



INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

FAIRDALE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

RALEIGH COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MARCH 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability - Analysis	8
High Quality Standards	9
Education Performance Audit.....	9
Indicators Of Efficiency.....	10
Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies.....	11
Identification Of Resource Needs.....	12
Early Detection And Intervention	13
Education Performance Audit Summary	14

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Fairdale Elementary School in Raleigh County was conducted December 11, 2013. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are persistently below standard and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Technology – Gloria Burdette, eLearning
Program Assistant, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Stephen B. Comer	Elementary School Principal	Glenwood Elementary School Mercer County
Mary Alice Kaufman	Board Member	Mercer County
Rebecca J. Peery	Primary School Principal	Memorial Primary School Mercer County
Ann E. Smith	Elementary School Principal	White Sulphur Elementary School Greenbrier County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

74 RALEIGH COUNTY

James G. Brown, Superintendent

211 FAIRDALE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – SUPPORT

Rachel Martin, Principal

Grades PK-05, Enrollment 508 (2nd month 2012-2013 enrollment report)

In 2013, West Virginia received waiver approval from certain federal rules and deadlines under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). West Virginia received approval to use its own accountability system which was developed to more effectively identify struggling schools and better direct resources to struggling schools (2013 ESEA Results). Every public school in the state is designated as a **SUCCESS, TRANSITION, FOCUS, SUPPORT** or **PRIORITY** school.

The West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) designated Fairdale Elementary School a Support school. The majority of student groups have not met the annual academic goals in mathematics and reading/language arts; and the school has not reached its goals in attendance or graduation rates, student academic growth, and learning gaps between student groups. The school must show progress in student achievement each year to maintain or improve this designation. A school's designation is determined once a year based on prior school year data, including WESTEST2 results.

Designation Status for Fairdale Elementary School.

Designation:	SUPPORT	Next Year's Target:	57.8288
Index Score:	35.2989	Met at least 50% of targets in Mathematics and Reading:	NO
Index Target:	55.0222	Met Participation Rate Indicator:	YES
Met Index Target:	NO		

Supporting Data

Proficiency (40% of the index score)	9.03
Achievement Gaps Closed (20% of the index score)	6.62
Observed Growth (15% of the index score)	6.88
Adequate Growth (20% of the index score)	8.00
<u>Attendance Rate (5% of the index score)</u>	<u>4.77</u>
Total Accountability Index (out of 100)	35.30

The West Virginia Accountability Index targets are set for each school to reach progressively higher performance on a defined set of data. Schools have an overall score based on multiple components of student and school performance. All schools were required to meet the same end point, thus defining school-specific trajectories requiring higher rates of improvement for lower performing schools. Targets comprised of the five components listed above are set with a goal of all elementary schools in West Virginia reaching 74.6679 by 2020. Proficiency targets are set at 75 percent for all students in all subgroups by 2020.

Fairdale Elementary School did not achieve the Accountability Index Target for the 2013-2014 school year. Considering the achievement target index of 57.8288 for 2014 and the proficiency target of 75 percent by 2020, with a current index score of 35.2589, Fairdale Elementary School has a steep trajectory to achieve both short term and long term targets. A significant gap exists in both the WVAI target and the target of 75 percent proficient by 2020.

**FAIRDALE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Grade-Level Proficiency Data
School Year 2013**

Grade-Level and Subgroup		Mathematics			Reading/Language Arts		
Grade	Group	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient
3	White	> 95%	77.01%	22.99%	> 95%	70.11%	29.89%
3	Special Education	> 95%	>95%	< 5%	> 95%	94.44%	5.56%
3	Low Socioeconomic Status	> 95%	84.78%	15.22%	> 95%	84.78%	15.22%
3	Total	> 95%	77.01%	22.99%	> 95%	70.11%	29.89%
4	White	92.86%	50.00%	50.00%	92.86%	59.62%	40.38%
4	Special Education	> 95%	83.33%	16.67%	> 95%	83.33%	16.67%
4	Low Socioeconomic Status	93.33%	71.43%	28.57%	93.33%	67.86%	32.14%
4	Total	92.86%	50.00%	50.00%	92.86%	59.62%	40.38%
5	White	> 95%	55.56%	44.44%	> 95%	56.94%	43.06%
5	Special Education	90.91%	80.00%	20.00%	90.91%	90.00%	10.00%
5	Low Socioeconomic Status	> 95%	65.22%	34.78%	> 95%	67.39%	32.61%
5	Total	> 95%	55.56%	44.44%	> 95%	56.94%	43.06%

