



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

ROANE COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

MAY 2012

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

Page

Introduction 2

Education Performance Audit Team..... 3

Initiatives For Achieving Adequate Yearly Progress 4

Annual Performance Measures For Accountability 6

High Quality Standards..... 29

Capacity Building 72

Roane County Summary..... 73

INTRODUCTION

An announced (five days in advance) Education Performance Audit of the Roane County School District and the county's schools was conducted on March 23 and 24 and March 29-31, 2010. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate reasons the county had not achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) during the past five years and other existing circumstances that warranted an on-site review. The Team also reviewed district level high quality standards in accordance with appropriate procedures to make recommendations to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as the State Board considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the high quality standards that are required by W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies.

The West Virginia Department of Education System of School Support was initiated to assist Roane County Schools. A Liaison to the State Superintendent of Schools was assigned to support the Roane County Superintendent of Schools.

A Follow-up Education Performance Audit of Roane County School System was conducted February 13-16, 2012. The purpose of the follow-up review was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status and a county school district shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. The Code and policy include the provision that a school “. . . does not have any deficiencies which would endanger student health or safety or other extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.”

This report presents comments from the previous Education Performance Audit Report and the follow-up review of Roane County School District and schools.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Roane County School District

February 13 – 16, 2012

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Dr. Gus Penix, Director

NAME	TITLE	COUNTY	CATEGORY
Dr. Monica Beane	Assistant Director, Office of Research	WV Department of Education	AYP/Five Year Strategic Plan /High Quality Standards
Carroll Staats	Member, County Board of Education	Jackson County School District	Evaluations/Administration
Delores Ranson	Retired Assistant Superintendent of Schools	Jackson County School District	Personnel/Hiring/Licensure
Mike Pickens	Executive Director, Office of School Facilities	WV Department of Education	Facilities
Dr. Gus Penix	Director	OEPA	Finance/Policies/Administration

**EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT
INITIATIVES FOR ACHIEVING ADEQUATE YEARLY PROGRESS**

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Roane County had undertaken an initiative for achieving Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP). The prominent initiative and activity included the following.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

1. **5.1.1 Achievement.** Roane County Schools has demonstrated an increased emphasis on student achievement since the initial audit in 2010, as verified by interviews conducted with the superintendent and central office staff members, and visits to individual schools. Many steps have been taken to reach this concentrated focus on student achievement.

Roane County Schools experienced a change in leadership since the initial Education Performance Audit was conducted in 2010. A new superintendent was employed effective July 1, 2011. A curriculum coordinator was employed by the board of education effective February 20, 2012, just after the Office of Education Performance Audits follow-up review of Roane County Schools was completed. Under the leadership of the new superintendent, a County Instructional Team consisting of the Director of Personnel, Director of Federal Programs, and Director of Special Education was formed to provide technical assistance to the schools in Roane County. The newly employed curriculum coordinator will be a part of this leadership team as well.

Roane County Schools' central office staff implemented a data analysis process utilizing an electronic e-walk platform. Each member of the County Instructional Team is assigned two schools. The Director of Personnel is assigned to Spencer Middle School and Reedy Elementary School. The Director of Special Education is assigned to Roane County High School and Walton Elementary School. The Director of Federal Programs is assigned to Geary Elementary/Middle School and Spencer Elementary School. Part of this assignment involves evaluating the building principal, leading data analysis, and serving as a liaison in the development of the school's Five Year Strategic Plan. This uniform and systematic approach to addressing the low achievement issue is having a positive impact concerning the culture around collection and use of student data at both the county and school levels. The Follow-up Team observed that the data analysis conducted in Roane County Schools has increased. However, the Team observed varied levels of use of data application to inform instruction at the school and classroom level.

2. **7.2.4. Data analysis.** Roane County Schools has designed a program to track the achievement gains of each student in schools. The Excel based spreadsheet allows the school to track an individual student's gains as well as to identify the students who made the greatest gains between subsequent years' testing. This led to the recognition and encouragement of students who, though they did not reach the highest proficiency levels on the test, could account for significant personal gains.

COUNTY PERFORMANCE

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and related student performance data. It also presents the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

5.1. ACCOUNTABILITY.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Adequate Yearly Progress

The No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data for the 2008-09 school year identified that Roane County did not make adequate yearly progress (AYP). Roane County failed to achieve AYP for the last five consecutive years. Chart 1 shows the grade span/assessment and subgroup(s) that did not make AYP. It also shows the percent proficient for each grade span/assessment and subgroup.

The Team noted that the performance of all subgroups failing to meet AYP (Chart 1) compared with the 2007-08 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data, decreased in academic performance. The decline was noted; however, the 2008-09 results were compared to a new test (WESTEST 2) which was more rigorous than the 2007-08 WESTEST.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

The Team noted improvements in student academic performance in the elementary reading special education (SE) and middle mathematics SE subgroups. The middle mathematics SE subgroup increased from 14.8 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 16.2 percent proficient in 2010-2011. The elementary reading SE subgroup increased from 17.6 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 21.6 percent proficient in 2010-2011.

The Team noted that the performance of all subgroups failing to meet AYP (Chart 1) compared with the 2008-2009 No Child Left Behind (NCLB) data, varied in academic performance. Specifically, decreases in academic performance were noted in the following subgroups. The elementary mathematics SE subgroup decreased from 27.5 percent in 2008-09 to 24.8 percent in 2010-2011. The middle mathematics economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup decreased from 38.7 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 32.4 percent proficient in 2010-2011. The middle reading SE subgroup decreased from 19.8 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 16.0 percent proficient in 2010-2011. The elementary reading SES subgroup decreased from 45.4 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 37.7 percent proficient in

2010-2011. The middle reading SES subgroup decreased from 43.9 percent proficient in 2008-2009 to 39.0 percent proficient in 2010-2011.

Chart 1

WESTEST					
GRADE SPAN / ASSESSMENT	SUBGROUP	2010-2011 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2009-2010 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2008-2009 PERCENT PROFICIENT	2007-2008 PERCENT PROFICIENT
Elementary – Mathematics	Special Education	24.8%	25.9%	27.5%	NA(S)
Middle – Mathematics	Special Education	16.2%	16.2%	14.8%	27.1%
Middle – Mathematics	Economically Disadvantaged	32.4%	32.5%	38.7%	57.4%
Elementary – Reading	Special Education	21.6%	20.2%	17.6%	NA(S)
Middle – Reading	Special Education	16.0%	13.1%	19.8%	28.8%
Elementary – Reading	Economically Disadvantaged	37.7%	33.1%	45.4%	69.5%
Middle – Reading	Economically Disadvantaged	39.0%	32.2%	43.9%	66.2%

Chart 2 shows that the number of Roane County’s schools identified for not achieving AYP increased in the last five years. In 2009, three of the county’s six schools or 50 percent failed to achieve AYP.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 2 shows that the number of Roane County’s schools identified as not achieving AYP decreased from three (3) schools in 2009 to two (2) in 2010. However, the number of schools not achieving AYP increased from two (2) in 2010 to four (4) in 2011. Of the six schools in Roane County, only two schools, Reedy Elementary/Middle School and Spencer Primary Center achieved AYP in 2011. The remaining four schools, Geary Elementary/Middle School, Walton Elementary/Middle School, Spencer Middle School, and Roane County High School did not achieve AYP in 2011. The Roane County School District did not make AYP for school year 2010-2011.

Chart 2

NUMBER OF SCHOOLS NOT ACHIEVING AYP	
Year	Number of Schools
2005	2
2006	1
2007	2
2008	2
2009	3
2010	2
2011	4

An examination of the WESTEST 2 assessment data for the 2008-09 assessment school year revealed that student achievement was significantly below the State average in all subgroups and at all levels (elementary, middle, and high school). (Charts 3-8).

Charts three through five indicated that the 2008-09 Roane County School District student percent proficient in mathematics was below the State percent proficient. Student performance in reading/language arts (Charts 6, 7, and 8) was also below the 2008-09 State percent proficient.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Charts 3 through 5 indicated that the 2010-2011 Roane County School District student percent proficient in mathematics was below the State percent proficient in all programmatic levels (elementary, middle, and high). Student performance in reading/language arts (Charts 6, 7, and 8) indicated the Roane County School District student percent proficient was also below the 2010-2011 State percent proficient in all subgroups except: The elementary economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroup proficiency rate of 41.2 percent was higher than the State proficiency rate of 37.7 percent in 2010-2011; the high school all students (AS) subgroup proficiency rate of 47.1 percent was higher than the State proficiency rate of 43.7 percent; the high school SES subgroup proficiency rate of 39.1 percent was higher than the State proficiency rate of 31.9 percent; and the high school racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroup proficiency rate of 47.0 percent was higher than the State proficiency rate of 44.3 percent.

Note: in Charts 3 through 5, all subgroups in the elementary and high school programmatic levels demonstrated increases in the percent of students proficient in mathematics from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011. In Charts 6 through 8, all subgroups in the elementary, middle and high school programmatic levels

demonstrated increases in the percent of students proficient in reading/language arts from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011. Most notably, substantial increases were shown in the percent of students proficient in reading/language arts for the elementary and high school programmatic levels.

Chart 3

ELEMENTARY MATHEMATICS						
Subgroup	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	56.4%	65.2%	32.4%	45.4%	42.1%	45.2%
White (W)	56.7%	65.7%	32.0%	46.0%	41.70%	45.9%
Black (B)	NA(S)	54.6%	NA(S)	33.9%	NA(S)	32.9%
Special Education (SE)	27.5%	40.9%	14.8%	25.9%	NA(S)	24.8%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	49.2%	56.0%	25.7%	35.3%	34.6%	35.0%

Chart 4

MIDDLE MATHEMATICS						
Subgroup	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	46.5%	56.9%	35.2%	42.8%	32.4%	43.3%
White (W)	46.6%	57.6%	35.4%	43.3%	32.1%	43.8%
Black (B)	NA(S)	42.3%	N/A(S)	30.3%	NA(S)	31.9%
Special Education (SE)	14.8%	23.1%	12.8%	16.2%	9.1%	16.2%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	38.7%	46.4%	28.1%	32.5%	23.7%	32.4%

Chart 5

HIGH SCHOOL MATHEMATICS						
	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	48.4%	56.9%	36.7%	40.4%	38.2%	43.0%
White (W)	47.7%	57.5%	35.8%	40.9%	37.9%	43.5%
Black (B)	NA(S)	44.3%	N/A(S)	25.7%	NA(S)	29.7%
Special Education (SE)	NA(S)	21.6%	N/A(S)	11.5%	NA(S)	12.5%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	39.0%	46.0%	25.00%	29.1%	31.1%	31.5%

Chart 6

ELEMENTARY READING/LANGUAGE ARTS						
	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	52.1%	65.5%	33.6%	44.0%	47.7%	48.2%
White (W)	52.7%	65.9%	33.2%	44.5%	47.5%	48.7%
Black (B)	NA(S)	57.8%	NA(S)	33.9%	N/A(S)	40.0%
Special Education (SE)	17.6%	32.8%	14.8%	20.2%	N/A(S)	21.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	45.4%	56.1%	26.3%	33.1%	41.2%	37.7%

Chart 7

MIDDLE READING/LANGUAGE ARTS						
	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	52.8%	63.2%	32.6%	43.2%	41.7%	50.0%
White (W)	52.6%	63.5%	32.8%	43.5%	41.1%	50.3%
Black (B)	NA(S)	54.9%	N/A(S)	34.1%	N/A(S)	41.9%
Special Education (SE)	19.8%	22.6%	10.2%	13.1%	10.7%	16.0%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	43.9%	52.8%	25.6%	32.2%	31.4%	39.0%

Chart 8

HIGH SCHOOL READING/LANGUAGE ARTS						
	2008-2009		2009-2010		2010-2011	
Subgroup	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient	District Percent Proficient	State Percent Proficient
All Students (AS)	42.0%	52.7%	27.1%	35.5%	47.1%	43.7%
White (W)	41.8%	53.2%	26.7%	35.9%	47.0%	44.3%
Black (B)	NA(S)	41.4%	NA(S)	23.3%	NA(S)	29.2%
Special Education (SE)	NA(S)	14.3%	NA(S)	9.5%	NA(S)	10.6%
Economically Disadvantaged (SES)	35.1%	41.8%	15.6%	24.7%	39.1%	31.9%

Source: <https://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/private/nclbdata11/replistD1c.cfm?xrep=1&cn=079&sn=999&det=1>

SAT/ACT Assessment Results

Chart 9 shows the Roane School District's Scholastic Aptitude Test (SAT) and American College Testing (ACT) results from 2004-05 to 2008-09. The SAT math mean score increased substantially from 422 in 2007-2008 to 499 in 2008-2009. The SAT reading score increased slightly from 458 to 564 during the same time period. The SAT writing score declined from 458 to 442. The percent of SAT test takers also increased from the 2007-2008 school year from 4.1 percent to 5.5 percent in 2008-09. A comparison of three year trend data shows that Roane County's students declined in percent of test takers, declined moderately in the math score, increased measurably in the reading score, and declined measurably in the writing score.

