



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

ROCK CAVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL

UPSHUR COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JULY 2014

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures For Accountability - Analysis	9
Education Performance Audit.....	10
Commendations.....	10
High Quality Standards	11
Indicators Of Efficiency	12
Building Capacity To Correct Deficiencies.....	13
Identification Of Resource Needs.....	14
Early Detection And Intervention	16
None Identified.....	16
Education Performance Audit Summary	17

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Rock Cave Elementary School in Upshur County was conducted May 1, 2014. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was two-fold. The primary purpose was to investigate the reason for performance and progress that are persistently below standard. Secondly, the purpose was to make recommendations to the school, school system, as appropriate, and West Virginia Board of Education on such matters as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress to meet the standard.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education, Office of Instructional Technology – Lori Whitt, Coordinator

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Joann Gilbert	Principal	Nutter Fort Primary School Harrison County
C. Steve Malnick	Principal	Monongah Middle School Marion County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

87 UPSHUR COUNTY

Roy Wager, Superintendent

208 ROCK CAVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL – TRANSITION

Amanda Craig, Principal
Grades PK-05, Enrollment 137

In 2013, West Virginia received waiver approval from certain federal rules and deadlines under the Elementary and Secondary Education Act (ESEA). West Virginia received approval to use its own accountability system which was developed to more effectively identify struggling schools and better direct resources to these schools (2013 ESEA Results). Every public school in the state is designated as a **SUCCESS, TRANSITION, FOCUS, SUPPORT** or **PRIORITY** school.

The West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) indicates Rock Cave Elementary School a Transition school. Transition schools are those schools that have either met their target based on their WVAI score or demonstrated that a majority of their subgroups are making academic progress against the annual academic goals in mathematics and reading/language arts, or the school has reached its goals in attendance or graduation rates. Transition schools may be demonstrating some combination of low achievement, achievement gaps, low growth or low attendance/graduation rates. The school must show progress in student achievement each year to maintain or improve this designation. A school's designation is determined once a year based on prior school year data, including WESTEST2 results.

Designation Status for Rock Cave Elementary School.

Designation:	TRANSITION	Next Year's Target:	53.1251
Index Score:	30.126	Met at least 50% of targets in Mathematics and Reading:	YES
Index Target:	49.5347	Met Participation Rate Indicator:	YES
Met Index Target:	NO		

Supporting Data

Proficiency (40% of the index score)	8.81
Achievement Gaps Closed (20% of the index score)	4.86
Observed Growth (15% of the index score)	6.56
Adequate Growth (20% of the index score)	5.00
<u>Attendance Rate (5% of the index score)</u>	<u>4.89</u>
Total Accountability Index (out of 100)	30.13

The West Virginia Accountability Index targets were set for each school to reach progressively higher performance on a defined set of data. Schools have an overall score based on multiple components of student and school performance. All schools were required to meet the same end point, thus defining school-specific trajectories requiring higher rates of improvement for lower performing schools. Targets comprised of the five components listed above are set with a goal of all elementary schools in West Virginia reaching 74.6679 by 2020. Proficiency targets were set at 75 percent for all students in all subgroups by 2020.

Rock Cave Elementary School did not achieve the Accountability Index Target for the 2012-2013 school year. When considering the index target of 53.13 for 2014 and the proficiency target of 75 percent by 2020, with a current index score of 30.13, Rock Cave Elementary School has a steep trajectory to achieve both the short term and long term targets. A significant gap exists between current performance of each subgroup and the target of 75 percent.

- Rock Cave Elementary earned 30.13 of 100 possible points for the West Virginia Accountability Index (WVAI) for the 2012-2013 school year. (The target was 49.53 for 2013 and is 53.13 for 2014).
- At least 50 percent of the subgroups at Rock Cave Elementary School met the targets in mathematics and reading.
- Rock Cave Elementary School acquired 8.81 of 40 possible points for proficiency.
- Rock Cave Elementary School acquired 4.86 of 20 possible points for closing the achievement gap.
- Rock Cave Elementary School acquired 6.56 of 15 possible points for observed growth.
- Rock Cave Elementary School acquired 5.00 of 20 possible points for adequate growth.
- Rock Cave Elementary School acquired 4.89 of 5 possible points for attendance.

