



EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

BRADSHAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

MCDOWELL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JANUARY 2010

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	6
Education Performance Audit.....	7
High Quality Standards	7
Indicators of Efficiency	9
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	9
Identification of Resource Needs	10
Early Detection and Intervention	11
Education Performance Audit Summary	12

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Bradshaw Elementary School in McDowell County was conducted November 18, 2009. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Stephen B. Comer	Elementary School Principal	Glenwood Elementary School Mercer County
Don E. Johnson	Elementary School Principal	Sutton Elementary School Braxton County
Leatha G. Williams	Elementary School Principal	Rupert Elementary School Greenbrier County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY

Suzette Cook, Superintendent

206 BRADSHAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Joseph Sparks, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 217 (2nd month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	98	102	102	100.00	78.57	Yes	Yes	✓
White	97	100	100	100.00	79.38	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	80	84	84	100.00	77.50	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	12	12	12	100.00	50.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	98	102	102	100.00	72.44	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	97	100	100	100.00	73.19	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	80	84	84	100.00	70.00	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	12	12	12	100.00	8.33	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 95.6%

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY
 Suzette Cook, Superintendent
206 BRADSHAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed
 Joseph Sparks, Principal
 Grades PK - 05
 Enrollment 215 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	89	112	112	100.00	60.67	Yes	Yes	✓
White	88	111	111	100.00	60.22	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	74	96	96	100.00	58.10	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	10	10	10	100.00	40.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	89	112	112	100.00	51.68	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	88	111	111	100.00	51.13	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	74	96	96	100.00	45.94	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	10	10	10	100.00	10.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
 * -- 0 students in subgroup
 ** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 96.9%

BRADSHAW ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	46	34	46	34	100.00	0.00	47.06	26.47	20.59	5.88	52.94
04	32	26	32	26	100.00	0.00	15.38	46.15	15.38	23.08	84.62
05	34	29	34	29	100.00	0.00	51.72	41.38	3.45	3.45	48.28

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	46	34	46	34	100.00	14.71	47.06	29.41	8.82	0.00	38.24
04	32	26	32	26	100.00	3.85	15.38	50.00	30.77	0.00	80.77
05	34	29	34	29	100.00	6.90	51.72	34.48	6.90	0.00	41.38

Enr. - Enrollment
 FAY - Full Academic Year
 Part. - Participation

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Met Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Bradshaw Elementary School achieved adequately yearly progress (AYP) for two consecutive years in the all students (AS), racial/ethnicity white (W), and economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education students (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored far below the State's percent proficient level in reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plan and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 47.06 percent in mathematics and 61.76 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 51.72 percent in mathematics and 58.62 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Employee Code of Conduct.
2. Assessment for Learning.
3. Data Analysis.
4. Policy Updates.
5. Module 2 – 21st Century Teaching and Deconstructing Standards.
6. Grading Practices.
7. Google Tools.
8. Teach 21.
9. White Boards, Wikis, Blogs.
10. Using Excelsior and Acuity in the Classroom.
11. Framing Your Success.
12. Policy 2421 and Policy 5902.
13. Data-Driven Decision Making.
14. Discipline With Dignity.
15. Middle School Concepts.
16. Strategies for Teaching in the Block.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT
HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

March 2006

5.1.10. Library/educational technology access. Students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

The library in the primary resource facility was located in a room that was being transitioned into a health/music facility. Library books were outdated and unused. Teachers did not have a process to retrieve instructional material. Classroom libraries were limited in size and selection of materials. The Team recommended that provisions be made for regular student access to a library/technology center equipped with current and appropriate library/technology resources. Lesson plans need to reflect activities for increased library/educational technology utilization. A budget needed to be developed to replace and update instructional materials.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. The school did not have a library/media center in its relocated school adjacent to Sandy River Middle School. Only classroom libraries were available. Title I had allocated \$1,000 to enhance the classroom libraries. McDowell County and Bradshaw Elementary needed to pursue a library and accompanying materials.

November 18, 2009

COMPLIANCE. The new building had two computer laboratories and a library with sufficient numbers of computers and various technologies. Students were using technology and updated materials were available for student use.

November 2009

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

Sufficient emphasis was not placed on science and social studies to ensure that students master content knowledge and skills as specified in the 21st century content standards and objectives as required by Policy 2510.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.** An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

A review of the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership, revealed weaknesses in the school's plan. The school must contact the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership, to discuss the areas of weakness and develop a plan to address the methods of correction.

RECOMMENDATION

- 7.2.4. Data analysis.** While WESTEST 2 data had been analyzed and the disaggregation had been completed by the school improvement facilitator, the Team recommended that the classroom teachers take a more active role in the disaggregation to be more aware of the students' needs.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Bradshaw Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. McDowell County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of McDowell County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

While numerous high quality staff development sessions had been provided and it was evident that teachers and the principal was working toward higher student achievement, the staff must remain aware of the decline in achievement, especially in reading/language arts. All staff must continue to provide instruction that is relevant and grade level appropriate.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Bradshaw Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

The Team determined that Bradshaw Elementary School has the capacity to correct the identified deficiencies.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The playground/recreational areas were not well equipped and appropriate for the age level.
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, on-line periodical indexes, and copying equipment were not available.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.**

The art facility did not have a ceramic kiln or black-out areas.

The music facilities did not have music chairs with folding arms, music stands, podium, recording devices, microphones, stereo sound system, piano, instructional technology equipment, and acoustical treatment.

The physical education facility was not located away from quiet areas of the building or acoustically treated with direct access to outdoor or recreational areas. It did not have a drinking fountain, provisions for two or more teaching stations, data projector or 50 inch screen monitor, network connection, or Internet access.

19.1.14. Food service. A chalkboard and bulletin board were not available.

19.1.15. Health service units. The health services unit did not have curtained or small rooms with cots, a lavatory, refrigerator with locked storage, or a locked medication box.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Given the declining achievement in all but one of the individual subgroups, Bradshaw Elementary School and McDowell County must continue to implement high yield instructional practices and instruction that will improve student achievement. McDowell County must actively pursue assistance from RESA 1, the West Virginia Department of Education, and the West Virginia Center for Professional Development to assist with school improvement efforts. Curriculum must be data-driven and instruction must be relevant to the curriculum and provide all students the opportunity to learn.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified two high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

They include the following:

7.1.9. Programs of study.

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.

The Team presented one recommendation, noted an indicator of efficiency and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Bradshaw Elementary School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Bradshaw Elementary School in improvement efforts.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Bradshaw Elementary School and McDowell County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report.