\$900.00
Bowles Rice LLP	Assistant Superintendent, Service & Professional Service personnel secretaries	12/3/13	080605	\$1650.00

Payment Procedure.

1. W. Va. Code §12-3-18 requires that an itemized accounting be submitted by any claimant for services rendered or materials furnished before payment can be made; payment cannot be made until the services are rendered or materials furnished; and all payments must be approved by the governing body.

Check #079025 dated 8/12/13 payable to Blue Bird Bus Sales of Pitt included payment of parts order PC001085892 in the amount of \$2,115.50 of which a detailed itemized invoice was not attached or canceled. Instead payment was issued from the parts order confirmation.

2. The West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) notified Logan County Schools on 12/20/13 that the county had received \$87,198 for estimated increased enrollment funds in which they were not entitled to receive and requested that the funds be returned no later than January 31, 2014. Those funds were returned via check #082741 dated 4/10/14.
3. Two checks had been written to date to Body Shop 2000. This vendor appears to be a business owned and operated by a teacher employed by Logan County Schools at the Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center to instruct auto body repair. The addresses and phone numbers of the business and the teacher's personal residence match in their entirety. Body Shop 2000, the business, does not appear to be registered with the West Virginia Secretary of State as a business. Further, no tax identification information has been entered in WVEIS for this vendor nor has it been tagged for 1099 issuance. In addition, no 1099-MISC was issued for this vendor in accordance with Internal Revenues Services regulations for calendar year 2012 or 2013.

From the Team's limited review it is unknown where the services were actually performed. Payments for the past few fiscal years to this vendor are listed below.

Fiscal Year	Amount paid per WVEIS
FY 2014 to date (4/22/14)	\$ 41,100.40
FY 2013	\$ 57,785.29
FY 2012	\$ 33,890.61

In addition, West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200, *Purchasing Policies and Procedures Manual for Local Educational Agencies*, requires competitive bidding for services and/or commodities. Records indicate this vendor has provided parts/services above \$25,000 annually; therefore, competitive procedures should have been followed for this service. The Team found no evidence of this process.

7.11.4. Purchases costing more than \$25,000 but less than \$50,000

- a. Competitive bids are required and bids shall be solicited from at least three (3) known suppliers whenever practical, using advertising media such as newspapers, the internet, trade journals, purchasing bulletins, other media considered advisable, or mass mailings.
 - b. The invitation for bids, shall include all specifications and pertinent attachments, and shall define the items or services sufficiently for the bidder to properly respond.
 - c. The Board may waive the requirement to advertise when a vendor is considered to be the sole source for the item being purchased, when it is determined to be in the best interest of the County, or when professional, technical, or specialized services are being acquired under an agreement. All waivers shall be well documented and those based on a best interest determination shall be approved by the Superintendent.
 - d. Any and all bids may be rejected if there is a sound documented reason.
 - e. The request for bids shall be retained for public review and inspection during normal business hours. After the bid is awarded, all criteria and evaluations used in making the selection, as well as all bids received from vendors, shall be retained for public review
4. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200, *Purchasing Policies and Procedures Manual for Local Educational Agencies*, requires that a service contract provide for the scope of service with an approximation of annual fees.
- A. In at least one instance an incomplete contract was presented and approved by the Logan County Board of Education (9/12/13). Information follows:

Vendor name: Contracted Individual
 Location of Service: Chapmanville Middle School and Logan High School
 Rate: Daily rate of \$500/day not to exceed \$21,000
 Duration: 42 weeks
 Description of services: NONE

B. Logan County School System contracts with Chief Logan Recreational Center to provide swimming instruction services to the Grade 4 elementary students. It appears that the system expends approximately \$50,000 annually for these services. No contract could be produced for these services.

5. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200, *Purchasing Policies and Procedures Manual for Local Educational Agencies*, states,

10.7 According to the West Virginia Division of Labor, all construction contracts in excess of \$10,000 must be in writing.

No written contracts could be obtained for the following:

Vendor	Scope	Amount of Project
Continental Flooring Company	Install new flooring in the gymnasium at Buffalo Creek Elementary	\$38,618.00
	Install new flooring in selected areas of the foyers, main office, hallways and stairwells at South Man Elementary	
Continental Flooring Company	Install new flooring in the kitchen and stage areas at Buffalo Creek Elementary	\$14,272.00
Nitro Mechanical	Logan Middle School repair of HVAC coils (Emergency Issue)	\$47,910.55

10.6. Prevailing wage rates apply to all construction projects, regardless of the dollar amount of the project.

It appears that the above contractor's invoices were paid without providing the board with any certified payroll information.

In addition certified payrolls could not be readily located by the central office personnel for the following payment:

Check #	Vendor	Project	\$Amount
082639	Dougherty Company	Chapman HS HVAC	\$55,737.00

Additional Finance Issues.

1. An individual was transferred from principal at Holden Elementary School to assistant principal at the Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center effective 8/1/13. He was reported on the certified list as assistant principal at the center; however, he continued to receive a principal's supplement instead of an assistant principal's supplement. There was also a discrepancy in his pay between the tier (8 - 14 teachers) on which his State principals' supplement is based and the tier (15 - 22 teachers) on which his county principals' supplement is based. The Team reviewed a copy of an agreement that the employee signed when he was transferred that indicated he would accept the transfer if he continued to receive his current pay. This agreement was also signed by the county superintendent.
2. A secretary was transferred from a school secretary position to the executive secretary in the personnel office in August 2013. Initially, her pay was based on a pay grade G for the executive secretary position she was awarded. At the end of November 2013, the personnel director directed the payroll accountant to change the personnel secretary's pay to a pay grade H because she was now a coordinator. The payroll department made the retroactive adjustment and paid her at pay grade H during the month of December. The CSBO became aware of the change, and directed the payroll accountant to change her pay back to pay grade "G". He also told the personnel director that he could not change the personnel secretary to a coordinator without board action. The change in position was placed on a later board agenda, but was not approved by the Logan County Board of Education.
3. Two teachers were hired as instructors for the Alternative Education program. They are paid on an hourly basis based upon their degree and years' experience, and retirement and health insurance are not offered. One teacher's current hourly rate is \$31.40, and the other teacher's current hourly rate is \$33.97. The last payroll record submitted indicated that each is paid for 5.50 hours per day for four days a week. Contradictory information was provided by the superintendent that indicated the program operated three or four hours per day. Enrollment information at the time of the January audit provided indicated four students were placed in the alternative education program.

In actuality, the program operates four hours from 3:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m., four days a week. These contracted employees are being paid one and one-half hour beyond the program time. It is understandable that one hour would be provided for

planning and work associated with a transition program. However, the Team found the additional half hour a questionable expense and the contradictory information about the program inconsistent with good management operations.

4. An individual was employed as the Communications/Public Relations Coordinator. She was not being paid a supplement. According to the payroll coordinator, she was not paid a supplement because she was not supervising anyone. She was not reported on the certified list. There is only one other known coordinator which is the Technology Coordinator. The Technology Coordinator is paid a supplement; however, it was reported that he received a supplement because he supervises several other employees.

Surplus Property

- 1 Tax Exempt Status. Seven buses were donated in 2013 to an organization called Duty International Ministries. The website for Duty International Ministries indicated it is a 501(c)3 charitable organization. A review of the Internal Revenue Service website, the West Virginia Secretary of State's website, and West Virginia State Tax Department's website did not include Duty International Ministries as a charitable organization. The CSBO called Steve Duty at Duty International Ministries and requested proof of tax exempt status, but none had been received by the time the Team departed. Churches may not be required to receive a declaration of their exempt status; however, the Team was uncertain if this organization qualified as a church. Therefore, a recommendation was included at the beginning of this finance report that Logan County Board of Education obtain proof of the tax exempt status of any organization prior to donating any additional items.
2. Disposal of Surplus Property. Logan County Board of Education minutes listed approval of donation of surplus school buses to Duty International Ministries:

January 10, 2013 – Bus Numbers 2001 and 9712;
October 24, 2013 – Bus Numbers 9502, 9504, 9802;
November 14, 2013 – Bus Number 9505; and
December 2, 2013 – Bus Number 9806. Note. This bus was declared surplus October 24, 2013.

This contribution of surplus buses to this organization violates West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200, *Purchasing Policies and Procedures Manual for Local Educational Agencies*, related to the disposal of personal policy. Specifically, Section 31.2. Disposal of Personal Property: (31.2.1.) states “. . . the purchasing director, in cooperation with the Chief School Business Official may declare the property surplus and dispose of the property in the most economical method for the LEA.” Surplus school buses are typically disposed of at a public auction. In this case, the Logan County School System did not benefit from these donations.

3. One of the buses donated to Duty International Ministries, Bus Number 9806, was red-tagged by a bus inspector in the summer of 2013. The superintendent had reportedly directed the mechanics to repair this particular bus near the beginning of school although they informed her it was not repairable. The cost of the materials was \$4,851.48, and two mechanics worked on the bus for approximately two days completing the repairs. Shortly after the repairs, the bus was declared surplus by the Logan County Board of Education and subsequently donated to Duty International Ministries. At the time of the January and April audits, the bus remained on Logan County District property.

General Comments

1. During 2013-2014, the Logan County Board of Education contracted with three consultants to provide technical assistance to low-performing schools. One individual was contracted at a rate of \$500/day for 88 days for a total \$44,000 to provide assistance to Chapmanville Regional High School and Man Senior High School. The contract and purchase order for the individual initially referenced an incorrect amount of \$550/day, but were changed to reflect the board action. This individual is billing at a rate of \$500/day.
2. The Team provided an invoice for a desk that was questioned. Three desks were purchased from Chapman Printing; the desks and chairs totaled \$3,876. One was for the special education office and two were purchased for the conference room. The new Communications/Public Relations Coordinator was using one desk. The second conference room desk was removed from the conference room. The custodian questioned what happened to the second desk. He was told that the superintendent's husband had removed the desk to keep in storage. The desk was later delivered to Holden Elementary School. While the desk was located, removing county property is not a prudent practice. The Team received conflicting information about the removal of the desk from the central office and its intended location and final arrival at Holden Elementary School. While the desk, purchased with public funds, ended up at a school in Logan County, inconsistent statements and the stated storage site of Logan County Board of Education property shows at a minimum poor judgment and practice by the county superintendent.
3. Purchase order #106199 in the amount of \$12,588.00 was issued to 4-IMPRINT, INC. for 1200 Cell Phone Power Banks "with 2 line imprint of: "Just To Say Thanks!" "Logan County Schools". Step 7 funds were used for this purchase.

According to interviews and documents reviewed, the purpose of this purchase was an appreciation gift for teachers. This violated W.Va. Code 18-5-13 which states "A school may use only funds it generates through a fund-raising or donation – soliciting activity." Furthermore, Step 7 are designated for Instructional Programs and this is an unauthorized use of Step 7 funds.

4. A separate account for the production of a Logan County School System sponsored production of "The Little Mermaid" was established in a separate account rather than the Logan County School District. According to one of the organizers, the account was through the Coal Field Theatre. As the OEPA understood, the person(s) interviewed, funds deposited into the account came from students attending workshops on how to audition for the play. Also, according to one organizer interviewed, the money collected was used for setting up the account, printing costs, donations to the facility where the production was held for custodian services, and funds remaining were divided among the volunteers "for giving up their weekends". The individual said this amounted to a little over \$286.00. This practice violated Policy 8200.

2. Facilities

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Logan County Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP), interviewed the Director of School Facilities, the county superintendent, and visited all schools in the county. Chart 11 describes the facility utilization rate of each school in the Logan County School System as reported in the county's CEFP. A narrative of the Team's observations follows.

Chart 11

Facility Utilization (CEFP)	
School	Utilization
Buffalo Elementary School	81%
Chapmanville East Elementary School	72%
Chapmanville Middle School	65%
Chapmanville Regional High School	80%
Holden Elementary School	84%
Hugh Dingess Grade School	67%
Justice Grade School	64%
Logan Grade School	106%
Logan High School	85%
Logan Middle School	71%
Man Central K-8 School (Elem)	80%
Man Central K-8 School (Middle)	71%
Man High School	66%
Omar Grade School	62%
Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center	48%
South Man Elementary School	63%
Verdunville Elementary School	66%
West Chapmanville Elementary School	93%

Buffalo Elementary School

Buffalo Elementary School was constructed in 1957 with an addition in 1985. Lighting levels were low throughout the facility due to burned out bulbs in the existing light fixtures. Multiple stained ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the building due to a deficient roof membrane. The roof needed to be replaced and the stained ceiling tiles needed to be replaced. Package terminal air conditioning units (PTACs) were used in the two-room classroom addition section of the building. These units did not provide adequate outside air ventilation to the classrooms. Carbon dioxide (CO₂) levels were elevated in these classrooms because of this type of unit being used. Non programmable thermostats were currently being used for temperature control on the

new rooftop units. An automated heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) control system needed to be used to place all HVAC units in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days. The Team recommended using a buildingwide automation system to control these units to improve indoor air quality and energy efficiency. The outside air dampers on the HVAC rooftop units could not be opened with the type of existing controls used in the building. This could potentially cause humidity issues during an unoccupied building during summer months.

Chapmanville East Elementary School

Chapmanville East Elementary School was constructed in 1935 with additions to the facility in 1984. Two portable classrooms were being utilized at this facility. A third portable on-site was being utilized for pre-school/head start. The main school building structure was partially air conditioned. A few classrooms have through the wall package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units. The remainder of the building is heated from a central Columbus Heating gas furnace which has exceeded its life cycle expectancy. The remainder of the air conditioning (AC) units in this facility are window AC units. There was no mechanical ventilation system capable of delivering outside air into the classrooms. The facility was not Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant. Several signs of ongoing roof leaks and water infiltration were present. The facility would benefit from a more aggressive housekeeping schedule.

