



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

GEARY ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL

ROANE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Office of Education Performance Audits

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Geary Elementary/Middle School in Roane County was conducted March 31, 2010.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Geary Elementary/Middle School was conducted February 14, 2012. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

79 ROANE COUNTY

Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent

202 GEARY ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement

Brenda Chadwell, Principal

Grades PK - 08

Enrollment 310 (2nd month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	173	188	187	99.46	65.11	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	172	187	186	99.46	64.91	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	111	124	123	99.19	55.45	Yes	Confidence Interval - Averaging	✓
Spec. Ed.	32	38	38	100.00	12.50	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	173	188	187	99.46	72.67	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	172	187	186	99.46	72.51	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	111	124	123	99.19	65.45	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	32	38	38	100.00	18.75	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.3%**

79 ROANE COUNTY
Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent
202 GEARY ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement
Brenda Chadwell, Principal
Grades PK - 08
Enrollment 314 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	188	201	201	100.00	46.27	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	187	198	198	100.00	45.98	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	127	138	138	100.00	34.64	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	33	34	34	100.00	3.03	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	188	201	201	100.00	48.93	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	187	198	198	100.00	48.66	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Low SES	127	138	138	100.00	40.15	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	33	34	34	100.00	12.12	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.1%**

79 ROANE COUNTY
Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent
202 GEARY ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL – Passed

Brenda Chadwell, Principal
Grades PK - 08
Enrollment 319 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	189	206	206	100.00	31.74	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	188	204	204	100.00	31.91	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	30	32	32	100.00	6.66	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	125	139	139	100.00	24.80	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	189	206	206	100.00	34.92	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	188	204	204	100.00	35.10	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	30	32	32	100.00	3.33	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	125	139	139	100.00	25.60	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Attendance Rate = 96.6%

79 ROANE COUNTY
Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent
202 GEARY ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL – Needs Improvement
Brenda Chadwell, Principal
Grades PK - 08
Enrollment 318 (2nd month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2010-2011

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	188	197	196	99.49	35.10	Yes	No	X
White	184	193	192	99.48	34.23	Yes	No	X
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	30	32	32	100.00	3.33	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	126	134	133	99.25	26.98	Yes	No	X
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	188	197	196	99.49	48.40	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	184	193	192	99.48	47.28	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	30	32	32	100.00	13.33	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	126	134	133	99.25	38.88	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year
* -- 0 students in subgroup
** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed
Attendance Rate = 97.6%

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Below Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Geary Elementary/Middle School failed to achieve adequately yearly progress (AYP) in Achievement for the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts. In accordance with Section 9.5 of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320, *A Process for Improving Education: Performance Based Accreditation System*, the West Virginia Board of Education issued the school Temporary Accreditation status at the December 2009 State Board meeting.

Geary Elementary/Middle School achieved AYP in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored exceedingly low in mathematics and reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 60.00 percent in mathematics and 47.50 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 57.14 percent in mathematics and 57.14 percent in reading; Grade 5 – 58.82 percent in mathematics and 55.89 percent in reading; Grade 7 – 48.48 percent in mathematics and 54.55 percent in reading; Grade 8 – 63.34 percent in mathematics and 60.00 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Analyzing the West Virginia 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs).
2. DIBELS Analysis and Yearly Overview.
3. WESTEST2 Analysis.
4. GradeQuick and Edline.
5. Reading First.
6. Five-Year Strategic Plan.
7. Mathematics Webinar.
7. Deconstructing the CSOs.
8. Acuity.
9. Response to Intervention.
10. Working with Students.
11. West Virginia Basic Skills/Odyssey.
12. Standards Based Instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

ACHIEVED STANDARD. The percentage of student's scoring at the proficiency level on the 2011 WESTEST2 improved for all subgroups except the special education (SE) subgroup in mathematics. Improvement from the 2009-2010 WESTEST2 to the 2010-2011 WESTEST2 included -
Mathematics: all students (AS) (+3.36 percent), racial/ethnicity white (W) (+2.32 percent), and economically disadvantaged (SES) (+2.18 percent).
Reading/language arts: AS (+13.48 percent), W (+12.18 percent), and SES (+13.28 percent).

This is the 1st year that Geary Elementary/Middle School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in one or more subgroups designated in 5.1.1. Achievement. Geary Elementary/Middle School failed to achieve AYP in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups in mathematics for the 2010-2011 school year. Although not large enough to constitute a subgroup for accountability, the special education (SE) subgroup needs attention and plans for improved performance.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

It was not apparent that the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) were the basis for the curriculum in at least one-third of the classes. The curriculum in these classes was based on the textbooks, workbooks, and worksheets. Teachers in these classes stated that they rely mainly on the textbooks as “they address the West Virginia CSOs.”

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) were driving the curriculum in all classrooms. Teachers stated that textbooks still play a role in curriculum delivery; however, the role of the textbook was one of a resource. Teachers made curricular decisions based on the CSOs, data analysis, and basic student needs.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

High expectations were not evident in the classrooms by instructional practices or from the administrative practices that assure curriculum rich instruction by teachers. Higher level learning skills and instructional techniques were not being utilized in the classrooms and the principal did not give evidence of requiring the teachers to have high expectations of students. The status quo was the general practice in classes.

Special education students in the pull out classes received instruction of extremely low level. For example, a special education teacher read to students and then asked them what they inferred from the information read to them. Students were instructed to look words up which they were unsure from the teacher’s reading. The pace of the class was very slow and the class worked on Lessons 6-9 for a month and a half. In one math class, direction was not given for the lesson. Students worked on whiteboards and a student would call out the answer to the problem. The teacher only checked that student’s answers and did not give feedback on the problem or review the work of the other students. Additionally, students were borderline rude with teachers i.e., in one class, a student stated ‘I’m bored.’