ACT trend data showed an increase in percentage of students taking the ACT (56.4 percent) in 2008-2009 over (47.3 percent) in 2007-2008. The ACT composite score also increased to 20.2 in 2008-2009 from 19.3 in 2007-2008. Three year trend data also revealed an increase in test takers and in the composite score.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

As noted in Chart 9, Roane County experienced an increase in SAT Takers from 1.5 percent in 2009-2010 to 3.5 percent in 2010-2011. The SAT Math Mean Score and Writing Score increased by 61 points and 52 points respectively. The SAT Reading Score decreased by 20 points. The ACT Composite increased by one-tenth of a point from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011.

Chart 9

SCHOLASTIC APTITUDE TEST (SAT) - Roane County Schools							
Roane County	2004 - 2005	2005 - 2006	2006 - 2007	2007 - 2008	2008 - 2009	2009 - 2010	2010 - 2011
SAT Takers (%)	6.7%	10.7%	10.4%	4.1%	5.5%	1.5%	3.5%
SAT Math Mean Score	481	461	501	422	499	505	566
SAT Reading Score	511	483	500	458	564	547	527
SAT Writing Score			475	458	442	470	522
AMERICAN COLLEGE TESTING (ACT) - Roane County Schools							
ACT Takers (%)	40.0%	51.1%	55.5%	47.3%	56.4%	45%	N/A
ACT Composite	20.8	20.2	20.1	19.3	20.2	20.4	20.5

Source: State, County and School Data, 2008-09 West Virginia Report Cards, West Virginia Department of Education.

ACT EXPLORE Assessment Results

Based on the 2008-2009 Grade 8 ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 10, Roane County test takers showed a decrease (14.4 to 14.1) in the composite score from the 2007-2008 school year. Three years of trend data showed a decrease in English (13.7 to 13.4); an increase in Mathematics (13.7 to 13.9); a decrease in Science (15.5 to 15.3); and Reading results remained constant (13.3 to 13.3).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Based on the ACT EXPLORE results in Chart 10, Roane County’s three year trend data (2008-2009 to 2010-2011) indicated the following: An increase in English (13.4 to 14.0); an increase in Mathematics (13.9 to 14.7); an increase in Reading (from 13.3 to 14.2); an increase in Science (from 15.3 to 15.9); and an increase in the Composite score (from 14.1 to 14.8). Roane County was below the State average scores by one-tenth point in English and Mathematics, above the State in Reading by one-tenth point, and equal to the State in Science and the Composite score

Chart 10

ACT EXPLORE RESULTS - Grade 8							
	2004 - 2005	2005 - 2006	2006 - 2007	2007 - 2008	2008 - 2009	2009 - 2010	2010 - 2011
English WV	14.2	14.3	14.2	14.3	13.9	14.1	14.1
English Roane	13.3	13.4	13.7	14.0	13.4	13.5	14.0
Mathematics WV	14.2	14.5	14.5	14.7	14.3	14.6	14.8
Mathematics Roane	13.4	13.4	13.7	14.3	13.9	14.0	14.7
Reading WV	13.8	13.9	13.9	13.9	13.6	14.0	14.1
Reading Roane	13.5	13.2	13.3	13.2	13.3	13.7	14.2
Science WV	15.8	15.9	15.9	16.0	15.6	15.8	15.9
Science Roane	15.4	15.5	15.5	15.7	15.3	15.1	15.9
Composite WV	14.6	14.8	14.8	14.9	14.5	14.8	14.8
Composite Roane	14.1	14.0	14.2	14.4	14.1	14.2	14.8

Chart 10A depicts the relative rank of Roane County on the 2009 ACT Explore compared with the 55 county school districts in West Virginia by subject for Grade 8 students. Roane County School District ranked 54th out of the 55 West Virginia county school districts in English, 48th in Math, 44th in Reading, and 50th in Science.

The chart also gives the benchmark for each content and the percentage of Roane County's Grade 8 students performing above the benchmark. The following details the percentage of Grade 8 students above benchmark: English – 40.74 percent; Math – 16.67 percent; Reading – 26.54 percent; and Science – 3.70 percent.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 10A depicts the relative rank of Roane County on the 2009, 2010, and 2011 ACT EXPLORE compared with the 55 county school districts in West Virginia by subject for Grade 8 students. The chart indicates Roane County had an increasing trend in the percentage of Grade 8 students performing above the benchmark on the ACT EXPLORE in English (40.74 percent in 2009 to 43.96 percent in 2011); Math increased from (16.67 percent in 2009 to 18.13 percent in 2011); and Science increased from (3.70 percent in 2009 to 7.14 percent in 2011). Roane County had a decreasing trend in the percentage of Grade 8 students performing above the benchmark in Reading (26.54 percent in 2009 to 24.18 percent in 2011).

Chart 10A

ACT Explore Grade 8 - Above Benchmark %								
2009								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 13	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 20
Roane County	54	40.74	48	16.67	44	26.54	50	3.70
2010								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 13	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 20
Roane County	42	51.85	45	23.28	42	34.92	43	6.35
2011								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 13	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 20
Roane County	53	43.96	48	18.13	52	24.18	43	7.14

ACT PLAN Assessment Results

Based on the 2008-2009 Grade 10 ACT PLAN results in Chart 11, Roane County test takers showed a decrease (15.8 to 15.6) in the composite score from the 2007-2008 school year. Three years of trend data showed a decrease in English (15.4 to 15.2); an increase in Mathematics (15.1 to 15.7); a decrease in Reading (15.8 to 14.5); and results remained constant in Science (16.5 to 16.5).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Based on the ACT PLAN results in Chart 11, Roane County's four year trend data (2008-2009 to 2011-2012) indicated the following: An increase in English (15.2 to 15.8); an increase in Mathematics (15.7 to 16.3); An increase in Reading (from 14.5 to 16.0); an increase in Science (from 16.5 to 17.4); and an increase in the Composite score (from 15.6 to 16.5). All Roane County subtest scores were below the State scores.

Chart 11

ACT PLAN RESULTS Grade 10								
	2004 - 2005	2005 - 2006	2006 - 2007	2007 - 2008	2008 - 2009	2009 - 2010	2010 - 2011	2011- 2012
English WV	16.7	16.8	16.7	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.3	16.0
English Roane	16.4	14.9	15.4	15.1	15.2	14.8	15.4	15.8
Mathematics WV	16.4	16.5	16.6	16.3	16.3	16.2	16.3	17.6
Mathematics Roane	16.0	14.9	15.1	15.3	15.7	15.0	15.6	16.3
Reading WV	16.5	16.6	16.5	16.5	15.7	16.1	16.0	16.7
Reading Roane	16.2	14.7	15.8	15.8	14.5	14.8	15.4	16.0
Science WV	17.7	17.8	17.7	17.5	17.1	17.3	17.2	17.8
Science Roane	17.3	16.4	16.5	16.7	16.5	16.6	16.4	17.4
Composite WV	17.0	17.1	17.0	16.8	16.5	16.6	16.6	17.2
Composite Roane	16.6	15.3	15.8	15.8	15.6	15.4	15.9	16.5

Chart 11A depicts the relative rank of Roane County on the 2009 ACT PLAN compared with the 55 county school districts in West Virginia by subject for Grade 10 students. Roane County School District ranked 53rd in English; 33rd in Math; 52nd in Reading; and 43rd in Science. The chart also gives the benchmark for each content and the percentage of Roane County's Grade 10 students performing above the benchmark. The following details the percentage of Grade 10 students above the benchmark: English - 62.35 percent; Math - 35.29 percent; Reading – 41.18 percent; and Science – 15.29 percent.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 11A depicts the relative rank of Roane County on the 2009, 2010, and 2011 ACT PLAN compared with the 55 county school districts in West Virginia by subject for Grade 10 students. Chart 11A indicates Roane County had an increasing trend in the percentage of Grade 10 students performing above the benchmark on the ACT PLAN in English – from 62.35 percent in 2009 to 67.68 percent in 2011, and in Reading – from 41.18 percent in 2009 to 44.17 percent in 2011. Roane County had a decreasing trend in the percentage of Grade 10 students performing above the benchmark in Math – from 35.29 percent in 2009 to 23.31 percent in 2011, and in Science – from 15.29 percent in 2009 to 9.82 percent in 2011.

Chart 11A

ACT Plan - Above Benchmark %								
2009								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 19	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 21
Roane County	53	62.35	33	35.29	52	41.18	43	15.29
2010								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 19	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 21
Roane County	53	65.43	41	30.86	50	45.68	36	17.28
2011								
County	Relative Rank	English Benchmark: 15	Relative Rank	Math Benchmark: 19	Relative Rank	Reading Benchmark: 17	Relative Rank	Science Benchmark: 21
Roane County	53	67.68	52	23.31	52	44.17	53	9.82

COMMENDATION

The Team noted an increase in both ACT EXPLORE (Chart 10) and ACT PLAN (Chart 11) composite scores for Roane County Schools. This growth has been celebrated in Roane County Schools; through personnel interviews conducted with teachers, students and central office staff, the improvement on the ACT assessments is attributed to a more centralized focus on data analysis and student achievement. Students spoke with team members about their personal growth as noted in ACT scores and their pride in the increased ACT results.

5.1.2. Participation rate. A minimum of 95 percent in the current or a two or three year average of all students enrolled in a public school/county school district/state at the time of testing, including students in each subgroup as required by NCLB must participate in the statewide assessment WESTEST or the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) in reading/language arts or mathematics. Students with a significant medical emergency may be exempt by appeal from the calculation of participation rate for AYP provided that the county superintendent has proper documentation. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

Roane County School District and the county's school met the State participation rate standard as shown in Chart 12.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Roane County met the State participation rate standard as shown in Chart 12.

Chart 12

NCLB - All Subgroup - Participation Rate										
WVEIS Code	School Name	School Type	2008 - 2009	2007 - 2008	AYP For PR 2008 – 2009			Trend		
			Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading	Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading		Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading	
ROANE COUNTY										
549.	079 - 503	ROANE COUNTY HIGH	High	98.8	98.8	96.1	94.9	Yes	Up	Up
550.	079 - 301	SPENCER MIDDLE SCHOOL	Middle	99.8	100.0	99.8	100.0	Yes	Up	100%
551.	079 - 206	WALTON ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL	Middle	100.0	99.6	100.0	100.0	Yes	100%	Down
552.	079 - 205	SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Elementary	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	Yes	100%	100%
553.	079 - 203	REEDY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Elementary	100.0	100.0	100.0	100.0	Yes	100%	100%
554.	079 - 202	GEARY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Middle	100.0	100.0	99.5	99.5	Yes	Up	Up

Chart 12A

NCLB - All Subgroup - Participation Rate									
WVEIS Code	School Name	School Type	AYP for PR 2010-2011		AYP For PR 2009 - 2010		Trend		
			Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading	Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading	Part. Rate Math	Part. Rate Reading	
ROANE COUNTY									
549.	079 - 503	ROANE COUNTY HIGH	High	93.9	95.2	96.1	96.7	Down	Down
550.	079 - 301	SPENCER MIDDLE SCHOOL	Middle	98.9	98.7	100	99.8	Down	Down
551.	079 - 206	WALTON ELEMENTARY/MIDDLE SCHOOL	Middle	100	100	100	100	100%	100%
552.	079 - 205	SPENCER ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Elementary	98.3	98.3	100	100	Down	Down
553.	079 - 203	REEDY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Elementary	100	98.5	100	100	100%	Down
554.	079 - 202	GEARY ELEMENTARY SCHOOL	Middle	99.5	99.5	100	100	Down	Down

5.1.3. Attendance rate (Elementary/Middle). The student attendance rate for elementary and middle schools is at or above 90 percent or the percentage of students meeting the attendance rate show improvement from the preceding year. The student attendance rate will be adjusted for students excluded as a result of the Productive and Safe Schools Act (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1a) and school bus transportation interruptions (W.Va. 126CSR81), West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4110, *Attendance Policy*, (hereinafter Policy 4110). Additional exclusions include excused student absences, students not in attendance due to disciplinary measures, and absent students for whom the attendance director has pursued judicial remedies to compel attendance to the extent of his or her authority. For the AYP determination, the attendance rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the attendance rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 13 indicated the Roane County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last five reporting years. The Team noted that the attendance rate had declined in the last five reporting years.

Roane County contracted with RESA 5 for attendance director services. W.Va. Code §18-8-3(a) requires the county to employ an attendance director, “. . . at least a half-time director of school attendance if such county has a net enrollment equal to or less than four thousand students All persons to be employed as attendance directors shall have the written recommendation of the county superintendent.” This lack of focus on student attendance by a county employed, permanent personnel director is recognized as a factor in the declining trend in the percentage of attendance.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 13 indicated the Roane County School District attendance rate has remained above the State requirement of 90 percent for the last seven reporting years. The Team noted that the attendance rate had steadily declined from 2004-2005 through 2009-2010 and had increased .67 percent increase from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011.

Chart 13

ATTENDANCE RATE	
Year	Attendance Rate
2004 – 2005	97.11%
2005 – 2006	97.11%
2006 – 2007	96.84%
2007 – 2008	96.59%
2008 – 2009	96.15%
2009 – 2010	91.82%
2010 – 2011	92.49%

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 13A lists the 2008-2011 attendance rates for each school in Roane County. All Roane County schools demonstrated a decrease in attendance rate from 2009 to 2010. However, four of the six schools in Roane County demonstrated an increase in attendance rates from 2009-2010 to 2010-2011. Reedy Elementary School and Roane County High School experienced decreased attendance rates. Reedy Elementary School decreased from 93.69 percent in 2009-2010 to 93.66 percent in 2010-2011. Roane County High School decreased from 89.86 percent in 2009-2010 to 89.77 percent in 2010-2011.