**ROCK CAVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL
Grade-Level Proficiency Data
School Year 2013**

Grade-Level and Subgroup		Mathematics			Reading/Language Arts		
Grade	Group	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient	Participation	Non-Proficient	Proficient
3	White	> 95%	69.57%	30.43%	> 95%	52.17%	47.83%
3	Special Education	> 95%	> 95%	< 5%	> 95%	66.67%	33.33%
3	Low Socioeconomic Status	93.33%	85.71%	14.29%	93.33%	64.29%	35.71%
3	Total	> 95%	69.57%	30.43%	> 95%	52.17%	47.83%
4	White	94.12%	75.00%	25.00%	94.12%	75.00%	25.00%
4	Special Education	> 95%	50.00%	50.00%	> 95%	75.00%	25.00%
4	Low Socioeconomic Status	93.33%	78.57%	21.43%	93.33%	85.71%	14.29%
4	Total	94.12%	75.00%	25.00%	94.12%	75.00%	25.00%
5	White	92.86%	46.15%	53.85%	92.86%	61.54%	38.46%
5	Special Education	> 95%	> 95%	< 5%	> 95%	> 95%	< 5%
5	Low Socioeconomic Status	90.00%	55.56%	44.44%	90.00%	77.78%	22.22%
5	Total	92.86%	46.15%	53.85%	92.86%	61.54%	38.46%

Attendance Rate = 97.80%

The chart, Grade-Level Proficiency Data for School Year 2013, depicts participation, non-proficient, and proficient percentage rates by grade level and subgroup for mathematics and reading/language arts.

Mathematics.

- Grade 5 students with a proficiency rate of 53.85 percent proficient outperformed Grade 3 students (30.43 percent proficient) and Grade 4 students (25.00 percent proficient).
- Grade 4 special education students with a proficiency rate of 50.00 percent proficient outperformed Grade 3 and Grade 5 students (each less than 5 percent proficient).
- Grade 5 low socioeconomic students with a proficiency rate of 44.44 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 students (21.43 percent proficient) and Grade 3 students (14.29 percent proficient).

Reading/Language Arts.

- Grade 3 students with a proficiency rate of 47.83 percent proficient outperformed Grade 5 students (38.46 percent proficient) and Grade 4 students (25.00 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 special education students with a proficiency rate of 33.33 percent proficient outperformed Grade 4 students (25.00 percent proficient) and Grade 5 students (less than 5 percent proficient).
- Grade 3 low socioeconomic students with a proficiency rate of 35.71 percent proficient outperformed Grade 5 students (22.22 percent proficient) and Grade 4 students (14.29 percent proficient).

ROCK CAVE ELEMENTARY SCHOOL Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group

***Note:** Numbers below represent those students who have at least 1 prior consecutive WESTEST 2 score.

Low	between 1-34th percentile
Typical	between 35th-65th percentile
High	between 66th-99th percentile