There is noticeable floor deflection at various areas of this building. In September 2013 an outside architectural/engineering firm was hired to review the building structure. The engineering firm made the following statement regarding the structure evaluation:

It appears the cause of deflection is due to the age of the structure. Overtime, the loaded wood members have continued to deflect by a phenomenon called creep. The International Building Code limits the total dead and live load deflection to L/240. For the 21' span, the allowable deflection is one inch. Therefore the classrooms are at or exceeding the allowable limits for deflection. It is our recommendations that all the classrooms be remediated of the floor framing deflection.

Chapmanville Middle School

Chapmanville Middle School was constructed in 1993. The rooftop heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units were recently replaced with new units. These new units were in the process of being commissioned by the contractor. All the rooftop units have been replaced with the exception of one unit. The replacement unit for that remaining unit has been ordered and scheduled to be replaced. After installation of the control system, schedules will need to be reviewed and corrected as necessary to achieve optimal energy efficiency and occupant comfort. There are several package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units still in service. The roof at this facility is two years old. Trash/debris on the roof needed

to be removed. The roof drains were collecting debris. The debris should be removed and the drains cleaned, then placed on a routine housekeeping schedule. Some vandalism (spray paint) on the walls around the roof area needed to be removed. The exterior of the facility was stained with efflorescence, indicating that water was infiltrating into the building through those walls. Several stained ceiling tiles and dirty air diffusers were prevalent throughout the facility, which also indicated water infiltration into the building. This facility would benefit from a more aggressive housekeeping schedule.

Chapmanville Regional High School

Chapmanville Regional High School was constructed in 2006. Several stained ceiling tiles throughout the facility were caused by water infiltration from the roof. Several roof deficiencies were cited in the Comprehensive Educational Facility Plan (CEFP). A large area of water still collects around the rooftop heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) equipment. This is a potential safety hazard not only from the water infiltrating into the building, but a safety concern for operation of the HVAC unit. The current building automation system was not adequately scheduling the unoccupied and occupied setpoints. There was no documented preventive maintenance plan for the facility/equipment. Two propane cylinders chained to the rear of the building needed to be secured in a fenced enclosure or removed. Several lights were burned out in the stairwells. The lower floor rest rooms had been taken out of service due to vandalism/tobacco use. The walls needed cleaning/painting in several areas from scuffing that has occurred through the course of the school year. Outside lights at the rear of the building were on during the day time. There was some minor efflorescence/staining at the rear of the facility. The rest rooms would benefit from a more aggressive housekeeping schedule.

Holden Elementary School

Holden Elementary School houses Pre-K through Grade 4 and was built in 1978. Three modular units were added in 1993. The facility is located adjacent to a coal mine and does not have the required acreage per West Virginia Board of Education Policy 6200; therefore, additional building construction cannot be expanded on this site. There was very little landscaping, which caused water to collect in a ditch between the school and playground. There was just enough parking for staff, consequently, parking was inadequate for visitors. Delivery trucks must pull behind vehicles to unload. The school did not have a camera or buzzer system to request entrance. To enter the building, visitors must knock and/or catch the attention of someone on the inside to gain access. The facility had a man-trap limiting access to the school upon entrance. The facility lacked a media center, library, defined counselor's office, teachers' workroom, music room, or separate dining space. The kitchen was inadequate in size for the number of meals (210-315 average total) prepared. The main custodian storage space was located in the Mechanical Room. This room also contained the main electrical entrance for the facility and the roof access ladder. This space was overcrowded and the exit doors were partially obstructed at all times. The heating, ventilation, and air conditioning

(HVAC) for the facility is provided through rooftop units that were installed in 2001. The filters for these units were located in the classrooms at the return grille and in most cases were very dirty. The frequency for replacement of these filters needed to be increased. The units were regulated with a building automation system and Barbara Coleman controls in each room. Most of the fans to these units were not running during the Team visit, which would explain the elevated CO₂ levels found in classrooms. The roof was replaced in 1994 according to the Comprehensive Educational Facility Plan (CEFP) and appeared in good condition. The three modular units have Trane packaged thermal air conditioning (PTAC) wall units that do not meet current ventilation requirements. The fans were set to an "Auto" position on these units; setting the fan control to an "on" or "continuous" position will allow for more ventilation of these spaces. This facility uses T-12 fluorescent lights throughout. These lights needed to be replaced as they are obsolete. Mini-fridges were found in classrooms throughout the facility.

Hugh Dingess Elementary School

The original section of Hugh Dingess Elementary School was constructed in 1940 with additions in 1972, 1985, and 2004. The facility was partially air conditioned. The majority of the building was heated with electric wall mounted units and had window air conditioning. There were some incremental package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units in the newer section of the building. The building was not mechanically ventilated and did not meet current ventilation standards. Sections of the building had windows that were old and inefficient. The nearby creek floods the lower parking lot and has infiltrated the lower portion of the building. The classrooms in the section of the building prone to flooding were not being utilized at this time. A new sidewalk has been installed along the rear of the building. The Team recommended that a new rail be installed along the sidewalk. Sections of the foundation along the rear of the building were beginning to degrade and needed to be addressed. The entire school appeared to be very clean. There was no documented preventive maintenance plan at this facility.

Justice Elementary School

Justice Elementary School houses Pre-K through Grade 4 and was constructed in 1951. The facility is located in a neighborhood and did not have the required acreage and cannot be expanded where it is currently located. The playground space was separated from the road by a chain link fence. This facility was not built with a designated library or media center space. The principal has turned the teachers' lounge space into a small (9'x14') library. This facility used a camera/buzzer system for visitors to access the building. The main office was not located adjacent to the entrance, so visitors are given access to the entire facility upon entering. The facility lacked a designated music room and separate dining area. A small teachers' work area with vending machines and refrigerator were available, but no teachers' lounge was provided. The dry storage and walk-in fridge/freezer space was inadequate for the number of meals prepared. The old coal furnace was replaced with individual room units with air handling units on the roof. This system was controlled by a building automation system and Andover Controls. The

filters were located at the return grilles in each classroom and were not clean, but did not need replaced yet. There was no roof access at the school. The coal furnace was completely removed and that space was being used for storage. There was no problem with water in this space. This facility uses T-12 fluorescent lighting throughout. These lights needed to be replaced as they are obsolete. The principal at this facility did not allow staff to have mini-fridges or microwaves in the classrooms.

Logan Elementary School

Logan Elementary School houses Pre-K through Grade 4 and was constructed in 1966. Two modular units were added in the mid-1990s with one of those being replaced in the mid-2000s after a fire. This facility did not have the required acreage and cannot be expanded at this location. Logan County was approved for the West Virginia School Building Authority (SBA) funds to replace the school, but property could not be found within the district. The facility lacked adequate parking. Alterations were made to the facility's entrance to accommodate a man-trap entrance. This facility did not use a camera or buzzer, but left the man-trap door unlocked. A secretary sits at the desk in this area and will sign in visitors and unlock the door for facility access. This facility did not have a library or media center, a music room, or a separate dining area. One modular unit housed a Pre-K class. The other unit was divided into two classroom spaces, each approximately 11 ft. X 22 ft. One was a Title 1 class and the other was a Grade 3 class. This space was too small for the Grade 3 class. The modular units had package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) wall units and T-12 fluorescent lighting. The main building classrooms had two or three package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) wall units in each and utilized 8 ft. T-12 fluorescent lighting. The elevated CO₂ levels in all classrooms can be attributed to the insufficient ventilation of the PTAC units; however, setting the fans to run in a continuous mode on these units will improve the air quality. The T-12 fluorescent lighting in the modular classrooms needed to be replaced as it is obsolete. Mini-fridges were in some classrooms in the facility.

Logan Middle School

Logan Middle School houses Grades 5 through 8 and was constructed in 1997 with West Virginia School Building Authority (SBA) funds. The facility was located in an urban setting with no room for expansion. The public library adjoined this facility and was accessible by the students through a buzzer system. This facility did not use a camera/buzzer system for visitor access, but had a man-trap to prevent access to the entire facility upon entrance. The heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) equipment was nearing its life expectancy and the county should start planning for equipment replacement. There was no school access to the HVAC controls and frequent problems occurred with temperature control in the building. A few locations of water infiltration, including a spot in the gymnasium, may be from HVAC unit condensation. Over the winter, 15 of the room heat pumps froze and caused a major water break in the building. The school was still trying to thoroughly clean the affected spaces and get back to a regular custodian schedule within the facility. There were

several areas of the building where it was extremely difficult to access the fixtures to change the lamps. As a result, several of these lights were out.

Logan High School

Logan High School houses Grades 9 through 12 and was constructed in 1957. The facility was located in an urban setting with little room for expansion. A community wellness center was attached to this facility; however, there was little control over the public's ability to access the school from the wellness center. The county replaced the original heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) equipment with through-the-wall packaged thermal air conditioning (PTAC) units (two or three units per classroom). These units did not provide enough ventilation to meet current American Society of Heating, Refrigerating, and Air Conditioning Engineers (ASHRAE) and West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 6200 requirements. Some of these units had the option to run the fan in a continuous mode, and this should be done to improve the air quality in those spaces. The library had signs of water infiltration at the windows and there was evidence of mold on some of the books on cases under the windows. The librarian was new to this school and still working on sorting books. Proper disposal of the molded books was discussed with the librarian and administration. This school needed a complete HVAC upgrade, including a building automation system. The county was working on removing the asbestos floor tiles from the classrooms at a rate of eight to 10 rooms per year.

Man PK- 4 School

Man PK-4 School was constructed in 2003 with an addition in 2008. An excessive number of lights were out in classrooms and created low lighting levels. A few stained ceiling tiles were prevalent in the facility. Rest rooms and commons areas were not clean. Overall cleaning efforts by the custodian staff needed to be improved. A missing breaker was found in the electrical panel P1 Section 2 located in the Custodian Room. The electrical staff was informed of this issue and will replace the missing cover. Most spaces had elevated humidity levels and were over ventilated. The Team recommended adjusting the minimum positions on the rooftop units and adding humidity control and demand controlled ventilation strategies to the building automation system to improve indoor air quality and energy efficiency. The Team recommended using the current building automation system to place all heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days and adding the HVAC units that are currently not controlled by the building automation system to the building automation system to allow those units to be placed in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days and provide control of the outside air dampers. The Team recommended that the building automation system be upgraded to interface with the standard building automation system used by the county. Outside air dampers were not closed during summer months. The HVAC units at this facility will be approaching their life expectancy in a few years. Plans to replace these units will need to be considered.

Man Middle 5-8 School

Man Middle 5-8 School was constructed in 2003 with an addition in 2008. An excessive number of lights were out in classrooms creating low lighting levels. A few stained ceiling tiles were prevalent in the facility. Several classrooms exhibited very poor painting practices. Rest rooms and commons areas were not clean. Overall cleaning efforts by the custodian staff needed to be improved. The temperature in the gymnasium was 78°F due to failed heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) equipment. Most spaces had elevated humidity levels and were over ventilated. The Team recommended adjusting the minimum positions on the rooftop units and adding humidity control and demand controlled ventilation strategies to the building automation system to improve indoor air quality and energy efficiency. The Team recommended using the current building automation system to place all HVAC units in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days and adding the HVAC units that are currently not controlled by the building automation system to the building automation system to allow those units to be placed in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days and provide control of the outside air dampers. The Team further recommended the building automation system be upgraded to interface with the standard building automation system used by the county. Outside air dampers were not closed during summer months. The HVAC units at this facility will be approaching their life expectancy in a few years. Plans to replace these units will need to be considered.

Man High School

Man High School was constructed in 1957. All classrooms used packaged thermal air conditioning (PTAC) units and did not provide adequate outside air ventilation to the spaces. Carbon dioxide (CO₂) levels ranged from 3000 – 4300ppm in classrooms. Normal maximum levels should not exceed 1200ppm. The urinals in the boys' restroom were designed to have continuous water flow. This type of urinal, by design, uses an excessive volume of water. A gas powered all-terrain vehicle (ATV) was stored in the gymnasium. This is a fire code violation and should not be permitted. Electrical disconnects and controls cabinets were located in the cafeteria for the heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units in that space. These electrical boxes were accessible to students and contained potentially lethal voltage levels. These electrical devices should be locked or relocated. A few stained ceiling tiles were prevalent in the facility. There were several major exterior wall cracks and mortar failure issues on the facility. Lighting levels were low and 4 ft. and 8 ft. T-12 fluorescent lighting was used throughout the facility.

Omar Grade School

Omar Grade School was constructed in 1964 with an addition in 1992. All classrooms used packaged thermal air conditioning (PTAC) units and did not provide adequate outside air ventilation to the spaces. Carbon dioxide (CO₂) levels were elevated in occupied classrooms. The site was not Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)

compliant. Stained roof insulating materials in the Auxiliary Gym needed to be replaced. 4 ft. and 8 ft. T-12 fluorescent lighting was used throughout the facility. A lighting retrofit was scheduled for this summer. Classroom lights were not turned off when the classrooms were unoccupied. Heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) controls were needed to place all HVAC units in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days. The Team recommended using the current building automation system to control these units. Outside air dampers were not closed during summer months.

Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center

Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center was constructed in 1976. An excessive number of classroom and shop area lights were out throughout the facility, creating very low lighting levels. A lighting retrofit for this site is scheduled for this summer. Most shops and classrooms in Building B and C did not have heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) systems capable of introducing outside air ventilation. Incandescent and T-12 fluorescent lighting was used throughout the facility. The new make-up air units and exhaust fans installed in the welding shop were running with no occupants in the space. These units should only run to mitigate welding fumes and air borne contaminants when the shop is in use. Several stained or damaged ceiling tiles were prevalent in the Building A facility. The exterior lights were on during daylight hours on the Building A facility. The HVAC units at this facility will be approaching their life expectancy in a few years. Plans to replace these units will need to be considered. Automation controls for Building A HVAC systems were not remotely accessible and were not utilized to schedule or alter the functions of the systems. Controls in Building B and C were stand-alone systems. The HVAC systems at this site were not scheduled off for holidays or snow days. The Team recommended that the controls for this site be replaced with the standard automation system used by the county for ease of use and access.