Chart 13A

ATTENDANCE RATE			
School	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011
Geary Elementary	97.07%	91.98%	93.39%
Reedy Elementary	96.88%	93.69%	93.66%
Spencer Elementary	96.59%	92.86%	94.01%
Walton Elementary/Middle	96.96%	92.55%	93.11%
Spencer Middle	96.98%	92.12%	93.32%
Roane County High	94.43%	89.86%	89.77%

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Roane County Schools previously contracted with RESA 5 for Attendance Director services. Currently, Roane County Schools has a full time Director of Student Services/Attendance who is directly responsible for attendance. The employment of this full time administrator has enabled Roane County Schools to place an emphasis on attendance. The Attendance Director provides weekly attendance data to county and school administrators.

These weekly updates from the Attendance Director to county and school administrators also include food service data. The child nutrition program updates provide breakfast and lunch data for student meal eligible categorizations (paid, free, and reduced). As a result of this data analysis, the school administrators at Spencer Middle School and Roane County High School conducted student surveys to determine why the number of free and reduced eligible students participating in the school breakfast and lunch program was low. Based upon the feedback of the surveys, the schools are implementing changes to the breakfast and lunch procedures. Additionally, Roane County is exploring a change in the schedule to accommodate a later breakfast period for students. The school principal also uses the breakfast and lunch data to make decisions as to how to reach the county goal of 50 percent student participation rate. Data will guide decisions such as when to schedule breakfast and how to encourage students to participate. Increased participation of students eligible for free lunch would result in increased reimbursement funding to Roane County School District to assist with meeting the WV State Superintendent’s goal of increased school breakfast and lunch participation for nutritious meals.

5.1.4. Graduation rate. The student graduation rate is 80 percent or the percentage of students meeting the student graduation rate shows improvement. The graduation rate is calculated according to the high school completer formula recommended by the NCES with the additional condition that graduates include only those students who receive a regular diploma in the standard number of years and does not include students receiving the GED. For the AYP determination, the graduation rate calculation will be used for accountability at the public school/LEA/SEA levels, but will not be calculated for each subgroup. However, for schools/LEAs that use the safe harbor provision to meet AYP for the achievement indicators, the graduation rate standard must be met by the subgroup/s not meeting AYP.

Chart 14 showed that the Roane County School District graduation rate met the State requirement of 80 percent for the last five reporting years. However, the Team noted that the graduation rate had declined in the past three years. The central office instituted an extra step that required students considering dropping out of school to complete an interview with a central office staff member (typically the assistant superintendent or contracted attendance director) prior to being able to withdraw from school. During the interview, the student must provide reasons for dropping out of school. In turn, the central office staff member discusses possible alternatives to dropping out of school.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

As noted in Chart 14, Roane County School District's graduation rate demonstrated a three year decreasing trend from 85.05 percent in 2006-07 to 82.74 percent in 2008-09. The graduation rate increased from 82.74 percent in 2008-09 to 85.89 percent in 2009-10. The Team noted the graduation rate declined from 85.89 percent in 2009-10 to 76.80 percent in 2010-11. This rate is below the minimum graduation rate of 90 percent required by federal No Child Left Behind regulations. The statement below explains the new federal requirement regarding the 4-Year Adjusted Cohort Graduation Rate calculation. The 2011 graduation rate of 76.80 percent will serve as Roane County's baseline graduation rate for the new adjusted cohort graduation calculation in place in West Virginia.

4-Year Adjusted Cohort Graduation Rate. Beginning in School Year 2010–2011, states are required to report a uniform, comparable, and accurate graduation rate known as a “four-year adjusted cohort rate,” which measures the percent of students in a ninth grade cohort that graduate with a regular diploma in four years or less. This rate also must be used for determining AYP beginning in 2011–2012. The regulations require states to report and use a “four-year adjusted cohort graduation rate” based on the following formula:

4-Year Adjusted Cohort Graduation Rate	= $\frac{\text{\# of cohort members who earned a regular high school diploma by the end of the 2009-2010 school year}}{\text{\# of first-time 9th graders in fall 2006 (starting cohort) plus students who transfer in, minus students who transfer out, emigrate, or die during school years 2006-2007, 2007-2008, 2008-2009, and 2009-2010}}$
---	---

(SOURCE): <https://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/private/nclbdata11/cohort/WV%20Four-Year%20Adjusted%20Cohort%20Graduation%20Rate.pdf>

To increase the number of graduates and the college going rate, Roane County Schools joined with Glenville State College in the Hidden Promise Consortium (HPC). This alliance targets students in grades 8 through grade 12 with the potential to attend college, but may not be considering college for a number of reasons.

Chart 14

GRADUATION RATE	
Year	Graduation Rate
2004 – 2005	80.00%
2005 – 2006	80.00%
2006 – 2007	85.05%
2007 – 2008	84.77%
2008 – 2009	82.74%
2009 – 2010	85.89%
2010 – 2011	76.80%

SECTION II
DATA ANALYSIS

Chart 15

NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP®), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED			
2009–2010			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered	Number of Honors Courses Offered	Number of College Credit Courses Offered
Roane County High School	4 (3 taught)	2	0
2010–2011			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered	Number of Honors Courses Offered	Number of College Credit Courses Offered
Roane County High School	9	10	2
2011-2012			
High School	Number of AP® Courses Offered	Number of Honors Courses Offered	Number of College Credit Courses Offered
Roane County High School	7	11	2

Chart 15 demonstrated the number of advanced placement (AP®), honors courses, and college credit courses taught in Roane County’s high school.

AP® Courses Taught
Biology
Calculus AB
Chemistry

Honors Classes Taught
English (9-12)
Math (9-12)

Chart 15A

AP® Courses Taught in 2010-11 and 2011-12

AP® Courses Taught	2010-2011 Enrollment		2011-2012 Enrollment	
	On Site	WV Virtual	On Site	WV Virtual
English Language & Composition	0	5	13	2
English Literature & Composition	14	0	18	0
U.S. Government & Politics	11	0	16	0
Chemistry	4	0	16	0
Psychology	8	0	0	0
Calculus AB	0	2	10	0
U.S. History	0	3	13	0
Art History	0	1	0	0
Microeconomics	0	1	0	0
Environmental Science	0	0	0	1

As demonstrated in Chart 15, the number of AP® courses, the number of Honors courses, and the number of College Credit courses offered and taught at Roane County High School has increased. All AP® courses are approved by the College Board, and all AP® teachers have been trained by the West Virginia Center for Professional Development (WVCPD). Roane County Schools meets the minimum requirement of WVBE Policy 2510 in the number of AP® courses offered.

Chart 15A shows the Advanced Placement (AP®) courses taught at Roane County High School in 2010-2011 and 2011-2012. Additionally, this chart reflects the number of students enrolled in both on campus and WV Virtual School AP® courses.

The Team interviewed the county curriculum administrator as well as the Roane County High School principal.

1. Only AP Biology, AP Calculus, and AP Chemistry were currently being taught at Roane County High School. Staff indicated that AP English was offered; however, not enough students were interested to warrant teaching the course. While three AP courses were being taught at Roane County High School during the 2009-2010 school year, they did not meet the four course requirement of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510. Additionally, AP courses taught prior to 2009-2010 were not authorized by the College Board.

CORRECTED. All AP® courses are approved by the College Board. Additionally, all AP® teachers in Roane County have been trained by the WV Center for Professional Development (WVCPD).

2. The principal at Roane County High School indicated the following AP courses will be offered during the 2010-2011 school year: AP Biology, AP Calculus, AP English, AP Studio Art, AP US Government and Politics, AP US History, and AP Comparative Government and Politics. The county and school will need to determine that the classes can be authorized by the College Board and that the teachers have participated in the required training.

CORRECTED . All AP® courses are approved by the College Board. Additionally, all AP® teachers in Roane County have been trained by the WV Center for Professional Development (WVCPD).

- Algebra III was not being taught as a dual credit course; it was being taught as a college credit only course after school through West Virginia University.

CORRECTED. Advanced Communications (Glennville State College) and Algebra III (WVU) are taught as dual credit at Roane County High School.

- Economics was offered, but due to lack of student interest, was not being taught.

Microeconomics was taught through West Virginia Virtual School in 2010-2011 (chart 15A). It was not taught in 2011-2012.

Chart 16

Roane County	2005 - 2006	2006 - 2007	2007 - 2008	2008 - 2009
10 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%)	9.5%	8.8%	1.8%	0.0%
10 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0			0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0			0.0%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0			0.0%
TOTAL Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	*	*	*	0.0%

Chart 16 showed that the percent of advanced placement (AP) test takers decreased schoolwide with 0.0 percent students taking the AP exam in 2008-09. No students scored a 3 or higher on the AP exam during the 2008-09 school year. Roane County High School appeared to lack a focus on advanced courses and data suggested that students were not adequately prepared to earn a passing score on the AP exam. Currently, no incentives were in place that encouraged students to take an AP course or to attempt the AP exam.

Chart 16A

Number of Students Enrolled in AP courses	
2008 - 2009	2009 - 2010
AP Chemistry 8 students	AP Calculus 2 students
AP Biology 7 students	AP Biology 10 students
	AP Chemistry 17 students

Chart 16A shows the advanced placement (AP) courses taught at Roane County High School in 2008-2009 and 2009-2010 and the number of students enrolled. The AP courses taught in 2008-2009 were not College Board authorized classes. Five-year

trend data showed that 0.0 percent of Roane County's students scored a 3 or higher on the AP examinations.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 16B shows an increase in the number of AP® exams taken from 13 in 2009-10 to 36 in 2010-11. Additionally, the number of students scoring a 3 or higher on the AP® exam increased from zero in years 2008-09 and 2009-10 to 7 in 2010-11.

Chart 16B

AP® Exams 2009-2010 and 2010-2011

	2008-2009	2009-2010	2010-2011
Number of Exams Taken	0	13	36
Score of 3 or Higher	0	0	7

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 16C details the honors courses taught at Roane County High School for school years 2009-2010, 2010-2011, and 2011-2012. The number of Honors Courses taught at Roane County High School has increased over the past three years.

Chart 16C

Honors Courses Taught at Roane County High School

2009-2010 Honors Courses	2010-2011 Honors Courses	2011-2012 Honors Courses
English (9-12)	English 9 Honors	English 9 Honors
Math (9-12)	English 10 Honors	English 10 Honors
	Geometry Honors	English 11 Honors
	Algebra II Honors	English 12 Honors
	Trigonometry Honors	Geometry Honors
	World History Honors	Algebra II Honors
	US Studies to 1900 Honors	World History Honors
	20/21st Centuries Honors	US Studies to 1900 Honors
	Physical Science 9 Honors	20/21st Centuries Honors
	Biology Honors	Physical Science 9 Honors
		Biology Honors

The high school graduate overall college going rate for Roane County in 2007-08 was 46.1 percent compared to the State's overall college going rate of 58.8 percent as presented in Chart 17. The county's college going rate declined 2.3 percent from fall 2007 while the State's college going rate increased 1.3 percent.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 17 indicates that Roane County’s overall college going rate increased from 46.1 percent in 2007-2008 to 54.6 percent in 2008-2009. The rate decreased from 54.6 percent in 2008-2009 to 53.6 percent in 2009-2010. Roane County remained below the State’s overall average college going rate for all years reported in the chart.

Chart 17

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2007		
	Number of High School Graduates 2006 – 2007	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	17,914	57.5
Roane	182	48.4
	Number of High School Graduates in 2007-08	Overall College Going Rate Percentage in 2007-08
State	18,222	58.8
Roane	167	46.1
	Number of High School Graduates in 2008 – 2009	Overall College Going Rate Percentage in 2008-2009
State	18,418	61.5
Roane	163	54.6
	Number of High School Graduates in 2009 – 2010	Overall College Going Rate Percentage in 2009-2010
State	18,290	58.8
Roane	140	53.6

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2007, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Roane County School District’s percentage of students enrolled in developmental courses was measurably higher than the State’s percentage of students taking English and mathematics developmental courses (Chart 18).

Sixteen of Roane County’s 59 first-time freshmen or 27.12 percent were enrolled in Developmental English during fall 2008 compared to the State total (15.79 percent). Twenty-six graduates or 44.07 percent were enrolled in Developmental Mathematics compared to the State total (27.55 percent).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Charts 18, 18A, and 18B indicated Roane County Schools had a decreasing trend in the percentage of high school graduates enrolled in college developmental courses. Students in Developmental English decreased from 27.12 percent enrolled in fall 2008 to 21.54 percent enrolled in fall 2009 to 16.70 percent enrolled in fall 2010. The percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental Mathematics decreased from 44.07 percent during fall 2008 to 36.92 percent enrolled in fall 2009 and increased slightly to 38.30 percent enrolled in fall 2010. While the percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental English and Developmental Mathematics courses decreased, Roane County continued to have a higher percentage of high school graduates enrolled in developmental courses when compared to the State percentage.

Chart 18C indicated the percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental English and Developmental Mathematics courses in 2011 continued to decrease. Roane County students enrolled in Developmental English decreased from 16.70 percent enrolled in fall 2010 to 14.6 percent enrolled in fall 2011. Roane County students enrolled in Developmental Mathematics decreased from 38.30 percent in fall 2010 to 19.5 percent in fall 2011. Both the percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental English and Developmental Mathematics was significantly lower when compared to the State percentage of students enrolled in Developmental courses in 2011. The percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental English in 2011 was 14.6 percent compared to the State percentage of 17.2 percent. The percentage of Roane County High School graduates enrolled in Developmental Mathematics in 2011 was 19.5 percent compared to the State percentage of 28.4 percent.