Attendance Rate = 95.40%

The chart, Grade-Level Proficiency Data for School Year 2013, depicts participation, non-proficient, and proficient percentage rates by grade level and subgroup for mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics. In mathematics, Grade 4 students at 50.00 percent proficient substantially outperformed Grade 3 students (22.99 percent proficient) and outperformed Grade 5 students (44.44 percent proficient). Students with disabilities performed less than 5 percent proficient in Grade 3, 16.67 percent proficient in Grade 4, and 20.00 percent proficient in Grade 5. Progression of low socioeconomic students showed the same pattern with students with disabilities 15.22 percent proficient in Grade 3, 28.57 percent proficient in Grade 4, and 34.78 percent proficient in Grade 5.

Reading. In reading, Grade 5 students at 43.06 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 students (40.38 percent proficient) and both Grades 4 and 5 performed higher than Grade 3 (29.89 percent proficient). Students with disabilities performed 5.56 percent proficient in Grade 3, performed higher 16.67 percent proficient in Grade 4, and performed 10.00 percent proficient in Grade 5. Low socioeconomic students performed lowest in Grade 3 (15.22 percent proficient), considerably higher in Grade 4 (32.14 percent proficient), and remained steady in Grade 5 (32.61 percent proficient).

FAIRDALE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group

**Note: Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST2 score.*

Low	between 1-34th percentile
Typical	between 35th-65th percentile
High	between 66th-99th percentile

Subgroup		Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
		Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
All Sub-Group	School	45 (35%)	40 (31%)	43 (34%)	49.0	37.3%	45 (35%)	42 (33%)	41 (32%)	49.0	37.3%
	County	2,124 (33%)	1,931 (30%)	2,367 (37%)	52.0	49.0%	2,247 (35%)	1,992 (31%)	2,170 (34%)	49.0	52.3%
	State	51,165 (35%)	45,256 (31%)	50,057 (34%)	50.0	45.1%	50,484 (35%)	45,076 (31%)	50,227 (34%)	50.0	48.8%
White Sub-Group	School	45 (35%)	40 (31%)	43 (34%)	49.0	37.3%	45 (35%)	42 (33%)	41 (32%)	49.0	37.3%
	County	1,843 (33%)	1,662 (30%)	2,103 (38%)	53.0	50.9%	1,958 (35%)	1,750 (31%)	1,890 (34%)	49.0	53.3%
	State	47,034 (35%)	41,704 (31%)	46,085 (34%)	50.0	45.7%	46,584 (35%)	41,462 (31%)	46,170 (34%)	50.0	49.2%
Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	41.0	8.6%	*	*	*	25.0	8.6%
	County	255 (42%)	171 (28%)	179 (30%)	42.0	23.4%	236 (39%)	168 (28%)	196 (33%)	47.0	19.8%
	State	7,956 (43%)	5,628 (31%)	4,781 (26%)	41.0	18.3%	7,406 (41%)	5,488 (30%)	5,291 (29%)	43.0	16.1%
Non-Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	37 (33%)	34 (31%)	40 (36%)	50.0	42.7%	34 (31%)	38 (34%)	39 (35%)	50.0	42.7%
	County	1,869 (32%)	1,760 (30%)	2,188 (38%)	53.0	52.3%	2,011 (35%)	1,824 (31%)	1,974 (34%)	50.0	56.5%
	State	43,209 (34%)	39,628 (31%)	45,276 (35%)	51.0	49.6%	43,078 (34%)	39,588 (31%)	44,936 (35%)	51.0	54.2%
LSES Sub-Group	School	30 (40%)	20 (27%)	25 (33%)	41.0	27.0%	26 (35%)	23 (31%)	26 (35%)	49.0	26.2%
	County	1,193 (35%)	1,024 (30%)	1,144 (34%)	50.0	38.0%	1,213 (36%)	1,051 (31%)	1,086 (32%)	48.0	41.7%
	State	26,545 (38%)	21,619 (31%)	22,119 (31%)	47.0	37.5%	25,763 (37%)	21,435 (31%)	22,576 (32%)	47.0	40.8%
Non-LSES Sub-Group	School	15 (28%)	20 (38%)	18 (34%)	52.0	51.1%	19 (36%)	19 (36%)	15 (28%)	47.0	52.1%
	County	931 (30%)	907 (30%)	1,223 (40%)	55.0	61.8%	1,034 (34%)	941 (31%)	1,084 (35%)	51.0	64.6%
	State	24,620 (32%)	23,637 (31%)	27,938 (37%)	52.0	58.1%	24,721 (33%)	23,641 (31%)	27,651 (36%)	52.0	62.5%
Male Sub-Group	School	30 (42%)	20 (28%)	22 (31%)	42.0	31.6%	30 (42%)	24 (33%)	18 (25%)	44.0	29.1%
	County	1,160 (36%)	957 (29%)	1,139 (35%)	49.0	47.5%	1,225 (38%)	995 (31%)	1,030 (32%)	47.0	44.5%
	State	27,113 (37%)	22,439 (30%)	24,615 (33%)	48.0	44.3%	27,485 (37%)	22,259 (30%)	24,047 (33%)	47.0	41.0%
Female Sub-Group	School	15 (27%)	20 (36%)	21 (38%)	55.0	43.7%	15 (27%)	18 (32%)	23 (41%)	58.0	46.6%
	County	964 (30%)	974 (31%)	1,228 (39%)	55.0	50.7%	1,022 (32%)	997 (32%)	1,140 (36%)	52.0	60.4%
	State	24,052 (33%)	22,817 (32%)	25,442 (35%)	51.0	45.9%	22,999 (32%)	22,817 (32%)	26,180 (36%)	52.0	56.9%