South Man Elementary School

South Man Elementary School was constructed in 1952. Classroom 11 had elevated Carbon dioxide (CO₂) levels. The original unit ventilators had been replaced with rooftop units and controlled by a building automation system. Most spaces had elevated humidity levels and were over ventilated. The Team recommended adjusting the minimum positions on the rooftop units and adding humidity control and demand controlled ventilation strategies to the building automation system to improve indoor air quality and energy efficiency. The site was not Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant. 4 ft. and 8 ft. T-12 fluorescent lighting was used throughout the facility. A lighting retrofit was scheduled for this summer. The Team recommended using the building automation system to place all HVAC units in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days and to close the outside air dampers during summer months. This was a very clean and well maintained facility.

Verdunville Elementary School

Verdunville Elementary School houses Pre-K through Grade 4 and was constructed in 1958. A modular unit with two classrooms was added in 1987, but was currently only used for storage. This facility did not have the required usable acreage and cannot be expanded on this site. Adequate blacktop space was available for staff and visitor parking, but it was not all marked and caused some problems with parking. This school did not have a camera or buzzer system to request entrance. The facility did not have a man-trap entrance that would prevent a visitor from gaining access to the entire facility upon entrance. The reception space was very small and did not have chairs for visitors needing to wait for a student or staff member. The facility did not have a media center or library, a defined counselor's office, or separate dining space. The teachers' workroom was inadequate in size. A new storage room was created when the old coal furnace was removed. This space is located on the main level of the school, above what was the furnace room. The space below was accessible by stairs and has a water infiltration problem when it rains. The domestic hot water heater was located in this space. The new storage space was the main custodian supply storage as well as non-food kitchen items (Styrofoam trays, cups, etc.). The kitchen was adequately sized for the number of meals being served. An office space was being created in the former dry goods storage area and a new dry goods storage space was located off the dock. The dock was very small and has two steps up into the facility. There were no handrails on the edges of the dock or at the steps. A storage room formerly shared by the kitchen staff and custodian staff was now a speech therapy room. This space was heated and cooled by a packaged thermal air conditioning (PTAC) wall unit. The old coal furnace was replaced by individual room units with roof mounted air handling units. There was no roof access at the school, and the county employees bring a ladder to access the roof from the outside. Filters were located at the return grilles and were changed monthly by the custodians. These units were controlled with a building automation system and Andover Controls. This facility used T-12 fluorescent lights throughout. These lights needed to be replaced, as they are obsolete. Mini-fridges were found in classrooms throughout the facility.

West Chapmanville Elementary School

West Chapmanville Elementary School was constructed in 1960. The building was partially air conditioned. The rooftop heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) system(s) that serve a portion of the building were approximately 10 years old. The remainder of the facility was served by unitary package thermal air conditioning (PTAC) heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) units. The units are controlled locally and do not offer scheduling capabilities. The HVAC system does not meet current ventilation standards. Two portable classrooms were being used at this facility. The walk way to the portable classrooms was not covered. Several downspouts that terminate at the building foundation needed to be channeled away from the building foundation. Several classrooms were cluttered. There was no documented preventive

maintenance plan at this facility. This facility would benefit from a more aggressive housekeeping schedule.

General Facility Observations/Recommendations

1. The Team recommended that Logan County review the county facility needs and update the Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP) accordingly. Based on the engineering report, the needs at Chapmanville East Elementary School should be deemed critical in nature and addressed as the number one priority in the county. Eliminating all portable classrooms throughout the county should be a high priority for Logan County.
2. Improved efforts needed to be made in all school facilities to maintain proper lighting levels in the classrooms and other instructional areas.
3. Logan County School System will need to begin converting the school sites that do not have building automation systems to a global building automation system that allows the HVAC systems to be monitored and controlled remotely.
4. Several facilities were not fully Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) compliant; therefore, the Team recommended that the county develop a facility inventory that identifies all the deficiencies that need to be corrected to bring each facility into ADA compliance.
5. A countywide documented preventive maintenance plan needed to be developed and implemented.
6. Logan County has a Safety Inspection Checklist and each facility receives a yearly inspection. The Team recommended the county review that checklist with each facility administration and begin completing the checklist on a quarterly basis.
7. Logan County has performed various mechanical and electrical updates at various facilities through the county. Several projects are scheduled to be completed. The Team recommended Logan County continue this practice and continue to identify, evaluate, and rank countywide facility needs, including replacing dated HVAC and electrical systems.

7.5. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICES AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS.

7.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information. Staff members provide parents and the community with understandable information and techniques for helping students learn.

Findings

1. Even though a newsletter was prepared by the communications/public relations coordinator, it is only available via Internet. Newsletters were emailed to schools, community organizations, and the local newspaper. Printed copies were not sent home or distributed.
2. The communications/public relations coordinator stated a clear method had not been established for her to work with schools to gather information. Even though this position was added in August 2013, a plan had not been established with the superintendent and coordinator for this individual to communicate and disseminate information to parents, community, and staff to promote the Logan County School system.
3. The Logan County School website was not up-to-date and lacked correct information to disseminate to the community, parents, and schools. For example, the page listing central office staff contained errors in jobs. One staff member was listed as “Technology Integration” while she was employed July 1, 2013, as “Director of School Improvement and Technology Integrationist”. One employee was identified as “publicist” while the actual job title was communications/public relations coordinator. Board minutes and agendas were also not online for the public to access. The county website could be improved and functional to provide valuable information to parents, teachers, and the community.
4. While county office staff and Logan County Board of Education members enthusiastically discussed the valuable business partnerships with individual schools, no such partnership was developed with the Logan County School System. A formal partnership/relationship with business and community members would be invaluable in helping establish and carry out the county’s vision and goals.

7.5.2. Codes of conduct. The county and schools implement, investigate, and monitor the code of conduct for students and the code of conduct for employees. (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5; Policy 4373; Policy 5902)

Findings

No county office employee interviewed was aware of an Employee Handbook or recalled being trained on the Employee Code of Conduct.

7.5.3. Statewide assessment. Test security measures are in place for the WESTEST. All students in the school participate in the statewide assessment program that includes state content assessments on the WESTEST or West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) at grades 3-8 and 10 and the Writing Assessment at grades 4, 7, and 10. Students with disabilities who have an IEP or a Section 504 Plan may be assessed on the state content assessments under one of the following conditions: standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, or non-standard conditions with modifications. Students unable to participate in the standardized assessment under these conditions and who meet the alternate assessment criteria will participate in the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA). Education Performance Audit teams will verify the eligibility of any student tested under standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, alternate assessment, or medical emergency student exemptions. Students who are continuously enrolled in the public school from the fifth instructional day of school to the spring assessment administration will be considered in the accountability system. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

The director of testing provided documentation as to all trainings provided to him and he has provided to school testing coordinators. The Team found that appropriate proceedings were followed for administering the statewide assessments.

7.5.4. Physical Assessment. The school participates in the appropriate statewide physical assessment program.

Finding

The county could not provide data to support monitoring the physical assessment passage rate, nor could the county provide the WVEIS physical assessment report.

**7.6. PERSONNEL.
January 21 – 23, 2014
Education Performance Audit**

**7.6.1 Hiring. County boards following hiring practices set forth in W. Va. Code.
(W. Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and §18-2E-3a.**

The Team reviewed 15 groups of postings and several posted positions within the group postings to verify that hiring practices set forth in W. Va. Code were being followed. Postings reviewed included: Professional, service, and extracurricular positions, including coaches.

Findings

1. Posting Sites. Vacant positions were posted on the county website, on the personnel hotline, in the county office, and at all worksites. Selected professional vacancies were placed in the State K-12 Job Bank. Due to the high number of professional personnel working on permits, the Team recommended that all professional positions be posted on the State K-12 Job Bank.
2. Posting Format. One posting number was used for a group of vacancies posted on a specific date. Postings were grouped by categories: Professional (classroom teachers and administrators) followed by Extracurricular (mentors, tutors, etc.), Athletics (coaches), and Service Personnel. Positions in each group were listed numerically by category beginning with #1 through the total number of vacant positions for that category. Vacancies reposted were given a new position number. The posting listed location and subject or title of the vacancy. The number of days of employment was not listed for any position, including principals, which include days beyond 200. Postings beginning July 1 through September 20 stated, "Anyone interested in applying for a position should submit an application for employment to the former Director of Personnel, Logan County Schools." After the 9th group posting, this wording was removed and no directions were given as to where or how to submit an application. The wording, "*An Equal Opportunity Employer*" was at the top of each posting; however, the discrimination prohibited statement, as required by Federal law and regulations, had been deleted from the posting form.

The current system of maintaining personnel files leaves a high probability for error in adhering to the complexity of following personnel law and West Virginia Board of Education policy. To assure uniformity and protect the county from grievances, the Team suggested that the personnel office develop an organized filing system for personnel. This could be accomplished by separate files (file folders) kept for each position posted. The file folder would have the group posting number followed by the specific position number. Example: 2014-005-3: 2014-005 would be the group number. The last number (3) would be the "Position Number." The file folder

would contain only information relevant to position 3, such as: A copy of the posting with #3 highlighted or identified, applications for position (#3 only), resumes, if any, correspondence to principals regarding position #3, such as: Interview schedules, recommendations from principal and faculty for position #3, notices or letters of withdraws from applicants, and completed matrix, if used, for position #3, etc. The successful candidate for the position should be noted on or in the file.

The director of personnel will need to review each group posting and positions (vacancies) listed before it is submitted for posting to ensure that all required information is on the posting and is accurate. The director of personnel will further need to check that information required on each posting, such as a discrimination prohibited statement has not been left off or accidentally deleted from the posting and that all information is accurate such as to whom the application is to be submitted.

3. Posting 2014-002 (July 12-18, 2013): Position #32, Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center – Assistant Principal: The principal of Holden Elementary School was transferred into the position of assistant principal of Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center. There was no posting application for this position. However, a letter on file states, “I accept the position at Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center at my present salary.” The employee, an assistant principal, was paid at a principal’s salary level.
4. Certification. The first group of postings reviewed (dated July 2 – July 9, 2013), did not list specific certification for professional positions. However, the top of the posting listed, “MUST HAVE CERTIFICATION IN AREA.” This wording was removed with the second group (44 professional positions) of postings. Beginning in July with the fourth group of postings for classroom teacher positions, posting information included the location, position, and on most postings a certification which would meet the certification requirements of the position (Reference group posting 2014-004). However, inconsistencies, errors, or omission in the required certification, especially at the middle school level, were noted throughout the postings.

Examples. Group posting 2014-015, posted January 9 - January 15, 2014, had 42 vacancies posted (1-42). Examples: *Position #25: “Logan Middle School – 7th/8th grade classroom teacher (Science) – (5-AD; 5-9: MS-K-8).”* This posting lists MS-K-8 as a certification for the science position; however, this is incorrect. K-8 (kindergarten – 8th grades) cannot be used as a certification for grades 7 and/or grade 8. *Position #29: “Chapmanville Middle School – 6th grade classroom teacher (English) (5-AD; 5-9).”* Although MS-K-8 is a certification that can be used for this posting and is the one preferred most often, it is not listed on the posting. (W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a (p)(D)) This appeared to be an example of lack of knowledge of school law and certification course codes. For group posting 2014-008 no certification is listed on the posting for position #1.

The professional personnel secretary and personnel director will need to ensure that correct certification is listed on the posting, identify vacancies to be posted, and review the course codes found in the 2014-2015 Course Manual on the West Virginia Department of Education Website.

5. At the time of the January 21-24, 2014 audit, 45 professional vacancies were filled with long-term substitute teachers. Substitutes assigned to these positions included individuals who were retired, working on long-term substitute permits, and/or a certification waiver. The positions were being posted periodically throughout the school year.

The personnel director must become knowledgeable of requirements to obtain and renew short and long-term substitute teacher permits as well as out-of-field authorizations. Out-of-fields are required to be approved by the county board. Vacancies filled by long-term substitute teachers should be posted continuously.

6. Job Application. The county's employment application or job application form for professional personnel did not give the applicant an opportunity to list all qualifications required to be considered when comparing and recommending applicants for employment. Missing from the application for a classroom teacher position included: 1) Academic Achievement, 2) Certified by National Board for Professional Teaching Standards, 3) Specialized training relevant to the performance of the duties of the job, 4) past evaluations of the applicant's performance in the teaching profession, and 5) seniority. (Specialized training was listed, but only if requested in posting, which was the old law.) The personnel director stated that he had discovered, prior to the Team's visit, that the county's job application form for professional personnel did not provide an opportunity for applicants to list information relevant to each qualification criterion listed in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b). He stated he was working to revise the form.

The personnel director will need to revise the job application immediately to obtain information relevant to the qualifications in W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b). Many counties' job application (as well as employment application) are posted online. These applications could be a resource in developing a job application for Logan County School System.

7. Job applications for posted positions within the group posting were retained in the group posting file folder (all postings posted on a specific date). This can include 40 or more vacant positions. Many were positions posted previously and not filled. On the job application form, an applicant may ask for up to five (5) positions listed by preference. When a position is to be filled, the director of personnel will review the applications and identify the posting/vacancy preferences of the applicants. Decisions for selection of applicants into positions are made, in part, based on the preference of the applicants. If there is more than one applicant in the group for a

position, but only one who identifies the position as his/her first preference, he/she will automatically be recommended for that position. If there is just one applicant for a position, that individual will be recommended for the position.