Chart 18

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2008					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	8,073	1,275	15.79%	2,224	27.55%
Roane County High	59	16	27.12%	26	44.07%
Roane County	59	16	27.12%	26	44.07%

Source: First-Time Freshmen, Previous Year WV High School Graduates in Developmental Courses by Type of Course Fall 2008 (census).

Chart 18A

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2009					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	8,010	1,264	15.78%	1,973	24.63%
Roane County High	65	14	21.54%	24	36.92%
Roane County	65	14	21.54%	24	36.92%

Source: https://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/private/nclbdata11/CRR_HS.cfm

Chart 18B

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2010					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	7873	1181	15%	2209	28.10%
Roane County High	60	10	16.70%	23	38.30%
Roane County	60	10	16.70%	23	38.30%

Source: https://wveis.k12.wv.us/nclb/private/nclbdata11/CRR_HS.cfm

Chart 18C

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2011					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	8040	1379	17.2%	2287	28.4%
Roane County High	41	6	14.6%	8	19.5%
Roane County	41	6	14.6%	8	19.5%

Source: https://www.wvhepc.org/resources/Dashboard/Remedial/2011/cr_ffr_pyvw_hs.html

SECTION III
HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS
7.1. CURRICULUM.

7.1.1. Curriculum based on content standards and objectives. The curriculum is based on the content standards and objectives approved by the West Virginia Board of Education. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team interviewed central office curriculum staff, reviewed documents, conferred with individual school audit teams, and talked to some principals and found the following situations in which curriculum was not based on 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs).

1. **Spencer Elementary School.** The individual school Education Performance Audit Team reported that the 21st Century content standards and objectives (CSOs) were not being used to guide the curriculum in several classes.
2. **Spencer Middle School.** The individual school Education Performance Audit Team reported that the 21st Century content standards (CSOs) were not guiding the curriculum.
3. **Geary Elementary/Middle School.** The individual school Education Performance Audit Team reported that in at least one-third of the classes the curriculum was based on textbooks, workbooks, and worksheets rather than the West Virginia CSOs.
4. **Roane County High School.** Only AP Biology, AP Calculus, and AP Chemistry were being taught at Roane County High School. The principal stated that AP English was offered; however, enough students were not interested to warrant teaching the course. The minimum requirements of Policy 2510 were being met, as the courses were offered, but not taken by students. A school wide plan needed to address the lack of interest in AP courses.
5. **Walton Elementary/Middle School.** The individual school Education Performance Audit Team reported that 11 teachers were not using the CSOs as a basis for the school's curriculum and instruction.
6. **Countywide.** Through findings documented in school team audits, it was evidenced that teachers were not basing their instructional practice on standards-based instruction. Textbooks and accompanying worksheets were driving the instruction. Teachers indicated during Team interviews that they used the textbooks to plan the instruction, and then they find the CSOs to see which ones fit the lesson.

There appeared to be confusion regarding the expectations of teachers to provide standards-based instruction. Teachers attended professional development sessions provided by the central office, but no plan was in place to follow-up with teachers at the school level to ensure that practice has changed.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County School District has taken actions steps to improve the focus on standards-based instruction and student engagement in all Roane County schools.

1. **Spencer Elementary School** was using Solution Tree as an outside vendor to facilitate the implementation of Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) to target student achievement and instructional practices.
2. **Geary Elementary School** used the Marzano Research Lab (previously used Solution Tree) to implement Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) targeted to improve student achievement and data analysis. In the first year, Geary Elementary School focused on the culture issues present in the school. In year two, the focus switched to student engagement and student achievement. In 2009-10, Geary Elementary employed a data coach (former Title I teacher). This professional worked with the staff to create a student data notebook for each student in grades Kindergarten through Grade 8.
3. **Roane County School District** utilized a modified growth model to chart individual student academic growth. The value added component is conducted after the summative assessment results are analyzed. The county demonstrated an understanding of the need for growth in this area, but has admitted the action steps for year one were foundational in order to see improvement in years two and three. The staff indicated that they anticipate growth in student achievement in the 2012 WESTEST2 scores. Of note, the increased scores on the ACT EXPLORE and ACT PLAN were referenced multiple times during interviews with central office and middle school staff. They are hopeful improvement results on these assessments will relate to an improvement in State assessment scores.

Roane County Schools employed the following positions to assist with curriculum and instruction.

1. **Assessment Coach** – This position is responsible for working with and tracking all student data, curricular alignment, and formation of Student Personalized Learning (SPL) groups. This position provides technical assistance to teachers.

2. **Transformation Specialist** – This position is responsible for all things transformational, coordinates PLC meetings, and ensures all NORMS are being met. This employee conducts classroom e-walks. Since the principal at Geary Elementary School has been absent (due to a serious medical illness), this employee has been acting as the backup building instructional leader.
3. **Mathematics Integration Specialist (50 percent Title I and 50 percent State Incentives Grant (SIG) funded)** – This position provides professional development in mathematics. The leadership team voted to amend the original grant request for a Technology Integration Specialist (TIS) and seek a math coach instead. This math-certified position serves as an instructional improvement coach in mathematics.

The previous mathematics teaching practices were replaced with strategies embedded in the Math Counts book. At this point, Roane County has reported progress in benchmarking student progress.

In regard to sustainability, Roane County Schools intends to employ a county mathematics specialist as they currently employ a county reading specialist. However, until such time as this employment is feasible, the county will utilize the math integration specialist described above in this capacity at Spencer Middle School for the 2012-2013 year. This will provide additional assistance for Spencer Middle School in addressing the issue of low performing students in the area of Mathematics.

7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal education opportunities including re-teaching, enrichment, and acceleration. (Policy 2510)

Students in Roane County were not provided ample opportunity to be prepared for success beyond graduation from high school. The lack of college preparatory and or advanced courses puts students at a disadvantage as evidenced by the high percentage of students enrolled in developmental English and mathematics courses in West Virginia's colleges.

Individual school Education Performance Audits reported instances in four of the six schools that indicated high expectations for students through curricular offerings, instructional practices, administrative practices, etc., needed to be strengthened throughout the county's schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County Schools increased the curricular offerings for students at the secondary level. The number of AP® courses offered and the number of students enrolled has increased significantly since the initial Audit in 2010. In addition, two dual credit courses are accepted for high school and college credit – Advanced Communications (Glennville State College) and Algebra III (West Virginia University). Roane County Schools participates in the Hidden Promise Consortium with Glennville State College (GSC). Students in Grades 8-12 are identified as having the potential to attend college and are provided with supports to ensure they have access to college. The Future Farmers of America (FFA) and the Future Business Leaders of America (FBLA) programs offered at Roane County High School allow high school students the opportunity to compete on a state and national level. Roane County employed a graduation coach to work with students who were at-risk, to ensure they complete high school, or complete the General Education Diploma (GED) requirements in order to be college or career ready. In addition, Roane County School District hosted an AP® potential night in May to inform parents and students of the curriculum and scheduling needs to ensure students were challenged and prepared for college.

Roane County High School offers six college classes for credit at WVU-Parkersburg on the high school campus - both during the school day and in the evening. While these are not dual credit courses, students may enroll in these courses to obtain college credit in English 101, English 102, Psychology 101, Sociology 101, History 152, and History 153.

7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The performance data and findings from the individual school Education Performance Audits indicated that the central office staff needed to be involved in the instructional practices applied in the schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County School has implemented an e-Platform that utilizes e-walks to gather specific data from schools across the district. The data collected from these e-walks is then used as conversation/discussion points for school administrators in faculty meetings/PLCs. The data from the e-walks and the data from Instructional Practice Inventory (IPI) observations are analyzed to determine whether there is a ‘disconnect’ in what the dual data sources show. Central office staff performs walk-through observations in classrooms in each

school. The OEPA findings were utilized as check points during these walk through observations. Teachers are aware of the expectations of the central office staff when they conduct the walkthrough observations. The data recorded in the observation is shared (electronically) with the teacher by the end of the day in a constructive manner. As verified by interviews with central office staff, the level of implementation and the quality of the e-walk data varies from school to school.

The Team concluded, through observations and interviews with county and school staff, that data analysis was being conducted at the county and school levels. Teachers were provided data and were trained in the analysis and use of student achievement data. A central office staff member was assigned to each school to oversee the e-walk implementation process.

7.1.6. Instruction in writing. Instruction in writing shall be a part of every child's weekly educational curriculum in grades K through 12 in every appropriate class. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

While the county had provided writing instruction professional development for teachers at all schools, the writing scores continued to decline. Roane County needed to provide support at all schools to assure that all teachers include instruction in writing as part of each child's weekly education curriculum.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The Team observed that teachers are now using WV Writes more frequently. On the date of the audit, the WV Writes usage ranged from three to four completed assignments per student, in each school (verified by the WV Writes data provided to Roane County by the WVDE). Data regarding feedback on assignments is discussed regularly with principals and building level Instructional Improvement Team members.

7.1.8. Instructional materials. Sufficient numbers of approved up-to-date textbooks, instructional materials, and other resources are available to deliver curricular content for the full instructional term. (Policy 2510)

A sufficient number of State approved textbooks were provided for all students; however, the Team concluded through interviews with central office staff (assistant superintendent and special education director), that the math textbook series (Saxon Math) did not align to the newly adopted West Virginia content standards and objectives (CSOs). The central office staff indicated that once the new textbook series is adopted and purchased, math instruction will improve, resulting in higher student achievement in mathematics. However, the West Virginia content standards and objectives were

revised nearly three years ago. The textbook should not be the basis of a curriculum driven by standards-based instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County Schools contracted with Pearson Learning to provide training in the mathematics instructional materials. National trainers provided training during the Roane County Summer Academy. In addition, mathematics teachers were provided training in order to understand standards-based mathematics. Training occurred in 2010, 2011 and follow-up training is scheduled for 2012. The 2012 training will align with the Common Core standards for mathematics. After teachers return from the 2012 Teacher Leadership Institute (TLI), there will be a series of meetings/discussions with key central office staff and building administration to determine the feasibility of implementing the common core mathematics course in 2013-2014.

7.1.9. Programs of study. Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in Policy 2510 for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

1. According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510 the following programs were not being taught at Roane County High School.
 - Only AP Biology, AP Calculus, and AP Chemistry were being taught. While AP English was offered, the principal said that enough students were not interested to warrant teaching the course.
 - Algebra III was not being taught as a dual credit course; however, it was being taught as a college credit only course after school through West Virginia University.
 - Economics was offered, but due to lack of student interest, was not being taught.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County High School offered and had student enrollment in more than the minimum number of AP® courses required in West Virginia Board of Education (WVBE) Policy 2510. The number of AP® courses offered and the number of students enrolled in AP® courses have increased. In addition, all AP® teachers were trained by the West Virginia Center for Professional Development (WVCPD) and course syllabi were approved by the College Board.

2. According to the West Virginia Department of Education Course Information for Policy 2510 the following programs were not being taught daily at Reedy Elementary School: Science and Social Studies. The schedules revealed that science and social studies were being taught in two week increments in grades 5 and 6.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County Schools is now in compliance with WVBE Policy 2510 in the amount of time science and social studies are being taught in elementary schools. Individual school Education Performance Audit Teams verified that social studies and science were being taught in elementary schools during the school audits.

3. **Spencer Elementary School.** The teachers' class instructional schedules provided the county level Team showed: A Grade 3 classroom had science two days per week, a Grade 3 classroom had social studies three days per week, a Grade 4 classroom had social studies and spelling during the same 30 minute block and science four days per week.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Review team members verified through lesson plans, master schedules, teacher interviews, and observations that all items were corrected.

7.1.12. Multicultural activities. Multicultural activities are included at all programmatic levels, K-4, 5-8, and 9-12 with an emphasis on prevention and zero tolerance for racial, sexual, religious/ethnic harassment or violence. (Policy 2421)

The county office had a Multicultural Plan that was adopted by the Roane County Board of Education December 9, 2009. The premise of the plan is to address zero tolerance in all programmatic levels. Each month had a suggested or recommended list of activities to address the multiple areas of zero tolerance. However, school audit findings indicated teachers in all schools were not able to discuss a school or county Multicultural Plan.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County School District now has a Multicultural team consisting of a minimum of one teacher and administrator from each school. This team meets quarterly to monitor implementation of the Roane County MultiCultural policy.

Administrators (school and central office) are required to conduct an e-Bus observation monthly. The purpose of this requirement is outreach. Being on the bus for the entire morning and evening bus route enables the administrators to develop an understanding of where the students live and environmental factors they may face. This practice also allows administrators to ensure the Respect and Protect program is in effect on the bus as well as during the school day.

Team observations and interviews with students and staff verified that the Respect and Protect program demonstrated an increased effect on the discipline and culture of the schools in Roane County. Team reviews of individual schools found that teachers in all schools were able to discuss the county Multicultural Plan. All schools had activities to address zero tolerance.

