



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

MCDOWELL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2013

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Education Performance Audit.....	8
High Quality Standards	8
Indicators of Efficiency	9
Early Detection and Intervention	11

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Welch Elementary School in McDowell County was conducted February 27, 2013. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Rhonda Crowley, Coordinator,
Office of Early Learning

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Lori G. Comer	Elementary School Principal	Whitethorn Elementary Mercer County
Denver E. Drake	Middle School Principal	Braxton County Middle Braxton County
Mary Alice Kaufman	Board Member	Mercer County
Timothy M. Via	Elementary School Principal	Davis Elementary Braxton County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY

James Brown, Superintendent

222 WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Sandra Murenskey, Principal

Grades PK-05

Enrollment 312 (2nd month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2010-2011

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	126	138	137	99.27	29.36	Yes	No	✗
White	89	98	97	98.97	29.21	Yes	No	✗
Black	36	37	37	100.00	30.55	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	13	16	16	100.00	7.69	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	99	109	109	100.00	27.27	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	126	138	137	99.27	34.12	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
White	89	98	97	98.97	31.46	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
Black	36	37	37	100.00	41.66	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	13	16	16	100.00	15.38	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	99	109	109	100.00	31.31	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 96.0%

60 MCDOWELL COUNTY
 James Brown, Superintendent
222 WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement
 Kristy East, Principal
 Grades PK-05
 Enrollment 334 (2nd month 2011-2012 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2011-2012

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	126	135	135	100.00	35.71	Yes	No	X
White	89	97	97	100.00	38.20	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
Black	35	36	36	100.00	28.57	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	22	24	24	100.00	18.18	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	93	99	99	100.00	36.55	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	126	135	135	100.00	31.74	Yes	No	X
White	89	97	97	100.00	35.95	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	35	36	36	100.00	20.00	NA	NA	NA
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	22	24	24	100.00	9.09	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	93	99	99	100.00	30.10	Yes	No	X
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 95.2%

WELCH ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	42	40	42	40	100.00	27.50	45.00	17.50	7.50	2.50	27.50
04	46	42	46	42	100.00	21.43	30.95	40.48	4.76	2.38	47.62
05	47	44	47	44	100.00	43.18	25.00	15.91	13.64	2.27	31.82

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
03	42	40	42	40	100.00	35.00	40.00	22.50	2.50	0.00	25.00
04	46	42	46	42	100.00	26.19	35.71	23.81	14.29	0.00	38.10
05	47	44	47	44	100.00	43.18	25.00	25.00	4.55	2.27	31.82

Enr. - Enrollment
 FAY - Full Academic Year
 Part. - Participation

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Below Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Welch Elementary School failed to achieve adequately yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement. Two subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement, included: All students (AS) subgroup in mathematics and reading/language arts and economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 9.4 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the West Virginia Board of Education continued the school's Conditional Accreditation status at the February 10, 2013 State Board meeting.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class revealed that students in Grade 4 performed at the highest level in mathematics with 47.62 percent proficient. Students in Grade 3 performed at 27.50 percent proficient and students in Grade 5 performed at 31.82 percent proficient. Students in Grade 4 also performed at the highest level in reading with 38.10 percent proficient. Students in Grade 3 performed at 25.00 percent proficient, while students in Grade 5 performed at 31.82 percent proficient.

Changes from the 2010-2011 WESTEST2 to the 2011-2012 WESTEST2 are depicted below.

<u>Mathematics</u>	<u>2010-2011</u>	<u>2011-2012</u>	<u>Gains/Losses</u>
All Students (AS)	29.36	35.71	+6.35
Racial/Ethnicity White (W)	29.21	38.20	+8.99
Racial/Ethnicity Black (B)	30.55	28.57	-1.98
Special Education (SE)	7.69	18.18	+10.49
Economically Disadvantaged(SES)	27.27	36.55	+9.28
<u>Reading/Language Arts</u>	<u>2010-2011</u>	<u>2011-2012</u>	<u>Gains/Losses</u>
All Students (AS)	34.12	31.74	-2.38
Racial/Ethnicity White (W)	31.46	35.95	+4.49
Racial/Ethnicity Black (B)	41.66	20.00	-21.66
Special Education (SE)	15.38	9.09	-6.29
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	31.31	30.10	-1.21

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Framing Your Success.
2. Everyday Math Classroom Support.
3. Next Generation/Common Core.
4. Writing Strategies, Reading Strategies, and Test Talks.
5. Climate and Culture.
6. WVEIS WOW Discipline Management System and Interventions.
7. Sticks and Stones Exposed: Facing Life's Goliaths.
8. Understanding Poverty.
9. Support for Personalized Learning.
10. Data Analysis.
11. Technology Issues.
12. Engrade Grading System.
13. School Improvement Conferences.
14. MimioSprout.
15. Balancing Conflict and Building Relationships.
16. Working with Parents.
17. Number Talks.
18. TechSteps.
19. Title I Collaboration.
20. Cultural Typology Survey.
21. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4373: Expected Behaviors in Safe and Supportive Schools.
22. Let's Move.
23. Read Well.
24. Beginning Teacher Academy.
25. Principal Leadership Academy.
26. Instructional Practices Inventory.
27. APL Instructional Skills and Strategies for the Experienced and Novice Teacher.
28. Lexia Reading Program.
29. Utilizing Data Notebooks.
30. Leadership Redefined.
31. WESTEST2 Data Analysis.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

The Education Performance findings of noncompliance (7.1.3 Learning environment; 7.1.6 Instruction in writing; 7.1.7 Library/educational technology access and technology application; 7.7.1 School rules, procedures, and expectations; 7.8.1 Leadership) presented in the January 2010 report had been corrected.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

One Grade 3 teacher did not challenge students. Students were off task and not redirected in a timely manner. A student was sleeping for an extended amount of time. Instructional strategies did not vary during the observation period and student attention began to wane.

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Grades 3 and 5 did not have the required number of instructional minutes, as indicated by the teachers' classroom schedule. Grade 3 had 15 minutes per day for "Data Notebooks", which teachers and students stated that the time was used to get ready for the end of the day departure. This time was not counted as instructional time.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Welch Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. McDowell County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of McDowell County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The principal was in her second year at the school and had shown great organization and knowledge of the needs of the school and students. High quality professional development had been integrated to address areas of weakness. Teachers indicated that they believed that the professional development provided had greatly increased the quality of teaching in the building. Team members observed high quality instruction in a majority of the classes and high expectations were evident in most situations. The dramatic decline in achievement in the special education (SE) and the racial/ethnicity black (B) subgroups in reading/language arts was alarming. A strong focus of assistance must be provided in these areas.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Welch Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Under the leadership of the principal, the Team believed that Welch Elementary School has the capacity to correct the deficiencies found. The principal must remain vigilant in classroom observations and curriculum delivery and provide assistance and materials for the teachers to deliver high quality instruction.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

- 19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

The Facility Team identified facility resource needs which are presented in the McDowell County School System Report under 7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The administration and staff of Welch Elementary School had conducted excellent data analysis and was working to implement programs and practices to address areas of weakness based on the data. Assistance must continue to be solicited from county and State educational personnel to assist in this endeavor.