The application should be designed such that if the applicant is applying for more than one position on the posting, the applicant can identify their preference; however, request an application be submitted for each job requested. If this is not changed, then the personnel staff should make copies of the application when it is received and file a copy of the application with each position, as these applications could go to different principals and faculty senates. This procedure should result in a better organized and more efficient system.

8. Interviews. The personnel director did not interview all applicants (including those new to the county) before recommending applicants for employment. However, a review of Group Posting 2014-004, Position 2, showed that an interview was held for the position of principal, Holden Elementary School.

As per the director, based on past practices of the personnel office, principals have not participated in an interview of applicants. As per W. Va. Code §18A-2-1, principals shall have an opportunity to interview all qualified applicants for his/her school. Faculty senates participating in the hiring process according to West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5000 are also given the opportunity to interview applicants who are candidates for vacant positions in their respective schools. When both the faculty senate hiring committee members and principal participate in the interview process, the interview of applicants is conducted jointly. Although 10 schools voted to participate in the hiring process, there was no evidence that this has happened this year.

Logan County School System must follow West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5000 when faculty senates participate in the hiring process. Otherwise, establish procedures when only principals and/or county office staff interview applicants and follow developed procedures.

Noncompliance with W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b) and West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5000.

1. Effective July 1, 2013, boards of education were to use the new criteria found in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b), and the hiring process of West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5000. However, Logan County School System initially continued to use the old criteria of W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(c), in the selection of classroom teachers. A matrix, although incomplete, with the old criteria was used with various postings. (Group Postings 2014-002: July 12 – July 18, 2013.)

For Example. Group Postings 2014-002: July 12–July 18, 2013: Position #2, Chapmanville Middle School – 5th grade classroom teacher (Math); Position

- #6, Business/Education/Technology 5-8 and Position #20, Logan Grade School, Kindergarten revealed a matrix used to compare qualification of applicants; however, the criteria were the old criteria (2nd set of factors) of W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(c) not the new criteria effective July 1, 2013. The matrix was also incomplete.
2. Assistant Principal Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center. The superintendent transferred the principal of Holden Elementary School into this position. There was no posting file for this position and it was not known if others applied. However, it was reported that employees in the school system applied for this position.
 3. According to the personnel director, the new criteria of W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b) had not been used in the selection of the most qualified candidate for a classroom teacher position when more than one person applies for the same position. Selection for a position, for the most part, has been based on the applicants' preferences for positions. Recommendations made by the personnel director are given to the secretary who types them and forwards them to the superintendent as "Personnel Schedules".

A copy of a matrix with the new qualifications listed in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b) was with the posting of an English position (6th grade) at Chapmanville Middle School (Posting 2014-015 January 9–15, 2014); however, only preferences for the position were listed on the matrix, with the individual listing the position as her first preference and being recommended. For each criterion listed on the matrix, there was a blank space. The posting did not list Elementary Education certification that would meet the certification requirements for the Grade 6 position.

4. Posting #2014-005 - #1 August 8 – August 14, 2013 - Communications/Public Relations Coordinator.

The position was posted "Communications/Public Relations Coordinator – see job description." Qualifications listed on the posting were: 1) Master's Degree in Professional Writing and 2) Use of media in presentations. No required certification for a professional position was listed. Five individuals applied for the posted position. At the end of the posting period, it was found that only one applicant met the specific qualification of the posting by having a "Master's Degree in Professional Writing." (She holds a W. Va. "short-term" substitute teacher permit.) All applicants participated in a "written" interview for the position. According to the personnel director, interview responses (without name of the applicant) were reviewed by all county directors and a recommendation was given to the personnel director. Without a personal interview of the successful applicant, the successful applicant was recommended for employment in the position effective August 26, 2013. This individual was not available to begin work on that date, and the effective date was later changed to September 9, 2013.

An identical position was posted as a vacancy on October 21, 2013, with the qualifications for a “Master’s Degree in Professional Writing” changed to “Prefer Master Degree in a related area of writing” (Reference Posting 2014-011 #1: Communications/Public Relations Coordinator). “Demonstrate success in developing a newsletter and may submit a portfolio at time of bid” were added to the qualifications. The Communications/Public Relations Coordinator was one of three applicants. Interviews were held with the superintendent and assistant superintendents and a matrix was completed to show that the new criteria in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b) were considered to compare qualifications of applicants. The employee was the only applicant with points listed on the matrix with the other two applicants getting zeros in all criteria. The employee was again selected as the most qualified and was transferred by the county board into the posted position on November 18, 2013. The first posting of the position (from which this individual transferred) had not been eliminated or reposted.

A grievance was filed by one of the applicants who, as per the superintendent, requested at Level I that the position be reposted. That request was granted. The earlier employment of the Communications/Public Relations Coordinator position was not rescinded; and the posted position became a “new” position. Grievant was not an applicant for the second posted position. At the time of the January 21-24, 2014 review, the superintendent indicated the grievance was proceeding to Level II.

It would appear that if the county board does not wish to have two Communications/Public Relations Coordinators, it should eliminate, by board action, the first position from which the employee transferred.

5. As per the superintendent, faculty senates and respective schools did not wish to participate in the hiring process as outlined in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5000. However, 10 school faculty senates voted to participate in the hiring process. Faculty senates in those schools (Chapmanville East Elementary, Chapmanville Middle School, Chapmanville Regional High School, Logan Elementary School, Logan High School, Man Elementary, Man Middle School, Man High School, Omar Elementary School, and West Chapmanville Grade School) identified the hiring model they wished to use and provided that information to the personnel director, along with the names of individuals who had received the required training. However, to date, (January 21-24, 2014), this process had not been implemented. The personnel director indicated there have not been situations with more than one applicant for a posted position. It was the understanding of the personnel director when there was only one applicant, that applicant was to be hired. However, that law changed with the new legislation and boards of education can now post a classroom teacher one additional time after the first posting, in order to attract more qualified applicants when fewer than three individuals apply during the first posting. (§18A-4-7a(p)(1)).

As per the principal of Chapmanville Regional High School, they were not given an opportunity to participate in the selection of two recently hired ROTC Instructors. (Group Posting 2014-009 # 1 and 2). The same was true for an elementary school. The reason for the non-participation was because there was only one applicant for the posted positions and the personnel director made the recommendation. The principal said she knew and was pleased with the applicants. However, she stated, when asked, that she would like to interview new teachers to her school before they were hired. She said that she and her faculty senate look forward to participating in the hiring process.

The director of personnel must become knowledgeable of W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a(b) and State Board Policy 5000 and ensure that personnel laws and policies are implemented. Procedures need to be developed as to the process of getting materials of applicants to the school principals if faculty senates are participating in the hiring process. Timelines need to be met and records relevant to filling of the job position need to be maintained.

6. Coaches. Certification requirements for coaches listed on earlier postings included WV Teaching Certification or WVSSAC Certification (Group posting 2014-002); however, this wording had been dropped from recent postings (Group posting 2014-015). Postings reviewed where applicants for coaching position included applicants with professional certification and applicants with coaching authorization (WVSSAC Certification), preference in hiring was given to the individual with professional certification.

Certification requirements will need to be included on the postings. The personnel director will need to check postings before submitting to ensure all required and necessary information is on the posting.

7. Job Descriptions. The bottom of the group postings state, "job description available in the personnel office." With new positions, job descriptions were included with the posting. (Reference posting 2014-005 #1. And Communication/Public Relations Coordinator, and posting 2014-009, #1 and #2. ROTC Instructor and #9. gifted teacher.) As per personnel secretaries job descriptions are attached to postings in the county office and in schools. Job descriptions reviewed for service personnel positions were out-dated. No service personnel job description the Team reviewed (Reference job descriptions for aide, cook, custodian, carpenter, general maintenance) specified "Successful passage of the State Competency Test" for the specific classification as a qualification requirement. However, the application for School Service Position stated the applicant must pass the required competency test.

The personnel office will need to review and update job postings, where needed. If all postings cannot be reviewed and updated immediately, personnel staff will need to review each posting before the position is posted and update it for that specific posting. Continue until all postings are updated. Where required, include in the job description the successful passage of the State Competency Test for the classification. Job descriptions from other counties can be used as examples.

Since the quantity of work seems to be great at this time, once a template or model is developed, work with other departments to assist with updating job descriptions in their areas of assignments, i.e., elementary and/or special education supervisors be able to assist with updating the aide job description.

8. Posting and Filling Service Personnel Positions. For service personnel positions, posting information included the location, position, and the starting and ending time of the daily shift (excluding bus operators). Amount of pay or other benefits were not listed on the posting. The service personnel secretary indicated the period of employment is listed if the position is more than 200 days. (W.Va. Code §18A-4-8b(g)(2)). Qualifications for the position were not listed on the posting.

Following the closing of a posting for a service personnel position, the service personnel secretary places the names of applicants on a form along with their seniority date. The applicants' names are grouped as: 1) Regular employee within classification, 2) preferred recall within classification, 3) regular employee outside classification, 4) preferred recall outside classification, 5) substitute within classification, and 6) substitute outside classification. The county hires service personnel based on qualifications and seniority. They do not appear to consider evaluation of past services. W.Va. Code §18A-4-8b(a).

Temporary positions have been posted and filled for positions of service personnel which are vacant due to an employee being on workers' compensation or an approved leave of absence for more than 30 days.

Personnel staff will need to include on the notice of all job vacancies for service personnel the employment term, starting and ending time of the daily shift, the amount of pay and any benefits (W.Va. Code §18A-4-8b(g)(2)).

The county could review postings from other counties to use as examples. To implement this law, the personnel director needs to request that the technology person for the county work to get all job descriptions online. The posting would then state that the job description for the vacant position is online with directions as how to review.

9. Transfer of Professional Personnel. In compliance with W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(m), the personnel director and superintendent stated that no professional persons were transferred after 20 days prior to the beginning of the instructional program. Although no classroom teachers had been transferred, a review of the Personnel Schedule indicated two administrators had been transferred.

Board Meeting Date	Name	From	To	Effective Date
Nov. 14, 2013	Educator	Assistant Principal Logan Middle	Assistant Principal Logan High	Second Semester
Nov. 14, 2013	Educator	Communication/Public Relations Coordinator	Communication/Public Relations Coordinator	November 18, 2013

When there is a transfer of any professional position, notification of the transfer is to be made to the State Superintendent of Schools with documentation of such notice.

Additional Findings/Comments.

The personnel director transferred from principal, Logan High School, to Assistant Superintendent of Personnel effective July 1, 2013. He had little or no knowledge of W. Va. School Law as it relates to the hiring practices of school personnel. He is assigned to a position that requires knowledge of school law and West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) policies as they relate to school personnel. However, he does not have a W. Va. School Law Book. He stated that he walked into an office with “empty files” with very little to nothing left behind to help in his new assignment. He relied solely on his secretary of service personnel, who had experience working with service personnel, and a former secretary of professional personnel who had transferred to another position in the county office on July 1. Although this secretary was willing to help, when possible, she had no experience working with the new 2013 Legislation or West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5000. It was seemingly determined the best operation of the personnel department was to “Do it the way we have always done it.” The new secretary assigned the responsibility of certification/licensure of teachers and professional personnel formerly worked as a school secretary in an elementary school. She, too, had no experience in her areas of responsibility. Although very cordial, she appeared to be overwhelmed and concerned.

The personnel director and secretary emphasized that they want to learn their respective jobs. However, there was no one in house available to train them. The former personnel director was no longer employed in the county school system. The

only training they received was Bowles Rice training seminars regarding school personnel. They have attended sessions on West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5000 and Reduction in Force (RIF) and Transfers. Both individuals stated they found the training difficult to comprehend as neither had any foundation to build on in personnel. They stated they were “studying” the training manuals received at the training sessions. Both individuals, along with the secretary assigned the responsibility of school service personnel, were personable and accommodated the Education Performance Audit Team.

Recommendations

It is imperative that the personnel director receive training to comply with school personnel laws, as he simply “does not know personnel laws and West Virginia Board of Education personnel policy.” Ideally and immediately, a total training program is needed in the general operation of personnel. This training should be done by a person knowledgeable of school law, experienced in working with school personnel, and recommended highly by someone who works with personnel directors around the State. If an individual cannot come to Logan County to do the training, the personnel director needs to seek out and work with a highly recommended personnel director in another county. Once a relationship is developed, this person needs to act as a mentor to the personnel director. Training received could be shared with the secretary. Continued training in specific areas of personnel as well as training provided by other groups such as WVASA is also recommended.

Likewise, training relevant for a secretary of professional personnel should be provided to the secretary in the same manner. Since the personnel secretary is assigned as the certification coordinator for the county, she needs to participate in all training relevant to certification. Both the personnel director and personnel secretary should schedule a training session with the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Professional Preparation.

The Team found the personnel director accommodating and courteous. He immediately addressed every request made by the Team. Although finding himself in a frustrating situation, his outward attitude was always professional and pleasant. The Team observed that the personnel director was assigned several responsibilities and was available to assist the superintendent in these areas. However, school personnel needs to be a priority in his job assignment, and since its implementation is dictated by law, he must know it and must follow it.

As per the personnel director and Logan County Superintendent of Schools, there were no files (other than posting files in the secretary’s office or stored on stage) in the personnel office when the personnel director took over the job the second week in July. File hangers were in the file cabinets, but all contents of the files were gone. The secretary did obtain the posting file for the assistant superintendent of personnel which had been stored “on stage” with last year’s postings (postings prior to July 1, 2013). If

personnel files are missing, the county superintendent will need to report this to the appropriate legal authorities for investigation.

