



**Office of Education
Performance Audits**

INITIAL EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT REPORT

FOR

MAGNOLIA HIGH SCHOOL

WETZEL COUNTY SCHOOL SYSTEM

JUNE 2011

WEST VIRGINIA BOARD OF EDUCATION

Table of Contents

	Page
Introduction	2
Education Performance Audit Team	2
School Performance	3
Annual Performance Measures for Accountability	8
Education Performance Audit.....	9
High Quality Standards	9
Indicators of Efficiency	12
Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies.....	13
Identification of Resource Needs	14
Early Detection and Intervention	15
Education Performance Audit Summary	16

INTRODUCTION

An announced Education Performance Audit of Magnolia High School in Wetzel County was conducted March 9, 2011. The review was conducted at the specific direction of the West Virginia Board of Education. The purpose of the review was to investigate the reasons for performance and progress that are low and declining and to make recommendations to the school and school system, as appropriate, and to the West Virginia Board of Education on such measures as it considers necessary to improve performance and progress.

The Education Performance Audit Team reviewed the Five-Year Strategic Improvement Plan, interviewed school personnel and school system administrators, observed classrooms, and examined school records. The review concentrated on the declining student achievement.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT TEAM

Office of Education Performance Audits Team Chair – Allen D. Brock, Coordinator

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader – Robert Hagerman, Assistant Director, Office of Professional Preparation (Certification)

West Virginia Department of Education Team Leader and Technology – Brenda Morris, Coordinator, Office of Instructional Technology

TEAM MEMBERS

Name	Title	School/County
Vicki L. Bombard	Middle School Assistant Principal	West Fairmont Middle School Marion County
Stephen Higgins	Closing the Achievement Gap Liaison (CAG)	Marion County
Steve Malnick	Middle School Principal	Monongah Middle School Marion County
David R. Mazza	Middle School Assistant Principal	Bridgeport Middle School Harrison County

SCHOOL PERFORMANCE

This section presents the Annual Performance Measures for Accountability and the Education Performance Audit Team's findings.

92 WETZEL COUNTY

William F. Jones, Superintendent

502 MAGNOLIA HIGH SCHOOL – Passed

Kathi Schmalz, Principal

Grades 09 - 12

Enrollment 478 (2nd month 2008-2009 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2008-2009

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	112	117	115	98.29	50.00	Yes	Yes	✓
White	110	115	113	98.26	50.92	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	11	11	10	90.90	10.00	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	42	46	46	100.00	33.33	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	112	117	115	98.29	46.36	Yes	Yes	✓
White	110	115	113	98.26	46.29	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
0	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	11	11	10	90.90	10.00	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	42	46	46	100.00	35.71	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Graduation Rate = 94.6%

92 WETZEL COUNTY
William F. Jones, Superintendent
502 MAGNOLIA HIGH SCHOOL – Passed
Kathi Schmalz, Principal
Grades 09 - 12
Enrollment 463 (2nd month 2009-2010 enrollment report)

WESTEST 2009-2010

Group	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Enrolled on Test Week	Number Tested	Participation Rate	Percent Proficient	Met Part. Rate Standard	Met Assessment Standard	Met Subgroup Standard
Mathematics								
All	98	103	102	99.02	25.77	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
White	97	102	101	99.01	26.04	Yes	Confidence Interval	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	17	19	19	100.00	11.76	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	33	34	34	100.00	15.15	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Reading/Language Arts								
All	98	103	102	99.02	31.95	Yes	Yes	✓
White	97	102	101	99.01	32.29	Yes	Yes	✓
Black	**	**	**	**	**	**	**	**
Hispanic	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Asian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Indian	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Multi-Racial	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Pacific Islander	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*
Spec. Ed.	17	19	19	100.00	17.64	NA	NA	NA
Low SES	33	34	34	100.00	12.12	NA	NA	NA
LEP	*	*	*	*	*	*	*	*

FAY -- Full Academic Year

* -- 0 students in subgroup

** -- Less than 10 students in subgroup

Passed

Graduation Rate = 95.8%

MAGNOLIA HIGH SCHOOL

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class

Mathematics											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
11	103	98	102	97	99.03	56.70	17.53	18.56	7.22	0.00	25.77

Reading											
Class	Tested Enr.	FAY Enr.	Tested	FAY Tested	Part. Rate	Novice	Below Mastery	Mastery	Above Mastery	Distinguished	Proficient
11	103	98	102	97	99.03	25.77	42.27	13.40	16.49	2.06	31.96

Enr. - Enrollment
FAY - Full Academic Year
Part. - Participation

The following charts show the actual number of students proficient and not proficient in mathematics and reading/language arts out of the number enrolled for the full academic year (FAY).