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. The Team observed high expectations in all general education classes. All students were challenged with high quality instruction. The staff had received staff development on high expectations and engaging all students.

The school had two special education teachers. One of the teachers had excellent instruction and kept all students challenged and engaged with high quality and interesting instruction. The other teacher was a long term substitute and did not keep all students engaged and the instruction that did occur was of extremely low level. This teacher was the full time teacher who was originally cited in the draft report.

7.1.4. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510, Assuring the Quality of Education: Regulations for Education Programs (hereinafter Policy 2510). (Policy 2510)

At least six or seven teachers stated in interviews that they were not providing at least 50 percent hands-on activities in science instruction. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2520.3: *21st Century Science K-8 Content Standards and Objectives for West Virginia Schools* states, "Students will engage in active inquiries, investigations, and hands-on activities for a minimum of 50% of the instructional time to develop conceptual understand and research/laboratory skills."

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All teachers exceeded science instruction that included 50 percent active inquiry, investigations, and hands-on activities. Evidence of this was found through teacher interviews, student interviews, and a check of lesson plans.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The principal indicated that professional development in standards based instruction had been provided; however, the Team saw no indication that it was being applied effectively. Classroom instructional delivery fell short of instructional practices to provide students the opportunity to master the 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs). Teaching strategies and learning activities were not implemented according to students' needs to achieve 21st Century learning skills. Instruction was not clearly organized, appropriately sequenced, nor did it link new information with prior knowledge or connect information across content areas.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Instruction in all the general education classrooms was high quality and students were interested and fully engaged in the class. A wide variety of instructional strategies were implemented to provide all students the opportunity to learn. Instruction was geared toward mastering the West Virginia 21st Century learning skills.

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)

The Team observed minimal amounts of technology being applied throughout all programs of study during the day of the Education Performance Audit. A total of seven classroom computers and one smartboard were seen in use. The computer laboratory was being used for the Golden Horseshoe test.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. All teachers and students were using technology to very high levels. A wide variety of technology was available both in the classrooms and in the computer laboratory. Students indicated that they were exposed to all of the technology at the school on a frequent basis.

7.2. Student and School Performance

7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)

While the school had an abundance of student data and data had been disaggregated, it was not evident that the data were used to meet students' instructional and learning needs. Teachers and the principal could not discuss how the data were used to guide classroom activities. There was no connection between the achievement data and the curriculum and instructional practices to improve student achievement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Roane County Central Office had assisted the school in providing a multitude of data for teacher use. All teachers were fluent in the variety of data that was being used to guide curriculum at the school. Team members were shown data books that the teachers were using to aid in decision making.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Geary Elementary/Middle School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Roane County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Roane County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

Until all teachers exhibit high expectations for all students and provide a content rich and meaningful curriculum, student achievement will not increase. All students must be challenged and active participants in the classes.

The West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) must be the basis for the curriculum. The textbook and other supplemental materials must serve to implement the CSOs rather than guide the curriculum.

While the data had been analyzed, the principal could not discuss how this data were covered by the teachers in the classrooms. A disconnect existed between what the results of the WESTEST2 showed and how the curriculum was applied to address items not mastered on the assessment.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

A great deal of work had occurred at the school in high expectations, implementation of the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs), and data analysis. Teachers were embracing these areas and stated that formal and informal testing results verified student improvement. The WESTEST2 that will be given this spring will be the true test of the overall effectiveness of the work that had been done at the school.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Geary Elementary/Middle School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

Capacity building needs to be developed for educators at the school in strategically targeting resources to the teaching and learning process as indicated in the Five-Year Strategic Plan to improve student and school achievement.

Student and school achievement continued to be deficient. The combination of long standing practices, poor student performance, and disconnected instruction relative to students' needs showed a lack of capacity for alleviating deficiencies and improving student achievement.

The Team recommended that the Roane County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Mr. Charles Heinlein, Executive Director, Office of Organizational Effectiveness & Leadership at 304-558-3199 to arrange a School Support System for correcting the deficiencies and improving student and school performance.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

Geary Elementary/Middle School and Roane County had developed the capacity to correct nearly all of the original citations in the initial Education Performance Audit Report. Team members reported high quality instruction in all general education classrooms and great efforts to incorporate the data analysis, West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs), and the needs of the school as defined in the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan to increase student achievement.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (*Policy 6200 and Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** Sufficient workspace and privacy were not provided.
- 19.1.3. Teachers' workroom.** Adequate workspace was not provided.
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** Adequate workspace, privacy, and easy access to student records were not provided.
- 19.1.7. K classrooms.** The Kindergarten classroom did not have at least 50 feet per child.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The art facility lacked adequate size, did not have adequate storage, and did not have counter space and black-out areas.

- 19.1.11. Grades 6-12 science facilities.** The science facilities did not have the following equipment and materials: Sink, hot and cold water, gas, AC and DC current, compressed air, ventilation fume hood, demo table, sufficient laboratory workspace, fire extinguisher, blanket, emergency showers, first aid kit, and main gas shut-off.
- 19.1.12. Grades 7-12 auditorium/stage.** Broadcasting capabilities and controlled illumination were not provided.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** Seating for dining and study purposes and a teachers' dining area were not provided.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** Adequate space was not provided. A refrigerator with locked storage and desk and chair were not provided.

FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION

With construction of the new section at the school, all areas listed above had been corrected.

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY

Geary Elementary/Middle School had received assistance from the Roane County Central Office, RESA 5, and the West Virginia Department of Education to correct the deficiencies found in the original Education Performance Audit. The Team believed that student achievement will increase due to these efforts.

SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
79-202 Geary Elementary/Middle	Full Accreditation			

Education Performance Audit Summary

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Accreditation status of Geary Elementary/Middle School.