Subsequent to the Education Performance Audit, the OEPA interviewed the former personnel director and secretary, who both stated personnel files were retained in locked cabinets and inactive personnel files were stored on the stage.

**8.5. PERSONNEL
(Second Education Performance Audit April 21 - 25, 2014)**

7.6.1 Hiring. WV Code. (W. Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and §18-2E-3a.

1. Posting Sites. Since the first Education Performance Audit in January 2014, no changes had been identified in the posting sites. Vacancies filled with long-term substitute teachers continued to be posted periodically with the last posting date of March 12 through March 18, 2014. Vacancies were posted in the county office, all worksites, and the Logan County Board of Education Website. One new professional position (elementary counselor) was posted during the period of the April 2014 on-site review. The vacant position was not placed on West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) K-12 Jobs Bank; although, not required, such postings would widen the pool of candidates for the counselor's position..

All postings professional vacancies filled with long-term substitute teachers are required to be posted continuously. The ending date of the posting could state, "until filled." Posted positions can be removed from the posting as filled. Due to the high number (currently 34) of vacancies being filled with long-term substitute teachers, the Team recommended the county post all professional positions on the West Virginia Department of Education K-12 Jobs Bank to attract more candidates.

2. Posting and Collection of Application Format. The Logan County School System has worked to make some changes in the posting format and organization of applicants' applications posted positions. Posted professional positions list: Position Number, Location, Position, Certification, Specialized Skills and Training, Employment Term, and Pay Scale. As per the personnel director, the "specialized skills and training" would be listed only if required by the position (W.Va. Code 18A-4-7a(p)(C)). Job applications and relevant information for a specific posting were being filed in separate files identified by the posting and position number.

If special criteria or skills are required for the posted position, the heading/wording for that category of the posting form should be changed from "Specialized Skills and Training" to "Special Criteria or Skills" as described in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a(p)(C). Since applicants do not always review job descriptions where this information is to be listed, if required, it would be prudent, as Logan County has done, to put the information on the posting along with the required certification.

3. Implementing WVBE Policy 5000. To implement WVBE Policy 5000, the personnel director screened applications, interviewed the applicants, completed a matrix evaluating the candidates on the first nine qualifications criteria of W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a, and placed the matrix form in the posting file. His office notified principals and made the file for the position available to the principal. Since the OEPA January 2014 on-site, only one position has been filled by a school (Chapmanville Regional High School) whose faculty senate participated in the

hiring process. Upon receiving the applications and relevant materials, a memorandum signed by the principal and faculty senate committee chair was subsequently sent to the director of personnel recommending an applicant. In reviewing three other postings, only one principal, Logan Middle School, currently used Appendix A of WVBE Policy 5000 to make her recommendation. One principal (East Chapmanville) sent an approval in a memorandum in which he did not sign. The principal of Buffalo Elementary School requested that the vacant position be reposted to attract more qualified applicants.

There is no requirement in State Code that personnel directors interview all applicants and complete a matrix prior to presenting the applicants' materials to the principals and faculty senates. To do so could give the appearance that the county office is giving preference to or interfering with the faculty senate and principal's authority to make recommendations as determined by their comparison of the applicants' qualifications. The Team recommended that the director of personnel collect applications for the posted positions, screen applications, and identify those applicants who meet the standards of the posting then submit those names to the principal. It should be determined and implemented as to how the principal and faculty senate receive the applicant applications and materials. The principal will subsequently be responsible for implementing the hiring process in his/her school as outlined in WVBE Policy 5000. Once the principal and faculty senate complete their component of the hiring process, the principal will return all applicant materials to the director of personnel along with the separate recommendations using only the forms from Appendix A and B of WVBE Policy 5000. These signed forms validate that the criteria found in W.Va. Code §18A-4-7a were used to consider applicants. Required timelines are to be met. Where the principal and faculty senate recommend the same candidate, and if the superintendent concurs, the recommendation for hiring will be made to the board. However, before the superintendent concurs with the principal and the faculty senate recommendation (where appropriate), she may determine, especially if the recommended applicant is new to the county, that the personnel director and/or designee (for example, secondary director for high school position; special education director for special education position) interview the applicants, check references, etc. This process should be determined at the county level so that it can be implemented consistently and effectively.

In the screening process of applicants' applications, those who do not meet the standards of the posting should not be considered. The personnel director should determine if the faculty senate has developed a policy permitting the superintendent or his/her designee to narrow the pool of qualified applicants to no fewer than three qualified applicants. If there are less than three certified applicants and none is recommended for hiring or if there are no certified applicants, a second posting is recommended. The posting could include considering applicants who are eligible for a permit license or out-of-field authorization.

4. Post Positions. Posting 2014-002 (July 12-18, 2013) Position #32. The individual who transferred from Principal, Holden Elementary School to Assistant Principal, Ralph E. Willis Technical Center, at the beginning of the 2013-2014 school term retired effective March 20, 2014. As of April 25, 2014, the vacancy has been filled with a substitute and has not been posted. W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a. stipulates at least one notice shall be posted within twenty working days of the position opening.

Posting 2014-005 #1 (August 8-14, 2013). This position was posted for a Communications/Public Relations Coordinator. The position was filled by an individual on September 9, 2013. On October 21, 2013, a second position for a Communications/Public Relations Coordinator was posted. The individual employed earlier was transferred by board action into the position on November 18, 2013. The first position was not eliminated and is, therefore, considered vacant. It, too, had not been posted.

Unless eliminated, post the assistant principal position at Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center and the position of Communications/Public Relations Coordinator.

5. Certification. The personnel secretary, who is in the first year in her assignment, relied on copies of past postings and the former personnel secretary to advise her as to what certification to use for vacant positions. The secretary had a copy of WVBE Policy 5202, which she referenced. However, she had not been informed of the WVDE Course Codes which are available online. Certifications required for posted positions are listed on postings. A review of Posting 2014-019 was a reposting of 26 positions filled with long-term substitutes. The posting was dated March 12 through March 18, 2014. As with the initial posting which was reviewed during the January 2014 on-site visit, there were errors in certification requirements. For example: Programmatic Levels were listed; however, some were in error. Certification for preschool was posted PK-K. Preschool can also be taught with PK certification, which is held by individuals with a Master's Degree in PK only. Certification for 7th and 8th grade middle school positions included MS K-8 (Multi-subjects K-8), which was in error. Certification for middle school grades 7 and 8 must be content specific listing the education specialization along with the programmatic level. Two science positions were posted for Logan High School. One certification option listed was 5-9. A person hired with this certification grade level could teach only 9th grade science, which may or may not meet the needs of the high school (The secretary did not know the specific assignment of the position).

The secretary responsible for all certification of professional personnel and for posting vacant positions must have some training from the WVDE, Office of Professional Preparation, or another individual well-trained and knowledgeable in teacher certification. The director of personnel states that he is knowledgeable of certification course codes. Therefore, he must review all postings before they are posted to ensure that correct certification specializations and programmatic levels

are listed. Additionally, the WVDE, Office of Professional Preparation, asks counties to assist teachers with their certification renewals.

6. Long Term Substitutes. A review of the personnel files showed the county has 34 long-term substitutes working on waivers granted by the State Superintendent of Schools. (WVBE Policy 5202 §126-136-14-14.1). Only one long-term position has been filled with a certified teacher this year (English Teacher, Chapmanville Regional High School).

The county must work to recruit (attract and obtain) certified teachers. The county sent recruiters to recruitment day events held at Marshall University (director of secondary and curriculum programs) and West Virginia State University (superintendent, and Communications/Public Relations Coordinator). Although the county recruiters passed out novelties such as pens with Logan County Schools written on them and note cards, they did not have attractive brochures and/or other materials such as salary schedules and employee benefits of Logan County Schools to attract prospective teachers' interest. The county has a full-time Communications/Public Relations Coordinator who could develop brochures and materials to be placed in a hiring packet to give to prospective teacher applicants at teacher recruitment fairs or during an interview for a vacant position. The materials could contain pictures of the schools with specific information such as programmatic levels, enrollment, specific academic events, etc. Information such as total scholarship amounts offered at each high school; highlights of the arts and athletic teams; brochures of noted community events; map of Logan County showing schools' distance from Charleston or Huntington; salary schedule, employee benefits, school calendar, etc. The Communications/Public Relations Coordinator could obtain ideas for materials from other counties who actively recruit and participate in teacher recruitment fairs.

7. Employment Applications. The employment application was not reviewed or addressed in the January 2014 on-site review. However, the Team found that the employment application for the school system was outdated and void of requesting crucial information such as whether the applicant "has ever been dismissed or asked to resign from a position and "Have you ever been convicted of a felony or misdemeanor?"

The personnel director is advised to look online at employment applications from other counties and revise Logan County's current application (both professional and service). For example, a review of the employment application for Jefferson County Schools lists the following: "Have you ever been dismissed or asked to resign from a position. Yes _____ No _____. If yes, provide full explanation." "Have you ever been convicted of a felony or misdemeanor? Yes _____ No _____. If yes, provide a full explanation."

8. Job Application. The job application had been updated since the January 2014 on-site visit. The personnel director looked at job applications from other counties and

created a new Professional Vacancy Request Form. However, there was some confusion in its development, and there was no place on the application for the applicant's certification. Instead of asking for the applicant's certification, the form provides a place for the applicant to list the certification required for the position (as listed on the job posting). There was no information as to whom to submit the application. The omission of the applicant's certification on the job application form should be corrected immediately as there is no way to determine if the applicant meets the standards of the posting (is certified). Also, add information as to whom to submit the application.

9. Interviews. The director of personnel stated school principals in Logan County have not traditionally interviewed applicants for vacancies in their respective schools. Since the January 2014 on-site review, only one school faculty senate (Chapmanville Regional High School) in the county has had an opportunity to participate in hiring a teacher. The decision for recommendation of the teacher was made on a review of the applicant's application. Although the person was new to the county, the principal and faculty senate did not participate in an interview of the applicant. Other principals, where vacancies and postings have occurred, have been given the opportunity to interview applicants. The personnel director did not know if those principals had interviewed candidates for their respective positions.

The selection of teachers is one of the most important task of principals. Training should be provided to principals in interviewing techniques, including sharing with the applicants the philosophy, goals, and expectations of the school, as well as how to present Logan County Schools in a positive, enthusiastic manner especially to those candidates new to the area.

New Findings May 2014

1. No Law Book. Upon returning to Logan County for a second audit (May 2014), the Team found that the personnel director had not obtained a law book and was still unfamiliar with school personnel law outside of what he had heard and retained from the Bowles Rice Training Sessions. The personnel director often seemed amazed that many topics discussed during the Team's visit were addressed in law.

The personnel director must obtain a W. Va. School Law book immediately. He must also take the initiative to study the law book for content areas and refer to it in his decision making. Decisions made regarding personnel should be based on school law. Although the majority of personnel law is contained in Article §18A, additional school law outside Article §18A, such as the hiring of personnel for Summer School Programs, found in W.Va. Code §18-5-39, include personnel legalities. Without the implementation of this corrective action, Logan County School System may fail to comply in hiring and other related personnel functions.

2. Failure to review job application. An applicant new to the county, applied for a posted math position. Upon receiving the application in the personnel office, the

personnel director, without review, called the principal with the name and telephone number of the applicant. The principal, subsequently, talked with the applicant by phone and recommended the applicant for employment. A red flag would have been evident as a result of the applicant's answer to a question on the application had the job application been reviewed by either the personnel director or the principal. A question on the application reads, "Why do you want to leave your present job?" The applicant's response, "Investigation which had no findings." The applicant was hired July 11, 2013, effective August 15, 2013.

It was later found that an investigation was on-going. The superintendent rescinded the applicant's employment; however, the applicant filed a grievance to retain employment. The grievance was granted (Level 2 mediation) along with 33 days of back pay.

The county can resolve these issues by revising the employment application to ensure questions are on the application, which if answered accurately, would indicate a possible problem or concern (See #6 Employment Applications above). Before considering any applicant "new" to the county, the personnel director or designee should be required to review the employment application. Where "red flags" surface, the personnel director or designee must investigate the situation prior to making a recommendation to the board for employment approval.

3. **Workers' Compensation.** The transportation director was assigned as the county individual in charge of Workers' Compensation (WC). He receives all employee accident reports and handles the administration component of workers' compensation cases. He monitors the employee's days absent from work and, when a service employee is to be absent for 30 or more work days and as per W.Va. Code §18A-4-15, notifies the personnel office to post the position (temporary) until the return of the regular employee. One such position did not follow this process. A bus operator (was approved at a board meeting held July 11, 2013, for retirement effective August 31, 2013. On August 20, the bus operator was injured (fell down bus steps). This was a workers' compensation injury. Subsequently, the bus operator requested the board rescind her retirement. The board rescinded her retirement at its September 26, 2013, meeting with the following approval status: "You will retain the classification of bus operator due to an injury but you do not hold a position with Logan County Board of Education". Therefore, with the language of the board's approval, her bus assigned position was filled as a regular vacant position. As per the personnel office, the status of the employee is "off on workers' compensation with no plan to return".

If there is no vacancy when the bus operator on workers' compensation is released to return to work, the board will have to create a position, post the position, and let the employee apply until the employee receives a position. It appeared that this action was only to provide current and future monetary rewards for the employee as county benefits will continue as long as the individual is a regular employee of

the board. This approval was not required in law and it appears that the board has set a precedent.