Mathematics			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	98	25	72
White	97	25	71
Special Education	17	2	15
SES	33	5	28

Reading/Language Arts			
	Number Enrolled for FAY	Number Proficient	Number Not Proficient
All	98	31	66
White	97	31	65
Special Education	17	3	14
SES	33	4	29

NUMBER OF ADVANCED PLACEMENT (AP), HONORS, AND COLLEGE COURSES OFFERED 2010-2011			
High School	Number of AP Courses Taught	Number of Honors Courses Taught	Number of College Credit Courses Taught
Magnolia High	3	4	5

AP Courses Taught: AP Calculus, AP French, AP Chemistry. Students had the opportunity to take additional AP courses through the Internet; however, the principal stated that students opted for the dual credit courses.

Honors Courses Taught: Honors English 9, 10, 11, 12.

College Credit Courses Taught: Composition 101, Composition 2, Biology, Speech, Psychology

Magnolia High	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10
10 th Grade Test Takers (%)	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%)	1.6%	1.6%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%)	20.6%	11.5%	0.8%	12.4%	0.0%
10 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
11 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
12 th Grade Test Takers (%) with a score of 3 or higher	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

Magnolia High School must investigate programs and practices to increase not only the number of students taking the AP exam, but also the number of students that score a 3 or higher. The Team noted that while no AP students took the AP exam in 2009-2010, advanced placements are weighted higher than other classes for students' grade point average (GPA).

ESTIMATED COLLEGE GOING RATE FALL 2009		
	Number of High School Graduates 2008-09	Overall College Going Rate Percentage
State	18,418	61.5%
Wetzel County	243	63.8%
Magnolia High	122	69.7%

Source: West Virginia College Going Rates By County and High School Fall 2009, West Virginia Higher Education Policy Commission.

Magnolia High School had a higher college going rate (69.7 percent) than the State (61.5 percent) and Wetzel County (63.8 percent).

HIGH SCHOOL GRADUATES ENROLLED IN DEVELOPMENTAL COURSES FALL 2009					
	1 st Time WV Freshmen Total #	English Total #	% in Developmental English	Mathematics Total #	% in Developmental Mathematics
State	8,311	1,291	15.53%	2,020	24.31%
Wetzel County	131	25	19.08%	51	38.93%
Magnolia High	70	16	22.86%	29	41.43%

Source: First-Time Freshmen, Previous Year WV High School Graduates in Developmental Courses by Type of Course Fall 2009 (census).

The percentage of Magnolia High School students enrolled in Developmental English college courses at 22.86 percent was higher than that of the State (15.53 percent) and higher than Wetzel County (19.08 percent). The percentage of Magnolia High School students enrolled in Developmental Mathematics at 41.43 percent was significantly higher than the State (24.31 percent) and higher than Wetzel County (38.93 percent). The principal must investigate and implement high quality, research-based programs and practices to decrease the number of students that need to enroll in the developmental classes.

ANNUAL PERFORMANCE MEASURES FOR ACCOUNTABILITY

Achieved Standard.

5.1.1. Achievement.

Magnolia High School achieved adequate yearly progress (AYP) in the all students (AS) and the racial/ethnicity white (W) subgroups in mathematics only by application of the confidence interval. Although not large enough to constitute a subgroup for accountability, the special education (SE) and economically disadvantaged (SES) subgroups need attention and plans for improved performance. Mathematics scores at Magnolia High School are in the bottom five high schools in the state.

Adequate Yearly Progress (AYP) Information by Class indicated scores below mastery and novice in both mathematics and reading: Grade 11 – 74.23 percent in mathematics and 68.04 percent in reading. These scores have implication for the Five-Year Strategic Plan and school improvement.

