



**EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**FOR**

**WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL**

**MCDOWELL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**JANUARY 2010**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

## Table of Contents

	Page
<b>Introduction .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Team .....</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>School Performance .....</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>Annual Performance Measures for Accountability .....</b>	<b>6</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit.....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>High Quality Standards .....</b>	<b>7</b>
<b>Indicators of Efficiency .....</b>	<b>10</b>
<b>Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....</b>	<b>11</b>
<b>Identification of Resource Needs .....</b>	<b>12</b>
<b>Early Detection and Intervention .....</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>Education Performance Audit Summary .....</b>	<b>14</b>

## INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Welch Elementary School in McDowell County was conducted November 19, 2009. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review was limited in scope and concentrated on the subgroups that failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP).

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

## TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Cindy L. Caldwell	Middle School Principal	Man Middle School Logan County
L. Alvin James	Elementary School Principal	Daniels Elementary School Raleigh County
Tammy L. Robinson	Elementary School Teacher	Rupert Elementary School Greenbrier County
Dorothy R. (Becky) Smith	Elementary School Principal	Stratton Elementary School Raleigh County

## SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

### 60 MCDOWELL COUNTY

Suzette Cook, Superintendent

### 222 WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Sandra Murensky, Principal

Grades PK - 05

Enrollment 340 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2007-08 enrollment report)

### WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	122	133	133	100.00	76.22	Yes	Yes	✓
White	92	102	102	100.00	75.00	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	29	30	30	100.00	79.31	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	103	112	112	100.00	71.84	Yes	Yes	✓
Spec. Ed.	10	10	10	100.00	20.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	122	133	133	100.00	70.49	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	92	102	102	100.00	70.65	Yes	Averaging	✓
Black	29	30	30	100.00	68.96	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	103	112	112	100.00	67.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	10	10	10	100.00	10.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**  
**Attendance Rate = 94.6%**

**60 MCDOWELL COUNTY**  
 Suzette Cook, Superintendent  
**222 WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed**  
 Sandra Murenky, Principal  
 Grades PK - 05  
 Enrollment 326 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2008-09 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2008-2009**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	124	139	139	100.00	54.83	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	93	105	105	100.00	58.06	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	30	32	32	100.00	43.33	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	98	110	110	100.00	51.02	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	12	14	14	100.00	33.33	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	124	139	139	100.00	45.16	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	93	105	105	100.00	44.08	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	30	32	32	100.00	46.66	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	98	110	110	100.00	41.83	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	12	14	14	100.00	25.00	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year  
 \* -- 0 students in subgroup  
 \*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**  
**Attendance Rate = 96.3%**

## WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

## Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	51	48	51	48	100.00	2.08	47.92	27.08	22.92	0.00	50.00
04	44	37	44	37	100.00	0.00	43.24	27.03	24.32	5.41	56.76
05	44	39	44	39	100.00	5.13	35.90	35.90	17.95	5.13	58.97

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	51	48	51	48	100.00	2.08	54.17	43.75	0.00	0.00	43.75
04	44	37	44	37	100.00	5.41	56.76	29.73	8.11	0.00	37.84
05	44	39	44	39	100.00	5.13	41.03	35.90	10.26	7.69	53.85

Enr. - Enrollment

FAY - Full Academic Year

Part. - Participation

## ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

### Met Standard.

#### 5.1.1. Achievement.

This is the 1st year that Welch Elementary School did not attain adequate yearly progress (AYP) in 5.1.1. Achievement. One subgroup designated in 5.1.1. Achievement was the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 10.6 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the school was notified of any subgroup that initially did not make AYP in one year on any indicator. Welch Elementary School and McDowell County were encouraged to revise the school and county Five-Year Strategic Plans when a subgroup is identified in any one year.

Welch Elementary School achieved AYP in the all students (AS) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts, the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup in reading/language arts, and the SES subgroup in mathematics only by application of the confidence interval. It is noted that the special education (SE) subgroup increased the percent proficient level in both mathematics and reading/language arts from the 2008-2009 school year, even though the WESTEST 2 was a more rigorous assessment than the previous WESTEST. The racial/ethnicity black (B) subgroup performed higher than the AS and W subgroups in reading/language arts.

The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address the performance of all subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

**Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 50.00 percent in mathematics and 56.25 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 43.24 percent in mathematics and 62.16 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 41.03 percent in mathematics and 46.15 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.**

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Using Excelsior and Acuity in the Classroom.
2. Policy 2421 and Policy 5902.
3. Technology Updates.
4. Framing Your Success.
5. Data-Driven Decision Making.
6. Discipline with Dignity.
7. Middle School Concepts.
8. Strategies for Teaching in the Block.
9. Five-Year Strategic Plan.

**EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT**  
**HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS**

**Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.**

**March 2006**

5.1.10. Library/educational technology access. Students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

A school library was not available. All books and periodicals are located in individual classrooms. No process for checking out books or purchasing new books and other library resources was observed. Funds must be budgeted annually for the purchase books and a procedure for checking books out and conducting research must be developed.

**FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**PARTIAL COMPLIANCE.** Due to the closing of Gary Elementary and the current school renovation, all books available were in the process of being centralized for student and teacher use. The Team questioned whether the county provided appropriate funding or a plan to provide funding for library books. The Team noted that the school partnered with the county library to provide “tubs/crates” of books for students.

**November 19, 2009**

**COMPLIANCE.** Current books were available for student use and the library was highly utilized.

5.5.2. Safe and healthy facilities. Buildings, grounds, furnishings, and equipment are free from observable safety hazards. (W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200)

The Team observed the following facility issues.

1. Emergency lighting in the kitchen stairwell was nonfunctional.
2. Ground Fault Circuit Interrupter (GFCI) receptacles in the kitchen were missing.
3. Exit lights were burned out in the kitchen.
4. The electrical panel in the stage area needed to be secured.
5. The playground was contaminated and damaged due to recent flooding. Although the area was “off-limits” during the school day, students utilized facilities after school. The Team recommended that existing gravel/ground cover in the play area be removed and replaced with sanitary cover/gravel.
6. The glass in the main entrance door was broken. The principal indicated it had been broken since August.



FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. Issues 1, 2, 3, 5, and 6, had been corrected. The electrical panel (4) in the stage area still needed to be secured.

November 19, 2009

**COMPLIANCE.** The electrical panel had been secured.

November 2009

**7.1. Curriculum**

**7.1.3. Learning environment. School staff provides a safe and nurturing environment that is conducive to learning. (Policy 2510)**

Proper classroom management was not evident in one Grade 1 classroom, to the level that it was a safety concern. The teacher yelled and tried to redirect the class, but students paid no attention to the teacher. One boy held up his glasses and broke them after playing with them for several minutes. Students were not on task and were not engaged in the learning process.

Students in Grade 4 reported harassment and bullying in the school and on the bus. They stated that the students do not report incidents of harassment to the office because they are “afraid of being beat up.” They said that when they reported it to the acting guidance counselor that the only punishment was to write from a dictionary for the students doing the bullying.

**7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child’s weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Teachers reported that Writing Roadmap was not utilized because the computer laboratory was not available. Teachers were struggling with how to teach writing and instruction in writing was not a part of the curriculum at least once per week in all classrooms.

**7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)**

Teachers stated that they did not have access to the computer laboratory. The computer laboratory was reportedly being fully utilized by the art teacher. The principal stated that time was available for the other classes to utilize the laboratory. A new computer laboratory was in the process of being developed.

### **7.7. Safe, Drug Free, Violence Free, and Disciplined Schools**

- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)**

Numerous students in Grade 4 reported that rules were inconsistently enforced. Grade 3 and 4 teachers stated that the rules and discipline were inconsistent and were not working to improve management of students.

### **7.8. Leadership**

- 7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)**

Due to the reported incidents of bullying and harassment at the school and the inconsistency of disciplinary procedures, along with the low test scores, the Team determined that assistance from the McDowell Central Office, the West Virginia Department of Education, and RESA 1 be sought to assist the building administrator in the operation of the school. The McDowell Central Office needs to take an active role in school improvement and to address the issues of the school.

## Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Welch Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. McDowell County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of McDowell County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.**

Student safety and security were a concern of the students. The principal must actively and aggressively correct the problem, or the perception of the problem, as this has the potential to negatively affect the learning process. Consistent and fair applications of the school and county discipline plan are necessary to correct this problem.

### **Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies**

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Welch Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team recommended that the McDowell County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Dr. Karen Huffman, Assistant Superintendent, Division of Educator Quality and System Support at 304-558-3199 to arrange a School Support System for correcting the deficiencies and improving student and school performance.

## Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

**According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.**

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not five acres plus one acre for each 100 students over 240.
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** The counselor's office did not have easy access to student records.
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, and on-line periodical indexes were not available.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility was not adequate in size and did not have counter space, mechanical ventilation, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas.

The music facility did not have music chairs with folding arms, music stands, a podium, or acoustical treatment.

The physical education facility was not located away from quiet areas of the building or acoustically treated and did not have direct access to outdoor or recreational areas. The facility did not have a drinking fountain, provisions for two or more teaching stations, a display case, a data projector or a 50 inch screen monitor.

- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A health service unit of adequate size was not available. The following equipment and furnishings were not available: Curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board, toilet, lavatory, scales, medicine chest, work counter, and desk and chair.

### **Early Detection and Intervention**

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

**The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.**

## **Education Performance Audit Summary**

The Team identified five high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

They include the following:

- 7.1.3. Learning environment.
- 7.1.6. Instruction in writing.
- 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.
- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations.
- 7.8.1. Leadership

The Team noted an indicator of efficiency and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Welch Elementary School's Education Performance Audit was limited in scope to the performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Welch Elementary School in improvement efforts.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Welch Elementary School and McDowell County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report.