4. **Suspension of Employee.** At the February 13, 2014, Logan County Board of Education meeting, a bus operator was suspended for 10 days without pay, effective January 29, 2014, through February 11, 2014. According to the personnel office, the employee was not permitted to return to work; however, there was no record of an extended suspension approved by the board. Subsequently, the superintendent recommended at the March 13, 2014, board meeting that the employee be terminated effective February 20, 2014. The board member making the motion to approve the personnel schedule struck the recommendation item. At the March 27, 2014, meeting of the board, the superintendent recommended to suspend the employee without pay pending further investigation, effective March 19, 2014. The board struck this recommendation item from the agenda. At the April 10, 2014, board meeting, the superintendent recommended a PAID LEAVE for the employee pending the results of ongoing evaluations, effective February 27, 2014 – pursuant to State Board Policy 4336, Section 18.2. It appeared that the employee was off work from February 12, 2014 to February 27, 2014, with no approved action of the board.

W. Va. Code §18A-2-7(c), provides that the superintendent can suspend school personnel pending a hearing upon charges filed by the superintendent with the county board and the period of suspension may not exceed 30 days unless extended by order of the board. Much transaction took place between the superintendent and the board with recommendations being made by the superintendent for various actions which were not acted on by the board (struck from the recommendation item). However, once a recommendation was made at the April 10, 2014, board meeting to place the bus operator on a paid leave, it should have extended the leave from February 12, not February 27, or prior to approving the paid leave, extended her suspension from February 12 to February 27, 2014.

5. **Leave of Absence.** Leave of absence is addressed in Logan County Board of Education Policy VI.2.3. Reasons for granting Leave of Absence include: Illness, education, pregnancy and/or child care, military, employment with another governmental agency. There are exceptions for leave without pay to serve on appointed boards or committees with other states or county governmental agencies, which may be granted by the superintendent or designee and does not require board approval. The policy does not provide for a “paid leave” without reason. It appears that in the case of a bus operator, the superintendent and board did not follow the board’s policy regarding a Leave of Absence.

As per payroll records, a second employee had been off work due to illness since March 6, 2014; however, had not requested nor been approved for a medical leave of absence. The employee did not belong to the sick leave bank and returned to employment May 9, 2013.

The superintendent and board must follow its board's policies.

6. **School Administrators.** Each elementary school had a full-time principal and half-time assistant principals employed at four elementary schools: East Chapmanville (340), West Chapmanville School (416), Logan Elementary School (371), and Man Elementary School (240). Buffalo Elementary School has 253 students with no board approved and assigned assistant principal. The superintendent reassigned the assistant principal of Logan Elementary School and Man Elementary School to serve the third school. She currently works three days a week at Logan Elementary, one day a week at Man Elementary School, and one day a week at Buffalo Elementary School. The personnel director was not aware of this assignment that took place effective August 19, 2013. However, the assignment was confirmed when he called the principal of Buffalo Elementary School during the on-site visit. W. Va. Code 18A-2-9 states, "Upon the recommendation of the superintendent, the county board of education shall, when needed, employ and assign, through written contract, assistant principals." There was no record that the assistant principal was reassigned by the Logan County Board of Education. The board did not follow W. Va. Code §18A-2-7 and; although West Virginia Board of Education Policy §5000 provides for reassignment of surplus personnel without posting based on pupil-teacher ratio and class size rules, this applies to teachers and aides and any reassignment must be approved by the board. There was no record that W. Va. Code §18A-2-7 was followed this year for the next school year (2014-2015). However, it appeared since Buffalo Elementary School has greater enrollment than Man Elementary School, it is the intent of the superintendent for the assistant principal to remain at Buffalo next year. This is a violation of personnel procedures.
7. **Corrections/Housekeeping Contracts.** The personnel director has found mistakes or omissions made in personnel that he was attempting to correct. Many of these were made before he became director of personnel going back five years or more. Where possible, these were being corrected under the title "Corrections" or "Housekeeping Contracts" on the Personnel Schedule. Some errors had been made since he started in his assignment on July 1, 2013. Some errors would have been caught had there been some safety net or cross checking of work from other departments, i.e., assuring all personnel are on the certified list, hiring all probationary personnel not to be placed on a reduction-in-force (RIF) before April 15, making sure jobs are posted and filled prior to the date employees are to begin their assignments (baseball coaches), etc.

The personnel director must be cognizant of personnel timelines and act within the timelines. Also, once an error is discovered, he will need to determine what changes can be made within the department to avoid the same or similar mistake/error in the future.

A return on-site visit in April 2014, found the personnel office had made an effort to improve. They had reorganized how they collected and grouped applications for posted positions, revised their job application, and were working to develop a procedure for hiring personnel. Although, the Team noted some small improvements, problems continued within the personnel department due to a lack of total understanding of what they were doing. There were also problems outside the efforts they had made. All of the problems appeared to stem from no direct training from an individual knowledgeable of personnel law and attempting to operate the personnel department without having a W. Va. School Law book for reference. Not having a Law Book three months after the Team's original visit seemed inexcusable.

The personnel director needs training in personnel and school law. It appeared that no other person in the county office was knowledgeable of school law. There was no safety net other than the county's lawyer, who was said to be a first-year law graduate and also learning school law. The county could provide needed training to the personnel office staff by contracting with an individual knowledgeable of personnel. This could be a retired individual or someone from a neighboring county who might agree to give a few days to Logan County Schools on site or the personnel director go to their county for training. This person could also act as a mentor that the personnel director could contact by phone or e-mail for assistance. Additionally, the secretary of professional personnel must have some training in her responsibilities in the hiring process and specifically certification. Certification training could be provided by the WVDE, Office of Professional Preparation.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team found numerous violations of (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2 and West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5202 observed through a detailed review of the certified list, WVEIS Master Course Schedule, and the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) Certification Database. The following summary details the number of educators by school who did not have the appropriate licensure for their assignment.

The Team also examined educators authorized to teach by West Virginia Code and State Board policy but did not meet the highly qualified federal definition. This information may connect to other issues in this report affecting student achievement.

Chapmanville East End Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Chapmanville Regional High School	- Seven teachers.
Holden Central Elementary School	- One teacher.
Hugh Dingess Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Justice Elementary School	- One teacher.
Logan Middle School	- Five teachers.
Logan Senior High School	- Ten teachers.
South Man Elementary School	- One teacher.
Verdunville Elementary School	- One teacher.
Chapmanville Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Man High School	- Nine Teachers.

The Coaches' Database revealed the following findings.

1. Chapmanville Middle School – Certification had expired for five coaches (Baseball Head Coach, Cheerleading Head Coach, Cheerleading Coach, and Basketball Coach/Football Coach).
2. Logan Senior High School – Certification had expired for one coach. (Football Coach/Track-Boys Head Coach).

During the review of educators to determine if teachers were properly credentialed for their assignments, the Team reported that the following schools had teachers who held the appropriate credentials to teach, but did not meet the definition for highly qualified.

Buffalo Elementary School	- Six teachers.
Chapmanville East End Elementary School	- Four teachers.
Chapmanville Middle School	- Nine teachers.
Chapmanville Regional High School	- Thirteen teachers.
Holden Central Elementary School	- Three teachers.

Hugh Dingess Elementary School	- Five teachers.
Justice Elementary School	- One teacher.
Logan Elementary School	- Eight teachers.
Logan Middle School	- Fourteen teachers.
Logan Senior High School	- Fifteen teachers.
Man Elementary School	- Six teachers.
Omar Elementary School	- One teacher.
South Man Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Verdunville Elementary School	- Four teachers.
West Chapmanville Elementary School	- Four teachers.
Man Middle School	- Four teachers.
Man High School	- Nine Teachers.

The Team also identified educators teaching with permits at the following schools.

Buffalo Elementary School	- Eight teachers
Chapmanville East End Elementary School	- Four teachers.
Chapmanville Middle School	- Ten teachers.
Chapmanville Regional High School	- Five teachers.
Holden Central Elementary School	- Three teachers.
Hugh Dingess Elementary School	- Four teachers.
Justice Elementary School	- Three teachers.
Logan Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Logan Middle School	- Nine teachers.
Logan Senior High School	- Eight teachers.
South Man Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Verdunville Elementary School	- Two teachers.
West Chapmanville Elementary School	- Two teachers.
Man Middle School	- Three teachers.
Man High School	- Four Teachers.

Note: Some educators may appear on both the Highly Qualified and Permit reports and are duplicates for both licensure areas.

The licensure issues were too extensive (154 pages) to include in this document and a summary has been developed to streamline reporting. The WVDE, Office of Professional Preparation, is working with the Logan County School System on these issues. Due to the magnitude of this report, the personnel office and schools will need extensive assistance to the personnel office and schools within Logan County.

7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

The Team reviewed new teacher hire logs for 2007-2008, 2008-2009, and 2009-2010 to determine the 0-3 years experience for required observations/evaluations, and compiled an alphabetical listing of personnel and matched the list with current personnel files.

The Team also reviewed personnel evaluations for professional personnel with 4-5 years experience, other professional personnel, support personnel, service personnel, coaches, etc., to determine that the evaluation process was conducted according to W.Va. Code §18A-2-12, West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310, and county policy.

Completed observation forms from which the evaluations are derived were not available as they are kept in the schools. Observation forms used for evaluations needed to be attached to the completed evaluations as they are an integral part of the evaluation and need to be filed in the individuals' personnel files.

Teachers

Teacher evaluations were reviewed at the individual schools. Individual School Education Performance Audit Teams reported principals and teachers lacked a clear understanding of the evaluation system.

A random review of 14 professional support personnel evaluations disclosed the following:

1. One athletic trainer (Man High School) had been evaluated in 2012-2013, but had not been evaluated using the proper form or procedures used to evaluate athletic trainers.
2. One school nurse (Chapmanville Middle School) was last evaluated in 2006. This did not meet the requirement of West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5310 which requires professional support personnel with more than five (5) years of experience be evaluated every three years.
3. One speech/language therapist (West Chapmanville Elementary School) was last evaluated in 2002. This did not meet the requirement of WVBE Policy 5310 which requires professional support personnel with more than five (5) years of experience be evaluated every three years.
4. One speech/language therapist (Special Education Office) has been employed 6+ years and no evaluation was in the personnel file.

5. One speech/language therapist (Buffalo Elementary School) in her first year of employment in 2012-2013 was evaluated, but the evaluation instrument used was the "Teacher Evaluation Form".
6. One school nurse (Man Middle School) has 6+ years of service as a nurse and no evaluation as a nurse. This did not meet the requirement of WVBOE Policy 5310, which requires professional support personnel be evaluated at least once every three years.
7. One speech therapist (Logan Elementary School) was last evaluated in 2006. This did not meet the requirement of WVBE Policy 5310 which, requires professional support personnel be evaluated at least one every three years.

Supervisors who supervise professional support personnel need additional training in proper procedures to use when evaluating professional support personnel.

Central Office Administrators

A random review of central office administrator evaluation files disclosed the following:

1. All school administrator evaluation files reviewed contained evaluations for the 2012-2013 year.
2. The Team reviewed a sampling of central office administrators' established goals for the 2013-2014 year and found goals in place for all administrators reviewed.
3. Interviews with a sampling of school administrators revealed some misunderstanding of Policy 5310 which states, ". . . the professional support /central office person and the supervisor will meet at least once annually to review progress toward meeting the established goals." In addition, the supervisor will schedule an evaluation conference with the central office person. The meeting to review progress toward meeting established goals needed to become more formal and better documented.

Principals

The Team reviewed the electronic evaluations for School Leaders (Principals) with the following results:

1. All school leaders had implemented their evaluations and were meeting the requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.
2. The new evaluation system for principals was underway and goals were established in October 2013. Principals were collecting information and materials for the summative evaluation in June 2014.

Coaches

The Team reviewed the evaluation files of sixteen (16) randomly selected coaches from all the schools that have sports programs.

1. All coaches in the random sample had received evaluations during the 2012-2013 year.
2. The required observations were not in the evaluation files, as they were being kept in the schools. Observations are an integral part of the evaluations and should be kept with the evaluations in the personnel files. The Team could not determine at the county office that coaches were evaluated during the 2013-2014 years.

Service Personnel

The county was not able to produce a Logan County Board of Education Service Personnel Evaluation Policy which is required by WVBE Policy 5314. The school administrators were following a practice that has been followed in past years to evaluate service personnel. This explanation was given to the Team by the personnel director when asked how principals and other administrators knew what procedures to use when evaluating service personnel.

The Team reviewed 87 evaluation files for service personnel.

1. Fourteen of the 15 evaluation files for cooks met all requirements.
2. One cook's (Man High School) evaluation was not signed by the employee.
3. All evaluation files reviewed for custodians met the requirements.
4. One custodian evaluation (Chapmanville Middle School) had two areas marked "Does Not Meet Standards", but there was no evidence the employee was placed on an improvement plan.
5. Eighteen of the 20 evaluation files of aides reviewed met all requirements.
6. The evaluation for one teacher aide (East Chapmanville Elementary School) was not signed and dated by the evaluator.
7. One teacher aide (Chapmanville Middle School) was last evaluated June 8, 2011. This did not meet the requirements of the Logan County Board of Education practices which require all service personnel to be evaluated annually.
8. The Team reviewed the evaluations for two Directors/Coordinators of Service and found one of the evaluations dated only with the month and year. The evaluation date should contain the month, day, and year.
9. The Team reviewed the evaluation files of 15 secretaries. Four secretaries (Chapmanville High School, Logan Middle School, Holden Elementary School, and the County Office) had no evaluations for the 2012-2013 year.
10. One maintenance worker had an evaluation dated July 26, 2013, but had no evaluation for the 2012-2013 year.
11. The supervisor of transportation had an evaluation dated July 5, 2013, but had no evaluation for the 2012-2013 year.
12. The Team reviewed the evaluation files of 11 bus operators and the evaluations met all requirements of past practices.

7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)

Findings.