Subgroup		Mathematics 2013					Reading/Language Arts 2013				
		Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient	Low	Typical	High	Median Percentile	Percent Proficient
All Sub-Group	School	12 (41%)	8 (28%)	9 (31%)	49.0	36.4%	10 (34%)	9 (31%)	10 (34%)	48.0	38.2%
	County	765 (38%)	688 (34%)	544 (27%)	44.0	38.9%	812 (41%)	622 (31%)	554 (28%)	43.0	43.4%
	State	51,165 (35%)	45,256 (31%)	50,057 (34%)	50.0	45.1%	50,484 (35%)	45,076 (31%)	50,227 (34%)	50.0	48.7%
White Sub-Group	School	12 (41%)	8 (28%)	9 (31%)	49.0	36.4%	10 (34%)	9 (31%)	10 (34%)	48.0	38.2%
	County	753 (39%)	670 (34%)	530 (27%)	44.0	39.1%	798 (41%)	603 (31%)	545 (28%)	43.0	43.3%
	State	47,034 (35%)	41,704 (31%)	46,085 (34%)	50.0	45.7%	46,584 (35%)	41,462 (31%)	46,170 (34%)	50.0	49.2%
Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	46.0	25.0%	*	*	*	25.0	25.0%
	County	139 (45%)	103 (33%)	70 (22%)	37.0	13.8%	142 (46%)	97 (31%)	72 (23%)	39.0	11.8%
	State	7,956 (43%)	5,628 (31%)	4,781 (26%)	41.0	18.3%	7,406 (41%)	5,488 (30%)	5,291 (29%)	43.0	16.1%
Non-Spec.Ed Sub-Group	School	10 (42%)	6 (25%)	8 (33%)	49.0	38.3%	7 (29%)	8 (33%)	9 (38%)	48.0	40.4%
	County	626 (37%)	585 (35%)	474 (28%)	46.0	44.0%	670 (40%)	525 (31%)	482 (29%)	44.0	49.8%
	State	43,209 (34%)	39,628 (31%)	45,276 (35%)	51.0	49.6%	43,078 (34%)	39,588 (31%)	44,936 (35%)	51.0	54.2%
LSES Sub-Group	School	11 (48%)	7 (30%)	5 (22%)	46.0	27.5%	9 (39%)	8 (35%)	6 (26%)	47.0	25.0%
	County	451 (40%)	391 (35%)	280 (25%)	42.0	28.8%	464 (42%)	346 (31%)	304 (27%)	42.0	33.5%
	State	26,545 (38%)	21,619 (31%)	22,119 (31%)	47.0	37.5%	25,763 (37%)	21,435 (31%)	22,576 (32%)	47.0	40.7%
Non-LSES Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	76.0	60.0%	*	*	*	69.0	73.3%
	County	314 (36%)	297 (34%)	264 (30%)	48.0	52.8%	348 (40%)	276 (32%)	250 (29%)	44.0	57.1%
	State	24,620 (32%)	23,637 (31%)	27,938 (37%)	52.0	58.1%	24,721 (33%)	23,641 (31%)	27,651 (36%)	52.0	62.5%
Male Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	50.0	28.1%	*	*	*	47.0	21.9%
	County	381 (39%)	323 (33%)	270 (28%)	43.0	38.6%	421 (43%)	309 (32%)	241 (25%)	41.0	34.9%
	State	27,113 (37%)	22,439 (30%)	24,615 (33%)	48.0	44.3%	27,485 (37%)	22,259 (30%)	24,047 (33%)	47.0	41.0%
Female Sub-Group	School	*	*	*	46.0	47.8%	*	*	*	48.0	60.9%
	County	384 (38%)	365 (36%)	274 (27%)	45.0	39.2%	391 (38%)	313 (31%)	313 (31%)	46.0	51.7%
	State	24,052 (33%)	22,817 (32%)	25,442 (35%)	51.0	45.9%	22,999 (32%)	22,817 (32%)	26,180 (36%)	52.0	56.9%

***Note:** Schools are those schools that have at least a 4th grade.

*Denotes cell size <20.

The chart, Growth Model School Level Summary Results by Sub-Group, identifies the percent proficient in each subgroup as compared to the county and the State averages. In addition, subgroup growth is examined and determined to be low, typical, or high growth based on previous performance.

Mathematics.

- The non low-socioeconomic subgroup showed high growth in mathematics and all other subgroups demonstrated typical growth.
- 36.4 percent of the all subgroup was proficient in mathematics as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- 36.4 percent of the white subgroup was proficient.
- 25.0 percent of the special education subgroup was proficient compared to the non-special education subgroup (38.3 percent proficient), which indicated a 13.3 percent achievement gap.
- 27.5 percent of the low socioeconomic subgroup was proficient compared to the non-low socioeconomic subgroup (60.0 percent proficient), which indicated a 32.5 percent achievement gap.
- 47.8 percent of the female subgroup was proficient in mathematics compared to the male subgroup (28.1 percent proficient), which indicated a 19.7 percent achievement gap.

