

# OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDITS



**DRAFT EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**FOR**

**PAW PAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL**

**MORGAN COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**JANUARY 2007**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

# Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Introduction.....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Team .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>School Performance .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Annual Performance Measures for Accountability .....</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>High Quality Standards.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Indicators of Efficiency.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Identification of Resource Needs .....</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>Early Detection and Intervention .....</b>	<b>15</b>
<b>School Accreditation Status .....</b>	<b>16</b>

## INTRODUCTION

An announced (five days in advance) Education Performance Audit of Paw Paw Elementary School in Morgan County was conducted on November 28, 2006. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was because the school had not been reviewed for at least three years and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary regarding performance and progress. The Team also checked the recommendations of the West Virginia Department of Education Office of Healthy Schools to determine progress of the school with these areas. Additionally, the Team reviewed parent complaints and other related documents that had been submitted to the Superintendent of Morgan County Schools as well as a member of the West Virginia Board of Education.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Pamela Hoppe, Coordinator, Office of Information Systems

## TEAM MEMBERS

<b>Name</b>	<b>Title</b>	<b>School/County</b>
Elizabeth Greenfield	Middle School Assistant Principal	Hedgesville Middle School Berkeley County
Thomas Wood	High School Assistant Principal	John Marshall High School Marshall County

**SCHOOL PERFORMANCE**

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team’s findings.

**58 MORGAN COUNTY**  
David Temple, Superintendent  
**204 PAW PAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed**  
Michelle Fleming, Principal  
Grades K - 06  
Enrollment 118

**WESTEST 2005-2006**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	61	66	66	100.00	73.77	Yes	Yes	✓
White	55	60	60	100.00	74.54	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	35	37	37	100.00	65.71	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	16	16	16	100.00	37.50	NA	NA	NA
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	61	66	66	100.00	73.77	Yes	Yes	✓
White	55	60	60	100.00	74.54	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	35	37	37	100.00	65.71	NA	NA	NA
Spec. Ed.	16	16	16	100.00	31.25	NA	NA	NA
LEP	**	**	**	**	**	NA	NA	NA

FAY -- Full Academic Year  
\* -- 0 students in subgroup  
\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**  
**Attendance Rate = 98.0%**

## Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

<b>Mathematics</b>											
<b>Class</b>	<b>Tested Enr.</b>	<b>FAY Enr.</b>	<b>Tested</b>	<b>FAY Tested</b>	<b>Part. Rate</b>	<b>Novice</b>	<b>Below Mastery</b>	<b>Mastery</b>	<b>Above Mastery</b>	<b>Distinguished</b>	<b>Proficient</b>
03	20	19	20	19	100.00	5.26	10.53	57.89	15.79	10.53	84.21
04	18	17	18	17	100.00	0.00	29.41	35.29	35.29	0.00	70.59
05	14	11	14	11	100.00	0.00	45.45	27.27	18.18	9.09	54.55
06	14	14	14	14	100.00	0.00	21.43	21.43	35.71	21.43	78.57

<b>Reading</b>											
<b>Class</b>	<b>Tested Enr.</b>	<b>FAY Enr.</b>	<b>Tested</b>	<b>FAY Tested</b>	<b>Part. Rate</b>	<b>Novice</b>	<b>Below Mastery</b>	<b>Mastery</b>	<b>Above Mastery</b>	<b>Distinguished</b>	<b>Proficient</b>
03	20	19	20	19	100.00	5.26	10.53	63.16	15.79	5.26	84.21
04	18	17	18	17	100.00	17.65	29.41	29.41	23.53	0.00	52.94
05	14	11	14	11	100.00	0.00	36.36	54.55	9.09	0.00	63.64
06	14	14	14	14	100.00	0.00	7.14	28.57	35.71	28.57	92.86

Enr. - Enrollment  
FAY - Full Academic Year  
Part. - Participation

## Other Relevant Performance Data

### 2005-2006 Writing Assessment Distribution of Performance Across All Performance Levels

GRADE 4	Total # Tested	% At Distinguished	% At Above Mastery	% At Mastery	% At Partial Mastery	% At Novice	% With No Score	% of Students at or Above Mastery	% of Students Below Mastery
STATE – WV	19,398	6	20	49	20	4	1	75	25
MORGAN COUNTY	194	1	13	46	34	4	0	61	39
PAW PAW ELEMENTARY	18	0	28	28	28	17	0	56	44

## ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

### Achieved Standard

#### 5.1.1. Achievement.

Although Paw Paw Elementary School did not have a cell size with a number (N) of at least 50 students for the special education (SE) subgroup the cell was far below the required percent proficient. The economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup with an N less than 50 showed an achievement gap between that subgroup and the all students (AS) and racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups.