**Note: Schools are those schools that have at least a 4th grade.*

**Denotes cell size <20.*

The chart, Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group, identifies the percent proficient of Fairdale Elementary School's students in each subgroup, as well as the county and State percent proficient. In addition, subgroup growth is presented and represented to be low, typical, or high based on previous performance. All subgroups demonstrated typical growth in mathematics. The special education subgroup demonstrated low growth in reading/language arts and all other subgroups demonstrated typical growth.

Schoolwide, 37.3 percent of students were proficient in mathematics and 37.3 percent of students were proficient in reading/language arts.

- 8.6 percent of special education students were proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts compared to non-special education students with 42.7 percent proficient in both subjects. This indicated a 34.1 percent gap.
- 27.0 percent of the low socioeconomic students were proficient in mathematics compared to 51.1 percent of non-low socioeconomic students, which indicated a 24.1 percent gap.
- 31.6 percent of male students were proficient in mathematics compared to 43.7 percent proficient of female students, which indicated a 12.1 percent gap.
- 26.2 percent of low socioeconomic students were proficient in reading/language arts compared to 52.1 percent proficient of non-low socioeconomic students, which indicated a 25.9 percent gap.
- 29.1 percent of male students were proficient in reading/language arts compared to 46.6 percent of female students, which indicated a 17.5 percent gap.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY - ANALYSIS

Fairdale Elementary School is an average sized school performing significantly below the county and State averages in reading/language arts and mathematics in every subgroup. Provided the target is 75 percent proficient in all subgroups, Fairdale Elementary has a steep trajectory to achieve this level by 2020.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. iPad Training.
2. Edwards Group Training for Title I Schools.
3. Advance Mac Book Training.
4. Policy 5000.
5. Enhancing Staff Performance.
6. Raleigh County Schools Elementary Teachers Training.
7. Apple Training for Elementary Teachers.
8. Engrade.
9. Infusing Technology.
10. 2013 National Conference on College and Career Readiness and Common Core Standards.
11. Common Core: A Framework for Teaching and Learning.
12. ECERS-R Training and Scheduling.
13. Just for Kids: Mandated Reporting and Child Abuse Training.
14. West Virginia Writes.
15. Youth Suicide: Awareness and Prevention.
16. Diversity Awareness: Staff to Staff and Staff to Student.
17. Raleigh County Curriculum Council.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including reteaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