Reading/Language Arts.

- The non-low socioeconomic subgroup demonstrated high growth in reading/language arts. All other subgroups demonstrated typical growth in reading/language arts except the special education subgroup which demonstrated low growth.
- 38.2 percent of the all subgroup was proficient in reading/language arts as indicated by the 2013 WESTEST2 data.
- 38.2 percent of the white subgroup was proficient in reading/language arts.
- 25.0 percent of the special education subgroup was proficient compared to the non-special education subgroup (40.4 percent proficient), which indicated a 15.4 percent achievement gap.
- 25.0 percent of the low socioeconomic subgroup was proficient compared to the non-low socioeconomic subgroup (73.3 percent proficient), which indicated a 48.3 percent achievement gap.
- 60.9 percent of the female subgroup was proficient compared to the male subgroup (21.9 percent proficient), which indicated a 39.0 percent gap.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY - ANALYSIS

Analysis of the data indicated Rock Cave Elementary School's index score of 30.126 was significantly below the index target for 2012-2013 (49.5347) and the target score for 2013-2014 (53.1251). Overall, achievement scores were higher in reading/language arts than in mathematics. The data indicated a need to provide support to the staff in mathematics and reading/language arts.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Next Generation Common Core Standards.
2. Mathematical Practices.
3. STAR Training/Accelerated Reader Training.
4. Test Data Analysis.
5. Policies and Procedures.
6. How to Work with Parents.
7. Pathways to the Common Core.
8. Instructional Practices Inventory.
9. Test Security Training/Online Writing Assessment.
10. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5000, *Procedures for Designated Hiring and Transfer of School Personnel*, Training.
11. Title I Professional Learning Communities (Writing Support, Reading Diets, Close Reading).
12. Deconstructed Standards.
13. iPad Training.
14. Number Talks.
15. Pearson Investigations.
16. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 4373, *Expected Behavior in Safe and Supportive Schools*, Training.
17. International Reading Conference.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

COMMENDATIONS

The Education Performance Audit Team reported that Rock Cave Elementary School had undertaken positive school improvement initiatives. The prominent initiatives and activities included the following.

7.1.2. High expectations. The Team observed classrooms, interviewed teachers and students and observed all staff held high expectations for all students. Expectations were communicated to students at all times through classroom postings, discussions with students, and meetings with parents and students. Students set their own goals for learning success in academics and the students were held accountable for achieving their learning goals. Teachers volunteered to work with students during a 30-minute time period at the end of the day when several students waited for the bus. All students reported they believed all staff cared for their achievement and safety.

7.1.3. Learning environment. The school's learning environment was excellent and conducive to the student learning environment. Teachers emphasized the importance of learning and challenged students to think and work to their highest capacity.

A monthly club focuses on social and life skills. Club activities included a gardening club, sewing classes, exercise activities, and crafts. The teachers manage the classes and activities are educationally based and contain character-building life skills. The school also held food drives, clothing drives, a backpack program, and a relay for life. The school staff and students also worked with the humane society. A scholarship was awarded to a Rock Cave Elementary alumnus at Buckhannon Upshur High School.

7.8.1. Leadership. The principal exhibited high quality leadership and provided teachers materials, programs, and support to foster a positive and nurturing learning environment. The principal was the curricular leader, yet fostered teacher leadership to effect student achievement in the greatest possible way. The principal was knowledgeable, well organized, and based all decisions on student needs.

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.2. STUDENT AND SCHOOL PERFORMANCE.

7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)

The Team could not determine that the guidance counselor was meeting with students the required 75 percent of the time or greater. The guidance counselor's log showed 72.5 percent direct student counseling.

