



**Office of Education  
Performance Audits**

**FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT**

**FOR**

**SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL**

**ROANE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM**

**MAY 2012**

**WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION**

*Office of Education Performance Audits*

## INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Spencer Elementary School in Roane County was conducted April 1, 2010.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Spencer Elementary School was conducted February 16, 2012. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

## SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

### 79 ROANE COUNTY

Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent

### 205 SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed

Dr. William Chapman, Principal

Grades PK - 04

Enrollment 565 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2007-2008 enrollment report)

### WESTEST 2007-2008

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	193	203	203	100.00	70.46	Yes	Averaging	✓
White	185	195	195	100.00	71.35	Yes	Averaging	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	116	125	125	100.00	64.65	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	29	31	31	100.00	48.27	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	193	203	203	100.00	76.16	Yes	Yes	✓
White	185	195	195	100.00	76.21	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	116	125	125	100.00	70.68	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	29	31	31	100.00	44.82	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**

**Attendance Rate = 97.0%**

**79 ROANE COUNTY**  
Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent  
**205 SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed**  
Dr. William Chapman, Principal  
Grades PK - 04  
Enrollment 538 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2008-2009**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	192	204	204	100.00	53.64	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	189	201	201	100.00	53.96	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	129	140	140	100.00	45.73	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Spec. Ed.	45	49	49	100.00	26.66	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	192	204	204	100.00	48.43	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	189	201	201	100.00	49.20	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Low SES	129	140	140	100.00	40.31	Yes	No	✗
Spec. Ed.	45	49	49	100.00	15.55	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**  
**Attendance Rate = 96.6%**

**79 ROANE COUNTY**  
 Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent  
**205 SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Needs Improvement**  
 Dr. William Chapman, Principal  
 Grades PK - 04  
 Enrollment 559 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2009-2010**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	176	179	179	100.00	28.40	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	174	177	177	100.00	27.58	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	48	48	48	100.00	14.58	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	125	128	128	100.00	21.60	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	176	179	179	100.00	28.97	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	174	177	177	100.00	28.73	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	48	48	48	100.00	12.50	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	125	128	128	100.00	20.00	Yes	No	✗
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**

**Attendance Rate = 96.5%**

**79 ROANE COUNTY**  
 Stephen F. Goffreda, Superintendent  
**205 SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – Passed**  
 Dr. William Chapman, Principal  
 Grades PK - 04  
 Enrollment 531 (2<sup>nd</sup> month 2010-2011 enrollment report)

**WESTEST 2010-2011**

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
<b>Mathematics</b>								
All	159	175	172	98.28	39.24	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
White	156	171	168	98.24	38.70	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	36	37	36	97.29	31.42	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	105	120	117	97.50	29.80	Yes	Safe Harbors	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
<b>Reading/Language Arts</b>								
All	159	175	172	98.28	44.93	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	156	171	168	98.24	44.51	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	36	37	36	97.29	37.14	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	105	120	117	97.50	37.50	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

\* -- 0 students in subgroup

\*\* -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

**Passed**

**Attendance Rate = 97.3%**

## ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

### Met Standard.

#### 5.1.1. Achievement.

Spencer Elementary School failed to achieve adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup in reading/language arts for the 2008-2009 school year. Spencer Elementary School achieved AYP in the all students (AS), the racial/ethnicity white (W), and the SES subgroups in mathematics, and the AS and W subgroup in reading/language arts only by application of the confidence interval. It is further noted that the special education (SE) subgroup with the number (N) less than 50, scored far below the State's percent proficient level in mathematics and reading/language arts. The county curriculum staff and school staff are urged to address these subgroups in the county and school Five-Year Strategic Plans and apply interventions to improve achievement of all students.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery in both mathematics and reading: Grade 3 – 43.48 percent in mathematics and 52.17 percent in reading; Grade 4 – 49.00 percent in mathematics and 51.00 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Differentiated Instruction.
2. Learning Strategies.
3. Fractions, Decimals, and Percents Professional Learning Community Book Study.
4. SES Achievement Training.
5. Gradequick and Edline.
6. Mathematics Webinar.
7. OEPA and You.
8. Compliant Individualized Education Program (IEP) Writing.
9. Unpacking the West Virginia 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs).
10. Response to Intervention (RTI).

### FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

**ACHIEVED STANDARD.** While gains were made in all subgroups in mathematics and reading/language arts from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011, gains in mathematics included: All students (AS) (+10.84 percent), racial/ethnicity white (W) (+11.12 percent), and economically disadvantaged (SES) (+8.2 percent). Gains in reading/language arts included: AS (+15.96 percent), W (+15.78 percent), and SES (+17.50 percent). Although not large

enough to constitute a subgroup for accountability the special education (SE) subgroup made substantial gains in both subjects: Mathematics (+16.24 percent) and reading/language arts (+24.64 percent).

## EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

### HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

#### 7.1. Curriculum

**7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Grades 3 and 4 English and language arts instruction was textbook driven rather than guided by the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs). Interviews revealed that textbooks were used to a very high extent and teachers stated that the textbooks addressed the CSOs. Kindergarten and Title I teachers said they developed their instructional plans and then checked to see which CSOs were covered.

### FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

**COMPLIANCE. All teachers were making curricular decisions based on test data analysis, the goals and action steps of the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan, and the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs). The textbook was being used as a resource.**

**7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

The Grade 4 teachers were not teaching social studies and science to master the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs). Teachers and the principal stated that they were focusing more on mathematics and reading/language arts and needed more time to devote to social studies and science.

Individual class schedules revealed that time during the school day could have been used more effectively and efficiently. For example, one class schedule



listed Check agenda/break 11:50-12:05 p.m.; Lunch 12:06-12:36 p.m.; Break, switch classes 12:40-12:55 p.m.; and Reading/Language Arts 1:00-2:30 p.m. The schedule contained other items of minimal value, i.e., Rest room break 9:00-9:05 a.m. (before PE, Art, or Music on alternating days) and Break/switch class 9:40-9:45 p.m. (after PE, Art, or Music). Also Read Aloud, alternating with Trout Water Change, is included in the schedule from 2:30-2:50 p.m. followed by Prepare to dismiss from 2:55-3:00 p.m. While the classroom schedules varied, all showed similar examples of time that could be applied more effectively to teaching and learning.

### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** Science and social studies were being taught in all classrooms. Teachers stated that science and social studies were an integral part of the reading and mathematics curriculum and were being addressed daily. Teacher lesson plans, teacher interviews, and student interviews reflected this conclusion.

All classroom schedules showed an effective use of instructional time. Noninstructional time was reduced to minimal levels and instructional time was preserved.

### **7.2. Student and School Performance**

**7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans.** An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

A review of the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan by the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership, revealed weaknesses in the school's plan. The school must contact the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Organizational Effectiveness and Leadership, to discuss the areas of weakness and develop a plan to strengthen the plan.

### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**COMPLIANCE.** The school's Five-Year Strategic Plan was complete, thorough, and met the needs of the school. All teachers could discuss the goals and action steps of the plan and the various classroom activities that addressed the goals.

## **RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application.** Although the Technology Integration Specialist (TIS) was enthusiastic, knowledgeable, and had delivered a great deal of professional development, the Team observed very few students using technology in the classrooms. Team members did not observe any students using the first floor computer laboratory during the day of the Education Performance Audit. The Team recommended that the school technology team plan to add technology hardware in the classrooms and work on consistent scheduling of computer laboratories.

### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED.** A variety of technology was being used buildingwide. Students and teachers were utilizing technology in the classrooms and the school's computer laboratories were being utilized.

- 7.1.12. Multicultural activities.** Although the county had a Multicultural Plan, the teachers could not enumerate specific activities other than using stories in the textbook that had international themes. The Team recommended that the school develop and use a comprehensive list of schoolwide multicultural activities in the classrooms.

### **FOLLOW-UP REVIEW**

**RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED.** A multitude of multicultural activities were being conducted both in individual classrooms and buildingwide. The Multicultural Plan was extensive and all students had a vast exposure to the different cultures of the state, country, and world.

## INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Spencer Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Roane County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Roane County or the accreditation status of the schools.

**8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.**

The principal and teachers were aware of the school's needs as identified by the WESTEST2 data analysis and had participated in high quality staff development on how to increase student achievement and close the achievement gap. The Team believed that once the staff development had been fully put into effect that achievement will increase. The most pressing concern is that all staff use the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) as a foundation for the curriculum.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**The student and school percent proficient rate increased from the 2009-2010 WESTEST2 to the 2010-2011 WESTEST2. Spencer Elementary School and Roane County exerted work in staff development, providing student and teacher materials, and monitoring to ensure greater student success. All curricular decisions were based on data analysis, West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs), and the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan.**

## **BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES**

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Spencer Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team believed that Spencer Elementary School and Roane County have the capacity to correct the identified deficiencies and increase student achievement. Continued assistance from the Roane County central office, RESA 5, and the West Virginia Department of Education will be important to complete this goal.

The Team recommended that the Roane County School System Superintendent and the school administrator contact Mr. Charles Heinlein, Executive Director, Office of Organizational Effectiveness & Leadership at 304-558-3199 for guidance in revising the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**Spencer Elementary School and Roane County corrected the deficiencies found in the original Education Performance Audit and increased student and school achievement.**

## IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

**19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials.** Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

**19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** Copying equipment was not provided.

**19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** A ceramic kiln was not available in the art facility.

**19.1.14. Food service.** A teachers' dining area of adequate size was not provided.

**19.1.15. Health service units.** A refrigerator with locked storage was not available.

### **FOLLOW-UP CONCLUSION**

**19.1.5. Copying equipment was provided.**

**19.1.15. A refrigerator with locked storage was provided.**

**All other facility resource needs remained as previously identified.**

## EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

**One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.**

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

### **FOLLOW-UP TEAM SUMMARY**

**Spencer Elementary School received assistance from the Roane County Central Office, RESA 5, and the West Virginia Department of Education to correct the deficiencies found in the original Education Performance Audit. The Team recommended that the principal continue to seek assistance from the various departments to provide programs and practices to increase student achievement.**

## SCHOOL ACCREDITATION STATUS

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit High Quality Standards	Annual Performance Measures Needing Improvement	Date Certain
79-205 Spencer Elementary	Full Accreditation			

### **Education Performance Audit Summary**

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Accreditation status of Spencer Elementary School.