While the Team noted high expectations in many of the classes, four teachers did not exhibit high expectations for all students in their class. The questioning in these classes was at a Depth of Knowledge Level 1, with basic recall the predominant instructional practice. Students were not challenged to work at higher levels of cognition and were not provided a challenging curriculum that would foster higher achievement. This factor is unquestionably one of the causes for the school's accountability designation as a SUPPORT school.

Two teachers were having students use iPads throughout the 30 minute OEPA Team observation; however, the instruction consisted of low level skills. Students were not challenged to increase achievement through the instruction provided.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510, physical education was not being offered to all students three times per week, 30 minutes per day as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

The Team could not verify through staff interviews that the guidance counselor was meeting with students at least 75 percent of the school day. When asked about a counseling log, the guidance counselor stated that she did not keep a current counseling log. The Team was given a counseling schedule, which did not indicate 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Fairdale Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Raleigh County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Raleigh County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The area of high expectations and related instructional practices is a great concern. Teachers must challenge all students to work at their highest levels of ability and provide an interesting and interactive curriculum to increase student achievement. The school is currently scoring approximately nine percentage points below the State in mathematics and reading/language arts percent proficient, and low expectations is almost certainly a contributing factor. The principal must actively monitor classroom instruction and ensure that all teachers are presenting rigorous content. Additional professional development, both schoolwide and individually, will need to be implemented to achieve this task.

This is the first year for the principal at Fairdale Elementary School. The principal was well-organized and knowledgeable of the school's needs and has been providing professional development and administrative leadership to effect change. The principal has a positive and proactive demeanor, and the Team believed that the principal possesses the leadership qualities that will guide the school in the proper direction. The principal will need to know what effective student learning involves and facilitate it in all classrooms in the school. The principal stated that the Raleigh County Central Office provides a great deal of assistance through professional development, financial resources, and leadership to enable positive changes in the school.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Fairdale Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

Building Capacity - Support

Having been designated a Support School, Fairdale Elementary School will receive services from various agencies. The majority of these services will be led by the local school district, with support from the Regional Education Service Agency (RESA 1) and the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE). The school will complete a targeted strategic plan and will be monitored throughout the year to review progress. The local school system and the local RESA will partner to provide professional development, technical assistance, interventions and develop an improvement plan. The school must show progress in student achievement each year to improve this designation. A school's designation is determined each year based on prior school year data, including WESTEST2 results.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

Through the principal's leadership and the support given by the Raleigh County Central Office, the Team determined that the staff of Fairdale Elementary School has the potential to develop the capacity to correct the deficiencies identified in the Education Performance Audit report and improve student achievement. The principal and staff will need to step up the level of instruction to match the needs of students.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, and on-line periodical indexes were not available. (Adversely impacts program and student performance.)
- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** Storage was not adequate in the classrooms. (Did not adversely impact program and student performance.)
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facilities did not have adequate storage, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas. The music facilities were not located away from quiet areas of the building and did not have an instructor's station or acoustical treatment. (Adversely impacts program and student performance.)
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A bulletin board, toilet, and lavatory were not available. (May adversely impact health and safety.)

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The principal, with assistance of the Raleigh County Central Office, has provided the teachers an abundance of data to show the areas of curricular weakness. The teachers were articulate about the methods used to disaggregate data and discussed the varying classroom curriculum based on the data. It will take some time for changes to come into effect; however, the Team believed these necessary changes will happen. The principal and county office must thoroughly and consistently monitor to insure relevant professional development is incorporated in each classroom and teachers' change traditional classroom practices to those involving uncovering meaning, making connections, and integrating content.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Fairdale Elementary School's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Fairdale Elementary School in improvement efforts.

The Team identified three high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

7.1.2. High expectations.

7.1.9. Programs of study.

7.2.2. Counseling services.

The Team noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted elements of early detection and intervention.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Fairdale Elementary School and Raleigh County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.