INDICATORS OF EFFICIENCY

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Rock Cave Elementary School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Upshur County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Upshur County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The principal and staff had conducted a thorough examination of the school's needs through data analysis, interviews with students, and parent conferences. From this needs analysis, the staff implemented high quality, research-based professional development. It was evident that all staff were implementing the professional development and eager to continue investigating further actions to increase student achievement.

BUILDING CAPACITY TO CORRECT DEFICIENCIES

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Rock Cave Elementary School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

The school and students will receive additional support. The majority of services will be led by the local school district, with support from the Regional Education Service Agency (RESA) and the West Virginia Department of Education (WVDE). The school will complete a targeted strategic plan and will be monitored occasionally for progress. The local school systems may partner with the local RESA and others to provide professional development, technical assistance and interventions.

18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.

Building Capacity - Transition School

Rock Cave Elementary School met the target for participation rate and at least 50 percent of the subgroups met targets in mathematics and reading/language arts. The school failed to meet the index target due to low proficiency rates. The school will determine interventions and will be supported by the Upshur County Central Office. The school will complete a targeted strategic plan and will be monitored occasionally for progress. Technical assistance, professional development, and monitoring may be requested in conjunction with RESA 7. With an index score of 30.126 and a target index of 49.5347, the staff of Rock Cave Elementary School must develop the capacity to increase student achievement.

IDENTIFICATION OF RESOURCE NEEDS

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not removed from hazards and undesirable noise and traffic. The sidewalks were not adequate with designated crosswalks, curb cuts, and correct slope. (Did not adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)
- 19.1.2. Administrative and service facilities.** An adequate reception/waiting room was not available. (Did not adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)
- 19.1.4. Counselor's office.** The counselor's office did not have adequate space. (Did not adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)
- 19.1.5. Library/media and technology center.** The library/resource/media center did not have adequate space, electronic card catalogs, automated circulation capacity, on-line periodical indexes, or copying equipment. (May adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

19.1.7. K classrooms. The kindergarten classroom did not have a storage area for student use. (Did not adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas. The art facility did not have adequate size and storage was inadequate. Deep sinks, hot and cold water, counter space, bulletin boards, a ceramic kiln, or black-out areas were not available. (May adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

The music facility did not have adequate size and storage was inadequate. The facility lacked music chairs with folding arms, music stands, a podium, recording devices, microphones, stereo sound system, piano, instructional technology equipment, instructor's station, and acoustical treatment. (May adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

The physical education facilities did not have a data projector or 50 inch screen monitor, network connection, or audio equipment. (May adversely impact program delivery and student performance.)

19.1.15. Health service units. A health services unit of adequate size was not available. The school did not have curtained or small rooms with cots, bulletin board, toilet, lavatory, scales, medicine chest, refrigerator with locked storage, first aid kit, work counter, desk and chair, or locked medication box. (May adversely impact student health and safety.)

EARLY DETECTION AND INTERVENTION

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

None identified.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT SUMMARY

Rock Cave Elementary School's Education Performance Audit examined performance and progress standards related to student and school performance. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school. The Team submits this initial report to guide Rock Cave Elementary School in improvement efforts.

The Team identified one high quality standard necessary to improve performance and progress.

7.2.2. Counseling services.

The Team presented three commendations (7.1.2. High expectations, 7.1.3. Learning environment, and 7.8.1. Leadership), noted an indicator of efficiency (8.1.1. Curriculum), and presented a capacity building observation.

Section 17.10. of West Virginia Board of Education Policy 2320 states:

If during an on-site review, a school or county board is found to be in noncompliance with one or more standards, the school and county electronic strategic improvement plans must be revised and shall be submitted to the West Virginia Board of Education within 30 days of receipt of the draft written report. The plans shall include objectives, a time line, a plan for evaluation of the success of the improvements, a cost estimate and a date certain for achieving full accreditation and/or full approval status as applicable.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Rock Cave Elementary School and Upshur County to revise the school's Five-Year Strategic Plan within 30 days and correct the finding noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.