The following professional development and/or training opportunities were provided as reported by the principal.

1. Sexual Harassment.
2. West Virginia Board of Education Policy 5310.
3. Homelessness.
4. Family Education Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA) Training.
5. Teacher and Student Codes of Conduct.
6. Parent Involvement.
7. Safe and Drug free Schools.
8. Response to Intervention.
9. Professional Learning Communities.
10. WESTEST2 Data Analysis.
11. Acuity.
12. Differentiated Instruction.
13. Edline.
14. West Virginia Writes.
15. 21st Century West Virginia 21st Century Content Standards and Objectives (CSOs).
16. Benchmark and Pacing Guides.
17. Teach 21 and Global 21.
18. Learn 21.
19. Depth of Knowledge.
20. Maintaining Student Engagement.
21. TechSteps.
22. Problem Based Learning.
23. Collaborative Teaching.
24. Creating a Culture for Learning.
25. Safety Plan.

EDUCATION PERFORMANCE AUDIT

HIGH QUALITY STANDARDS

Necessary to Improve Performance and Progress.

7.1. Curriculum

- 7.1.2. High expectations. Through curricular offerings, instructional practices, and administrative practices, staff demonstrates high expectations for the learning and achieving of all students and all students have equal educational opportunities including enrichment and acceleration. (Policy 2510)**

Two English teachers did not teach from bell to bell. The Team observed at least ten minutes of non-instructional time not being used productively in each class.

None of the English classes exhibited higher order thinking skills. Worksheets and defining vocabulary words were the predominant strategies. One other teacher exhibited low expectations of students.

The Team interviewed a group of senior students who were taking advanced placement (AP) and honors courses. These students expressed a concern that they were not challenged in classes overall and did not feel prepared for college.

- 7.1.5. Instructional strategies. Staff demonstrates the use of the various instructional strategies and techniques contained in Policies 2510 and 2520. (Policy 2510; Policy 2520)**

Seven teachers did not vary instructional strategies. Teacher directed instruction was the predominant instructional strategy in these classes.

Students in one physical education classes were playing a modified softball game (Alfonzo Ball) in which students would throw the ball at other students to get them "out". Students are not to be used as targets as this may lead to physical and/or emotional harm. Female students in this teacher's class during a different class period were sitting on the bleachers and not engaged in the class while male student were playing basketball and the teacher was also sitting on the bleachers.

7.2. Student and School Performance

- 7.2.2. Counseling services. Counselors shall spend at least 75 percent of the work day in a direct counseling relationship with students, and shall devote no more than 25 percent of the work day to counseling-related administrative activities as stated in W.Va. Code §18-5-18b. (W.Va. Code §18-5-18b; Policy 2315)**

Neither of the two guidance counselors was meeting with students at least 75 percent of the time. The counselors reported that the student counseling time

was less than 25 percent. Duties with standardized testing, transcript requests, lunch duties, and scholarships were among the reasons they gave for the low percentage.

- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback. Lesson plans that are based on approved content standards and objectives are prepared in advance and the principal reviews, comments on them a minimum of once each quarter, and provides written feedback to the teacher as necessary to improve instruction. (Policy 2510; Policy 5310)**

Seven teachers had inadequate lesson plans that could not be followed by a substitute teacher. Nineteen teachers' lesson plans had not been checked by the principal two times as of the day of the Education Performance Audit

7.6. Personnel

- 7.6.3. Evaluation. The county board adopts and implements an evaluation policy for professional and service personnel that is in accordance with W.Va. Code, West Virginia Board of Education policy, and county policy. (W.Va. Code §18A-2-12; Policy 5310; Policy 5314)**

One teacher's observation did not have a date that the principal had signed it; therefore, it could not be verified that it had been signed within five days required by Policy 5310. This teacher signed the observation 14 calendar days after the observation.

One teacher observation was signed by the teacher and administrator ten calendar days after the observation. This teacher's evaluation did not have the principal's signature or date the evaluation had been conducted.