The county had developed a Support for Improving Professional Practices plan, (WVSIPP) which had been approved by the West Virginia Department of Education. Persons responsible for the development and implementation of the plan were not aware that W. Va. Code §18A-3-2b, Beginning teacher internships and State Board Policy §5900, had been repealed. The WVSIPP plan was patterned after the formerly required beginning teacher internship program and includes mentors for all beginning teachers. Mentors work closely with new teachers and document weekly teacher/mentor observations, monthly support team meetings, as well as professional development meetings/training program attended by both the new teacher and mentor. The beginning teacher has an opportunity to complete an end-of-the-year survey of the Beginning Teacher program. Beginning teachers who successfully complete the program receive a Certification of Completion and are recommended for Full Professional Status.

The plan for improving professional practices was rich in high quality staff development designed to support and improve professional practice of both new and experienced teachers. Training last year was provided by Chelonda Seroyer who works for Harry Wong. A total of 80 new teachers attended the training. Two and ½ days of training with Ms. Seroyer were provided throughout the school year. Priority has also been given to training of the Common Core Standards. All training is also open to teachers working in long-term assignments and to student teachers. Funding for the training is provided with Title I and Title II funds.

The county employed academic coaches to work with beginning teachers. Teachers in the Transition to Teaching program have additional support from “coaches” at the State level.

The beginning principal internship program was implemented according to W. Va. Code §18A-3-2d. The personnel director indicated three new principals had not been assigned mentors as no mentors were available.

The county has 35 teachers and two principals in the internship programs. Mentors for the beginning teachers/principals are paid \$600 for a full year. Several individuals are mentors to two to four teachers.

The WVSIPP plan includes beginning teachers, but was developed at the county level and approved by the West Virginia Department of Education. With up to four individuals assigned as mentors to up to four teachers, it is evident that the county is unable to provide a mentor on a 1 to 1 mentor/teacher ratio. As a result, it would appear to be difficult for mentors to carry out the responsibilities outlined in the former rescinded law and State Board Policy 5900, which appeared to be the model the county was following. Counties can continue to have mentors for beginning teachers in the support for improving professional practice plan, but Logan County will need to evaluate its mentor program and design a program that can be carried out successfully. Changes in the plan should be resubmitted to the WVDE for approval. W. Va. Code §18A3-2d and WVBE Policy 5899 regarding new principal internship are still in law and must be followed.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

Findings

1. Individual School Education Performance Audit Teams reported five schools did not have a uniform set of rules and expectations for student behavior. The staffs in general expressed the need for a schoolwide, positive behavior support plan.
2. The Education Performance Audit Teams reviewing facilities, noted two middle schools had safety issues with areas of the building unlocked and easily accessible to students.
3. The Team observed evidence of tobacco use in two high schools.

7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

W.Va. Code §18A-1-12a (17) states, "All official and enforceable personnel policies of a county board must be written and made available to its employees."

Findings

1. The county uses Neola for county policy development; however, all policies in the county policy manual lacked the date which each policy was approved by the local board of education. With the lack of adopted dates, the Team was unable to determine if policies were up-to-date.
2. The county was not able to produce a Logan County Board of Education Service Personnel Evaluation Policy which is required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5314. The county reported that staff followed "past practices" in evaluating service personnel.
3. The county was not able to produce a written program of studies and stated they follow Policy 2510 in delivering the program of studies.

4. The county did not follow Logan County Board of Education Policy V1.2.3. regarding granting a leave of absence for one employee.
5. No county office employee interviewed was aware of an Employee Handbook or recalled being trained on the Employee Code of Conduct.
6. No procedure or policy was found on the operation of county vehicles.

7.8. LEADERSHIP.

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

W.Va. Code §18A-2-12a (1) provides “The effective and efficient operation of the public schools depends upon the development of harmonious and cooperative relationships between county boards and school personnel.”

Findings

The Team interviewed all five members of the Logan County Board of Education and the Logan County Superintendent of Schools. The Team also reviewed agendas and minutes of county board meetings from July 19, 2012, through April 10, 2014. The following findings verified that the Logan County Board of Education was not operating according to statutory requirements and West Virginia Board of Education policies. Board minutes and board member and county staff interviews showed that the county school system board operations were dysfunctional and board meetings were unproductive and resulted in the inconsistent following of State Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies.

Superintendent of Logan County Schools

1. Organizational Framework. A central office organizational chart had not been fully developed or widely distributed. During both the January 2014 and April 2014 Education Performance Audits, the Team was given an organizational chart with central office staff names inserted with a pencil. One OEPA Team member was given an organizational chart by a central office employee dated 2008-2009. All curriculum central office staff had difficulty identifying the specific roles and responsibilities of other central office staff. For example, the Director of Elementary Education did not have any job duties assigned in elementary education; and the Director of Title I and Pre-K seemed to have all elementary education duties. The Team saw no evidence that job duties for senior curriculum staff were well developed or explained.

Overall, central office personnel were not operating as a team, communication was limited, important information was not shared/reviewed to drive decision making as a whole team.

No county organization flow chart was found. Sometimes job descriptions did not match to whom county office staff reported. Interviews indicated that budgets were developed in an insular programmatic fashion as opposed to involving a team

approach. No one was able to speak to another curriculum director's budget or why it was developed and how budgets were aligned to meet the county's academic needs.

2. Organization and Management. The Logan County School System organization system was top down. Collaboration and communication was minimal, and the system breakdown was evident in all central office departments.
3. Strategic Planning. Logan County's Five-Year Strategic Plan was not submitted to the Logan County Board of Education until February 27, 2014. The board of education did not have input in developing the plan.
4. A list was provided of county vehicles and names of employee's assigned vehicles. Vehicles were assigned to maintenance, technology, transportation, warehouse, food service, assistant superintendents and the superintendent. Most of the vehicles were marked as to being driven home. However, no procedure or county policy was found regarding vehicle use. It was found that the superintendent used the county car for out-of-state personal travel. This practice was contrary to the superintendent's contract which specifies the county vehicle is to be used for travel involving work.
5. A school bus was red tagged by a bus inspector and declared surplus by the county board; however, over \$4000 expended in bus parts and two transportation mechanics worked two days to repair the bus. This bus was donated to Duty International Ministries. It was reported additional body work was performed on this same bus. However, the Team has been unable to verify the body work.
6. Personnel.
 - The superintendent recommended and the county board transferred a principal of Holden Elementary School to Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center – Assistant Principal in which the employee did not bid on the position.
 - Communications/Public Relations Coordinator. During executive session (August 16, 2013) Logan County Board of Education meeting the Superintendent called one applicant as directed by a board member and offered the applicant another job. (Confirmed by three board members). Another applicant was employed, employee called, filed grievance, and an identical position was posted. The employee was again selected and was transferred by the county board. The first position had not been eliminated or reposted.
 - Workers' Compensation procedure on a bus driver had not been followed; thereby, resulting in additional expenses to the Logan County School System.

Logan County Board of Education

Board Meetings

1. **Executive Session.** The Logan County Board of Education (LCBE) held 29 meetings from July 1, 2013 to April 10, 2014. Executive sessions were held in 19 of the 29 meetings. W.Va. Code §6-9A-4. Exceptions was invoked for executive sessions. Minutes of the Logan County Board of Education listed Facilities and Personnel as the purpose of most executive sessions.

- July 1, 2013 – Special Meeting – Swearing in superintendent – Executive session for Facilities and Personnel. 30 minutes open and 30 minutes closed.

- July 11, 2013 – Executive Session for Employee Issues. 35 minutes open and 2 hours 15 minutes closed. Action employ Partain Law Office as legal counsel.

- August 1, 2013 – Special Meetings – Purpose – discussion and possible actions of the following items: levy election, facilities, test scores, and personnel. 17 minutes open and 2 hours 58 minutes closed. Personnel was the only action item listed on the meetings minutes. Nothing was noted regarding levy election, facilities, or test scores.

- August 16, 2013 – Special Meeting. Purpose - Hire personnel for 2013-2014. Executive session for Facilities and Personnel. 15 minutes open and one hour 55 minutes closed.

- October 24, 2013 – Executive Session for Facilities and Personnel. 14 minutes open and 46 minutes closed.

- November 4, 2013 – Executive Session for Facilities and Personnel. 7 minutes open and 3 hours 3 minutes closed.

- December 23, 2014 – Special Meeting – Purpose - To address items that would have been scheduled Thursday, November 28, Thanksgiving. Executive Session for Facilities and Student Expulsion. 13 minutes open and 2 hours 30 minutes closed.

- March 10, 2014 – Special Meeting – Purpose – Review OEPA audit review. Executive Session for Employee Issues. 9 minutes open and one hour 10 minutes closed.

Examples of the purpose and length of time the Logan County Board of Education spends in executive session do not fully meet the intent of West Virginia Codes §6-9A-3. Proceedings to be open; public notice of meetings and §6-9A-4. Exceptions. Nor did the Logan County Board of Education cite the particular subsection of §6-9A-4 in holding executive sessions.

Some Logan County board members stated that topics were discussed in executive sessions that should not have been discussed.

2. **Strategic Planning.** Members of the Logan County Board of Education were not involved in developing the Logan County Five-Year Strategic Plan and establishing a vision and goals for the county.

February 27, 2014, board of education minutes stated “. . . updated the Board on the progress of the Logan County Strategic Plan.”

3. **Personnel.** Members of the Logan County Board of Education were directly involved in requesting the county superintendent contact an employee at the August 16, 2013 board meeting. According to four board members, a board member requested the Superintendent locate and call the employee during executive session to offer her a position regarding a particular posting. Board member and the county superintendent responses were inconsistent regarding the board member directing the phone call. However, four board members interviewed and asked this question and the county superintendent all reported that a telephone call was made during executive session to this employee. Three board members indicated the employee was offered another position and the superintendent said she was directed to call the employee and explain that she was not qualified for the position.

Text messages and audio between superintendent and candidate were reported. Four of the board members said they had heard about texts during this meeting, but did not actually see the texts. The county superintendent stated that the employee had used [superintendent] cell phone to text her [employee's] husband about the job.

Personnel Files. The county superintendent, personnel director, and one board member stated personnel files were “empty” or missing, and grievance files were taken by the former attorney/personnel director. The OEPA contacted this individual who stated she told board members before her departure from Logan County Schools that she would continue to represent the board, at their request, in the four remaining personnel hearings (RIFs and Transfers) for the 2012-2013 school year. The board asked if she would represent them in these cases until such time as they had an attorney. She stated, “I took these four files with me” and the conversation occurred with the entire board in executive session held during the last board meeting with the Logan County Board of Education before “I” left. The Logan County Board of Education rescinded and reinstated the four individuals, and the former attorney stated she mailed the four files back to the Logan County Board of Education Personnel Office.

8.1. INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Findings

Elementary Schools

1. The elementary review teams reported a heavy reliance on teachers' manuals for curriculum development in several schools. In certain instances, teachers' manuals were being used for the development of lesson plans and in other cases copies of manuals were being used in place of lesson plans. This practice indicated numerous elementary teachers were not following a specific program of study that included the State approved content standards and objectives. Interviews with teachers indicated that teachers desired more support and training in delivery of the West Virginia Next Generation Standards. While training was provided at the beginning of the year, the Team recommended central office personnel, develop an ongoing, embedded professional development plan to provide support to all teachers in the delivery of the West Virginia Next Generation Mathematics and English/Language Arts Content Standards and Objectives. The Team also recommended teachers participate in sessions offered by the central office staff and utilize professional learning community (PLC) time to become more familiar with the West Virginia Next Generation Content Standards and Objectives.
2. In two elementary schools the Team did not verify social studies and science were being offered daily for Grades 3-4, nor could they verify significant emphasis was being placed on social studies and science in order to assure students master the content knowledge in Grades K-2. The Team recommended the principal review the required program of study with teachers to assure all teachers are aware of requirements, and utilize lesson plan review and walkthroughs to assure teachers are providing the required standards.

Middle Schools

1. At one middle school, the master schedule reflected classes for students with disabilities were available. Through further interviews, the Team determined the grouping of students with disabilities was not appropriate to meet the diverse needs of this population. Students identified with significant cognitive disabilities and requiring instruction utilizing the alternate academic achievement standards were grouped with students identified with less severe disabilities receiving instruction through the West Virginia Next Generation Standards. These students

did not have similar social, functional or academic needs. The Team determined these practices did not meet the standards established in WVBE Policy 2419 regarding the grouping of students with exceptionalities.

2. According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510 the following program was not being taught at two middle schools: foreign language for students in Grades 7 and 8 is not being offered. The Team determined through the master schedule review and principal interviews, only one class of Spanish was offered and recommended central office staff develop a plan that includes distance learning as an option for course delivery.

High Schools

1. According to West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, *Assuring Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs*, “A minimum of four College Board AP courses (at least one from each core content areas of English Language Arts, mathematics, science, and social studies) or the IB Program must be offered annually.” Two of the three high schools were not offering an Advanced Placement course in science, and one of the three schools was not offering an Advanced Placement course in mathematics.
2. High school administrators reported their schools did not have written or electronic programs of study guides and that none had been provided by the central office. Although the schools reported relying on Policy 2510 for programs of study information, it could not be verified how the staff, students, and parents were informed of the policy requirements, or how school-based procedures for student retention and course placement were communicated to all stakeholders. The Team recommended the schools develop a written plan for programs of study, which could be communicated and utilized by all.

8.1.2. Transportation. The school district evaluates the cost containment and effectiveness of the transportation system and provides students efficient transportation services consistent with State laws and policies.

Findings

The Team reported inefficiencies in the cost containment of the transportation system. One involved donating surplus school buses in which the county did not realize any benefit. School districts generally auction surplus buses and receive a considerable amount for the sales. Another cost inefficiency involved workers’ compensation for a bus driver who the board approved for retirement and employed a permanent driver in the position. These practices failed to exercise efficiency or effectiveness in operating the transportation system.

