



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

KIMBALL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

MCDOWELL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JANUARY 2010

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	6
Education Performance Audit.....	7
Initiatives for Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress	7
High Quality Standards	8
Indicators of Efficiency	9
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	10
Identification of Resource Needs	11
Early Detection and Intervention	12
Education Performance Audit Summary	12

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Kimball Elementary School in McDowell County was conducted November 18, 2009. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Cindy L. Caldwell	Middle School Principal	Man Middle School Logan County
L. Alvin James	Elementary School Principal	Daniels Elementary School Raleigh County
Tammy L. Robinson	Elementary School Teacher	Rupert Elementary School Greenbrier County
Dorothy R. (Becky) Smith	Elementary School Principal	Stratton Elementary School Raleigh County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY

Suzette Cook, Superintendent

217 KIMBALL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Alan Eanes, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 312 (2nd month 2007-08 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	118	135	134	99.25	72.64	Yes	Yes	✓
White	75	86	86	100.00	73.33	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	43	48	47	97.91	71.42	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	104	119	118	99.15	70.87	Yes	Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	26	35	34	97.14	64.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	118	135	134	99.25	80.34	Yes	Yes	✓
White	75	86	86	100.00	80.00	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	43	48	47	97.91	80.95	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	104	119	118	99.15	78.64	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	26	35	34	97.14	48.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.2%

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY
 Suzette Cook, Superintendent
217 KIMBALL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed
 Alan Eanes, Principal
 Grades PK - 05
 Enrollment 328 (2nd month 2008-09 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	131	147	146	99.31	51.14	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	81	96	95	98.95	51.85	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	49	50	50	100.00	51.02	Yes	NA	✓
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	119	134	134	100.00	48.73	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	24	28	27	96.42	37.50	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	131	147	145	98.63	55.72	Yes	Yes	✓
White	81	96	94	97.91	54.32	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	49	50	50	100.00	59.18	Yes	NA	✓
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	119	134	133	99.25	52.94	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	24	28	26	92.85	25.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
 * -- 0 students in subgroup
 ** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 96.4%

KIMBALL ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	53	46	53	46	100.00	4.35	50.00	23.91	17.39	4.35	45.65
04	40	36	40	36	100.00	0.00	36.11	38.89	19.44	5.56	63.89
05	54	49	53	49	98.15	4.08	48.98	38.78	4.08	4.08	46.94

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	53	46	53	46	100.00	0.00	58.70	36.96	4.35	0.00	41.30
04	40	36	40	36	100.00	5.56	27.78	41.67	25.00	0.00	66.67
05	54	49	52	49	96.30	6.12	32.65	44.90	14.29	2.04	61.22

Enr. - Enrollment
 FAY - Full Academic Year
 Part. - Participation

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Met Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Kimball Elementary School achieved adequately yearly progress (AYP) in the racial/ethnicity white (W) and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts, and the all students (AS) subgroup in mathematics only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored at a low percent proficient level in mathematics and reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 54.35 percent in mathematics and 58.70 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 36.11 percent in mathematics and 33.33 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 53.06 percent in mathematics and 38.78 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Using Excelsior and Acuity in the Classroom.
2. Policy 2421 and Policy 5902.
3. Technology Updates.
4. Framing Your Success.
5. Data-Driven Decision Making.
6. Discipline with Dignity.
7. Middle School Concepts.
8. Strategies for Teaching in the Block.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Kimball Elementary School had undertaken initiatives for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

- 7.2.2. Counseling services.** The Team commended the school for implementing the Developing Realistic Expectations Among McDowell County Students (DREAMS) program. This program provided after-school activities four days per week in which each student received 21st Century academic instruction relating to 21st century content in real-world context, informal and formal assessments, health activities and wellness activities, civic and financial literacy activities, mentoring and violence/drug prevention tutoring, enrichment activities, and a nutritional snack. The Team considered this an excellent method to keep students engaged in school and promote higher achievement among the participants.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

March 2006

5.2.3. Accounting practices. The county board's and individual school's accounting practices are consistent with state policies and procedures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11; and 18-4-10; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100)

The Team reported the following school accounting issues.

1. Bank deposits were not being made in a timely manner. A receipt for \$592.54 was issued on September 9, 2001; however, the funds were not deposited until September 14. All funds collected must be deposited whenever total collections on hand exceed \$500 or before any extended school holiday. Bank deposits must be made at least weekly, regardless of the amount collected.
2. One purchase order reviewed, No. 2234, was out of numerical sequence based on the date it was issued. The purpose of maintaining a purchase order system is to provide the principal with a means of maintaining control over purchases to ensure that funds are available and to deter unauthorized purchases. Purchase orders need to be obtained prior to obligating funds.
3. Copies of the bank deposit tickets were not retained on file. Bank deposit slips are to be prepared in duplicate. The original is to be remitted to the bank with the funds being deposited and the copy is to be retained on file. The bank will provide a validated deposit ticket that can be attached to the copy retained.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE.

1. The current examination found no instances of untimely deposits.
2. The current examination revealed nine purchase orders out of 40 tested that had dates subsequent to the invoice dates.
3. The current review found all validated bank deposit tickets to be on file.

November 18, 2009

COMPLIANCE. The finance review auditor at the central office reported that the items had been corrected.

November 2009

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)**

The Team did not observe technology application in the classrooms or in the computer laboratories. Teachers were using Elmos and other forms of technology but students were not using those technologies. One Kindergarten teacher had students using computers in the classroom. Grade 4 teachers stated that there were a lot of problems with the computers due to mechanical and technical issues.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.**

A review of the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan by the West Virginia Department of Education Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership, revealed weaknesses in the school's plan. The school must contact the Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership to discuss the areas of weakness and develop a plan to address the methods of correction.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Kimball Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. McDowell County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of McDowell County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Technology issues must be corrected and various forms of instructional technology must be incorporated into all classrooms. The principal must continue to investigate and implement high quality, research-based programs and practices to improve student achievement.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Kimball Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team recommended that the McDowell County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Dr. Karen Huffman, Assistant Superintendent, Division of Educator Quality and System Support at 304-558-3199 to arrange a School Support System for correcting the deficiencies and improving student and school performance.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not 11 usable acres plus one acre for each 100 students over 600.
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, and on-line periodical indexes were not available.
- 19.1.7. K classrooms.** The Kindergarten classroom was not of adequate size and did not have a sink and hot and cold water.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The music facility did not have music chairs with folding arms, music stands, a podium, or acoustical treatment.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Team identified two high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

They include the following:

- 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.
- 7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.

The Team presented one commendation, noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Kimball Elementary School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Kimball Elementary School in improvement efforts.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Kimball Elementary School and McDowell County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report.