

OFFICE OF EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDITS



FINAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT FOR TYLER COUNTY SCHOOLS

NOVEMBER 2004

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
INTRODUCTION	
Education Performance Audit	3
SECTION I	
School Performance	4
SECTION II	
Tyler County School System	16
SECTION III	
Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies	17
Early Detection and Intervention	18
SECTION IV	
Identification of Resource Needs	19
SECTION V	
School System Approval & School Accreditation Status	20

INTRODUCTION

Education Performance Audit

The West Virginia Office of Education Performance Audits conducted an Education Performance Audit of the Tyler County School District December 16-18, 2003.

A follow-up Review of Tyler County was conducted October 6, 2004. The purpose of the follow-up was to verify correction of the findings identified during the original Education Performance Audit. The review was in accordance with West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 and West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 which specify that a fully approved school system in which other deficiencies are discovered shall remain on full approval status for the remainder of the approval period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. A school that meets or exceeds the performance and progress standards but has other deficiencies shall remain on full accreditation status for the remainder of the accreditation period and shall have an opportunity to correct those deficiencies. However, the code and policy require that the school does not have any deficiencies that would endanger students, or extraordinary circumstances as defined by the West Virginia Board of Education.

SECTION I

School Performance

The Follow-up Education Performance Audit Team checked identified noncompliances and recommendations to determine if they had been corrected. This section presents the initial Education Performance Audit Team's findings of noncompliances and recommendations, and the follow-up review team's comments and status of compliance with the original citations.

Elementary Schools

85-201 Arthur I. Boreman Elementary
85-202 Sistersville Elementary

Middle School

85-303 Tyler Consolidated Middle

High School

85-503 Tyler Consolidated High

85-201 ARTHUR I. BOREMAN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

RECOMMENDATIONS

7.1.5. Instruction. During classroom observations, the Team found limited direct instruction related to the physical education skills being presented to the students. Therefore, the Team recommended that staff development in physical education instruction be provided to the physical education department and staff implement strategies to improve student performance in physical education.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Staff development in physical education instruction had been provided within the county staff development program. The physical education instructor will attend the physical education teachers' conference at Camp Caesar. A walking track had been installed on the playground and students are required to run at the beginning of each recess. The school also instituted a schoolwide walking program.

7.1.8. Library/educational technology access and technology application. During classroom observations, the Team found effective computer utilization in laboratory settings. Lesson plans indicated technology and classroom integration; however, the Team did not observe the integration of technology instruction into the classroom program. The Team recommended that a monitoring system be developed to ensure consistent integration of technology into all classroom instruction.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. All teachers provide the principal their plans for using technology in their classrooms. This information is taken by the principal when he visits classrooms. The principal looks for the use of technology during the classroom visits and discusses it with teachers following the classroom visits. The principal also monitors use of the computer laboratories through the computer printouts that are produced by the COMPASS program.

ARTHUR I. BOREMAN ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

7.1.14. Multicultural education. The Team found that multicultural education was being delivered; however, a collaborative/consistent schoolwide instructional approach for teaching the multicultural program was lacking. The Team recommended that a collaborative, sequential, schoolwide curriculum be developed to ensure that all students receive a comprehensive K-5 multicultural program.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. Staffs from the elementary schools met during the summer and prepared a county multicultural curriculum for elementary schools which was being used by this faculty.

85-202 SISTERSVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

NONCOMPLIANCE

6.1. The Annual Performance Measure Goals

- 6.1.4. Presidential Physical Fitness Test.** The percentage of students in grades K-9 passing the Presidential Physical Fitness Test at one of the following levels: Presidential, National, or Fitness is forty percent (40%) or above or shows an increasing trend during the most recent three (3) years. (W.Va. Code §18-2-7a)

The percentage of students passing the Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) for 2002-03 was 36.14 percent and did not show an increasing trend.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The percentage of students passing the Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) for the 2003-04 school year was 46.52 percent.

RECOMMENDATIONS

- 7.1.6. Instructional strategies.** Through classroom observations the Team found evidence that the Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) were being addressed; however, the majority of the strategies observed involved direct instruction. The Team recommended professional development to implement high yield instructional strategies and a plan to monitor their implementation and effectiveness.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The staff was working on this recommendation and will continue planning for training during the Instructional Support and Enhancement Day scheduled for Friday, October 8, 2004.

SISTERSVILLE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

7.1.8. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The Team found that the school computer laboratory was used effectively. However, the computers within the classrooms were not being used to their capacity. The Team recommended that a schoolwide plan be developed to use computers in the classrooms for instructional strategies. The Team also recommended that professional development be provided Sistersville Elementary teachers on best practices regarding using computers to enhance academic achievement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The staff will be preparing a schoolwide plan on computer use in the classrooms for best practices and instructional strategies during the Instructional Support Enhancement Day Friday, October 8, 2004. Once the plan is in place, staff development on best practices regarding using computers to enhance academic achievement is planned for later this school year.

7.1.14. Multicultural education. The Team observed that multicultural education was being implemented on a schoolwide basis. However, there was little evidence that multicultural education occurred in the classrooms. The Team recommended that a schoolwide implementation plan be developed for consistency and relevancy at each grade level.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. During the summer of 2004, the elementary teachers prepared a curriculum for multicultural education for the elementary schools which was currently being implemented.

