



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

MASON-DIXON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

MONONGALIA COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2009

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability	6
Education Performance Audit.....	7
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	7
High Quality Standards	7
Indicators of Efficiency.....	9
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	9
Identification of Resource Needs	10
Early Detection and Intervention	10
Early Detection and Intervention	11
Education Performance Audit Summary	11

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Mason-Dixon Elementary School in Monongalia County was conducted on March 10, 2009. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Sarah Lyons, Coordinator,
Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Diane M. Betler	Elementary/High School Principal	Pickens Elementary/High School Randolph County
Christine E. Miller	Junior High School Principal	East Fairmont Junior High School Marion County
Kristina L. Peterman	Elementary School Principal	Jayenne Elementary School Marion County
Jennifer D. Ramsey	Elementary School Assistant Principal	Mineral Wells Elementary School Wood County
Debra L. Schmidlen	Elementary/High School Principal	Harman Elementary/High School Randolph County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

56 MONONGALIA COUNTY
Frank Devono, Superintendent

236 MASON-DIXON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Karen Collins, Principal
Grades K - 05
Enrollment 359 (2nd month 2006-2007 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2006-2007

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	227	230	229	99.56	69.91	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	223	226	225	99.55	69.81	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	113	113	112	99.11	56.25	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	39	42	42	100.00	28.20	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	227	230	229	99.56	70.79	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	223	226	225	99.55	70.72	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	113	113	112	99.11	62.50	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	39	42	42	100.00	12.82	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.7%**

56 MONONGALIA COUNTY
Frank Devono, Superintendent

236 MASON-DIXON ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Karen Collins, Principal
Grades K - 05

Enrollment 335 (2nd month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	177	178	177	99.43	67.04	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	174	175	174	99.42	67.05	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	86	86	85	98.83	57.64	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	31	31	31	100.00	32.25	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	177	178	177	99.43	72.72	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	174	175	174	99.42	72.83	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	86	86	85	98.83	61.17	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	31	31	30	96.77	30.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.5%

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	56	55	55	54	98.21	9.26	22.22	38.89	20.37	9.26	68.52
04	61	61	61	61	100.00	3.28	32.79	44.26	11.48	8.20	63.93
05	61	61	61	61	100.00	3.28	27.87	40.98	19.67	8.20	68.85

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	56	55	56	55	100.00	9.09	27.27	36.36	21.82	5.45	63.64
04	61	61	61	61	100.00	8.20	13.11	40.98	34.43	3.28	78.69
05	61	61	60	60	98.36	10.00	15.00	45.00	25.00	5.00	75.00

Enr. - Enrollment
 FAY - Full Academic Year
 Part. - Participation

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

5.1.1. Achievement.

Mason-Dixon Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts for two consecutive years. Mason-Dixon Elementary School achieved AYP in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored far below the State's percent proficient level in mathematics and reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plan and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 31.48 percent in mathematics and 36.36 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 36.07 percent in mathematics; Grade 5 – 31.15 percent in mathematics and 25 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education-Performance Based Accreditation System* in Section §126-13-6 provides:

6.1. A system of points on an index will be used to assess and weigh annual performance measures for state accreditation of schools and approval of school systems that gives credit or points on an index to prevent any one measure alone from causing a school to achieve less than full accreditation status or a school system from achieving less than full approval status: Provided, That a school or school system that achieves AYP is eligible for no less than full accreditation or full approval status, as applicable, and the system established pursuant to this subsection shall only apply to schools and school systems that do not achieve AYP.

The index showed that Mason-Dixon Elementary School performed within the point range (751-640) for full accreditation status.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Model Schools Conference.
2. K-03 Reading.
3. Positive Behavior Support.
4. Thinkfinity.
5. School Improvement Focus.

6. WESTEST Data Analysis.
7. DIBELS Data Analysis.
8. Assess for Learning.
9. Who Took My Chalk.
10. Edline Odyssey.
11. TechSteps.
12. Acuity Analysis.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Mason-Dixon Elementary School had undertaken an initiative for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiative and activity included the following.

- 7.1.3. Learning environment.** The school facility was clean, well-maintained, and educationally stimulating. A great deal of student work was displayed and the building was clearly student-centered. Staff and students showed pride in their school.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.9. Programs of study.** Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team did not observe 50 percent inquiry, investigation, and experimentation instruction in science classes. Science teachers stated that they did not include at least 50 percent of hands-on science in their instruction. The principal said the estimate was about 30-40 percent. Staff reported a lack of materials as a partial cause of this.

RECOMMENDATION

- 7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives.** Approximately one-half of the teachers showed a list of the 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) that were taught. The other half could not show that the CSOs had been covered. The Team believed these teachers were teaching the CSOs; however, nothing was available to the Team that showed CSOs were being covered. The Team recommended that all teachers have a means of showing the CSOs covered to ensure that the State's curriculum is being delivered.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

None identified.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Mason-Dixon Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team determined that Mason-Dixon Elementary School and Monongalia County have the capacity to correct the identified deficiency.

The Team recommended that the Monongalia County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Dr. Karen L. Huffman, Assistant to the State Superintendent, West Virginia Department of Education, Division of Educator Quality and System Support at 304-558-3199 to arrange a School Support System for correcting the deficiency and improving student and school performance.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility did not have a ceramic kiln or black-out areas. The music facility did not have music chairs with folding arms or a podium. The physical education facility did not have a data projector or 50 inch screen monitor.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** A locker/dressing room and chairs were not available.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A refrigerator with locked storage was not available.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

None identified.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified one high quality standard necessary to improve performance and progress to meet 5.1.1 Achievement – 7.1.9. Programs of study.

The Team presented one commendation and noted one recommendation.

Mason-Dixon Elementary School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this draft report to guide Mason-Dixon Elementary School in improvement efforts. Pursuant to W.Va. Code §18-2E-5, the school and county have until the next accreditation cycle to correct deficiencies noted in the report.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Mason-Dixon Elementary School and Monongalia County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the finding noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.