7.1.13. Instructional day. Priority is given to teaching and learning, and classroom instructional time is protected from interruption. An instructional day is provided that includes a minimum of 315 minutes for kindergarten and grades 1 through 4; 330 minutes for grades 5 through 8; and 345 minutes for grades 9 through 12. The county board submits a school calendar with a minimum 180 instructional days. (W.Va. Code §18-5-45; Policy 2510)

Walton Elementary/Middle School did not meet the required number of minutes as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2510 (per Walton school audit findings). The Team reviewed individual teachers' classroom schedules at one school and found that instructional time was not always being used effectively. The Team recommends that the central office staff review all classroom schedules and practices to assist the schools in effectively using instructional time.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. Roane County Schools has corrected the issues noted in the Initial Audit report regarding this standard. However, in regard to the requirement in this standard, "priority is given to teaching and learning", Roane County High School's master schedule indicated two class periods (1st and 9th) were designated as Support for Personalized Learning (SPL) courses. However, through classroom observation and teacher interviews, the Team found that the two teachers were not being utilized in an efficient manner. Two English teachers were scheduled to provide intervention to students identified as at risk and below mastery in reading. The two teachers were not given the guidance and support to establish a curriculum that supplied structured intervention for students. Although the school administration and staff supplied a list of students with D and F grades for the first nine-week grading period, no students received intervention during that time. In addition, fewer than 20 students have received tutoring in multiple content areas during the second and third nine-week grading periods. When interviewed, one teacher expressed belief that the time could be beneficial for struggling students; however, she and her colleague were not

adequately prepared to provide intervention help to students. During the classroom observation, the Team verified students were not scheduled for the intervention during 1st or 9th periods, and no intervention log or data were gathered or available for the audit Team.

7.1.14. Alignment with job market opportunities. The technical and adult programs in the school are aligned with first local, and then state, then national job market opportunities. (Policy 2510)

The Team found the technical and adult programs were aligned with local and state job market opportunities (health care, oil & gas, farming, and education); however, no evidence was found supporting national job market opportunities. Job shadowing was available for students upon request. A meat processing lab is located at Roane County High School. Agriculture and farming are prevalent in the area. The FFA chapter consistently competes successfully at the national level.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County Schools has taken action steps to provide more opportunities for students to receive appropriate training that aligns with local, state and national job market opportunities. Roane County High School student programs, Future Farmers of America (FFA) and Future Business Leaders of America (FBLA), continued to perform well on the State and national level. Roane County School District added Earn A Degree, Graduate Early (EDGE) courses and college courses to prepare students for post-secondary college and career readiness.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.1. County and School electronic strategic improvement plans. An electronic county strategic improvement plan and an electronic school strategic improvement plan are established, implemented, and reviewed annually. Each respective plan shall be a five-year plan that includes the mission and goals of the school or school system to improve student or school system performance or progress. The plan shall be revised annually in each area in which the school or system is below the standard on the annual performance measures.

The county plan did an adequate job of analyzing data and identifying areas of need; however, no plan of action was used to determine implementation of the plan. In addition, school improvement plans were considered ineffective as they were not created by a team of individuals. Teachers interviews in each school during the school audits indicated that not all had been given the opportunity to contribute to the plan or comment on the plan and many were not familiar with the goals identified in the plan.

Related to student achievement, the reason the district was identified for improvement, the scores in all areas were on a declining trend. Math scores were near the lowest in the State and the willingness to build capacity was limited at the central office. Through staff interviews conducted on the day of the audit, the rationale for low math achievement was that “there are no qualified math instructors in this county,” that they had a person dedicated to improving math achievement, but he now works at the West Virginia Department of Education. However, the county employed an interventionist assigned to work with staff at the elementary level to improve reading instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County School District improved the strategic planning process. Roane County central office staff established a protocol, whereby the central office curriculum team reviews each school’s strategic plan. A central office staff member is assigned to each school in Roane County. The staff utilizes a rubric to ensure the school strategic plan meets the criteria identified by the WVDE, Office of School Improvement. Roane County School District staff conducted a professional development series designed to assist school administrators and staff in creating strategic plans based upon data analysis and needs assessments.

Individual school Education Performance Audit Teams found that school staffs were knowledgeable of the process and development of school and county strategic plans. Teachers indicated that strategic plans were aligned to identified school deficiencies.

Roane County has extensively analyzed data and identified areas of need. The county has provided professional development to teachers and principals on the

meaning of data and how to utilize it in making decisions relative to student needs.

As evidenced by school visits, strategic plans have been developed by school teams and those plans have been communicated to staff. Teachers were familiar with the goals.

7.2.4. Data analysis. Prior to the beginning of and through the school term the county, school, and teacher have a system for analyzing, interpreting, and using student performance data to identify and assist students who are not at grade level in achieving approved state and local content standards and objectives. The county, principal, counselors, and teachers assess student scores on the American College Test and the Scholastic Aptitude Test and develop curriculum, programs, and/or practices to improve student and school performance. (Policy 2510)

While opportunity existed for data analysis, a deep understanding of what to do with the data analysis did not exist. RESA 5 staff had been utilized at Spencer Middle School, but more guidance is needed countywide.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Roane County has taken extensive measures to ensure that data analysis occurs at the county and school levels. The county leadership provided training to teachers and principals on how to analyze data. Interventionists have worked with teachers and principals on interpreting data from AIMSweb and procedures for placing students in Student Personalized Learning (SPL) groups based on their individual need for additional learning help. (AIMSweb is a benchmark and progress monitoring program.) Since the 2010 OEPA audit, Roane County has added AIMSweb, Read 180, Save The Children, and customized Acuity benchmark testing to their arsenal for identifying student deficiencies and determining response and interventions.

As observed and verified by the Team, Roane County Schools uses a comprehensive data analysis procedure involving multiple measures of data collection and data analysis. The Individual school Education Performance Audit Teams observed data analysis implemented in all schools. However, as noted in the individual school audits, the level of implementation and use varied from school to school.

7.4. REGULATORY AGENCY REVIEWS.

7.4.1. Regulatory agency reviews. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority of West Virginia, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures. (W.Va. Code §§18-9B-9, 10, 11, 18-4-10, and 18-5A-5; Policy 1224.1; Policy 8100; W.Va. Code §18-5-9; Policy 6200; Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 §104.22 and §104.23; Policy 4334; Policy 4336)

1. Finance

In the annual audit of Roane County Schools, the auditors noted the following conditions.

Central Office

Fiscal Year 2009 Audit report reviewed. No findings or deficiencies were reported in internal control.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

There were no findings or deficiencies reported in internal controls for the Fiscal Year 2010 and 2011 Audit reports.

The general fund balance decreased by \$188,633, from Fiscal Year 2008. The decrease can be directly attributed to the county having to record an expense for other post employment benefits (OPEB) for the first time. In spite of this unusual expense the board's general current expense fund balance was a positive \$406,564.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Chart 19 details the fund balances for Fiscal Years 2009, 2010, and 2011.

Chart 19

Fiscal Year	Fund Balance	Increase/Decrease Over Previous Fiscal Year
2009	\$ 633,917	
2010	\$ 804,158	\$ 170,241
2011	\$ 811,197	\$ 7,039

The Team reviewed the Treasurer’s Report to the Board and reported the following finding. The treasurer provides a listing of expenditures and revenue each month to the board. The report did not contain all information required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8100, Handbook for School Finance in West Virginia. Requirements are shown in detail on page 53 of the handbook.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. As verified from the Roane County Board of Education meeting minutes, the treasurer’s monthly report to the board of education met all requirements set forth in the West Virginia Board of Education Policy 8100 Handbook for School Finance in West Virginia.

Individual Schools

An audit of Roane County individual schools was conducted by the Board’s internal auditor for the year ended June 30, 2008. Corrective action plans addressing findings were prepared by each school principal. The audit of the year ended June 30, 2009 had not been completed.

Finding all Schools

West Virginia Board of Education Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Sections 5-1 and 5-7, requires the board to approve all groups collecting funds in the name of the school. No record of such board action was available.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The Roane County Board of Education, through board action, approved groups for collecting funds in the name of each school: for school year 2010-2011 (board approval occurred on September 9, 2010) and for school year 2011-2012 (board approval occurred on October 6, 2011).

Spencer Middle School

Finding 1. Checks 8123 and 8128 were issued to pay invoices dated prior to purchase orders being approved.

West Virginia Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-18. Purchase Orders, requires a pre-numbered purchase order be approved in writing by the principal or designee before the purchase is made.

Reedy Elementary

Finding 1. Checks 3426, 3430, and 3434 were issued to pay invoices dated prior to purchase orders being approved.

West Virginia Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-18. Purchase Orders, requires a pre-numbered purchase order be approved in writing by the principal or designee before the purchase is made.

Roane County High School

Finding 1. The Team reviewed invoices paid with checks 1207, 1211, 1213, 1217, and 1227 and could not make sure the invoices were verified for clerical and mathematical accuracy. Approval by principal or designee was not shown on invoices.

The Team recommended that the school strictly follow procedures for Itemized Claim for Payment required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-21.

Spencer Elementary

Finding 1. The Team reviewed invoices paid with checks 5035, 5039, and 5041 and could not make sure invoices were verified for clerical and mathematical accuracy. Approval by principal or designee was not shown on invoices.

The Team recommended that the school strictly follow procedures for Itemized Claim for Payment required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-21.

Finding 2. The Team reviewed invoices paid with checks 5039 and 5041 and found the invoices were dated prior to purchase orders being issued and approved.

West Virginia Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-18. Purchase Orders, requires a pre-numbered purchase order be approved in writing by the principal or designee before the purchase is made.

Walton Elementary and Middle

Finding 1. The Team reviewed invoices paid with checks 2633, 2636, 2635, and 2643 and could not make sure invoices were verified for clerical and mathematical accuracy. Approval by principal or designee was not shown on invoices.

The Team recommended that the school strictly follow procedures for Itemized Claim for Payment required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-21.

Geary Elementary and Middle

Finding 1. The Team reviewed invoices paid with checks 4950, 4951, 4952, and 4953 and could not make sure invoices were verified for clerical and mathematical accuracy. Approval by principal or designee was not shown on invoices.

The Team recommended that the school strictly follow procedures for Itemized Claim for Payment required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 1224.1, *Accounting/Procedures Manual for the Public Schools in the State of West Virginia*, Section 1-21.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. In response to the individual school audit reports, the treasurer reviewed purchasing practices with principals at a May 25, 2010 Principals' Meeting. The staff accountant reviewed purchasing practices with school secretaries at training meetings held June 9 and August 6, 2010.

The Fiscal Year 2010-2011 individual school audit reports were only partially complete as of the date of the follow-up audit review.

2. Facilities

The Education Performance Audit Team visited the schools in Roane County. A narrative of the Team's observations follows.

- 1. Geary Elementary School.** This building was constructed in 1980 with additions in 1986 and 1985. The site is 9.6 acres. The building heat is provided by a hot water boiler. The boiler is original to the building and is 30 years old. There is no central air conditioning system for all the classrooms;

- the classrooms have window air conditioning units. The existing system does not meet current ventilation standards. There is a crawl space under a portion of this facility. A piece of vapor barrier is missing, otherwise the crawl space appears dry and in good condition. There is some wall cracking in the corner of the multipurpose room. Some mercury thermostats were in place that should be removed. This facility received School Building Authority (SBA) funding to add additional instructional space and build a new gymnasium. Construction is to begin the summer of 2010. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office cited one issue at this facility during the 2010 inspection regarding the failure to have the kitchen hood fire extinguishing system inspected annually. That issue has been resolved. This building does not have a fire protection sprinkler system.
2. **Reedy Elementary School.** This building was constructed in 1980. The site is 1.9 acres. The building is heated with a hot water boiler. The boiler is original to the building and is 30 years old. The central office and gymnasium have central air conditioning that is approximately 10 years old. The classrooms have window air conditioning units. The existing mechanical system does not provide forced air ventilation to the classrooms. The access roads to the school could use some improvement. The designated parking area is not adequate. Some sidewalk cracks could pose a tripping hazard, especially the sidewalk from the exit ramp to the playground. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office cited one issue at this facility during the 2010 inspection regarding the failure to have the kitchen hood fire extinguishing system inspected annually. That issue has been resolved. This building does not have a fire protection sprinkler system.
 3. **Spencer Elementary School.** This building was constructed in 1982 with additions to the original building in 1988, 1989, 1991, and 1999. The site is 27.5 acres. This facility is totally air conditioned. Some of the ceiling mounted air diffusers have moving louvers which are noisy and disruptive. The Team recommended that they be replaced. The cooling tower located on the roof is aging. Some sidewalk/concrete issues have been noted by the local health department. These issues have been or are in the process of being addressed. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office cited one issue at this facility during the 2010 inspection regarding the failure to have the kitchen hood fire extinguishing system inspected annually. That issue has been resolved. This building does not have a fire protection sprinkler system.
 4. **Walton Elementary/Middle School.** This building was constructed in 1966 with additions to the original structure in 1980, 1986, 1995, and 1998. The site is 29 acres. This facility has a variety of heating systems. The newest rooftop equipment at this facility was manufactured in 1997. Some of the classrooms have residential type gas furnaces installed. These classrooms need to have carbon monoxide detectors installed per West Virginia State Board of Education Policy 6200. Several of the wall mounted units had dirty air filters.