7.6.2. Safe, healthy, and accessible facilities. Standing water collected behind the school building outside the Kindergarten classroom and may cause future indoor air quality problems. The Team recommended that a an appropriate drain be installed with an appropriate ditch to drain water that may collect.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. A drainage ditch had been constructed and a drain had been installed. The area no longer collects water.

85-303 TYLER CONSOLIDATED MIDDLE SCHOOL

5.1.1. Achievement.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

NONCOMPLIANCE. Tyler Consolidated Middle School failed to attain adequate yearly progress (AYP) for 5.1.1 Achievement for the special education (SE) subgroup. Consequently, the West Virginia Board of Education issued the school Temporary Accreditation status at its September 10, 2004 meeting.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

NONCOMPLIANCES

6.1. The Annual Performance Measure Goals

6.1.4. Presidential Physical Fitness Test. The percentage of students in grades K-9 passing the Presidential Physical Fitness Test at one of the following levels: Presidential, National, or Fitness is forty percent (40%) or above or shows an increasing trend during the most recent three (3) years. (W.Va. Code §18-2-7a)

The percentage of students passing the Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) for 2002-03 was 31.14 percent and did not show an increasing trend.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. This school year the physical education time for students who take band and/or choir was increased from 12 weeks to 18 weeks. The remainder of the students have 36 weeks of physical education each year. The physical education staff has changed and the new staff placed more emphasis on activities that are tested on the Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT).

The percentage of students passing the PPFT for the 2003-04 school year was 27.74 percent. This is expected to improve with the changes instituted this year and the new physical education staff.

TYLER CONSOLIDATED MIDDLE SCHOOL

7.1. Curriculum

7.1.5. Instruction. Instruction is consistent with the programmatic definitions in Policy 2510. (Policy 2510)

All students were not provided general music instruction. The principal verified that students in band and chorus were not enrolled in general music.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) were rewritten for the band and chorus classes to include the CSOs for general music.

7.2. Student and School Performance

7.2.4. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

The physical education teacher was unable to produce lesson plans. Given the low Presidential Physical Fitness Test (PPFT) results (31.14 percent), attention to delivery of the physical education Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) needed to be monitored.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed a checklist showing that lesson plans had been submitted to the principal and reviewed each week. Lesson plans for the physical education teacher for last year and this year were in the file.

TYLER CONSOLIDATED MIDDLE SCHOOL

RECOMMENDATION

5.1.1. Achievement. The Team recommended that the school continue implementing the Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) to decrease the percentage of special education students scoring in the bottom quartile and increase the percentage of special education students achieving in the top quartiles.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) had been reviewed and revised to emphasize instruction for all students performing below the Mastery level.

85-503 TYLER CONSOLIDATED HIGH SCHOOL

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

NONCOMPLIANCES

- 7.1.6. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

The Team observed a limited variety of instructional strategies and a lack of promoting higher order thinking skills. In view of the low achievement of the economically disadvantaged and special education subgroups, questioning strategies and the synthesis and analysis of higher order thinking skills questioning needed to be utilized.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Staff development sessions were provided on instructional strategies and higher order thinking skills. Instructional strategies were being monitored weekly by the principal. The Team visited most classrooms and observed a variety of instructional strategies being used.

- 7.1.8. Library/educational technology access and technology application. The application of technology is included throughout all programs of study and students have regular access to library/educational technology centers or classroom libraries. (Policy 2470; Policy 2510)**

The Team observed a limited number of students using technology. The use of technology was not verifiable through schoolwide observations, staff and student interviews, or computer laboratory log sheets. Only 13 students were observed using technology (eight of whom were in one class).

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Technology use was monitored by the principal through classroom visits. The Team visited classrooms throughout the school, interviewed students and staff, and observed technology being used throughout the programs.

TYLER CONSOLIDATED HIGH SCHOOL

- 7.1.10. Programs of study.** Programs of study are provided in grades K-12 as listed in W.Va. 126CSR42 West Virginia Board of Education 2510 (hereinafter Policy 2510) for elementary, middle, and high school levels, including career clusters and majors and an opportunity to examine a system of career clusters in grades 5-8 and to select a career cluster to explore in grades 9 and 10. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)

The Team found that four levels of dance were not offered as required by Policy 2510. The 2003-04 Course Description Catalogue and the principal indicated that four levels of dance were not offered.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Dance I was offered during the 2003-04 school year with 21 students taking the course. Dance I - IV was listed in the course offerings for the 2004-05 school year with Dance I and Dance II classes having enough students enrolled to offer the classes. It is expected that enough students will be interested to offer classes in Dance III and Dance IV in future years as the students currently in dance class progress through the grades.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.4. Lesson plans and principal feedback.** Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)

The Team interviewed teachers, conducted classroom observations, and found that lesson plans had not been completed in a number of classrooms. Teachers stated that lesson plans were not required, only the use of a Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs) checklist. The principal did not comment on lesson plans as required.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The high school principal now requires all teachers to complete weekly lesson plans. These plans are submitted to the office each Friday. A Weekly Lesson Plan Checklist is used by the principal for verification of the completion of lesson plans.