7.7. Safe, Drug Free, Violence Free, and Disciplined Schools

- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations. School rules, procedures, and expectations are written; clearly communicated to students, parents, and staff; and enforced. (Policy 2510; Policy 4373)**

Students reported that discipline buildingwide was inconsistently enforced and based on if the student was an athlete or not. Athletes reportedly received preferential treatment by the teachers and administration. In addition to the students, at least five teachers stated that this was the case.

- 7.7.2. Policy implementation. The county and schools implement: a policy governing disciplinary procedures; a policy for grading consistent with student confidentiality; policies governing student due process rights and nondiscrimination; the Student Code of Conduct policy; the Racial, Sexual, Religious/Ethnic Harassment, and Violence policy; an approved policy on tobacco use; an approved policy on substance abuse; and an approved policy on AIDS Education. (W.Va. Code §18A-5-1 and §18-8-8; Policy 2421; Policy 2422.4; Policy 2422.5; Policy 4373; Policy 2515)**

Tobacco use was evident in the boys' rest rooms throughout the building during the day of the Education Performance Audit.

Chemicals in one science classroom were not secured. The chemicals were in a teacher work area; however, they were not in a locked area.

7.8. Leadership

7.8.1. Leadership. Leadership at the school district, school, and classroom levels is demonstrated by vision, school culture and instruction, management and environment, community, and professionalism. (Policy 5500.03)

Due to the number of deficiencies found at Magnolia High School, the Team determined that assistance from the central office administration, the West Virginia Department of Education, and RESA 6 needed to be provided to assist the building administrator in the school's operation.

Seven teachers reported that the principal was bullying them and employed intimidation against teachers. The teachers indicated that the principal's brother was the local board president and that their jobs would be in danger if they went against the principal. Bullying by teachers against other teachers was also reported. The teachers that talked about this issue stated that more teachers wanted to talk about the bullying issues but would not due to fear of retaliation.

RECOMMENDATION

7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application. While technology was being used well in many of the classrooms, technology could be used to a higher extent and to a higher degree in the other classrooms. The Team recommended that all teachers be provided support and staff development in using technology and to help fully integrate technology to the highest extent.

Indicators of Efficiency

Indicators of efficiency for student and school system performance and processes were reviewed in the following areas: Curriculum delivery, including but not limited to, the use of distance learning; facilities; administrative practices; personnel; utilization of regional education service agency, or other regional services that may be established by their assigned regional education service agency. This section contains indicators of efficiency that the Education Performance Audit Team assessed as requiring more efficient and effective application.

The indicators of efficiency listed are intended to guide Magnolia High School in providing a thorough and efficient system of education. Wetzel County is obligated to follow the Indicators of Efficiency noted by the Team. Indicators of Efficiency shall not be used to affect the approval status of Wetzel County or the accreditation status of the schools.

8.1.1. Curriculum. The school district and school conduct an annual curriculum audit regarding student curricular requests and overall school curriculum needs, including distance learning in combination with accessible and available resources.

The toxic atmosphere among the staff at the school was having a detrimental effect on the learning environment. Teacher to teacher bullying and administrator to teacher bullying were reported by teachers. While other curricular issues were found by the Team, this issue needs to be corrected immediately as it negatively affected teacher morale, which in turn affected student achievement.

Building Capacity to Correct Deficiencies

West Virginia Code §18-2E-5 establishes that the needed resources are available to assist the school or school system in achieving the standards and alleviating the deficiencies identified in the assessment and accountability process. To assist Magnolia High School in achieving capacity, the following resources are recommended.

- 18.1. Capacity building is a process for targeting resources strategically to improve the teaching and learning process. School and county electronic strategic improvement plan development is intended, in part, to provide mechanisms to target resources strategically to the teaching and learning process to improve student, school, and school system performance.**

While the principal was organized and had a great deal of knowledge, the Team had strong reservations about the school's capacity to correct the deficiencies given the issue of the bullying among the staff. Until that issue is resolved, the school will have a great deal of difficulty in correcting the deficiencies presented in this report.

The Office of School Improvement will be contacting the school and county regarding the necessary revisions of the school's strategic plan and providing assistance through the West Virginia Department of Education State System of Support.