Several were obstructed with classroom storage items. Several mercury thermostats were currently in use at this facility. These need to be removed from the classrooms and properly disposed. There are several areas where roof leaks appeared to be active. The building layout is less than desirable. Several classrooms (Rooms 100, 101, 103, 104, 105, 106) enter/exit through other classrooms. This could be disruptive to the educational process. Black staining on the rear wall of the facility needed to be cleaned. The fenced area (appeared to be a pre-school playground) was cluttered and needed to be cleaned out. The rest room exhaust systems were inoperable during the visit. The hallway electrical panels were not locked. Panels that are accessible to students should remain locked at all times. Several areas would benefit aesthetically with a thorough cleaning and some new paint. Significant soil erosion existed at the rear of this facility. A Geotechnical Engineer has evaluated the site and reported that the erosion is within 30 feet of the school building foundation. This issue is critical and needs to be addressed as quickly as possible. After the repairs are complete a safety fence should be installed between the playground and the river. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office cited two issues at this facility during the 2010 inspection regarding the failure to have the kitchen hood fire extinguishing system installed and inspected annually. These issues have been resolved.

- 5. Spencer Middle School.** This building was constructed in 1949 with additions constructed in 1949, 1980, and 1986. The site is 7 acres. Access to the facility is narrow and less than ideal. The facility does not have centralized air conditioning or mechanical ventilation for the classroom spaces. Several stained ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the facility. The building would benefit from a thorough cleaning and some new paint. The Mechanical Room was cluttered and several electrical panels were obstructed. Numerous areas were listed on the OEPA facilities checklist as being inadequate. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office reported that all the outstanding issues at this facility had been resolved. The building is partially sprinkled.

The children play on a football field that is next door to a rubber factory. The odor from the factory permeated the school and playground. The staff reported that was something you had to get "used" to. The close proximity of the factory to the school facility compromises the educational environment and potentially poses some health and safety issues for the students and staff.

- 6. Roane County High School.** This building was constructed in 1993. The site is 72 acres. This is the newest facility in the county inventory. It has central heating, air conditioning, and ventilation. Some stained ceiling tiles were prevalent throughout the facility. A ceiling tile behind the kitchen (exit sign) had mold growth. This area and issue have been noted on the annual SBA Facility Reviews for the past three years. The issue has not been

resolved. Several units in the upstairs Mechanical Room were in the process of receiving compressor replacements. Some of the units had loaded air filters. Replacement filters were on site but they had not been installed. The school staff reported the county HVAC technician had resigned his position and that the compressor and filter replacements were on "hold". The facility is still in sound condition. However, there are numerous signs that the facility is not receiving the required maintenance to maintain the facility to standard. This facility needs to have an aggressive maintenance and housekeeping plan implemented to maintain the facility in like new condition. The West Virginia State Fire Marshal's office reported that all outstanding issues at this facility have been resolved. This building has a fire protection sprinkler system.

Countywide Notes/Recommendations.

- The largest need at every facility in the county, excluding Roane County High School, is an updated mechanical system that includes central heating, air conditioning, and ventilation.
- The county has a behavioral based energy program in place. The county should explore performance contracting options that include capital investment upgrades to the facilities.
- The county has an automated Internet based work order program in place. However, the county does not have a written preventive maintenance program in place. The current work order software that the county is utilizing can be expanded to include a preventive maintenance work order system. The Team recommended that the county establish a documented preventive maintenance program for every facility.
- The county maintenance staff is comprised of two full time people. The county is currently down to one full time person. An open HVAC technician position is being currently advertised. It is hoped that the position will be filled at the April 2010 board meeting. There is also a position at the high school that serves as a half time custodian/half time maintenance person. The county has six facilities. At the current staffing levels it is difficult to adequately maintain the facilities. Staff time is likely spent making repairs, leaving little time for preventive maintenance and improvements. The Team found several filters that were loaded during the visit. There was little evidence that preventive maintenance was being performed. The county should consider increasing staff levels or outsourcing critical activities like preventive maintenance. It is recommended that all the boilers be inspected annually by a licensed inspector.
- The county is replacing the old carpet in the classrooms with tile as time and money permit. All mercury containing thermostats should be removed from the classrooms and replaced with digital thermostats.
- The county should remain diligent in identifying and repairing roof leaks. Ceiling tiles should be replaced within 24 hours of wetting to reduce the potential for mold growth.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE) Office of School Facilities performed a follow-up on-site visit of Roane County Schools February 13-16, 2012, with the purpose of identifying progress of the action plan to eliminate and improve deficiencies identified in the initial 2010 OEPA report. An exit interview was conducted with the superintendent of Roane County Schools to inform him of the progress. Items in the following chart were identified as priority items from the 2010 visit and if completed, would satisfy the requirements of the initial OEPA report of 2010 to improve the efficiency of the Roane County School District.

Recommendations of Improvement Team, County Response & Objective(s):

Action Steps	Timeline	Person Responsible	Budget	Progress
GEMS – Additional vapor barrier will be added to crawl space.	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$100	Completed
GEMS – Removal of mercury thermostats and will be replaced with digital thermostats.	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$1300	Completed
GEMS – Repair of wall cracking in the corner of multipurpose room	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$100	Completed
GEMS – Additional instructional space, gymnasium, and fire protection sprinkler system.	June 2010 – July 2011	RCS jointly with School Building Authority	\$5,000,000	This school is currently involved with a SBA project that will correct the items.
GEMS Building Renovations – Exterior Walls Exterior Doors Roofing Flooring Toilets HVAC Lighting Technology Intercom Security	Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020	RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects	\$1,340,000	This school is currently involved with a SBA project that will correct some of the items. Items not covered by this project are in Roane County's CEFP to be addressed in their ten year plan.

RES – Repair of sidewalk cracks.	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$500	Completed
RES Site Work – Re-surface Roads Re-surface Parking New Parking Area	Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020	RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects	\$55,000	Roane County's CEFP will address these additional repairs in the ten year CEFP.
RES Building Renovations MPR Exterior Wall Roofing Flooring Ceilings Kitchen Flooring Toilets HVAC Lighting Intercom Technology Security System	Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020	RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects	\$760,000	Items identified will be covered with renovations to this school which are currently in Roane County's CEFP ten year plan
SES - Repair of sidewalk cracks.	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$1000	Completed
SES Building Renovations - Floor Structure Roofing Flooring Ceilings Painting Toilets HVAC HVAC Chiller Intercom Technology	Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020	RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects	\$1,169,000	Renovations to this school will cover items identified in Roane County's CEFP ten year plan
WEMS – Removal of black staining on the rear wall.	Spring 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	None	Completed

WEMS – Cleaning/Removal of clutter in the preschool playground area.	Spring 2010	WEMS Staff	None	Completed
WEMS – Locking of all hallway electrical panels.	Spring 2010	RCS/WEMS Staff	None	Completed
WEMS – Installation of carbon monoxide detectors	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$500	Completed
WEMS – Removal of mercury thermostats and will be replaced with digital thermostats.	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$2000	Completed
WEMS – Installation of 1000 foot barrier wall along the Pocatalico River Bank to stop soil erosion	Summer 2012	RCS, US Corp of Engineers, WV Soil Conservation Office	\$1,200,000	\$100,000 Feasibility Study by US Corp of Engineers (USCE).
WEMS – Installation of new exhaust fans in Rooms 101-106	Summer 2010	RCS Maintenance Staff	\$1500	Completed
WEMS – Building Renovations Windows Exterior Doors Roofing Painting Flooring Toilets HVAC Lighting Electric Wiring Fire Alarm Technology Intercom	Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020	RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects	\$1,054,000	Renovations to this school will cover these items identified in Roane County’s CEF ten year plan and will be submitted as a MIP project to the SBA.

<p>SMS – Construct New Spencer Middle School</p>	<p>Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020</p>	<p>RCS jointly with School Building Authority</p>	<p>\$15,939,00 0</p>	<p>Construction of a new Spencer Middle School is a “Needs” project identified in Roane County’s Ten Year CEFP. Roane County will partner with the SBA with this project.</p>
<p>RGHS – Replacement of stained ceiling tiles.</p>	<p>Daily as occurrences happen</p>	<p>RGHS Custodial Staff</p>	<p>\$5 per tile</p>	<p>Roane County maintenance staff has replaced stained ceiling tiles and continues to replace these as maintenance requires.</p>
<p>RGHS Building Renovations Exterior Doors Roofing Flooring Painting Toilets HVAC Lighting Intercom Technology</p>	<p>Comprehensive Facilities Educational Plan 2010-2020</p>	<p>RCS Maintenance Staff, RCS jointly with School Building Authority Major Improvement Projects</p>	<p>\$3,480,000</p>	<p>Renovations to this school will cover items identified in Roane County’s CEFP ten year plan. This will be submitted as a MIP project to the SBA.</p>

<p>Countywide Preventive Maintenance – Currently, RCS is exploring the best option for preventive maintenance. RCS options for preventive maintenance are as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (1) Contract to Preventive Maintenance Company including Boiler Inspections (2) Employee an additional HVAC/general maintenance worker (3) Work with WVU-P and utilize co-op students 	<p>Winter 2011</p>	<p>Superintendent of Schools, Director of Maintenance, Director of Finance, and Director of Personnel</p>	<p>\$35,186</p>	<p>Roane County has hired a General Maintenance /TruckDriver /Carpenter 2/24/11. This will relieve duties currently performed by other employees, who can now be used for preventive maintenance purposes.</p>
<p>Countywide removal of old carpet in classrooms and replacing with tile.</p>	<p>Summer 2010 and on-going</p>	<p>Director of Maintenance</p>	<p>\$34,000 \$1,415</p>	<p>Walton Elementary-Middle School completed (WEMS). Reedy Elementary School completed (RES).</p>

CONCLUSION.

After the on-site visit and discussions with the superintendent and Maintenance Director, it was evident that an assertive effort was performed to address all items in the OEPA initial visit document. Roane County School District demonstrated a proactive approach in solving and improving their facility environment by completing the action steps or implementing a long term action plan to address the items from the OEPA initial visit and the ten year Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plan (CEFP). Roane County Schools is encouraged to work closely with the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Facilities, to implement the software based statewide preventive maintenance program which will be offered in the spring 2012.

7.5. ADMINISTRATIVE PRACTICES AND SCHOOL-COMMUNITY RELATIONS.

7.5.1. Parents and the community are provided information. Staff members provide parents and the community with understandable information and techniques for helping students learn.

1. The school and county websites provide information to parents, students, and community on a wide variety of topics.
2. The student/parent handbooks contain abundant information on county and school policies and procedures.
3. The county has provided the "Edline" program for schools, and it is used to provide parents of individual student information on a weekly basis on how their child(ren) are progressing in each of their classes.
4. A variety of other communications were provided to parents from teachers on ways they can help their children learn.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

No Review Warranted.

7.5.2. Codes of conduct. The county and schools implement, investigate, and monitor the code of conduct for students and the code of conduct for employees. (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5; Policy 4373; Policy 5902)

The Team reviewed policies and incident reports to verify the Student Code of Conduct and the Employee Code of Conduct had been distributed and discussed with students and employees. Interviews were held with the superintendent, principals, and teachers to verify that the codes of conduct were being implemented. The Team also reviewed local school improvement council reports. The county and schools were found to comply with the requirements of law and policies. One school's Education Performance Audit report indicated that the Employee Code of Conduct should be reviewed with staff and clear expectations of professionalism stated.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

No Review Warranted.

7.5.3. Statewide assessment. Test security measures are in place for the WESTEST. All students in the school participate in the statewide assessment program that includes state content assessments on the WESTEST or West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA) at grades 3-8 and 10 and the Writing Assessment at grades 4, 7, and 10. Students with disabilities who have an IEP or a Section 504 Plan may be assessed on the state content assessments under one of the following conditions: standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, or non-standard conditions with modifications. Students unable to participate in the standardized assessment under these conditions and who meet the alternate assessment criteria will participate in the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment (APTA). Education Performance Audit teams will verify the eligibility of any student tested under standard conditions, standard conditions with accommodations, alternate assessment, or medical emergency student exemptions. Students who are continuously enrolled in the public school from the fifth instructional day of school to the spring assessment administration will be considered in the accountability system. (Policy 2340; Policy 2419; Policy 2510)

The Team interviewed the superintendent, county administrators and the high school principal and observed the procedures used to secure and protect the testing materials, the procedures used to distribute and collect the testing materials, the storing and using of test data, the records of students who took the West Virginia Alternate Performance Task Assessment and reviewed all other aspects of the state testing programs to verify the state testing programs were conducted in accordance with the requirements of State Board policies and found the statewide assessment programs were operating in accordance with all applicable policies.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

No Review Warranted.

7.6. PERSONNEL.

7.6.1. Hiring. County boards follow hiring practices set forth in W.Va. Code. (W.Va. Code §§18A-4-7a, 18A-4-8, and 18-2E-3a)

- Postings. The Team reviewed postings (professional, service, and extracurricular) in the Personnel Office. Vacancies were posted in the county board office, in all schools, and on Edline. The county moved its vacancy postings from the county webpage to Edline in January 2010, as they found Edline to be much easier for the county's programmer and more accessible for individuals looking for vacancies with Roane County Schools.

Positions were being posted as soon as they became vacant. Each posting included a nondiscrimination statement.

Professional vacancies, where certified applicants were at a minimum, were posted on the State website. During the summer months, when school is not in session, all vacancies are announced on a county personnel hotline. If a vacant position is not filled and reposted, it is reposted as a "new" vacancy/posting.