TYLER CONSOLIDATED HIGH SCHOOL

7.10. Professional Development and Evaluation

- 7.10.1. Evaluation.** The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)

Through teacher and principal interviews and staff evaluation reviews, the Team found that evaluation time lines and requirements were not being met. The principal, as immediate supervisor, did not conduct all of the evaluations.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The Team reviewed the personnel evaluation schedule for the current school year and the evaluations completed last school year. After the Team visit, evaluation time lines were met and the principal completed the evaluations.

- 7.11.3. Policy implementation.** The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 2422.5A; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)

The West Virginia Board of Education grading scale was not being followed for Advanced Placement courses.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. Weighted grades were being used in the Advanced Placement courses in compliance with the adopted county policy as permitted by West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2515.

TYLER CONSOLIDATED HIGH SCHOOL

7.12. Leadership.

7.12.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

Due to the number and nature of the noncompliances at Tyler Consolidated High School, the Team determined that the leadership of the school was deficient in vision and management.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

COMPLIANCE. The leadership (principal) at the school has changed and the new principal appeared to be providing vision and management for the school.

RECOMMENDATIONS

5.1.1. Achievement. The Team recommended that the staff follow the revised Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) to improve the achievement of students in the (SES) economically disadvantaged and (SE) special education subgroups.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The Unified School Improvement Plan (USIP) was revised and being followed by the school staff in an attempt to improve the achievement of students in the economically disadvantaged (SES) and special education (SE) subgroups. The school met Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) for the 2003-04 school year.

7.1.1. Mission and goals. Through teacher and student interviews, the Team found that the school's mission and goals were not communicated to parents. The Team recommended that a method be developed to communicate the school's mission and goals to parents.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. The school's mission and goals have been distributed to parents through the Parent Newsletter, printed on the student report cards, included in the student handbooks, and given to parents of Grade 9 students at the annual orientation program.

SECTION II
Tyler County School System

This section presents the county school district high quality standards identified by the Education Performance Audit Team as being out of compliance with state policies and regulations. It also presents, recommendations, commendations, and building capacity to correct deficiencies.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

RECOMMENDATION

7.6.1. Determine during on-site reviews and include in reports whether required reviews and inspections have been conducted by the appropriate agencies, including, but not limited to, the State Fire Marshal, the Health Department, the School Building Authority, and the responsible divisions within the West Virginia Department of Education, and whether noted deficiencies have been or are in the process of being corrected. The Office of Education Performance Audits may not conduct a duplicate review or inspection nor mandate more stringent compliance measures.

The Health Department Inspection record at the county office was not current. The latest record showed an inspection on 10-12-00. The Team recommended that Tyler County Schools contact the Tyler County Health Department to request current inspection updates.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

RECOMMENDATION FOLLOWED. A request to the Tyler County Health Department in the 2003-04 school year resulted in an inspection conducted at Sistersville Elementary School. Another request to the health department on September 22, 2004, resulted in inspections at all the county schools. The school system is currently awaiting reports from the health department on the school inspections.

SECTION III

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

- 17.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county Unified Improvement Plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

The Team reported that Tyler County and the schools have the capacity to correct the deficiencies noted in the report.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The Tyler County School System corrected all the noncompliances issued by the Education Performance Audit Team. Help may be necessary from outside agencies to permit Tyler County Schools to meet the Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) for students in the special education (SE) subgroup at Tyler Consolidated Middle School.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Due to the high number of noncompliances and recommendations at Tyler Consolidated High School, the Team recommended that the office of the superintendent of Tyler County investigate preventive solutions to correct the deficiencies. Assistance from the West Virginia Department of Education may be utilized to help correct the problems before the accreditation status of Tyler Consolidated High School is affected.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

The superintendent prepared improvement plans for principals in schools that had noncompliances on the Education Performance Audit and monitored the progress on compliance with the audit findings during the remainder of the 2003-04 school year. This process has resulted in all findings of the noncompliances being brought into compliance for the 2004-05 school year.

SECTION IV

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

18.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities, which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school listed was below standard in the areas identified.

Sistersville Elementary School

18.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.

A bulletin board, scales, and a refrigerator with locked storage were not provided in the Health Services area.

The Food Service area did not have a dressing room. The Team recommended that a dressing room be added by setting up an adjacent room, which was being used for a mop storage room.

FOLLOW-UP REVIEW

There has basically been no change. A bulletin board was ordered, received, and is ready for installation. All other conditions remained the same.

SECTION V

School System Approval & School Accreditation Status

The Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education continue the Full Approval status of the Tyler County School System and the schools be issued the accreditation status listed in the chart.

School	Accreditation Status	Education Performance Audit	Annual Performance Measures	Date Certain
85-201 Arthur I. Boreman Elementary	Full Accreditation			
85-202 Sistersville Elementary	Full Accreditation			
85-303 Tyler Consolidated Middle	Temporary Accreditation		5.1.1 (SE)	
85-503 Tyler Consolidated High	Exemplary Accreditation			