Adequate yearly progress (AYP) information by class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Mathematics – Grade 4 – 29.41 percent and Grade 5 – 45.45 percent; Reading – Grade 4 – 47.06 percent and Grade 5 – 36.36 percent. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement. This issue must be addressed to correct the problems that are causing the low achievement in these areas.

West Virginia Writing Assessment scores for Grade 4 were below the State and Morgan County. The percent of students at or above mastery for West Virginia was 75; for Morgan County was 61; and for Paw Paw Elementary School was 56. It is essential that the school implement a writing rubric to address the West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment scores to address this issue immediately. The staff had training in Writing Roadmap and Writing Across the Curriculum. This training, along with other high yield instructional strategies, must be implemented to assure student achievement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided by the West Virginia Department of Education, RESA VIII, county and/or school.

1. 21<sup>st</sup> Century Learners.
2. Title I Reading Strategies.
3. ACT PLAN/EXPLORE.
4. Co-Teaching.
5. WESTEST.
6. Strategic Planning.
7. Formative/Summative Assessment.
8. Reading Academy.
9. Thinking Maps.
10. Building Champions.
11. Focus on Standards.
12. The Power of Two.
13. 21<sup>st</sup> Century Technology.
14. Confidentiality.
15. Student Assistance Teams.
16. Evaluation Process.

17. Employee Code of Conduct.
18. Pacing Guides.
19. Data Analysis.
20. Differentiated Instruction.
21. Writing Roadmap.
22. Thinking Map.
23. Writing Across the Curriculum.
24. PLATO.

Note: The principal reported the listed professional development/training opportunities. However, the Team report does not show that the strategies and programs from the training have been implemented. This has implications for targeted, on-going, and sustained professional development that is applied consistently by the entire staff.

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Paw Paw Elementary School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

**6.1.3. Learning environment.** The school was very clean, well-decorated with student work, and was warm and inviting.

The students were friendly, mannerly, and helpful to Team members.

**6.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information.** The school developed “Test Talk Night” in which parents were informed about the test data and their own individual student’s progress. This was an excellent means for keeping parents involved about their child’s progress and achievement.

### HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

**Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress to continue to achieve Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP).**

#### 6.1. Curriculum

**6.1.5. Instructional strategies.** Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team observed a lack of varied instructional strategies. A majority of instruction was teacher directed with little individual student investigation in many of the classes. Methods such as lecture, handouts, and guided discussions were overly utilized in many classrooms.

**6.1.6. Instruction in writing.** Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child’s weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team did not find evidence through classroom observations, teacher interviews, and student interviews that writing instruction was being conducted weekly in all subject areas. West Virginia Statewide Writing Assessment Scores for 2005-2006 were considerably lower than the scores for West Virginia, and the lack of writing in every classroom on a weekly basis was indicative of these scores.

**6.1.8. Instructional materials.** Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)



The Team found that teachers were giving students materials lists for students to purchase at local stores. This is inconsistent with a free and appropriate public education provided by West Virginia Code. The county is urged to check practices at all schools within the county to assure that students are not required to purchase required materials that should be provided by the county and/or school. This practice must cease in future school years.

**6.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)**

While a countywide Multicultural Plan was in place, the plan was not being implemented on a schoolwide basis. Several teachers discussed only two or three activities that were being done on a schoolwide basis and some teachers stated that most of the multicultural activities were done through the social studies classes.

**6.2. Student and School Performance**

**6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

Many of the lesson plans were incomplete and could not be followed by a substitute teacher. There were not enough activities contained in the plans to complete the classes. In many of the classes, activities were listed that would have taken 5-10 minutes to complete with no other activities planned. These particular plans would be difficult, if not impossible, for a substitute to follow and sustain instructional continuity.

**6.4. Regulatory Agency Reviews**

**6.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)**

The Team reviewed the recommendations of the West Virginia Department of Education Office of Healthy Schools regarding school security. The original recommendations are listed as presented by the WVDE with the Education Performance Audit Teams' findings below each recommendation.

1. Install security cameras at all school hallway entrance/exits with monitors in the office.

Security cameras had been installed the week before the audit and the process was expected to be completed within the next two to three weeks.

2. Install a buzz-in lock system on entrance/exits other than the main entrance.

A committee had been established and met, yet a definite decision had not been made on installing buzzers or scan locks on outside doors. The county superintendent stated that the Morgan County Blueprint for School Safety contains this as Phase II to occur between now and April 1, 2007. The lack of a specific lock-system plan seems to imply that the installation of a system will be closer to April 2007.

3. Replace all exterior classrooms doors with exit only doors that remain locked from the outside.

All exterior main doors were not locked from the outside. The Team found and some educators indicated when asked that the classroom exit doors on the front section of the building were locked from the inside, making no secondary egress for these students and teachers. The superintendent stated that a program is in place to replace doors and the county is accepting bids now.

4. Revitalize a peer mediation or Natural Helper process and integrate it with the work that is being done by Clinical Social Worker, Gary McDaniel.

