



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

TUG VALLEY HIGH SCHOOL

MINGO COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JULY 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Tug Valley High School in Mingo County was conducted March 20, 2013.

A Follow-Up Education Performance Audit was conducted May 8, 2014. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Carroll Staats

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)**

The school was using students to work as office aides. Students ran errands and answered the telephone. This practice did not exhibit high educational expectations for students and did not provide a challenging curriculum. There was no direct instruction and no Content Standards and Objectives were being covered. The potential of a violation of student privacy was present with the student aides in the office.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Tug Valley High School no longer scheduled students to work in the school office as student aides.

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

At least 70 percent of the lesson plans were incomplete and could not be followed by a substitute teacher. Lesson plans did not include enough information to teach the entire period in a majority of the classes.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. School administrators and faculty developed a new process for lesson planning. A lesson plan checklist was developed with content for a good lesson plan. All teachers self-assessed their lesson plans utilizing the checklist. Transition times were noted in the lesson plans. The West Virginia Next Generation Standards were used when preparing lesson plans. A new section was added with alternate work for a substitute teacher, if necessary. Sufficient material and activities were included in lesson plans to provide instruction for the entire class period.

7.7. Safe, Drug Free, Violence Free, and Disciplined Schools

7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

Tobacco use was evident in the boys' and girls' rest rooms.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The school developed multiple ways of addressing the tobacco problem in the school. A ten-week program on tobacco cessation was implemented and students with a tobacco problem complete this program. Staff monitored rest rooms at all times students were not in the classrooms. A sign-out system was put in place for students going to the rest rooms during class time. This information was used to identify students when problems occurred. The Prevention Resource Officer (PRO) was actively involved with the tobacco prevention program and issued tickets for students to appear in court for using tobacco in school when other methods did not work. The principal reported the problem with use of tobacco declined.

The Team observed rest rooms and found no evidence of tobacco use.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Tug Valley High School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Mingo County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Mingo County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Tug Valley High School was effectively utilizing their resources and was implementing the high quality professional development provided. A strong relationship existed between the school and the Mingo County Central Office and teachers stated that they were supported by the principal and the superintendent. Student achievement was increasing in all subgroups and the Team saw evidence buildingwide of excellent teaching strategies.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The strong, professional relationship between the school staff and the Mingo County Central Office staff remained in place. Student achievement increased in the school and the faculty planned to continue this trend and remain a “SUCCESS” school designation next year.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Tug Valley High School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Tug Valley High School demonstrated the capacity to not only increase student achievement, but to provide an excellent learning environment that was educationally stimulating and safe in nature.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The Team found the conditions presented above in place and the school functioned well.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

The Facility Team identified facility resource needs which are presented in the Mingo County School System Report under 7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews.

Tug Valley High School (Grades 9 - 12)

Mechanical issues related to the heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) system and controls were major issues at this site. All HVAC units were past their expected life and were in poor condition. These systems did not provide adequate outside air ventilation, thus, causing poor indoor air quality. Mercury bulb thermostats were used to control some of the equipment and have the potential, if broken, to cause a hazardous materials cleanup effort at a very expensive cost. The HVAC controls for this facility did not have energy conservation functions that allowed for night time set back of temperatures or scheduling of holidays or snow days. This site had significant energy savings potential that should be explored.

The outside aesthetics of the site needed to be addressed. Issues, such as, rusting handrails, peeling paint on benches, and improperly maintained fence lines created a

poor exterior appearance. The emergency shut off valves for the natural gas supply to science rooms were not located within the classroom or easily accessible. The second floor teachers' lounge had excessive build-up of dust on the ceiling tiles around the supply diffuser and on the return grille. The fire rating of the Technology closet door on the second floor had been lost due to the open hole where a lock had been removed. The boys' locker room storage door had been damaged and needed to be repaired or replaced. Cars were parked in a clearly marked no parking zone outside the kitchen area and other areas of the site. Stained ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the facility. The HVAC unit serving the Computer Laboratory in Room 211 did not have outside air capability. The site was not handicapped accessible and would require extensive modification to meet the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) guidelines for accessibility.

Facilities Resource Needs Evaluation Checklist

- The topography was not varied enough to provide a desirable appearance and had steep inclines.
- The site did not have stable well drained soil free from erosion.
- Sidewalks were not adequate with curb cuts and correct slopes.
- The teachers' work area was not adequate.
- The Media Center lacked some of the equipment specified.
- The Art Room lacked some of the equipment specified.
- The physical education facility lacked some of the equipment specified.
- The science facilities did not have laboratory workspaces of 2.5 linear ft./student with sinks, water, gas, and electricity.
- The auditorium facility lacked some of the equipment specified.
- A teachers' dining area was not provided.
- The health services area lacked some of the equipment specified.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The maintenance department repaired the heating, ventilation, and air conditioning (HVAC) systems.

Fences were in better condition. Rails in front of the school were repaired and painted. Landscaping improvements were in progress. Once other work is completed, (installing pipe across the parking lot), the parking lot will be resurfaced. Some of the ceiling tiles were replaced.

Other items were not changed.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The principal and staff of Tug Valley High School utilized formal and informal student data to identify areas of weakness in the school's curriculum and made adjustments to correct the identified weaknesses. Teachers stated that the professional development provided was beneficial to enriching curriculum delivery and that the principal was instrumental in fostering a positive learning environment. The principal and staff reported that the Mingo County Central Office provided excellent support.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

Good instruction continued at Tug Valley High School and student achievement improved.

Education Performance Audit Recommendation

Based upon the results of the Follow-up Education Performance Audit, it is recommended and a motion is requested to approve the report.