- Job Descriptions. Job descriptions for postings are available on Edline. Copies of job descriptions are also available in each school and the county office. Job descriptions for service personnel were updated and adopted by the Roane County Board of Education February 11, 2010.

Several job descriptions for professional personnel were outdated. Job descriptions for elementary and secondary teachers were approved September 1993 and December 1992, respectively. A speech pathologist job description was approved in 1989. Job descriptions reviewed did not include the "responsibilities" as required in State Board Policy 5310. (See §126-142-13, Classroom Teacher Responsibilities; §126-142-18, Administrators' Responsibilities; and §126-142-28, Coaches' Responsibilities.) Responsibilities for Professional Support Personnel **may be** included in job descriptions (§126-142-23). It was also noted that qualifications listed on postings were not noted in all job descriptions, such as, masters degree preferred, listed on all professional and extracurricular postings, and a current PPD test listed on all postings.

W.Va. Code §16-3D-3 (c) requires a tuberculosis skin test for the **initial** employment. Also, there was no evidence that a masters degree applicant gets preference over a bachelors degree applicant, as the county uses weight for the criteria listed in §18A-4-7a to determine the most qualified applicant. Even in a tie, seniority, not a masters degree breaks the tie.

Only two professional positions were posted after five days prior to the beginning of the instructional term and both positions were filled with applicants new to the county. (Kindergarten, Walton Elementary/Middle School and Social Studies, Roane County High School).

- There is an application for the initial employment (professional and service). There are no applications or forms to complete when requesting a specific posted position. Individuals who wish to apply for a specific position must submit a written request; however, this can be a one sentence request in a letter or written on a scrap piece of paper with no supporting data showing qualifications for the position.
- Several professional/extracurricular postings reviewed had only one or no certified applicants. According to the personnel director, this is the norm. When there is more than one applicant, the county follows W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a to determine the most qualified candidate for vacant positions. The Team reviewed matrices (grids) of those positions. Each matrix showed that the appropriate criteria listed in §18A-4-7a were used to evaluate each applicant. The county used a point system to determine the most qualified applicant when evaluated with the first set of factors in §18A-4-7a. The county also used the first set of factors listed in §18A-4-7a for extracurricular positions. When using the second set of factors in §18A-4-7a, there has never been a situation where the most senior regularly employed applicant was not selected as the most qualified.
- Interview questions are prepared in advance of the scheduled interviews and asked to all candidates. Some interviews require a written response to a prepared question. Interviews are held by the principal, the personnel director, or both. The interview questions, written responses, and interviewer notes are kept on file.
- The recommendation for employment is made by the principal and personnel director to the county superintendent.

The county works to fill vacant positions with certified applicants who also meet the No Child Left Behind (NCLB) definition of a highly qualified teacher. The county participates in the Transition to Teaching Program and has one teacher in the program. Two teachers were on an Alternate Route to Certification. The county has two speech assistants. To recruit new applicants, the personnel director uses the "Approved Educational Personnel Preparation Programs in West Virginia Colleges and Universities" provided by the West Virginia Department of Education to contact state colleges and universities for specific certified teachers. She also contacts colleges and universities from bordering states and the Big East Career Consortium to get leads on available candidates. The personnel director credits the county's use of Edline in getting out-of-the area applicants. The county recently hired (effective for next year) a science teacher and a science/math teacher from Kentucky - and a teacher with multi-categorical/autism certification

and a teacher certified in social studies who will be transferring from other counties in the State.

- No individuals have been employed on out-of-field authorizations this year (2009-2010).
- Coaches. There are no non-paid coaches. All coaches hold a teacher's license, substitute permit, or coaching authorization. Individuals holding a professional license are given priority in hiring. Once that is determined the county uses the first set of factors in §18A-4-7a, giving points to each criterion, to determine the most qualified.
- Service Personnel. W. Va. Code §18A-4-8b is followed in the selection of service personnel. Once applicants meet the criteria of qualifications and evaluation of past service, seniority becomes the deciding factor for transfer or employment of service personnel. The county has an employment application for initial employment as a service personnel employee. They do not have an application (form) to use when applying for a specific posted position. Therefore, individuals (regular employees wishing to transfer and substitutes) apply for the position by writing on a piece of paper, posted note, etc., that they want to apply for the posted position.
- All personnel employed by Roane County are reported on WVEIS. The county contracts three retired former Roane County employees through RESA 5 for ½ time administrative positions. Those positions included: Director of Federal Programs; Director of Student Services; and Director of Parent Involvement. As per the superintendent, with the declining student enrollment and the economy concern, the county was proactive when three full-time administrators retired. Those positions were eliminated and services for those positions were contracted on a half-time basis with the same employees at a set rate of pay. The superintendent states that this has been a substantial savings to the county during this lean time.

Recommendations

1. Number job postings. Once numbered, the county can keep track of the posting. For example, if the position is re-posted due to no applicants available, the same number is used. Example of a posting number: P11-501-01 (P = Professional, 11 = FY School Year; 501 = School Number (Roane County High School); 01 = actual posting number.) The Team recommended that Roane County use the same format for Service and Extracurricular using instead of P, S for Service and X for Extracurricular. This process will also provide accurate data to the personnel director in completing the annual Personnel Data Report required by the WVDE.

2. Job postings. Job postings should reflect the qualifications listed in the job descriptions. The Team recommended that the personnel director review qualifications and update them to ensure they are truly required. Example: Current PPD test could be listed as PPD test for initial employment.
3. Job Descriptions. Professional and Extracurricular – The Team recommended that job descriptions be updated and include the qualifications currently listed on job postings. The Team further recommended that the county add Responsibilities for Classroom Teachers, Administrators, and Coaches as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310. Responsibilities for Professional Support Personnel also may be added.
4. The Team recommended that the county create an application/form for applicants to use when requesting employment or transfer into a posted position. An application/form listing the criteria in §18A-4-7a would provide the personnel director information to use to screen applicants and determine their qualifications for the position.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The Team interviewed the director of personnel and reviewed documents addressed below.

1. **Job postings.** Posting information had been updated for all postings (professional, service, and extracurricular) and complied with W.Va. Codes §18A-4-7a and §18A-4-8b. All job postings were numbered. Once a number is assigned to a posting, the posting number remained the same, even if the position is reposted. Job postings were posted on the county's webpage.
2. **Teacher job description** had been updated (January 2011). It appeared that all job descriptions had been reviewed and/or updated during the past two years. Persons applying for vacant positions can find the job description for the position on the county's website. Directions in obtaining the job descriptions can be found on the posting.
3. **The county has created new applications and application forms for requesting a specific posted professional position.** The forms are designed to obtain information needed, as per W. Va. Code §18A-4-7a to fairly evaluate the qualifications of all applicants who apply for a posted position.

7.6.2. Licensure. Professional educators and other professional employees required to be licensed under West Virginia Board of Education policy are licensed for their assignments including employees engaged in extracurricular activities. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2; Policy 5202)

The Team reported that Roane County complied with licensure requirements.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE.

7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

The Team reviewed a sampling of personnel evaluations for the 2008-2009 year covering all schools and the county office for the various groups of school personnel that included: 12 evaluations of teachers, 10 evaluations of coaches, 6 evaluations of professional support staff, 5 evaluations of school administrators, and 12 evaluations of service personnel from the various service personnel classifications. Overall the personnel evaluations were in excellent shape and completed in accordance with the requirements of State Code, West Virginia Board of Education policies and Roane County Board of Education policies. Three incidents were found that did not meet the requirements: 1. Two observations for one evaluation completed for a teacher at Spencer Elementary School were not signed by the evaluator; 2. one coach at Spencer Middle School did not have an evaluation for the 2008-2009 year; and 3. evaluations for all fall and winter coaches at Roane County High School were not available for review.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

PARTIAL COMPLIANCE. The Team interviewed the county personnel director and the principals at Spencer Elementary School, Spencer Middle School, and Roane County High School and reviewed evaluations of coaches for the 2010-2011 school year and the first half of the 2011-12 school years to test the three findings in the original Education Performance Audit.

- 1. All teacher evaluations and teacher observations in the sample reviewed by the Team had been signed and dated by the evaluator and the teacher as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310 and Roane County Board of Education Policy 4220.**
- 2. All coaches at Spencer Middle School had evaluations for the 2010-11 school year and all coaches of fall sports for the 2011-12 school year had evaluations as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.**
- 3. Evaluations for coaches of fall sports at Roane County High School were available and reviewed. All coaches had evaluations as required except the Varsity Volleyball Coach for whom no evaluation was available.**

The coaches' evaluations that were reviewed consisted of one page for the entire evaluation. The evaluation process requires two observations for the evaluation. The one form provided by the State is to be used for observations and the evaluation. The evaluator is to note by checking the appropriate box whether it is the first observation, second observation, or the evaluation. The coaches' evaluations in Roane County simply had all three boxes marked on the same form; therefore, it was impossible to determine if statements on the document were for an observation or for the evaluation. This did not comply with the requirements of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.

7.6.4. Teacher and principal internship. The county board develops and implements a beginning teacher internship program and a beginning principal internship program that conform with W.Va. Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies. (W.Va. Code §18A-3-2b and 2d; Policy 5899; Policy 5900)

All beginning teachers (12) and principals (2) had mentors and participated in the Beginning Internship programs. The programs were monitored by the county personnel director who planned and conducted a county orientation. Principals are responsible for the implementation of the program in their respective schools. No mentor has more than one beginning teacher. No teacher was in his/her second year of the program. Mentors attempt to implement the program according to West Virginia Code and State Board and county policies; however, observations of the beginning teacher by the mentor and required conferences/meetings are held informally at lunch, in the hallway, etc., rather than on a scheduled basis meeting the time requirements listed in policy and law. Principals and beginning teachers interviewed appeared pleased with the program. The personnel director surveys beginning teachers each year and findings provide data to the county in evaluating its program and making improvements. Two new staff development sessions will be scheduled next year for beginning teachers as a result of the 2009-2010 survey.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

NONCOMPLIANCE. The Team interviewed principals, mentor teachers, and new teachers (mentees) and found that all were satisfied with the way the process was working. It did not appear from the records that the required time for in class observations of the new teacher by the mentor was sufficient to meet the requirements of the program. There was no evidence that a Professional Support Team, as required by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5900, was functioning in the two schools sampled.

7.7. SAFE, DRUG FREE, VIOLENCE FREE, AND DISCIPLINED SCHOOLS.

7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)

All schools provide each student a student handbook which contains the school rules, procedures, schedules, expectations, etc., that will be in effect for that school for the school year. These handbooks are reviewed with students to ensure they understand the rules and procedures and the handbooks are shared with parents. Edline is provided for each school so the teachers and parents may directly communicate on student progress, class expectations, etc. A county website posts such things as rules, procedures, and expectations of students. The Team reviewed a sampling of school discipline records to verify the rules were being enforced.

Roane County Schools publishes a Roane County Schools Handbook for Parents and Students that is distributed to all elementary and middle school students. This handbook provides students and parents notice of required policies and procedures. This includes the grading policy, Student Code of Conduct, student discipline policy, student attendance policy, and drug free workplace. The handbook also includes Internet links to the official policies of Roane County Schools.

The one policy that was not located in the Parent and Student Handbook was notice of the Anti-Harassment and Violence policy. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2421, Harassment requires notice of this policy either through the student-parent handbook or distribution of the policy to all students, faculty, and staff.

Roane County High School publishes a separate student handbook. Just like the elementary and middle school version, it provides notice to students and parents of policies related to grading, Student Code of Conduct, student discipline, and attendance policy. It also included notice of the Anti-Harassment and Violence policy.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed a current copy of the Roane County School Handbook for Parents and Students. The notice of the Anti-Harassment and Violence Policy was part of the Parent and Student Handbook which was distributed to parents and students for the 2011-2012 school year.

Roane County High School implemented a student leadership team for the 2011-2012 academic year. The students initiated a comprehensive anti-bullying campaign with high school students. The communication plan included press coverage and radio announcements. Since the new principal and assistant principal began their responsibilities, there have been no student fights at Roane County High School.

The director of student services was being utilized as a key communicator between the central office and schools/parents. The Team observed improved school attendance rates and decreased discipline incidents.

7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

W.Va. Code §18A-1-12a (17) states, “All official and enforceable personnel policies of a county board must be written and made available to its employees.”

Roane County Schools has been working with a policy development company for several years. The Team reviewed the Roane County Schools policy manual on-line (<http://www.neola.com/roane-wv/>), and found that Roane County Schools has done an excellent job of developing policies that ensure student safety. Policies governing student discipline, student due process rights, nondiscrimination, Student Code of Conduct, and Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy have been clearly defined and written. Policy 5517.01, Aggressive Behavior Toward Students, clearly outlines procedures for both staff and students if they feel they have been a victim of aggressive behavior.

All policies are online and easily accessible to everyone, including students and parents. A search engine is available to assist in locating related policies.

The Roane County Schools Policy Manual outlines the procedures on amending, adopting, or repealing policies. This is located under Legislative in the Bylaws. The basic procedure indicates final action may be taken at the second meeting that the policy(ies) has been on the agenda consecutively.

Policy updates and changes are communicated to central office administrators and school principals at monthly staff meetings and through e-mail communication.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE.

7.8. LEADERSHIP.

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

W.Va. Code §18A-2-12a (1) provides “The effective and efficient operation of the public schools depends upon the development of harmonious and cooperative relationships between county boards and school personnel.”