The county attendance official has trained students on the Natural Helpers process.

5. Train all staff in consistent use of school discipline system. Newer staff members may need monitoring.

The superintendent indicated that all staff had been trained. The Team noted that during the review staff demonstrated professional behavior in all areas. No reports were made regarding inconsistent discipline.

6. Continue to work on parent communications and involve parents in safe schools planning processes.

The superintendent stated that the entire staff was trained last year and parent training was also conducted.

#### Summary

The original complaints were dealt with by the county immediately after they were presented last school year. The Clinical Social Worker continues to work with students in a preventive behavioral approach. According to school staff, the superintendent, and the clinical social worker, this year has been uneventful.

Issues related to staff have been resolved as the teacher(s) is/are no longer at this school.

The Safe Schools recommendations have received cursory attention, yet remain the same as noted in the June 6, 2006 West Virginia Department of Education School Site Visit Report.

## RECOMMENDATIONS

- 6.1.3. Learning environment.** The fans in the rooms were not in the “ON” position. The Team recommended that the fans be in the “ON” position in order to bring in fresh air while students and staff are present. Tests have shown that increasing the oxygen levels and lowering the carbon dioxide levels helps facilitate student achievement.
- 6.1.4. Instruction.** Special education co-teachers and general education teachers did not have a common planning time. The Team recommended that the schedule be revisited to provide common planning opportunities between special education co-teachers and general classroom teachers.
- 6.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.** Computers throughout the classrooms needed to be upgraded. The computers were being used; however, many of them were outdated and functioned improperly. The Team recommended that the computers be upgraded throughout the school with the assistance of the central office and RESA VIII and the administration investigate means to purchase additional technology equipment. The Team also recommended that the school keep up-to-date records of technology usage throughout the building.

## Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Paw Paw Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Morgan County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Morgan County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**7.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.**

The school must vary the delivery of the curriculum and must investigate high yield instructional practices that will increase student achievement. All students, especially the economically disadvantaged and those of special needs, require that the instructional strategies be varied on a regular basis to maintain attention and foster learning.

**7.1.3. Facilities. Schools are operated efficiently, economically, and without waste or duplication, and the number and location of schools efficiently serves the student population. (W. Va. Code §18-9D-15 and §18-9D-16 (d))**

Paw Paw Elementary School and Paw Paw High School are two separate schools, yet share facilities. Elementary and high school students use the same cafeteria, music and art facilities, gymnasium, and counselor's office. One principal, one assistant principal, one guidance counselor serve both schools. Essentially, the schools operate as one school. The combined use of the facilities by both schools impedes the use of the facility.

### Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Paw Paw Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS	RECOMMENDED RESOURCES
6.1.5. Instructional strategies.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instruction (304) 558-6320
6.1.6. Instruction in writing.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instruction (304) 558-6320
6.1.8. Instructional materials.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Legal Services (304) 558-3667
6.1.12. Multicultural activities.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Student Services and Health Promotion (304) 558-8830
6.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of Instruction (304) 558-6320
6.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews.	West Virginia Department of Education Office of School Facilities (304) 558-2711  West Virginia Department of Education Office of Student Services and Health Promotion (304) 558-8830

- 16.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county Unified Improvement Plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building is an issue for the Morgan County School District with a 20 percent turnover in staff from last year. While the staff at Paw Paw Elementary School is dedicated, factors such as small enrollment, the struggle to provide all required classes, and limited technology seems to keep the school from operating within the needs of the 21<sup>st</sup> Century Learning Skills.

### Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

**17.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

**According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.**

- 17.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility was not of adequate size and did not have two deep sinks, mechanical ventilation, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas.
- 17.1.15. Health service units.** The health services unit was not of adequate size.

### **Early Detection and Intervention**

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

**Paw Paw Elementary School must continue to investigate and implement high quality programs and practices to ensure student achievement. The school must pursue assistance from the Morgan County central office, RESA VIII, and the West Virginia Department of Education to improve the curriculum and instruction for students. Student data must be analyzed to correlate instruction to student weaknesses.**



**School Accreditation Status**

<b>School</b>	<b>Accreditation Status</b>	<b>Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards</b>	<b>Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement</b>	<b>Date Certain</b>
58-204 Paw Paw Elementary	Full Accreditation	6.1.5; 6.1.6; 6.1.8; 6.1.12; 6.2.3; 6.4.1		

**Education Performance Audit Summary**

The Team identified six high quality standards – necessary to improve performance and progress to meet 5.1.1 Achievement. The Team also presented two school initiatives for achieving adequate yearly progress (AYP), and three recommendations. In addition, the Team noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources and noted an early detection and intervention recommendation. The Team submits this draft report to guide Paw Paw Elementary School in improvement efforts. The school and county have until the next accreditation cycle to correct deficiencies noted in the report.