8.1.3. Facilities. Schools are operated efficiently, economically, and without waste or duplication, and the number and location of schools efficiently serves the student population. (W. Va. Code §18-9D-15 and §18-9D-16 (d))

Findings

Occupied schedules on the building automation system for the sites seemed to have excessive operating hours and days. All schedules needed to be reviewed and adjusted to reflect actual occupied hours of the sites. The heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) systems of all schools needed to be placed in an unoccupied mode during holidays and snow days for energy conservation. Sites that have building automation systems should utilize these controls for this purpose. Sites that have stand-alone controls or programmable thermostats will need to have staff training.

Logan County Schools will need to phase out all T-12 fluorescent lamp, incandescent lamps and metal halide lighting fixtures with more efficient lighting systems. The Team recommended that Logan County School System begin an energy tracking program to determine the energy usage and efficiency of all of their school and support facilities so that inefficiencies at the higher energy intensive sites can be identified and addressed. Logan County should explore performance contracting as a means to accomplish some of these goals. There are many energy conservation practices that could be implemented using the building automation systems or utilizing school staff. Logan County Schools should perform an energy analysis of all schools and support facilities to determine the energy conservation practices that would be cost effective.

There were several new school administrators in the county. The Team recommended facility training be provided to the administration at each facility. The training should be specific to each facility and include general topics such as operation, custodian care, safety, regulatory requirements, utilizing the existing automated maintenance request system, etc. Each facility shall have the following regulatory reports on-site and up to date: Asbestos Management Plan, WV State Fire Marshal Report(s), and Pest Management Plan. It is also recommended to provide each administrator with a copy of the county custodian check list and review the checklist with the school administration and custodian staff to set the expectations for acceptable custodial care. The checklist should be completed on a monthly basis as a minimum.

8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

Findings

The county has co-principals and two assistant principals at Logan Middle School (741). Other middle schools, Chapmanville Middle School (613) and Man Middle School (461) have a principal and two assistant principals. Man High School (424) has a principal and two assistants. Chapmanville Regional High School (718) and Logan High School (785) have a principal and three assistants. A principal and one assistant principal were assigned to Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center.

It further appears that there is a discrepancy in the assignment of principals in the middle schools. Two principals (co-principals) served Logan Middle School. This would result in a pupil/principal ratio of 370.5:1 at Logan Middle School compared to 613:1 at Chapmanville Middle School and 461:1 at Man Middle School.

Logan County should review the assignment of school principals for equity among schools. If changes are made, the county must follow W. Va Code §18A-2-9 in the assignment of assistant principals and W. Va Code §18A-2-7 in the transfer of personnel. The county must also follow Logan County Policy VI. Personnel, “. . . all changes in employment status other than routine longevity increments must be specifically authorized by the Board and appear on the official minute record.” Also, a board action to reassign the assistant principal to a third school should have communicated to the personnel director that the action was recommended and subsequently took place. This is evidence of poor communications between the personnel director and superintendent. Logan County School System must follow W. Va Code §18A-2-9 in assigning assistant principals and §18A-2-7 transferring personnel.

8.1.5. Personnel. The school district assesses the assignment of personnel as based on West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies to determine the degree to which instructional and support services provided to the schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

Findings

The following chart indicates the number of professional and service personnel employed in excess of the state aid formula.

Personnel Employed

	2013-2014	2012-2013	2011-2012
Actual FTE Enrollment – 2nd Month (adjusted)	6271.74	6427.13	6397.20
Allowable Professional State Aid Eligible Positions based on enrollment	454.39	465.65	463.48
Professionals Employed Actual – 2 nd Month	480.95	470.20	470.58
# Professionals Employed in Excess of State Aid	(26.56)	(4.55)	(7.10)
Estimated Cost to be absorbed by local BOE **	\$1,229,000		
Allowable Service Personnel State Aid Eligible Positions based on enrollment	280.535	287.486	286.147
Service Personnel Actual – 2 nd Month	337.418	324.313	319.623
# Service Personnel Employed in Excess of State Aid	(56.883)	(36.827)	(33.476)
Estimated Cost to be absorbed by local BOE **	\$1,462,000		

** Calculation based upon the amount to be allocated for FY2015 budget for the state aid personnel by major classification.

Historically, Logan County Board of Education has been able to carry a few personnel over the state aid formula without dramatically impacting their operating reserves due to an ongoing excess levy passed by their citizens. A new excess levy was passed on October 26, 2013, to be effective with fiscal years beginning in July 1, 2014, and continuing through June 30, 2019. The new levy is expected to generate approximately \$11.8 million annually, of which \$8.5 million has been specifically allocated towards personnel costs as indicated below:

- \$3,659,959 Professional Salaries
- \$2,086,141 Service Personnel Salaries
- \$ 409,421 Substitute Costs
- \$2,342,461 Payroll Taxes and Personnel Benefits.

8.1.6. Regional Education Service Agency. The school district effectively utilizes Regional Education Service Agency programs and services or other regional services that may be initiated between and among county boards.

Findings

Based on the previously-mentioned Title II finding, the Logan County Board of Education was apparently using RESA 2 to provide services to low performing schools in the previous school year. The Team reviewed expenditures with RESA 2 to determine if the Logan County Board of Education was utilizing services offered by RESA 2. Logan County Board of Education paid RESA II a total of \$92,269.78 in fiscal year 2012 primarily for technical assistance and computer repair. RESA 2 was paid a total of \$169,780.00 in fiscal year 2013 with \$80,620 for technical assistance for low performing school and the remainder primarily for other technical assistance. To date in fiscal year 2014, RESA 2 has been paid \$68,836.10 primarily for bus operator training and an audiology contract. Logan County School System was not utilizing RESAs to the extent used previously.

CAPACITY BUILDING

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

1. Curriculum. Logan County School District failed to demonstrate the capacity to improve student achievement. While all schools demonstrated typical growth, analysis of the median percentile scores indicated the majority of middle and high schools were falling within the low range of typical growth. High school proficiency rates ranged from 26.4 percent to 42.5 percent in mathematics and 36.1 percent to 44.7 percent in reading language arts. Only two of 17 schools in Logan County had more than 50 percent of their students proficient in mathematics, while five schools had 50 percent or more of their students proficient in reading/language arts. Logan County School System's Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE DATA have been below the State results for the last three years. The county also experienced a steady decrease in student performance in each of the academic areas of the ACT PLAN, except in English and Science, where scores remained the same. Logan County exhibited a declining graduation rate that is currently 77.04 percent and even lower for low-socioeconomic status students (71 percent) and special education students (46.90 percent). While Logan County exceeded the State's overall college going rate by 3.4 percent, the percentage of students enrolled in developmental mathematics and reading courses measurably exceeded the State average.
2. Strategic Planning. Strategic planning was not evident by the Logan County Board of Education to target resources strategically to the teaching learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance. An organizational structure that sets forth clear duties and responsibilities for central office staff was absent. A unified, cohesive framework for overall functions and operations of the various county office departments had not been developed and was not in place.
3. Finance. Logan County School System's financial operations showed a system that lacked checks and balances to assure accountability in the handling of the county school system's fiscal resources. The structure is such that the finance office lacks the operating procedures for an effective system of fiscal management. Financial audit reports suggest a deteriorating system. Against advice of the chief school business officer (CSBO), the county superintendent proceeded with numerous financial expenditures that violated WVBE Policy 8200 and State Code.
4. Personnel. The current personnel practices involved flagrant violations of West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 5000 regarding employment and transfer of personnel. A system was lacking that evidenced

personnel decisions were being based on State Code, WVBE policies, and the needs of Logan County's Schools.

5. Facilities. Logan County School System demonstrated facility needs that require planning and implementation. As such, Logan County has a pressing need to evaluate the county school system's facility needs and update the Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP) accordingly. An engineering report revealed the needs at Chapmanville East Elementary School should be deemed critical and be addressed as the number one priority in the county. Furthermore, eliminating all portable classrooms in the county should also be a high priority for Logan County.
6. Leadership. The lack of wherewithal of the Logan County School System to provide a high quality education for its students through certified teachers, curriculum, fiscal responsibilities, employment practices, and organizational and management practices has impeded the county's progress. This was shown by the county board's and superintendent's propensity to not engage in the most compelling and urgent obligations and statutory responsibilities confronting them constructively and responsibly.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Logan County School System must exercise fiscal responsibility and anticipate increasing costs to operate the school system. The county must also follow statutory and policy requirements in all matters involving personnel.

LOGAN COUNTY SUMMARY

The Education Performance Audit of the Logan County School System revealed conditions and practices present in the school system that impede a thorough and efficient education system. These include, but are not limited to, the following conditions.

1. Curriculum. Logan County did not have a framework for curriculum leadership or an organizational chart for central office employees.
2. Personnel. Employment practices, in many cases, were not in accordance with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5000.
3. Finance. Numerous finance practices did not comply with West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8200.
4. Leadership. As shown throughout this report, the county superintendent and Logan County Board of Education did not always adhere to West Virginia Codes and WVBE policies in providing a thorough and efficient system of schools.

LOGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SUMMARY
EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

School	Accountability Index Designation	Findings
Omar Elementary School	Transition	7.1.6; 7.6.2
Buffalo Elementary School	Priority	7.6.2
Chapmanville East Elementary School	Transition	7.1.1; 7.1.2; 7.1.4; 7.2.3; 7.7.1; 7.6.2
Holden Central Elementary School	Focus	7.1.5; 7.2.3; 7.6.2; 7.7.1
Hugh Dingess Elementary School	Transition	7.1.2; 7.1.5; 7.2.4; 7.6.2
Justice Elementary School	Transition	7.2.3; 7.1.1
Logan Elementary School	Transition	7.2.3; 7.6.2
South Man Elementary School	Success	7.1.4; 7.6.2
Verdunville Elementary School	Success	7.1.5; 7.1.6; 7.1.11; 7.2.1; 7.6.2; 7.6.3; 7.7.1; 7.8.1
West Chapmanville Elementary School	Transition	7.1.4; 7.1.7; 7.2.3; 7.6.2
Man Elementary School	Transition	7.6.2
Man Middle School	Support	7.1.9; 7.1.13; 7.2.1; 7.2.4; 7.2.5; 7.6.2; 7.6.3
Logan Middle School	Success	7.1.2; 7.1.3; 7.1.13; 7.2.3; 7.6.2
Chapmanville Middle School	Focus	7.1.3; 7.1.9; 7.2.1; 7.2.3; 7.2.4; 7.6.2; 7.6.3; 7.6.4; 7.8.1
Chapmanville Regional High School	Priority	7.1.2., 7.1.3., 7.1.5., 7.1.6., 7.1.7., 7.1.9., 7.2.1., 7.2.3., 7.6.3., 7.7.1., 7.7.2., 7.8.1.
Man Senior High	Priority	7.1.2, 7.1.5, 7.1.6, 7.1.7, 7.1.13, 7.2.1, 7.2.3, 7.2.4, 7.6.2, 7.6.3, 7.7.1, 7.7.2, and 7.8.1
Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center	NA	7.1.1, 7.1.5, 7.2.1, 7.2.3, 7.6.3, 7.7.1, and 7.8.1

Elementary Schools

- Lesson plans. Several lesson plans lacked a focus on delivery of approved instructional objectives and did not adequately cover the instructional time allotted.
- Several teachers were using outdated content standards and objectives for instruction.
- A lack of usage of technology, which demonstrated a need for staff professional development and implementation of professional development.
- Schools had an abundance of materials and programs; however, it was not clear which were required and which were optional. Some programs were not being used to full potential.
- Licensure. Several teachers were either not certified for the area(s) taught, or not highly qualified, or were on permit.

Summary -- Middle Schools

- Lesson plans. Several lesson plans lacked a focus on delivery of approved instructional objectives and did not adequately cover the instructional time allotted. Issues included a lack of administrative feedback and constructive comments to aid teachers in improving lesson planning and development and missing weeks of lesson plans.
- Data analysis was not thorough and student-specific to address individual students' needs. There was a general lack of knowledge to implement Support for Personalized Learning with fidelity.
- Licensure. Several teachers were either not certified for the area(s) taught, not highly qualified, or were on permit.
- Learning environment. Two of three schools had safety issues with areas of the building unlocked and easily accessible to students.
- Programs of study. Two of three schools offered foreign language in only one grade.
- Instructional day. Two of three schools offered less than 330 minutes instruction per day and lacked sufficient bank time to cover the non-academic activities.
- Strategic plan. Two of three schools were not using data to determine goals, action steps and professional development; teachers were not knowledgeable of the goals and their role in implementation of the plan.
- Evaluation. Two of three schools failed to use data to determine student learning goals; many teachers were unaware of their progression status.

- Leadership. Effective and efficient use of assistant principals was not evident in two of three schools.

Summary – High Schools

- Technology. There was a lack of usage of technology by students and staff, which demonstrated a need for professional development and implementation of the professional development.
- Evaluation. There was a lack of knowledge regarding the Online Educator Evaluation system and its role in the school improvement process. Principals were unaware of the reports that could be produced from the system and their role in planning professional development for staff. Teachers goals were often not measurable or based on student specific data.
- Lesson plans. Consistent and meaningful feedback from administration regarding teacher instruction was not evident.
- Writing instruction. There was a lack of a schoolwide approach in providing writing instruction.
- Licensure. Several teachers were either not certified for the area(s) taught, or not highly qualified, or were on permit.

Statement Ralph R. Willis Vocational Technical Center

- Content standards and objectives. Three teachers were using outdated content standards and two teachers were using lesson plans dated from 2009.
- Professional development. There was a lack of professional development offered for career and technical education teachers.
- Principal support. There was a need for support for the principal who has a lack of CTE experience.
- Lesson plans. Timely and meaningful feedback from the principal regarding teacher instruction was not evident.