Identification of Resource Needs

A thorough and efficient system of schools requires the provision of an adequate level of appropriately managed resources. The West Virginia Board of Education adopted resource evaluation as a part of the accreditation and evaluation process. This process is intended to meaningfully evaluate the needs for facilities, personnel, curriculum, equipment and materials in each of the county's schools and how those impact program and student performance.

19.1. Facilities, equipment, and materials. Facilities and equipment specified in Policy 6200, Chapters 1 through 14, are available in all schools, classrooms, and other required areas. A determination will be made by using the Process for Improving Education (W.Va. Code §18-2E-5) whether any identified deficiencies adversely impact and impair the delivery of a high quality educational program if it is below the West Virginia Board of Education standards due to inadequacies or inappropriate management in the areas of facilities, equipment, and materials. The Education Performance Audit Teams shall utilize an assessment instrument for the evaluation of school facilities which generally follows the requirements of Policy 6200. Note: Corrective measures to be taken in response to any identified resource deficiency will of necessity be subject to the feasibility of modifying existing facilities, consideration of alternative methods of instructional delivery, availability of funding, and prioritization of educational needs through Comprehensive Educational Facilities Plans and the West Virginia School Building Authority. This policy does not change the authority, judgment, or priorities of the School Building Authority of West Virginia who is statutorily responsible for prioritizing "Need" for the purpose of funding school improvements or school construction in the State of West Virginia or the prerogative of the Legislature in providing resources. (Policy 6200 and *Tomblin v. Gainer*)

According to the items checked in the School Facilities Evaluation Checklist, the school was below standard in the following areas. The principal checked and the Team confirmed the following school facility resource needs.

- 19.1.1. School location.** The school site was not large enough for future expansion and was not removed from hazards and undesirable noise and traffic.
- 19.1.8. Grades 1-12 classrooms.** Storage was not adequate in all classrooms.
- 19.1.10. Specialized instructional areas.** The music facility did not have music chairs with folding arms.
- 19.1.11. Grades 6-12 science facilities.** The science facilities were not located with easy access to outdoor activities and isolated to keep odors from the remainder of the building.

- 19.1.13. Grades 7-12 school site vocational.** The vocational department did not have a digital camera or VCR and DVD players. A Health Occupations course was not offered.
- 19.1.14. Food service.** The food service seating area was not adequate and seating was not available for dining and study purposes.
- 19.1.15. Health service units.** A refrigerator with locked storage was not available.
- 19.1.16. Grades 7-12 vocational.** Classroom and laboratory space in each career technical area was not adequate to meet curriculum needs and storage was not adequate.

Early Detection and Intervention

One of the most important elements in the Education Performance Audit process is monitoring student progress through early detection and intervention programs.

Magnolia High School is likely to maintain the course of its performance levels if it does not receive continuous and sustained intervention from local and State education agencies, with special emphasis on learning environment and tolerance.

The School Support System presented under the Capacity Building Section will be an invaluable resource in guiding school improvement.

Education Performance Audit Summary

Magnolia High School's Education Performance Audit concentrated on the declining student achievement. The Team also conducted a resource evaluation to assess the resource needs of the school.

The Team identified eight high quality standards necessary to improve performance and progress.

- 7.1.2. High expectations** (students were not being challenged by the curriculum).
- 7.1.5. Instructional strategies** (teaching strategies were not being varied).
- 7.2.2. Counseling services** (counselors were not meeting the required 75 percent student counseling).
- 7.2.3. Lesson plans and principal feedback** (seven sets of lesson plans were inadequate).
- 7.6.3. Evaluation** (teacher evaluation policy irregularities observed).
- 7.7.1. School rules, procedures, and expectations** (discipline reported to be inconsistent).
- 7.7.2. Policy implementation** (tobacco use evident and chemicals not secured).
- 7.8.1. Leadership** (principal needed assistance).

The Team presented one recommendation (7.1.7. Library/educational technology access and technology application), noted an indicator of efficiency, offered capacity building resources, and noted an early detection and intervention concern.

Based upon the results of the Education Performance Audit and the revised strategic plan, the Office of Education Performance Audits recommends that the West Virginia Board of Education direct Magnolia High School and Wetzel County to correct the findings noted in the report by the next accreditation cycle.