The Team reviewed the Roane County Board of Education agendas and minutes and interviewed all five members of the board of education and the county superintendent. Interviews and the board records indicated that a harmonious and cooperative relationship existed between the county superintendent and county board as a body. The board as a whole supported the county superintendent and this was reflected in board meetings and individually through all interviews.

During the course of the interviews, statements surfaced and minutes supported that indicated a desire by some board members for more communication from the superintendent to board members. Board meetings held once a month restricted the board in receiving communication and also confined them in acting on important items. The explanation of this was “budgetary constraints; however, the Team feels that two meetings monthly would be valuable in county business necessitating board of education action and provide timely communication to board members and the community.

1. Local school improvement council (LSIC) meetings with the board of education were not documented in the board minutes. The agenda states that the board of education will meet with the LSIC prior to the following board of education meeting to be held at the school. W.Va. Code §18-5A-2 (i) states, the local school improvement council shall meet at least annually with the county board, in accordance with the provisions in section fourteen. The board was meeting annually with each LSIC, but the meeting was not at a documented board of education meeting. The Team further noted that it was not possible to determine that the LSICs reported on their school’s Five-Year Strategic Plan.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Minutes of the Roane County Board of Education meetings dated September 1, 2011, October, 18, 2011, November 15, 2011, and December 20, 2011, reflected that the board met with Local School Improvement Councils (LSIC) from Geary Elementary/Middle School, Reedy Elementary School, Spencer Elementary School, and Roane County High School respectively. According to documentation, all LSICs discussed their Five-Year Strategic Plan during the meetings. Walton Elementary/Middle School and Spencer Middle School LSICs

will meet with the Roane County Board of Education during meetings scheduled later this school year.

2. Board minutes were not signed but were stamped by the superintendents' signature stamp. The superintendent stated future minutes would be signed.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The superintendent had signed all board minutes.

3. Minutes were hard to follow, vague, and did not list a start time or end time. Executive sessions did not indicate the time the board entered an executive session or returned from the session. It was difficult to understand the board's business that was conducted.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. Board of Education Minutes stated the beginning and ending times for meetings, and the beginning and ending times for executive sessions. The minutes were brief, vague, and it was difficult at times to determine business conducted.

4. Board of education members would benefit from professional development regarding their role in policy development and adoption practices. The current policy development process had minimal involvement of members of the board of education. The agendas and minutes frequently did list the title or specific policy that was being approved.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. According to documentation, policy training occurred during West Virginia School Boards' Association (WVSBA) trainings held in September 2010 and February 2012.

5. County office leadership was restricted by three administrative positions being contracted ½ time positions.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. This has been corrected with the hiring of a full time federal programs director, a full time attendance director, and a full time curriculum coordinator.

6. Board of Education members would benefit from more communication between the superintendent and the Board of Education members. Interviews with the superintendent and board members showed that no formal communication or updates existed between the superintendent and board members, such as, weekly or bimonthly newsletters, etc. The primary communication was by telephone to the board president.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

COMPLIANCE. The superintendent communicates with board of education members with a weekly update of information on school matters. In addition to weekly updates, the superintendent also communicates by phoning, texting, and e-mailing board members as needed.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – LEADERSHIP SUMMARY – February 2012

Board of Education meetings were being held at least twice each month. Board members indicated that they were very pleased with this arrangement. This gives greater opportunity to address matters in a timely manner. Interviews with board members and the superintendent indicated a good flow of communication between the superintendent and board members, the board and superintendent were focused as a team on improving learning for all Roane County students, and the board relies on the superintendent to provide leadership to bring about positive teaching and learning in the Roane County School District.

Prior to beginning his term as Superintendent of Roane County Schools on July 1, 2011, the superintendent-elect met with all personnel on June 9, 2011, to discuss his leadership vision to improve student achievement for all students in Roane County. His vision of urgency for transforming education in Roane County Schools was entitled, *Roane Right Now!* This vision focused on standards based on the West Virginia CSOs, effective instructional practices, student engagement, positive school culture and climate, effective management procedures, and a comprehensive approach of assessment and accountability for every employee. This vision, coupled with the superintendent's formation of a County Leadership/Curriculum Team to guide schools in Roane County, is a foundation for improvement and growth in the system. Sustaining this leadership approach is essential for continued progress and growth.

8.1. INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The county office staff has determined that the Saxon Mathematics program does not match the West Virginia content standards and objectives (CSOs) and is the reason for the low mathematics scores. While this may be a factor in the low mathematics assessment results, the school reports show a countywide curriculum need to concentrate on the 21st Century content standards and objectives and to use instructional time more effectively.

The Roane County central office staff responsible for curriculum was placed at Reedy Elementary School for three months to oversee daily school operations during the hiring of a new principal. This impeded the county in providing curricular leadership at schools that failed to make adequate yearly progress (AYP).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Roane County Schools adopted a standards-based mathematics curriculum that aligns with the West Virginia 21st Century content standards and objectives (WV CSOs). Roane County School District provided extensive professional development and support to all staff delivering mathematics instruction.

By establishing a County Leadership Team, Roane County Schools now has the foundation to provide specific instructional and curriculum support to each school. The leadership team assists schools with monitoring for effective use of instructional time.

8.1.4. Administrative practices. The school district assesses the assignment of administrative personnel to determine the degree managerial/administrative services provided schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

The assignment of administrative personnel at the county office negatively affected student, school, and school system performance. Roane County does not have an excess levy that supports the education program and the county's response has been to eliminate county office positions and contract the positions as ½ day as staff retire. Three contracted ½ time positions were in place: Director of Federal Programs, Director of Student Services (attendance director), and Director of Parent Involvement. With a 61.7 percent county economically disadvantaged rate (West Virginia School Percent of Needy Students Report Based on 2nd Month Enrollment for 2009-2010) for all grade levels, the county expressed this was the best use of their resources.

While this method of employment may meet statutory hiring and conserve county fiscal resources, the Team questions the effectiveness and efficiency of one-half time, contracted persons in critical area positions of Director of Federal Programs and Director of Student Services (attendance director).

With the high percent of needy students, the declining graduation rate, and declining attendance rate; these management decisions may not be working to effect student performance. The Team recommended that the Roane County School District evaluate effectiveness of the county level administrative assignments to determine if this staffing practice is limiting services to the schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Roane County Schools has taken steps to improve the alignment of personnel at the County Office. The following actions demonstrated improvement.

- 1. Roane County employed a full-time Director of Federal Programs whose responsibilities include: Title I, Title II, Rural and Low Income Schools, Child Nutrition, School Improvement Grants, and E-Rate. This person also serves as a member of the County Leadership/Curriculum Team.**
- 2. The Director of Student Services position is now full-time (not contracted) and is responsible for attendance and graduation rates.**
- 3. The Director of Personnel is responsible for personnel and data collection/analysis. Additionally, a contracted position (previous personnel director) exists for the remainder of the 2012 year to provide support to the newly employed Director of Personnel.**
- 4. The Director of Special Education is now a full-time position and this person is a key member of the County Leadership/Curriculum Team.**

By assigning specific roles and responsibilities to each central office staff, Roane County School District has established a foundational core team focused on curriculum and achievement. This will serve as a basis for further growth and improvement in student achievement in Roane County Schools.

8.1.5. Personnel. The school district assesses the assignment of personnel as based on West Virginia Code and West Virginia Board of Education policies to determine the degree to which instructional and support services provided to the schools establish and support high quality curriculum and instructional services.

- The Team reviewed student enrollment data for the last four years. The superintendent said that the enrollment has stabilized. The data showed a**

decrease in enrollment of 67 students from 2006 to 2009; however, enrollment increased by 17 students from 2008 to 2009.

- The county did not have an excess levy; therefore, must work to stay within the state aid formula. Each year, principals project their school needs for the upcoming year by projecting enrollments in their respective schools. The county then retains teachers to meet the basic needs, students' IEPs, and pupil/teacher ratio as required in W.Va. Code §18-5-18a. Split-grades are planned each spring in the elementary schools for the upcoming school year; however, this is not implemented if Title II (class size reduction) funds are available. Once these funds are no longer available the county may be required to have split grades if other funds are not available. Central office administrator positions have been cut and eliminated. Three administrators have been replaced with contracted services at a decreased cost to the county.
- As per the business manager, the county currently has three and one-half professional and two and one-half service positions funded outside the formula. There are also positions funded with federal funds, such as Title I, (9.5); Title II (2.5); Rural and Low Income (1); School Improvement Grant (1), etc. After school tutoring is funded from a Homeless Children and Youth Grant.
- As per the personnel director, the principal of Roane County High School, and the superintendent, all required courses are offered to students. When necessary, low incident courses are offered through virtual school. Art, music, and physical education are offered to all students by specialists, with the exception of art at Reedy Elementary School (PreK-4). Art is provided at that school by the regular classroom teachers. Physical education time requirements are met at all schools. Three RN school nurses and two LPN/aides serve the county. Counselors and librarians are assigned to the middle and high schools. School counselors are assigned on an itinerant basis to all elementary schools. The amount of time assigned to each school is determined by the number of students and needs of the respective schools. No itinerant person is assigned to more than two schools.
- Service personnel appear to be sufficient to serve the county. Aides are assigned to preschools and in special education classes where required or "needed." Custodians are assigned to the schools based upon the square footage of the facility. Cooks are assigned according to the number of meals served at the school and the guidelines listed in school law. The facility reviewer observed that the number of maintenance employees may not be adequate for preventive facility maintenance.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

Student enrollment in Roane County Schools decreased by 61 students over the past three school years (2,554 students in FY2010 to 2,443 in FY2012).

Currently, Roane County has 7.5 professional and 19 service positions funded outside the State Aide Formula.

As per the superintendent of schools, all required courses are offered to students. When necessary, low incident courses are offered through virtual school. Art, music, and physical education are offered to all students by specialists, with the exception of art at Reedy Elementary School (PreK-4). Art is provided at that school by the classroom teachers. Physical education time requirements were being met at all schools. Two RN school nurses and four LPN/aides serve the county. Counselors and librarians were assigned to the middle and high schools. School counselors were assigned on an itinerant basis to all elementary schools. The amount of time assigned to each school is determined by the number of students and needs of the respective schools. No itinerant person is assigned to more than two schools.

Service personnel appeared to be sufficient to serve the county. Aides were assigned to preschools, kindergarten, and in special education classes where required or “needed.” Custodians were assigned to the schools based upon the square footage of the facility and based on the needs of the facility. Cooks were assigned according to the number of meals served at the school and the guidelines listed in school law. An additional maintenance employee was employed July, 2011, to address preventive maintenance needs.

8.1.6. Regional Education Service Agency. The school district effectively utilizes Regional Education Service Agency programs and services or other regional services that may be initiated between and among county boards.

Roane County Board of Education is a member of Regional Education Service Agency 5 and receives its RESA services through this organization. The Roane County School District participates in all State mandated programs and services provided by RESA 5. A sampling of programs and services offered by RESA 5 in which Roane County participates included: Computer repair services, Adolescent Health Initiative, adult education, cooperative purchasing, continuing education, Medicaid reimbursement, professional development, tobacco use prevention, safe and drug-free schools, special education support, WVEIS support, and assistance for low performing schools.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

The Team found Roane County utilized RESA 5 on a regular basis. The RESA 5 Special Education Coordinator and the RESA 5 Director of Professional

Development serve on the Roane County Leadership Team for State Incentives Grant (SIG) Schools. Additionally, RESA 5 staff delivers professional development and support to each school in Roane County, as directed by the County Improvement Plan. In addition, Roane County School District utilizes RESA 5 for the following services: STAR Program (healthy living), Instructional Practices Inventories (IPI), surveying school culture, assisting with implementation of special education programs, and school bus driver training.

CAPACITY BUILDING

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

The Team observed an overall lack of a plan for capacity building in Roane County Schools. With key staff positions being part time and contracted services, areas of need continued to worsen and student achievement continued to decline.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

The Team observed that Roane County has focused a great deal of attention on capacity building by utilizing available resources to provide extensive trainings for teachers and administrators to improve teaching, learning, and student achievement.

Roane County has begun the process of implementing Professional Learning Communities (PLCs) in their schools to facilitate the processes of building team work among the staff, benchmarking student academic progress, and developing plans to address issues associated with school success. The implementation and utilization of PLCs will need to be monitored by school administrators to evaluate progress, assess professional development needs, and determine resource needs. The Team believed that these efforts will contribute significantly to building capacity in Roane County Schools to improve student achievement.

ROANE COUNTY SUMMARY

The Education Performance Audit of the Roane County School District identified that curriculum, instruction, and curricular leadership were the shortcomings of the school district. Declining student achievement in all areas and the individual school findings showed that the county must focus on learning. The structure at the central office impedes the county school district in providing the continuous and sustained leadership to individual schools.

It is the recommendation of the Office of Education Performance Audits that the Roane County School System continue to receive assistance from the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Improvement to revise its Five-Year Strategic Plan and to assist with improving the students, schools, and school system performance.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW – February 2012

The Follow-up Education Performance Audit found that the Roane County School District has given due diligence to improving the curriculum and instruction being delivered to students. The district leadership team has worked cohesively to provide guidance and support in the improvement process, and they have been persistent in benchmarking and monitoring progress.

It is the recommendation of the Office of Education Performance Audits that the Roane County School System continue to receive assistance from the West Virginia Department of Education, Office of School Improvement to assist with improving the students, schools, and school system performance.